THE PHENOMENA OF MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER:
CREATING AN ARCHITECTURAL SENSE OF PLACE ON GRAND CANYON

By

BARBARA ANN MATUSIK

A DISSERTATION PRESENTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
OF THE UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA

2017
To my husband Robert who took me to the Grand Canyon.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank my committee for their expertise and for balancing their schedules to attend meetings. Foremost, I would like to thank my committee Chair, Janet Snyder Matthews for her steadfast guidance regarding the National Park Service and Historic Preservation Law. I received significant feedback and encouragement from my Historic Preservation and architecture committee members, Morris Hylton, Peter E. Prugh and Vandana Baweja. A well-deserved thank you goes to mentor, Michael J. Heckenberger for his expertise in the field of anthropology, methodology, and theoretical framework. A special “thank you” to my dear Flagstaff, Arizona friend Jane Scholes for making a copy of an original M.E.J. Colter’s 1933 Manual for Drivers and Guides from the University of Northern Arizona Library. Without her assistance, my initial research would not have been possible. My gratitude also goes to Colleen L. Hyde, Museum Specialist and staff at the Grand Canyon National Park Museum Collection Archives for their assistance in locating M.E.J. Colter archival material and generating digital files necessary to my research. Nevertheless, any errors or omissions that may occur are mine. I cannot forget the Native American individuals who have shared their Hopi and Navajo culture leaving an indelible impression on my worldview. Lastly, I want to express my appreciation to author, Arnold Berke for his advice and David Norton, restoration contractor of D.L. Norton General Contracting in Scottsdale, AZ for all the information on Historic Restoration to M.E.J. Colter’s structures at Grand Canyon National Park.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF DEFINITIONS</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 WHO WAS MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER?</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introducing M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.E.J. Colter’s Education Background</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Years in St. Paul, MN</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Trends and M.E.J. Colter’s Inspirations</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alvarado Exhibit for the Fred Harvey Company</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.E.J. Colter’s First Grand Canyon Architecture</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding M.E.J. Colter’s Inspirations</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Grand Canyon Architecture</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative Methods</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Research</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating the Case Study</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Design Defined</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature Review</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyzing the Information</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 THE FRED HARVEY COMPANY</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who was Fred Harvey?</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Santa Fe Railway Partnership</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvey Hotels, Restaurants and Harvey Girls, a Harvey Trademark</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 1915 San Diego World’s Fair</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Colter Hotels Outside of Grand Canyon</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Fonda in Santa Fe, NM</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Posada in Winslow, AZ</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Harvey Company Indian Department and Native American Collection</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 THE NATIONAL PARKS BEGINNINGS</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture - The Early National Park Years</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture – 1916 the Organic Act and the National Park Service</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation Of Nationa Park Service 1938 Design</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 IN SEARCH OF ANCIENT TOWERS</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ancient Ruins of the Southwest</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who Were the Ancient Builders of the Southwest?</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Elisabeth Jane Colter’s Research</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Desert View Watchtower</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hopi World View</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Native Voice</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 CONCLUSION: A SENSE OF PLACE AT GRAND CANYON TODAY</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A LIST OF M.E.J. COLTER BUILDINGS &amp; INTERIOR DESIGNS</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B M.E.J. COLTER FIREPLACES</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER INFLUENCE?</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF REFERENCES</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td>Saint Paul High School 1888 postcard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>California School of Design c. 1890s Mark Hopkins Mansion, San Francisco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-3</td>
<td>A.F. Mathews portrait of M.E.J. Colter c.1890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>A. F. Mathews c.1989 with CSD class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-5</td>
<td>Walter J. Mathews architect – First Unitarian Church of Oakland c.1890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-6</td>
<td>Walter J. Mathews architect – Oakland residence G.C. Perkins c. 1880s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-7</td>
<td>AT&amp;SF Railway architect rendering - The Alvarado Hotel Albuquerque, NM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-8</td>
<td>Colter’s arrangement of FHC museum objects c.1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-9</td>
<td>Colter’s arrangement of FHC sales room c.1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-10</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter - Hopi House at Grand Canyon 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-11</td>
<td>Oraibi Arizona c.1898 Photographer George Wharton James (1858-1923)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-12</td>
<td>Edward Curtis collection 1925 plate no. 576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-13</td>
<td>House Restoration, Old Oraibi, Third Mesa, Hopi Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-14</td>
<td>The Hopi House 12-17-2014 historic restoration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-15</td>
<td>Colter’s A) 1914 Lookout Studio GRCA # 09590 B) 2014 restoration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-16</td>
<td>Colter’s 1914 Hermit’s Rest GRCA # 107091 &amp; GRCA # 07514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Map of the Old Santa Fe Trail with the AT&amp;SF Railway route</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>Santa Fe NM Palace of Governors A) c.1822 &amp; B) c.1900s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-3</td>
<td>El Ortiz Hotel 1910 Lamy, NM A) exterior &amp; B) Harvey Girl at counter .......</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-4</td>
<td>El Navajo Hotel - AT&amp;SF Railway Depot exterior Gallup, NM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5</td>
<td>El Navajo interior Navajo sand paintings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-6</td>
<td>LA Union Station 1939 M.E.J. Colter Pueblo Deco style Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-7</td>
<td>La Fonda Hotel on the Plaza in Santa Fe, NM December 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-8</td>
<td>A) La Fonda’s Cantinita metal light fixture by M.E.J. Colter from 1949 and B) La Fonda women’s restroom tile 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-9</td>
<td>FHC “Detours” Couriers at La Fonda Hotel NMHA #046971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-10</td>
<td>La Posada exterior views restored historic hotel Winslow, AZ 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>Theodore Roosevelt c.1903 and John Muir on camping trip to Yosemite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td>Norris Soldier Station (NPS Ranger Museum) c.2012 Yellowstone NHL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-3</td>
<td>US Army stone structure c. 1909 now Albright Visitor Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-4</td>
<td>Lake Yellowstone Hotel - Colonial Revival style NHL 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>Old Faithful Inn architect, Robert Reimer built 1903–1904, addition 1913–1914, addition 1927–1928, final addition 1936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-6</td>
<td>Adirondacks Great Camps – The Sagamore Lodge c.1883 NRHP 1976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-7</td>
<td>Robert Reamer - Yellowstone Canyon Lodge NPS demolished 1950s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8</td>
<td>Belton Chalet - Outside entrance to Glacier National Park. One of first Great Northern Railway hotels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-9</td>
<td>Daniel R. Hull “rustic” Grand Canyon building by NPS Landscape Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-10</td>
<td>Cabin drawings M.E.J. Colter before WWI - Used in 1922 Grand Canyon Phantom Ranch project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-11</td>
<td>Gilbert Stanley Underwood Ahwahnee Hotel Yosemite c. 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-12</td>
<td>Underwood Grand Canyon North Rim Lodge HABS/NPS file</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-13</td>
<td>Historic “Buckey” O’Neill Cabin A) c. 1935 GRCA #628 restoration B) author’s photo 2012 in Bright Angle Lodge complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-14</td>
<td>Red Horse Station historic old stage stop &amp; post office A) c. 1903 NAU.PH.90.9.341 – B) Cameron Hotel GRCA #9721 c. 1935 under restoration for Bright Angle Lodge complex C) 2012 author photo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-15</td>
<td>Bright Angle Lodge Plan from NPS 1938 Parks and Recreation Structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-1</td>
<td>Tree types of Four Corners states 2014 research Journal of Nature Communications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-2</td>
<td>Chaco Canyon Tree Ring Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-3</td>
<td>Traditional Navajo hogans GRCA #13660 at Hopi House c.1900s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5-4  A) c.1905 M.E.J. Colter Hopi House interior archival photo UNA  B) Hopi House Exhibit of Navajo rugs, photo/Steve Collins .................................................. 162

5-5  archaeologist, A.V. Kidder and photographer, Jesse Nusbaum c.1908 AIA Mesa Verde survey ................................................................. 163

5-6  M.E.J. Colter doing research at MVNP kiva c.1931 # 17013 FHC ............. 163

5-7  A) Watchtower Colter kiva B) ceiling repurposed timbers from Grandview Hotel C) Grandview Hotel GRCA#06255 c.1900s ........................................ 164

5-8  A) Fred Kabotie Watchtower art B) Fred’s grandson Ed Kabotie doing restoration artwork on same wall area in the Watchtower Hopi Room c. 2016. 164

5-9  GCA Map of Grand Canyon 11 Traditionally Associated Tribes .................. 165

5-10  Grand Canyon Tribal Medallion November 2016 talk by Lyle Balenquah, Hopi (left) and Jason Naz, Navajo (right) author’s photos ............................... 165

APPENDIX

A  List of M.E.J. Colter Buildings & Interior Designs ........................................ 171

B-1  Two M.E.J. Colter Hopi House fireplaces – author’s photo 12-2014 ............ 173

B-2  M.E.J. Colter Bright Angle Lodge Lobby fireplace author’s photo 12-2014 and Bright Angle Lodge History Room Grand Canyon geological layer fireplace with M.E.J. Colter metalwork – author’s photo summer 2012 ............ 173

B-3  M.E.J. Colter letter to Eddie McKee regarding the Bright Angle Lodge geological fireplace # GRCA 75828 GCNP Collection ................................. 174

B-4  M.E.J. Colter - Hermit’s Rest (1914) fireplace at Grand Canyon National Park. GRCA Museum Collection photos c.1916 A) #49404 B) # 22665 ........ 175

B-5  Hermit's Rest great fireplace, author’s husband in 2016 and author in 2012.... 175

B-6  M.E.J. Colter fireplaces in La Fonda Hotel Santa Fe, NM author’s photos 2014. A) In “Detours” lecture room. B) Colter commissioned sculptor Arnold Rönnebeck (1885-1947), once a pupil of Auguste Rodin. C)“La Cantinita” in 1949, Colter’s last FHC project, She transform the room into a 19th century Mexican-Spanish environment D) La Fonda lobby fireplace .............................. 176

C-1  The Lodge at Santa Fe, NM http://www.lodgeatsantafe.com/ ...................... 177
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adobe</td>
<td>A building material traditionally made of mud and straw, commonly made into brick. Modern practice is to use sand and clay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hacienda</td>
<td>A large homestead of a ranch or estate, usually in places where Colonial Spanish culture has had architectural influence or the main house of a large estate or plantation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation</td>
<td>Webster defines it as “a teaching technique that stresses appreciation and understanding, combining factual with stimulating explanatory information.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroglyphs</td>
<td>Pecked, abraded, or scratched on the surface of a rock face.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phenomena</td>
<td>An exceptional person, a genius, a wonder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pictographs</td>
<td>Art work painted on rocks by applying pigment to the rock.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverine</td>
<td>Relating to a system of inland wetlands and deep-water habitats associated with non-tidal flowing water, characterized by the absence of trees, shrubs, or emergent vegetation, of or pertaining to a river.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rustic</td>
<td>Living in the country, as distinguished from cities or towns; rural, simple, plain, or made of rough, bark-covered branches or roots, such as rustic furniture. Masonry having a rough surface or irregular, deeply sunk, deliberately conspicuous joints; rusticated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of place</td>
<td>Places said to have a &quot;sense of place&quot; have identity and character deeply felt by local inhabitants and/or by visitors. A social phenomenon that exists independently of any individual's perceptions or experiences yet depends on human engagement. A feeling derived from the natural environment, a mix of natural and cultural features in the landscape that may include the people who occupy a place or what makes a place special or unique, a sense of authentic human attachment and belonging.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supais</td>
<td>Within the Grand Canyon the location of the Havasupai Nation, place of emergence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worldview</td>
<td>A particular philosophy of life or conception of the world: the way someone thinks about the world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viaga</td>
<td>A heavy rafter, especially a log supporting the roof in Native American and Spanish Colonial architecture of the Southwest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZ</td>
<td>Arizona</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT&amp;SF</td>
<td>Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSD</td>
<td>California School of Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCA</td>
<td>Grand Canyon Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCNP</td>
<td>Grand Canyon National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCMC</td>
<td>Grand Canyon Museum Collection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHC</td>
<td>Fred Harvey Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FH/SF</td>
<td>Fred Harvey/Santa Fe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHNAC</td>
<td>Fred Harvey Native American Collection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HABS</td>
<td>Historic American Building Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICA</td>
<td>Indian Citizenship Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNA</td>
<td>Museum of Northern Arizona</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MVNP</td>
<td>Mesa Verde National Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NM</td>
<td>New Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAGPRA</td>
<td>Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCAI</td>
<td>National Congress of American Indians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPS</td>
<td>National Park Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRHD</td>
<td>National Register Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHL</td>
<td>National Historic Landmark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRHP</td>
<td>National Register of Historic Places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHPO</td>
<td>State Historical Preservation Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNA</td>
<td>University of Northern Arizona</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE PHENOMENA OF MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER:  
CREATING AN ARCHITECTURAL SENSE OF PLACE ON GRAND CANYON

By

Barbara Ann Matusik

May 2017

Chair: Janet Snyder Matthews
Major: Design, Construction and Planning

Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter (1869-1958) artist, teacher, architect and interior designer, created structures on the Grand Canyon South Rim (1904-1937) for the Santa Fe Railway and their concessioner, the Fred Harvey Company. Colter used design elements gained from her extensive study of indigenous Southwestern cultures and the ancient pueblo ruins of the Four Corners area. She studied the construction methods used by the ancient builders to create structures that blended with the rugged landscape of Grand Canyon creating a Sense of Place. Eleven years prior to Grand Canyon’s designation as a National Park, Colter created Hopi House in 1905, a site-specific commercial building to attract AT&SF Railway passengers from the eastern United States. In 1914, she designed Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio, two canyon viewing locations for the Fred Harvey Company, using her signature “jagged style” of native canyon rocks that imitate vernacular structures harmonizing with the Grand Canyon geology. While creating a “Sense of Place” at Grand Canyon, did M.E.J. Colter’s distinctive architectural style inspire the design projects of National Park Service (NPS) architects following the 1916 Organic Act?
CHAPTER 1
WHO WAS MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER?

Introducing M.E.J. Colter

Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter (April 4, 1869 – January 8, 1958) was an exceptional woman and 20th century architect who designed structures throughout the Southwestern United States (US) for the Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe (AT&SF) Railway and their concessioner, the Fred Harvey Company (FHC). Her methods and habits, as collector and designer, set her apart as an individual who valued indigenous art and culture.¹ Because she was a female architect working within two large companies and the remoteness of her architecture, Colter’s works had gone virtually unnoticed until Virginia Grattan’s 1980 biography. Using characteristics from southwestern native cultures to draw ‘Easterners’ to the Grand Canyon, she created tourist enticing “Sense of Place” commercial building for the Fred Harvey/Santa Fe (FH/SF) partnership. While doing her research in the late 1970s, Colter’s first biographer, Virginia L. Grattan (Mary Colter: Builder upon the Red Earth, 1980) was able to interview Harvey family members and others who knew Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter (M.E.J. Colter).² Grattan states that, Colter “might have remained just a talented interior decorator if there hadn’t been something remarkable about her personality.”

From an early age, Colter demonstrated a strong will and determination to do things her way. Quoting from Grattan, her critics remembered her as a “chain-smoking small woman with piercing violet eyes and un-kept hair” who was often outspoken and cruel. Whereas those she called friends found her charming, interesting to talk to, and


² From V. L. Grattan (1980) Mary Colter: Builder Upon the Red Earth in 1977 she was able to obtain interviews from Fred Harvey’s grandson, Stuart Harvey, and others living who knew M.E.J. Colter.
generally happy. In an 1980 interview with Stewart Harvey, Grattan states, in order to get her way Colter had influence with the Harvey family, and they would “influence the railroad people” to get her whatever she wanted. However, she had to get along with the AT&SF Railway architects because they would draw the working plans from her building designs (Grattan, 1980: 21).

During the early western park development period M.E.J. Colter was growing up, obtaining an art education in California, and teaching in Saint Paul, MN. She was born in Pittsburg Pennsylvania to Irish immigrants, William H. Colter and Rebecca Crozier Colter who had an older daughter named Harriet (Grattan, 1980:2). According to biographer Arnold Berke (2002), although she was born in Pittsburgh, Colter had always considered St. Paul, Minnesota her home. Her parents had originally immigrated there and the family finally settled in St. Paul when Mary was eleven (Berke, 2002, p. 24 & Grattan, 1980, p. 2).

The same year Colter was born, Harriet Beecher Stowe (1811–1896) and her sister, domestic economist Catherine Beecher (1800 –1878) wrote *The American Woman’s Home* and Civil War General Ulysses S. Grant was inaugurated as the 18th president of the United States (US). On March 1, 1872, the world’s first national park

---

3 William and Rebecca Crozer Colter had originally immigrated to Minnesota because William had relatives in St. Paul. In 1863 their first daughter, Harriet Brierly Colter was born in St. Paul. After Harriet’s birth, Rebecca wanted to move to Pittsburgh, PA to be closer to her relatives when Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter was born on April 4, 1869. The family remained in Pittsburgh until Mary was three years old. While in Pittsburgh, William operated the Hats, Caps and Clothing store where Rebecca was a milliner or hat designer.

4 Biographer Arnold Berke is contributing editor of “Preservation” the magazine for the Historic Preservation organization. In “Mary Colter: Architect of the Southwest” (2002) he writes an in depth study of M.E.J. Colter, her education and as an artist, her teaching years and her historic architecture designs for FH/SF Railway on the Grand Canyon as well as the NRHP hotels La Fonda in Santa Fe, NM and the La Posada in Winslow, AZ.
was established when President Ulysses S. Grant signed legislation creating
Yellowstone Park.\(^5\)

During 1872, William Colter moved his family from Pennsylvania back to St. Paul, then to Texas in 1879 and to Colorado. Finally, in 1880 the Colter family settled permanently in Saint Paul.\(^6\) The city of Saint Paul was prominently situated on the east bank of the Mississippi River that encouraged settlers and the export of local products. As the nation was moving further west, Colter was growing up, obtaining her education and being prepared to become the influential interior designer and architect for one of the country’s largest railroads. By 1880, Minnesota had nearly thirty-one hundred miles of rail line.\(^7\) The early construction of railroads in the state also helped colonize western government lands.

**M.E.J. Colter’s Education Background**

In 1883, Colter graduated from Saint Paul High School (Figure 1-1); in the same year the Northern Pacific Railway was completed from St. Paul to Portland, Oregon allowing easier visitor access to Yellowstone Park (Grattan, 1980).\(^8\) During these years the Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway (AT&SF) had become one of the largest

---

\(^5\) Yellowstone National Park, established by the US Congress and signed into law by President Ulysses S. Grant on March 1, 1872 is a national park located primarily in the state of Wyoming, although it also extends into Montana and Idaho.

\(^6\) In 1880 the city’s population grew from a few hundred to 40,000.


\(^8\) President Chester Arthur and Civil War General U.S. Grant were in St. Paul for ceremonies when the Northern Pacific Railroad was completed.
railroads in the US.\(^9\) Originally chartered in February 1859, the AT&SF Railway system reached the Kansas-Colorado border in 1873 and Pueblo, Colorado in 1876 and was the first rail line to take passengers to the Grand Canyon south rim in 1901 (Bryant, 1974, p. 186). The development of the railroads into the southwest and the early nation’s western parks was a fundamental part of Colter’s career with Fred Harvey and the Santa Fe (FH/SF) Railway partnership.

At an early age, Colter showed artistic talent and a strong desire to pursue a career in art. Art classes were a part of the Minnesota school curriculum and she would have taken courses in clay modeling, object drawing and basket weaving (Grattan, 1980, p. 4). She graduated from St. Paul high school with a well-rounded education, an interest in fine arts and a desire to continue her art education in San Francisco, California. However, her parents felt she was too young, at the age of 14, to go alone to a school so far from home (Berke, 2002 & Grattan, 1980). In 1886 at the age of 17, she became the sole support of her mother, Rebecca and her sickly sister Harriet (six years her senior), when her father, William Colter died at the age of 53 from a blood clot on the brain leaving the family without an income (Grattan, 1980 p. 4). Colter convinced her mother that it was time she had the opportunity to further her art education so that she could teach art and provide for her family.

Taking some “funds left by her father”, she enrolled in the California School of Design (CSD) in 1887, moving her mother and sister to Oakland across the Bay from

---

\(^9\) The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe is often referred to the shortened name of just the Santa Fe. However, since a portion of this dissertation also deals with the city of Santa Fe, New Mexico I have chosen to use AT&SF Railway.
San Francisco (Berke, 2002, p. 28). The school founded in 1874, catered mostly to women. By the time Colter arrived in the San Francisco area, the Arts and Crafts movement was a growing influence in the state although no new American architectural style had developed. However, some architects in southern California followed qualities resembling the Spanish Missions along the California coast that would later become the Mission Revival Style.

During Colter’s art student days in San Francisco, the whole country was in the midst of discovering its own architectural style. Shown in Figure 1-2 is an image of the Mark Hopkins Mansion home of the CSD in San Francisco and typical of the Victorian architecture of the period. During the 1880s, Colter had been exposed to a variety of architectural styles found in the expanding city of Saint Paul, including Victorian Queen Anne, Craftsman Bungalows, Colonial and Tudor Revivals, and the emerging Prairie Style of Chicago architect, Frank Lloyd Wright (1867–1959). Although she was a contemporary of Wright, there is no evidence they ever met. However, Wright’s 1937

---

10 The California School of Design (CSD) developed a national reputation and amassed a significant collection of early California and western fine art for the foundation’s planned museum.

11 The late 19th and early 20th century was a period of architectural transition, marking the entrance into a new era of building. It was the beginning of architectural design with styles not based on previous building forms. Changes in construction techniques, due to skyscraper technology, and a desire for houses that fit into the natural environment influenced west coast developing styles. The English Arts and Crafts movement stressing handcrafted materials and harmony with nature inspired California bungalows. The Movement revived traditional artistic craftsmanship stressing simplicity, function, harmony, and nature promoting moral and social health through quality of architecture and was a revolt against the poor quality of industrialized mass production.

12 An architectural style that drew inspiration from the late 18th and early 19th century Spanish missions built in California.

13 Frank Lloyd Wright (born Frank Lincoln Wright, June 8, 1867 – April 9, 1959) was an American architect, interior designer, writer, and educator, who designed more than 1,000 structures, 532 of which were completed. Taliesin West in AZ and Falling Water in northwestern PA are associated with this well-known architect.
“Taliesin West” winter home in Arizona near Phoenix embodies a site-specific quality that Colter created on Grand Canyon in 1914 with Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio.\textsuperscript{14}

When M.E.J. Colter graduated in 1890 from the four-year program in art and design at the CSD, she was qualified to teach art and drawing (Berke, 2002 & Grattan, 1980). That same year Sophia Hayden (1868-1953) was the first woman to graduate with a degree in architecture (with honors) from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.\textsuperscript{15} Although Colter had apprenticed at a local architect firm, California did not license architects until 1901 when the state established standards as a profession.

In 1902 at the age of 33, she received her first commission as an interior designer for the FHC and continued to work as an architect and designer for the company for 46 years. By incorporating Southwestern culture, history, and an appreciation for archeology into her designs, Colter envisioned site-specific structures creating a sense of place for the early tourism industry. Her job description was as a designer and architect for the FHC.\textsuperscript{16} She was involved in every aspect of her projects for her two employers, the AT&SF Railway and their concessioner, the FHC.\textsuperscript{17} Colter’s talents extended beyond architecture and interiors to designing furnishings and commissioning art work. She even created whimsical metal ashtrays and fireplace

\begin{flushleft}\textsuperscript{14} Taliesin West is a NHL designed by Wright in the desert foothills of the McDowell Mountains outside of Scottsdale, AZ. Today it is the home of the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation and the Frank Lloyd Wright School of Architecture. \\
\textsuperscript{15} Hayden was born in Chile and moved to the United States with her parents when she was six. She was the architect who designed the Women’s Building for the 1892 World’s Columbia Exposition in Chicago, Illinois.\\
\textsuperscript{16} M.E.J. Colter’s own statement located in the Heard Museum Fred Harvey Collection, Phoenix, AZ \\
\textsuperscript{17} Although M.E.J. Colter worked for the FH/SF she received payment from each partner in relation to the project. Her office was with the FHC in Kansas City. Her designs were first approved by FHC then submitted for final approval by the AT&SF whose licensed architects drafted the working drawings.\end{flushleft}
accessories for her settings. In the 1930s, she designed the ‘Mimbreno’ china for the AT&SF Railway “Super Chief” dining cars that is still in use at the El Tovar Hotel dining room.\(^\text{18}\) Her artwork for the china was envisioned from pottery patterns found in New Mexico (NM) prehistoric ruins.\(^\text{19}\)

Because she spent her entire career as a FHC employee (1902–1948), and the AT&SF Railway architects drafted her final structure working drawings, she never had the kind of exposure she could have enjoyed had she been a licensed architect.\(^\text{20}\) Grattan confirmed that (1980, p. 4), “there were only eleven thousand architects in the whole country by 1900.” Following her graduation in 1890 from the CSD art and design program, Colter was qualified to teach mechanical and freehand drawing, but not work as a licensed architect. Although toward the end of her life she would eventually earn her own noteworthy place in American architecture, at the time she graduated her prime concern was to support her family by teaching.

**Teaching Years in St. Paul, MN**

Returning to Minnesota Colter taught drawing and architecture for six months at the Stout Manual Training School in Menomonie, Wisconsin.\(^\text{21}\) By 1892, Colter moved

\(^\text{18}\) Introduced in 1936 during the “golden age” of the AT&SF Railway, this classic dining car china designed by Colter was first used on the “Super Chief”. The original china is sought-after by collectors. A line of authorized reproduction china is available at the El Tovar gift shop and used in their dining room.

\(^\text{19}\) She created thirty-seven different decorations for various pieces of china, inspired by the pottery of the Mimbres Indians that are stylized versions of birds, animals and fish. The china was produced by the Onandaga Pottery Company exclusively for the AT&SF Dining Car from 1936-1971.

\(^\text{20}\) The buildings Colter designed were built and owned by the AT&SF Railway. Based on Colter's floor plans and elevation drawings the AT&SF architects produced construction blueprints and the Railway’s chief architect, E.A. Harrison, usually signed off on her work.

\(^\text{21}\) The University of Wisconsin-Stout traces its history to 1891 when The Stout Manual Training School began educating students in manual training and domestic science. Under the auspices of the Menomonie Public Schools, James Huff Stout funded various educational enterprises. In 1911, following Senator Stout's death, ownership transferred to the State of Wisconsin.
back to her home city of St. Paul to teach free hand drawing, drafting, and architecture for seven years at the all boy Mechanic Arts High School in St. Paul. In her personal obligation as a teacher, she continued her education by taking courses in archaeology and anthropology at the University of Minnesota extension school where she also lectured on world history and architecture (Grattan, 1980, p. 6). She was also a member of the Art Workers’ Guild of St. Paul and participated in various school activities. Arnold Berke reveals that a number of publications indicate Colter’s involvement as one newspaper article in the 1905 Mechanic Arts High School scrapbook states, “Miss M.E.J. Colter has contributed very definitely through her work at Mechanic Arts High School, to the Arts and Crafts development of the city” (2002, p. 33). Mechanic Arts closed in 1976 when several high schools consolidated.

**National Trends and M.E.J. Colter’s Inspirations**

The first transcontinental railroad was finished in 1869, making it feasible to expand industrialization and Euro-American culture to the West coast. The railroads revolutionized many aspects of nineteenth century American culture. When Colter left San Francisco in 1890, the railroads were the largest employer in the country. Women began to be involved in public activities once appropriate only for men. The 1890s also saw an increased in the presence of women in the workplace. M.E.J. Colter was able to succeed as an influential architect and designer within the FH/SF Railway at a time when professional women were still considered unusual and women had not yet acquired the right to vote.\(^\text{22}\)

\(^\text{22}\) The American woman of the 1890s began to participate in society rather than just observe it. The Women’s Christian Temperance Union, founded in the mid-1870s, was the largest association for women and claimed 150,000 members in 1890. The organization fought chiefly for the prohibition of liquor but
By the late 1890s, women began to study painting and creating art objects often exhibiting their work in public (Berke, 2002, p.15). As Colter was studying design, decorating, painting and drawing at CSD (1886-1890), variations of Victorian style mansions and other European inspired buildings covered the San Francisco hills. In the 1882 publication “California Architect and Building News” Harold D. Mitchell states, American architects wanted a new style “governed altogether by the fitness of design…for the purpose for which it is to be erected…for the locality were it is to stand…for the material chosen, not alone as regards to strength and durability, but with respect to color.”

Virginia Grattan states that Colter “shared these convictions and applied them as guiding principles in her designs” (Grattan, 1980, p.5).

In 1894, the architectural partnership of Greene and Greene was established in Pasadena, California. The Greene brothers, Charles Sumner and Henry Mather, began their design approach based on the Arts and Crafts style bungalows better suited to the region (Berke, 2002, p.31). At the same time, M.E.J. Colter was studying at the CSD, she apprenticed with an unknown San Francisco architect firm (Gratten, 1980, p.4 & also addressed issues related to suffrage, labor unions and social hygiene. A note in Keith Bryant, History of the Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railway (New York: Macmillan, 1974)

23 In 1893, Edward F. Searles donated the Hopkins Mansion, one of the most palatial and elaborate Victorian mansions built, to the Mark Hopkins Institute of Art. It became San Francisco's first fine arts and cultural center housing both the California School of Design's campus and the San Francisco Art museum Association's art collection. It was destroyed by fire following the 1906 California earthquake. At the time, the replacement value of the building and its contents was estimated at $2,573,000.


25 Best known for their work on bungalows in southern California, the architect-designers Charles Sumner Greene and Henry Mather Greene were given free control to design their architecture that integrated furnishing, and interiors for wealthy Southern California clients. They developed a distinctive style utilizing principles of Japanese design mixed with the Craftsman style defined by low-pitched gabled roofs with broad eaves, large front porches, and exposed wooden structural elements. Houses were typically 1-1½ stories and of wood construction. Homes designed by Greene & Greene include the impressive historical Gamble House in California. The brothers achieved a high level of quality in their designs.
Berke, 2002, p.29). Colter’s biographer, Arnold Berke (2002, p.30) writes that architect; Bernard Maybeck (1862-1957) was a teacher at CDS and speculates that he might have “instructed Colter” in architecture. However, documentation indicates Colter graduated in 1890 before Maybeck began his connection with the school. However, California architect, Julia Morgan (1872-1957) benefited from working with Maybeck who encouraged her to attend the École des Beaux-Arts in Paris, France.

On the other hand author Berke states, one of Colter’s influential teachers at the school was Arthur Frank Mathews (1860-1945), who was a prominent illustrator, designer and painter. He was a master craftsman and exerted tremendous influence on California art and hundreds of his students. During his years as director, the CSD became famous, not only in this country but in Paris. He was known as a hard taskmaster because of his caustic comments and sarcastic manner. Nevertheless, his classes were noted for their fine draftsmanship although some students felt forced to leave due to his severe criticism. Shown in Figure 1-3, Arnold Berke indicates,

---

27 From Karen Mc Neill, 2007. “Julia Morgan Gender, Architecture, and Professional Style” Morgan was the first woman to attend the famous school in Paris, France.
28 Arthur F. Mathews (1860-1945) was born in Markesan, Wisconsin, and lived there until he was six years old. His father was an architect and moved the family to San Francisco in 1866.
29 Like his brothers Walter and Edgar, Arthur learned architecture from his father; he then studied painting at the CDS, under the influence of Virgil Macey Williams. Arthur studied art in Paris at the Académie Julian from 1885 to 1889, where he was influenced by the academic classicism. Professor Eugene Neuhaus, wrote in his book, The History and Ideals of American Art: that Arthur Mathews’ influence on the art of the west has been far-reaching in that his thorough knowledge of the great traditions of the past has served as a guiding and refining influence in a new civilization where unrestrained vigor and enthusiasm are not always balanced by discretion and retrospection.
30 California Art Research A MICROFICHE EDITION Edited by Gene Hailey Originally published by the Works Progress Administration San Francisco, California 1936-1937
“Mathews grew close to Colter” painting her portrait in 1890. In Figure 1-4, Mathews is shown with his class and M.E.J. Colter near his right. Both images are from Arnold Berke’s biography on Colter (2002, p.29).

Arthur F. Mathews was from a family of architects practicing in Oakland. He was a draftsman for four years with his father prior to his fine art education. Berke states, “(I)t is entirely possible” that Colter may have apprenticed with his father and/or brothers. An enquiry into the history of California architects reveals that Arthur’s older brother, Walter J. Mathews (1850–1947), also trained under his father, Julius, and worked for his father’s firm from 1874–1875. In 1886, Walter started his own practice and worked as the Oakland City architect in the 1890s. His projects were typical of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, including office buildings, hotels, theaters, clubs, commercial buildings, churches, and houses.

Walter J. Mathews was active in the San Francisco area from 1874 to at least 1940. Built in 1890, Figure 1-5 shows a postcard of the First Unitarian Church of Oakland designed by W.J. Mathews in the Romanesque style popularized by East Coast architect Henry Hobson Richardson. Figure 1-6 illustrates the residence of US

---


32 Arthur F. Mathews’ name has entered the literature incorrectly as Arthur Frank Mathews, when in fact his given name was Arthur Francis Mathews. See Arthur Francis Mathews biographical card file, 1914, California Room, California State Library, Sacramento; Mathews himself provided the information.

33 Colter’s 1952 only autobiographical outline is from the Heard Museum archives in Phoenix, AZ that states (she) “studied architecture in an office of San Francisco architects.” Her art teacher and friend at the CSD was Arthur F. Mathews (1860-1945) who came from a family of architects. His father, Julius and two brothers, Walter and Edgar were in the profession.

34 Henry Hobson Richardson (1838 – 1886) His masterpiece is Trinity Church, Boston (1872–77), designated a NHL. He was a prominent American architect who designed buildings in Albany, Boston, Buffalo, Chicago, Pittsburgh, Cincinnati, and other cities. The style he popularized is named for him: Richardsonian Romanesque. Semicircular arches, the use of stone and other rough exterior surfaces, and dynamic interior spaces characterize this architectural genre.
Senator George C. Perkins designed by Walter Mathews. He was also known for being “technically meticulous” with his clients’ designs. One of the traits M.E.J. Colter demonstrated in all her architectural work.\textsuperscript{35} Virginia Grattan also states that, Colter was a perfectionist who knew the effect she wanted to achieve and defended her artistic vision. This new investigation reveals that Colter would have had the opportunity to apprentice in Mathews’ firm.

For a brief period during 1908 and 1909, M.E.J. Colter spent time in Seattle, WA developing the decoration and display department for Frederick and Nelson, a leading department store that grow into a large regional chain (Berke, 2002, p.70).\textsuperscript{36} The store was a retail pioneer offering new ways to sell its merchandise and had recently expanded its operations when Colter was hired. Regrettably, her mother Rebecca passed away requiring Mary and her sister Harriet return to St. Paul and bury yet another parent in the family plot next to their father (Grattan, 1980 & Berke, 2002).

**Alvarado Exhibit for the Fred Harvey Company**

Through an informal contact with the FHC, Colter acquired a commission as interior designer for the “Indian Building” adjoining the AT&SF Railway’s new Alvarado

\textsuperscript{35} A letter from M.E.J. Colter was sent to Edwin McKe (see Appendix B) relating her specifications for the geographical fireplace under construction in the Bright Angle Lodge. (Printed in Grattan,1980, p. 88) During the 1932, construction of the Desert View Watchtower Colter would supervise the stonework. If she was late to the site and work was not to her liking she would make the masons take out their work and redo it to her liking (Grattan, 1980, p.76).

\textsuperscript{36} Frederick & Nelson was Seattle’s premier department store founded by Donald E. Frederick (1860-1937) and Nels B. Nelson (1854-1907). In 1890, they began selling used furniture during the rebuilding of Seattle after the Great Fire of 1889. The business expanded to include home delivery of goods, a tea room, and ready-to-wear men’s and women’s fashions. The owners built a reputation for elegance and customer service. In 1929, Frederick sold his interest in the store to Marshall Field & Co. of Chicago, but he retained ownership of the building. From: Robert Spector. 1990. *More than a Store: Frederick & Nelson, 1890 to 1990.* Bellevue, WA: Documentary Book Publishers Corp.
Hotel in Albuquerque, NM. Although the Mission Revival style had been popular in California since the 1890s, as seen in Figure 1-7 the Alvarado Hotel and its connected “Indian Building” designed in 1902 by Chicago architect, Charles Whittlesey was the first structure of its kind built in NM.

The FHC “anthropologists,” Herman Schweizer and Fred Harvey’s son-in-law, John F. Huckel, bought large numbers of Native American artifacts in bulk and began to encourage native artisans to make new items to “satisfy the enthusiastic demand” the FHC was creating for Native American goods among tourists, private collectors, and eastern museums (Weigle and Babcock, 1996, pp. 67-85). The contributions of women to the success of the Harvey enterprises may have encouraged the FHC to hire a woman who was well versed in Native American culture and their arts and crafts. Miss Alice Steele was employed by the FHC to interview and hire young eastern women for the positions of “Harvey Girls.”

In the early 1900s, being head of personnel for the entire Harvey business was an especially important executive position for a woman. Author Stephen Fried states (2010, p. 262), Alice Steele and M.E.J. Colter were among the highest-ranking women in corporate America. Colter had gained a reputation in the St. Paul area as a person “most informed on Native American culture” (Berke, 2002, p. 35).

---

37 The term “Indian” used in my dissertation for Native American is not intended to suggest any political or cultural belief nor is it politically incorrect. It was used by the FH/SF Railway in their tourist advertising and is used here only as intended for the period. The indigenous people, their culture, and Pueblo architecture are more important as inspiration for M.E.J. Colter’s works.

38 All that remains of the Alvarado today is a historic marker next to the train station.

39 From Stephen Fried, 2010. Appetite for America: Fred Harvey and the Business of Civilizing the Wild West-One Meal at a Time. The “Harvey Girl” image was a revolutionary idea in the restaurant business and became a large part in creating the Harvey House reputation.
There is some indication in the literature that Harvey’s daughter, Minnie Harvey Huckel, was Colter’s mentor and first connection to the company. At the Alvarado part of the arcade between the hotel and the depot was set aside as a museum, as shown in Figure 1-8, for the FHC’s Native American Collection. The Alvarado Hotel designed by Whittlesey was intended to resemble a Pueblo dwelling re-imagined in the Spanish tradition recognizing the dual heritage of the region.

The Hotel (demolished in 1970) was connected to the AT&SF Railway depot by a 200-foot arcade that was built to entice tourists to buy Native American goods (Grattan, 1980, p. 10). Colter was hired to arrange both the “not for sale” archaeological objects in the museum area and in another location arrange sale items, shown in Figure 1-9, “to be made appealing” for the railway travelers to purchase.40 When the Alvarado opened in 1902, Colter’s summer job ended and she returned to teaching in St Paul.

Chapter 3 will examine the partnership of Fred Harvey with the Santa Fe Railway and M.E.J. Colter’s influence on the partnership and concession architecture on Grand Canyon. Over the years, the FH/SF also hired other architects M.E.J. Colter worked with, as well as Whittlesey, who designed both the Alvarado and the El Tovar Hotel at Grand Canyon, AZ (1905); Louis Curtis, designer of El Ortiz in Lamy, NM (1910); and John Gaw Meem (1894 –1983).41 Colter worked with Meem as architect consultant and interior designer for the additions made to the La Fonda Hotel (1929), which FH/SF

40 A system used today at most theme parks where the gift shop is before the exit of an attraction. There is some question as to what photo is of the sales room and/or the museum objects display. (Berke, 1980).

41 John Gaw Meem, an American architect based in Santa Fe, NM, is best known for his role in the development and popularization of the Pueblo Revival style. He is regarded as one of the most important and influential architects in NM. Meem was head of the HABS in NM from 1934 until 1955. He also donated land for St. John’s College in Santa Fe where he served on the Board of Visitors and Governors.
Railway purchased in Santa Fe, NM. Meem’s most significant work during this period was the remodeling of La Fonda that required him to respect the vernacular forms of the original structure while updating the building for contemporary uses. He proved adept at balancing preservation with new design, leading to other work with old buildings in the area. Meem became known as the father of the Santa Fe style of architecture.

**M.E.J. Colter’s First Grand Canyon Architecture**

By 1901, the FH/SF Railway partnership had the financial means and aspiration to expand their tourist facilities to the South Rim of the Grand Canyon. By the time the Railway extended tracks from their hotel at Williams, AZ to the Grand Canyon South Rim, the FHC had developed the commercially profitable tourist-oriented “Indian store” at the Alvarado Hotel. The summer of the following year the FHC offered M.E.J. Colter a commission to design a gift shop devoted to Native American arts and crafts adjoining the new El Tovar Hotel. Charles Whittlesey, the same AT&SF Railway architect of the Alvarado Hotel and “Indian Museum” at Albuquerque, was designing this new hotel. The AT&SF designers were suggesting a Swiss Style chalet “curio shop” fitting the style of

---

42 By 1910, M.E.J. Colter was a permanent employee. She had an unusual working relationship with the Harvey Company who needed its own designer and who could ensure a consistent thematic style and quality befitting the Fred Harvey image. Colter was the interiors designer for all of the FH/SF locations and received her paycheck from both companies.

43 Charles Morse, president of the AT&SF Railway made a deal with Fred Harvey. The two companies began a partnership with only a handshake to seal their agreement. In 1876, Harvey opened his first railroad restaurant in Topeka, Kansas. The AT&SF Railway provided the buildings for the Harvey restaurants where passenger trains would stop twice daily for meals. Harvey hired, trained and supervised all personnel and provided for food and service. The railroad carried all the produce and supplies needed by the Harvey restaurants including transporting the dirty laundry.

44 The Fray Marcos Hotel is located inside the Williams Depot was one of the original Harvey Houses. It was named for Spanish missionary Marcos de Niza, who explored the Southwest in the early 16th century. (The FHC often named its hotels after early explorers.) The hotel and adjoining depot opened to the public in 1908 with 22 guest rooms. In 1925, 21 more rooms were added.
the new hotel. However, Colter preferred to introduce a Native American pueblo style structure appropriate of the Hopi culture.

Finding M.E.J. Colter’s Inspirations

Colter drew inspiration from her ethnographic research of the Hopi culture and her research of Native American ruins across the four corner states of Arizona, New Mexico, Utah and Colorado (Berke, 2002; Colter, 1933; & Gratten, 1980). This new building (Figure 1-10) was to be Colter’s first architectural structure. She chose to design a dwelling similar to those at Old Oraibi (Figure 1-11) located on the Hopi mesa, bringing a pueblo to the Grand Canyon rim.45 As a teacher and designer, Colter wanted her building to reflect the indigenous culture, to educate the visitors, and appear to be a part of the canyon while not distracting from the landscape.

When Colter was growing up in St. Paul, attempts were made to assimilate Native Americans out of existence as separate people. During the early 1800s, the Lakota-Dakota/Sioux and Canadian Ojibwa Native Americans lived in this region.46 Biographer Arnold Berke indicates that, as a child M.E.J. Colter’s “enthusiasm for Indian life was aroused when a relative of her father, John Graham, gave the family a number of “Indian made gifts,” including some 1876 Sioux drawings (Berke, 2002, p. 27). My research has determined that Graham was the US Paymaster at Fort Keogh. Before

45 The village of Old Oraibi, established in 1100 CE, is considered the oldest continuously inhabited Native American settlement in North America. The site of the present-day Old Oraibi is not original location. Oraibi was first established below its present site, at the base of Third Mesa. Old Oraibi is located on top of Third Mesa, just above the town of Kykotsmovi, the tribal government seat.

46 The city of Saint Paul, MN owes its existence to Fort Snelling, the first major US military presence in the state. Construction began in 1819 and was completed in 1825. One of the missions of the fort was to mediate disputes between the Ojibwe and the Dakota tribes. The Territory was formalized in 1849 with Saint Paul named as its capital. In 1858, Minnesota was admitted to the union with Saint Paul becoming the capital of the 32nd state. Men from the East passed through Sioux lands on their way to California gold fields bringing with them smallpox, measles, and other contagious diseases. The native population had no immunity and the diseases eradicated their population by an estimated one-half.
1876, he cared for Sioux prisoners from the Battle of the Little Bighorn who created a number of pictograph drawings of those significant events and Sioux life done in the Plains Ledger Art style.\textsuperscript{47} When prisoners were in jail, they would fill out a sketchbook or ledger with drawings of whatever events came to them.

Following an outbreak of smallpox that occurred among the area Sioux, Rebecca Colter burned the gifts (Grattan, 1980, p. 2). However, Mary hid the drawings under her bed saving them from destruction and keeping them all her life, as they were one of her “most precious possessions” (Grattan, 1980, p. 2).\textsuperscript{48} In later years as a teacher, she used the drawings to tell her students about the Plains Indians and their style art. M.E.J. Colter donated the drawings to the Custer Battlefield National Monument.\textsuperscript{49}

To assure authenticity when constructing Hopi House, the FH/SF Railway hired Hopi builders to construct the structure using the vernacular traditions and materials they would use to build their own homes.\textsuperscript{50} This type of construction requires continual maintenance as shown in Figure 1-13 usually done by the "enjarradora’ or mud women shown in Figure 1-12. Before Native American interactions with the Spanish explorers, adobe techniques were in use in addition to local stone masonry in construction.

\textsuperscript{47} Ledger art is a term for Plains Indian narrative drawing or painting on fabric, animal skins or notebooks brought west by white settlers and the military. The style flourished primarily from the 1860s to the 1920s.

\textsuperscript{48} Grattan, Virginia L. \textit{Mary Colter: Builder Upon the Red Earth}. Grand Canyon, AZ: Grand Canyon Natural History Association, (1980, p.110). M.E.J. Colter donated the drawings to the Custer Battle Field Monument but at the time of her death they were sent to the Eastern Montana College collection. The drawings are now located in the collection at Little Bighorn Battlefield National Monument site of the June 25 and 26, 1876, Battle of the Little Bighorn, near Crow Agency, Montana.

\textsuperscript{49} The Colter’s Collection of thirty-six drawings was donated to the NPS in 1954 and has also been digitized in the Little Bighorn Battlefield National Monument Collection in Montana.

\textsuperscript{50} Grattan, 1980, p. 14
According to Neil Merton Judd (1916), making adobe is an intensive process that first requires mud, sand, and clay to be churned “by the bare feet of a laborer,” while adding straw or grass to increase the tenacity of the mud.  

Being in an open area, the Hopi House at Grand Canyon is subjected to seasonal changes in temperature and wind conditions. Over the last 110 years few changes have been made to the Hopi House exterior although maintaining the original mortar compound is an ongoing process. In 1905, when both Hopi House and the El Tovar Hotel were completed Colter returned to her teaching profession and her life in St Paul.

**Early Grand Canyon Architecture**

In 1980, Virginia L. Grattan's, *Mary Colter, Builder Upon the Red Earth* states that, “Colter's philosophy was that a building should grow out of its setting, embodying the history and flavor of the location. It should belong to its environment as though indigenous to that spot” (Grattan, 1980, p. 59). Colter's designs were not considered until she had thought out its “history” adding to the sense of place. According to Frankeberger and Garrison (2002), adding a themed story line to each of her projects provided an architectural edge that makes her buildings “come alive to the general public today—an edge most architects today do not apply.” She did not copy history but fashioned her environments from their essences (Berke, 2002, p. 10).

The 1974 NPS National Register of Historic Places – Inventory Form for M.E.J. Colter's Buildings describes, “Colter's place in American architecture is important

---


52 Personal contact with David Norton of D.L. Norton, General Contracting of Scottsdale, AZ licensed to work on NRHP and NRHL using the US Sec. of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.
because of the concern for archeology and the sense of history conveyed by her buildings, and the feelings she created in those spaces."  

Her creative free-form buildings of Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio (1914) took direct inspiration from the landscape and served as part of the basis of the developing artistic aesthetic for appropriate development in areas that became national parks. Colter’s architecture shows her sensitivity to the Grand Canyon environment (Kaiser, 1997, p. 226).

Her study of ancient Puebloan architecture is documented in her *Manual for Drivers* (1933). Her typewritten notes accompany her archived research photographs of the ancient ruins in the Southwest indicate an individual well versed in knowledge of their early architecture (GRCA Museum Archives, obtained 12-19-2914). Found in her 1930s archival notes on Mesa Verde, she marveled that: “Circular walls vary so little from true that they might well have been “struck with a compass.” Straight walls are plumb. Where a “battered” wall is planned, the “gradual rake is mechanically exact.”

This page from her research photo album also states, “the upward sweeping curve of

---

53 Eleven of Colter’s buildings are on the NPHP and five have been designated NHRL in “recognition of their exceptional value to the nation.” Unfortunately, many of the railway station hotels and restaurants lost support and did not survive the 20th century due to the emergence of highways and the subsequent increase in auto travel.

54 [http://www.nps.gov/nr/](http://www.nps.gov/nr/) The National Register of Historic Places is the official list of the Nation’s historic places worthy of preservation. Authorized by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, the National Park Service’s National Register of Historic Places is part of a national program to coordinate and support public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect America’s historic and archeological resources.

55 My reference notes are from M.E.J. Colter’s original manuscript first published in 1933 as *Manual for Drivers and Guides, Descriptive of the Indian Watchtower at Desert View and its Relation, Architecturally, to the Prehistoric Ruins of the Southwest*. Grand Canyon National Park, AZ: Fred Harvey Company. In 2015, the Grand Canyon Association has printed a new version of the Manual, with photographs as *Watchtower at Desert View*. 
the Round Tower at Cliff Palace is as subtle as that of a Greek column – regarded by architects as the most perfect line in architecture” (Colter, 1933).

She was welcomed at the Hopi Mesas and had observed the vernacular construction methods and maintenance used by living peoples’ building techniques. The Native American artisans were trained through oral traditions drawing their forms, and symbols appropriate from a very old collective memory. Women were usually involved with working the mortar, a technique that is still practiced in NM today (Rodriguez and Pettus, 1990). Personal contact with Dave Norton, confirms the same mortar mixture is still used when the 100 year plus Hopi House requires maintenance as shown in Figure 1-14.

M.E.J. Colter was often portrayed as being assertive, demanding and sometimes unforgiving. She was a talented and inspired woman in a profession generally dominated by men. In the late 1800s, women who wanted to pursue a profession, or be recognized for their own needs and desires were considered selfish. However, M.E.J. Colter thought of herself as a teacher providing for her family who became an interior designer and architect for the FHC creating a sense of place with her architecture.

Research indicates that Colter studied the ancient builders’ construction methods taking notes and making sketches. Her longtime friend and writer, Frank Waters (1902-1995), describes her as “an incomprehensible woman in pants (who) road horseback through the Four Corners making sketches of prehistoric pueblo ruins, outside...

---

56 MEJ Colter December 1933 typewritten notes from “MESA VERDE – GREEN TABLELAND” located in a photo album in the Grand Canyon Museum Archives.

57 Personal contact with David Norton, Historic Preservation Restoration Contractor of D.L. Norton Contracting, Inc. in Scottsdale, AZ

58 My daunting research into NPS museums has not revealed M.E.J. Colter field notes or sketchbooks.
studying details of construction, the composition of adobes...She had an Irish wit, a tender heart and a caustic tongue."\(^{59}\)

In 1933, M.E.J. Colter wrote in her *Manual for Drivers* that she knew of three hundred “Indian ruins” that dot the Grand Canyon rim (Colter, 1933, p.12). Native tribes discovered, explored, hunted, farmed and lived inside the canyon for over 10,000 years. As early as the 12\(^{th}\) century, the ancestors of the Paiute, Havasupai and Hualapai were hunters, gatherers and sometime planters. Around 1185 CE, ancestral Puebloans developed now known as the Tusayan settlement a few miles from the Grand Canyon Village on the southern edge of the canyon.\(^{60}\) Chapter 5 will continue discussing how the Grand Canyon remains both spiritually and physically important to the Hopi and is a holy place of origin and legends for other Native American groups.

Chapter 4 goes into the importance of Colter’s designs of Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio (1914) that may have led the way to the NPS “rustic” form of architecture and influenced park structures throughout the US in the early 20\(^{th}\) Century. Berke maintains (2002, p. 219), that Colter helped pioneer and reinforce the design approach to “National Park Rustic”...which emphasized simplicity, ruggedness, and the use of natural materials. The FH/SF Railway employed M.E.J. Colter full-time to design her style of architecture in 1914, prior to the formation of the NPS in 1916 and before 1919 when the Grand Canyon become a National Park. According to James Garrison of the AZ State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO for the state of AZ), “The Lookout

\(^{59}\) From Frank Waters. (1950, p. 105). *Masked Gods: Navajo and Pueblo Ceremonialism*. Athens, Ohio: Swallow Hill Press. Written when Colter was still alive, it is one of the best descriptions written of M. E.J. Colter by a friend. Waters also has more to say in this book about her work for FHC.

\(^{60}\) In 1928, Herbert C. Maier acted as museum consultant for the construction of the small cultural museum at the entrance of the ruins.
Studio (Figure 1-14) within Grand Canyon Village definitely set the standard for all park architecture to follow (and) Hermit’s Rest (Figure 1-15), set a separate and higher standard for all of M.E.J. Colter’s own work.” Built into the side of a hill it does not intrude upon the canyon, but sits on the canyon rim in harmony with its environment.

Garrison also states that during the 1920s and 1930s directors Stephen Mather (1918-1922) and Horace M. Albright (1922-1933), employed NPS architects and landscape architects to follow the FH/SF examples when design park buildings, utility structures, roads, trails and other features in other US National Parks (Frankenberg and Garrison, 2002). In 1927, museum architect, Herbert C. Maier, designed the Grand Canyon Yavapai Observation Station. A team of NPS geologists selected the site for the express purpose of observing and understanding Grand Canyon geology. Maier designed this museum following M.E.J. Colter’s 1914 rim style examples to blend the structure into its setting, using indigenous Kaibab limestone and ponderosa pine in its construction. Known today as the Yavapai Geology Museum, it was the first trailside museum constructed by the NPS in a National Park.

My research indicates that during the early years of park architecture Colter’s designs for a private concessioner influenced the NPS architects and their architecture that followed. The Bright Angle Lodge (1935) and surrounding cabin village is defined

---

61 Herbert C. Maier designed structures for the American Association of Museums (AAM) and played a significant role as a consultant in the use of the NPS Rustic style of architecture in western national parks.

62 Grand Canyon is geologically significant because of the thick sequence of ancient rocks that are beautifully preserved and exposed in the walls of the canyon. These rock layers record much of the early geologic history of the North American continent.

63 Herbert C. Maier (1893 –1969) was an American architect and public administrator, most notable as an architect for his work for the AAM at Yosemite and Yellowstone National Parks. Maier designed four trailside museums in Yellowstone, three have survived as NRHL. Maier would later become a NPS architectural consultant and Western Park director.
by the NPS and the NRHP as “National Park Rustic” (Berke, 2002, p.18). Photographic examples of this Grand Canyon Village Plan showing M.E.J. Colter’s architecture on the Grand Canyon is recorded in the NPS 1938, p.72 is Figure 4-15 of *Park and Recreation Structures*, Harvey H. Kaiser’s 1997, *Landmarks in the Landscape: Historic Architecture in the National Parks of the West*, and numerous NPS historical documents.

Chapter 5 concentrates on Colter’s research of the ancient Native American towers and the extensive research done for her final Grand Canyon indigenous inspired structure. The Watchtower at Desert View is an example of Colter’s dedication to the authenticity of the numerous towers she spent months researching to locate the most suitable features of the ancient builders to produce a sense of place with her tower architecture. Colter also utilized the artwork of Fred Kabotie to educate Grand Canyon visitors on Hopi culture. Colter earned the respect of the Hopi people who allowed her to share their religious legends for the “viewer to admire and regard.” In 1933, she was the only white person in attendance when the Hopi blessed her Watchtower.
Figure 1-1. Saint Paul High School was in use from 1883 to 1912. This 1888 postcard image shows a later Annex to the right.

Figure 1-2. California School of Design (CSD) c1890s located in the Mark Hopkins Mansion. An example of the architecture found in San Francisco at the time. The structure was destroyed in the fire that followed the earthquake of 1906.
Figure 1-3. A.F. Mathews portrait of M.E.J. Colter c. 1890 AZ Historical Society, Flagstaff

Figure 1-4. A. F. Mathews (center front) c. 1989 with CSD class California Historical Society – M.E.J. Colter seated to Mathews’ right.
Figure 1-5. Walter J. Mathews architect – First Unitarian Church of Oakland c.1890

Figure 1-6. Walter J. Mathews architect – Oakland residence G.C. Perkins c. 1880s

Figure 1-7. AT&SF Railway architect rendering - Alvarado Hotel and depot including FHC Native American Museum and “Indian Building” Albuquerque, NM
Figure 1-8. Colter’s arrangement of Fred Harvey Indian Department collection in the Alvarado Hotel area c.1905 Image in the New Mexico Historical Society archives

Figure 1-9. Colter’s arrangement of Native American object in the FHC sales room photo c.1905 Image in the New Mexico Historical Society archives
Figure 1-10. M.E.J. Colter - Hopi House at GCNP author’s photo 2012

Figure 1-11. Oraibi Arizona c.1898 Photographer George Wharton James (1858-1923) National Archives Washington, D.C. #4532
Figure 1-12. Edward Curtis collection 1925 plate no. 576 (photogravue, brown ink) “Replastering a Paguate House” Paguate is a census-designated place in Cibola County, NM. The 2010 census population was 421

Figure 1-13. House Restoration, Old Oraibi, Third Mesa, Hopi Nation, AZ Photo: California Historical Society
Figure 1-14. Hopi House 12-17-2014 during historic restoration work author’s photo

Figure 1-15. Colter’s Lookout Studio. A) 1914 Lookout Studio GRCA #09590  
B) 2014 historic restoration author’s photo

Figure 1-16. Colter’s 1914 Hermit’s Rest A) East side view GRCA #107091  
B) West side view GRCA #07514
CHAPTER 2
METHODOLOGY

This dissertation is written from a historic preservation perspective focusing on the decades from the early 1900s to the late 1930s. Three stories intertwine to produce my research topic: The Partnership of the Santa Fe Railway and the Fred Harvey Company, the Grand Canyon National Park South Rim architecture, and the talents of artist, designer and architect, Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter (M.E.J. Colter). The research positions the goals, methodology, and explicit assumptions that identify my research questions, briefly summarizes the existing knowledge on my topic, and discuss the validity for addressing them. Qualitative methodology is best suited to my research. A qualitative approach is expressed as being a descriptive form of research rather than a scientific quantitative approach. By using a historical methodology, I plan to produce evidence no one has pointed out before, thereby adding to the collective understanding of the past development of National Park Rustic architecture. My goal is to tell the story of M.E.J. Colter and to build an argument for her site-specific architecture via what was happening to southwestern architecture, her involvement with the AT&SF Railway and FHC on the Grand Canyon South Rim, and why we should regard Colter’s “Sense of Place” architecture as important to visitors today.

Qualitative Methods

The idea behind qualitative analysis is to understand information gained by systematic research and thorough investigation of circumstances to generate new knowledge for my research questions. Since I am dealing with historical data to obtain

---

1 Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter is often referred to as Mary Jane Colter in most books and journal articles. In some cases her last name is misspelled as Colton adding to the confusion with Mary-Russell Ferrell Colton who with her husband, Dr. Harold Sellers Colton, founded the Museum of Northern Arizona (MNA) in Flagstaff. To keep from adding to that confusion I will address Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter as M.E.J. Colter as she preferred to sign her name.
information about incidents and people in the past, my research describes, analyses and interprets events that have already taken place and how they relate to the present. Such historical research lends itself to case studies that do not fit into particular theories. In such a qualitative study, the “research design should be a reflexive process operating through every stage of a project” (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1995, p. 24).

Historical research preference is given to primary sources rather than secondary resources. The reason being is that information transferred from one source to another may be inadvertently or deliberately distorted (Welman, Kruger, and Mitchell, 2005). The “primary sources” refer to a direct source of information or original documents that provide the bases for everything that is already known about the topic from the past.

Prime sources are M.E.J. Colter’s (1933) *Manual for Drivers and Guides: Description of the Indian Watchtower at Desert View and its relation, architecturally, to the Prehistoric Ruins of the Southwest* and her personal research documents located in the Grand Canyon National Park Museum archives. Writings relating to Colter’s buildings as well as the Desert View Watchtower, National Park Service (NPS) documents including National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) nominations for historic park structures are also among reliable “primary sources” for research.

The two biographies by Virginia L. Gratten, (1980) *Mary Colter: Builder upon the Red Earth*, and Arnold Berke, (2002) *Mary Colter: Architect of the Southwest*, are very important books on her life and work.² Other books relating to the AT&SF Railway and the FHC have been scrutinized for valid information regarding M.E.J. Colter. These and

---

² After M.E.J. Colter’s death in 1958, her collection of personal books was given to the Grand Canyon Library, which was destroyed in a fire. In 1963 early records for the Fred Harvey Company in Kansas City, MO were also destroyed by fire. Following the 1906 San Francisco earthquake, M.E.J. Colter’s education information was destroyed when a fire demolished the Mark Hopkins Institute of Art building, containing the CSD facilities, records and art collection.
other “secondary sources” refer to scholarly writings that used primary documents to interpret that past. However, some sources needed to be evaluated and compared in order to confirm the facts.

**Research Questions**

My research answers several questions that define the phenomena of M.E.J. Colter, her architectural style used at GCNP and how that architecture defines a sense of place to visitors today. Therefore, a number of questions should be answered, such as: How did M.E.J. Colter’s visionary designs from 1914 reflect the 1920s through late 1930s NPS “Rustic” architecture? What characteristics of Colter’s style of architecture influenced early NPS architects? What quality of Colter’s architecture contributes to tourism at Grand Canyon? Why are her buildings important to Grand Canyon Sense of Place today?

**Historical Research**

Historical research employs all published and documentary sources of known or presumed relevance, interviews of knowledgeable persons regardless of location, and thoroughly analyzes and presents findings from all information gathered by direct and indirect significance. As with any historical study, this research was limited to the archival material available, placing limitations on the extent of the study. Therefore, my investigation examines the work of specific NPS architects and park structures during the 1920s and 1930s through scholarly journals, books, photographs, archival collections and historical NPS documents to compare architectural style, park settings, dates of construction, and how M.E.J. Colter is positioned within the history of the NPS “Rustic” architecture.
Other research materials used in this investigation consist of historic building structure reports, NPS studies and narratives, documented maps, and the Grand Canyon National Park museum archive records. The resources generally cover past happenings or are preserved in archival collections that were located and evaluated. However, the “past” needs to include the recent past as well in order to determine the status of M.E.J. Colter’s structures today. My study has properly documents the NPS sources and assumes that they are reliable.

An archeological study related to ancient Native American architectural techniques include analysis of all prehistoric architectural features associated with M.E.J. Colter’s destructive research and her written documents for the design of the Desert View Watchtower. This includes analyses of specific NPS archeological sites recorded in archeological project reports, historic structure reports, and the cultural landscapes in NRHP nomination forms and NPS cultural landscape reports. Ethnographic studies were done to collect empirical data that includes interviews with living Hopi and Navajo individuals. NPS sites were visited and accessible documents and materials were analyzed to demand what should remain confidential or of sensitive information to the Hopi culture.

Creating the Case Study

In his 2003 book, *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, Robert K. Yin indicates that case studies are appropriate when there is a unique or interesting story to be told. A case study also defines an investigation of a specific individual or a specific context. My research was done using a combination of what has been found in the literature, archival photographs, unstructured interviews, and my direct observation of
National Park architecture. M.E.J. Colter (an individual) is the primary focus of my research to identify her position as a woman in the early years of park architecture.

By creating a case study that compares the interpretive trailside museum architecture of Herbert C. Maier located at Grand Canyon National Park (1928) and Yellowstone National Park (during the 1920’s) with Colter’s 1914 Lookout Studio and Hermit’s Rest is an essential part of my research. The documented evidence suggests that M.E.J. Colter was significant in the development of NPS “Rustic” architecture in the US between 1920 and the late 1930s.

The literature implies that Maier was inspired by Colter’s 1914 site-specific Grand Canyon structures when he designed the 1928 geological trailside museum at Yavapai Point on Grand Canyon. In the late 1920s, NRHP nomination forms for Maier’s museum designs at Yellowstone National Park were unlike the park structures he had done before. Maier designed the first park museum at Yosemite in 1924, in the newly emerging NPS Rustic Style. It was the first building constructed as a museum in the National Park system and served as the home of educational initiatives that served as models for parks nationwide.

**Research Design Defined**

According to Yin (1994, p.19) “Every type of empirical research has an implicit, if not explicit, research design.” The design plan is to ensure that my research method is sufficient to obtain valid, objective and accurate answers to the presented research.

---

3 Maier’s Yavapai Point design has been altered from the original and is not eligible for NRHP listing.

4 From the NRHP nomination related to three American Association of Museums Yellowstone National Park Trailside museums designed by Herbert C. Maier in the late 1920s.

5 A partnership between NPS, the AAM and the Laura Spelman Rockefeller Foundation formed to construct this building then went on to construct museums in Yellowstone and at Grand Canyon.
questions. The major steps are to collect and analysis relevant data from the primary research materials.

I have applied the NPS Research Standards as defined in NPS-28 Chapter 2 found in a “Cultural Resource Management Guideline” published by the NPS. The “research selects primary published and documentary sources of known or presumed relevance that promise expeditious extraction of relevant data, interviewing all knowledgeable people who are readily available, and presenting findings in no greater detail than required.” On site trips were made to Grand Canyon involving both documentary research and field investigation, interviews arranged with park and concession employees to determine and describe the integrity, authenticity, associative values, and significance of M. E. J. Colter’s architecture.

The first step is the Data Collection obtained from the “collected works.” A literature review reflects careful investigation of all significant, relevant sources and show how previous materials relate to each other and to my research study. Other information collected comes from numerous sources including journals, NPS documents, quality academic journals, and current knowledge obtained through personal e-mails and interviews. Research materials acquired from the Grand Canyon Museum Archives includes additional structure reports, NPS studies and maps, archival drawings and photographs.

The second step is to analyze the information obtained. This objective is conditional and only fully known following the successful completion of the existing information discovered. I have found this to be an ongoing process as “existing information” continues to turn up.
Literature Review

A review of the literature provides a solid historical background for my dissertation research. For the qualitative research for this section of my dissertation, I have obtained information from books, journals, dissertations, newspapers and magazines (including the AT&SF Railway’s corporate magazine). Since this is a historical study, the research is limited to the archival material available placing limits on the scope of the study. For example, there is a lack of early corporate letters of the FHC due to a fire at the Company’s Kansas City headquarters. Documentation of Colter’s San Francisco education at CSD was destroyed in the fire following the city’s 1906 devastating earthquake. Early M.E.J. Colter field notes and drawings before the 1930s have proved impossible to locate. She never gave an interview or wrote a diary. Some Colter related letters are found in the Grand Canyon Museum Archives, Mesa Verde National Park collection, and in NPS collections at Harper’s Ferry. In 1948, Colter’s two-page bio listed her position as “retired Architect-Designer with Fred Harvey.”

The majority of the literature studied is the most significant published information involving the FH/SF Railway while M.E.J. Colter was designing interiors and concession structures on the Grand Canyon (1904-1933) and before 1919 when the Forest Preserve became a national park. Chapter 3 provides substantiation that the FH/SF Railway partnership contributed to the cultural setting provided by the Railway System in the development of the Southwest. Extensive research into National Park documents

---

6 The earthquake ignited fires around the city burning for three days and destroying nearly 500 city blocks. The earthquake and fires killed approximately 3,000 people and leaving 200,000 city residents homeless.

7 M.E.J. Colter’s statement not dated – Her own typed two-page personal biographic information relates to important life events and work with the FHC. Located in The Heard Museum archival collection located in Phoenix, AZ
and National Register nominations indicate that prior to the Organic Act of 1916 and the establishment of the NPS, the Grand Canyon FHC concession architecture designed by M.E.J. Colter influenced NPS architects and their early park architecture.\footnote{NPS Rustic Architecture 1916-1942 \url{https://www.nps.gov/parkhistory/} At a time when landscape architecture was beginning to exert major influence...one of the first new structures was the Lookout Studio (1914), designed by M. E. J. Colter.}

In a 2011 dissertation, “Necessary Guidance: The Fred Harvey Company Presents the Southwest” submitted to the Graduate College of History at the University of Minnesota, Marisa Brandt produced a list of scholarly resources contributing to my literature list. She referenced literature on tourism, advertising, and the West to trace the significance of the FH/SF Railway advertising to the development of the Southwest as a tourist destination.

Keith L. Bryant’s 1974 \textit{History of the Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railway} offers a complete story of the Railway’s growth and relates to the merger of railroads that later became just the Santa Fe Railway that played a major role in the development of the American West. Although, Bryant’s book offers a balance between academic prose and readability and is the most accessible book about the development of the southwest by the AT&SF Railway, I found two discrepancies regarding M.E.J. Colter making me question the accuracy of the volume as a whole.\footnote{From Keith L. Bryant, Jr. (1974) \textit{History of the Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railway} pages 119-120 Bryant gives credit to Mary E.J. Colter for the design of the massive “adobe” Alvarado Hotel that was designed by Santa Fe Railway architect, Charles Whittlesley. See Stephen Fried (2010, p. 174) \textit{Appetite for America} for correct information. Also from \textit{History of the Atchison, Topeka, and Santa Fe Railway} page 341, Bryant misspells her last name as Coulter when describing her “Indian” motif china design for the FH/SF Super Chief dining cars. In a 1975 Business History Review Abro Martin, associate professor of History at The American University, Washington: DC reviews Bryant saying, he “did not make a comprehensive study of Santa Fe archives. There are some errors in this book that should have been caught along the way.”}
Reviewers clam that one of the strongest academic submissions dealing with the FHC is *The Great Southwest of the Fred Harvey Company and the Santa Fe Railway*, edited by Marta Weigle and Barbara A. Babcock (1996). This book represents well researched anthropological and folklore scholarship with articles first appearing as part of an accompanying publication related to a seminar at the Heard Museum in Phoenix, AZ for an exhibit: “Inventing the Southwest: The Fred Harvey Company and Native American Art.” The essays are on research relating to the Fred Harvey Fine Arts Collection and the Harvey Indian Department's interactions with Native Americans and tourists. The book’s essays make up three segments - "The Fred Harvey Company and the Santa Fe Railway," "Traders and Collectors," and "The Fred Harvey Company and the Native Southwest" and examine various aspects of different time periods relating to the FHC and the AT&SF Railway.

Another 1996 book by Kathleen L. Howard and Diana F. Pardue related to the Heard Museum exhibit portrays the work of Native American artists and how their communities were transformed by the FHC as it bought, sold, and popularized their arts and crafts. The Harvey collection reveals how contact of Native peoples with modern corporate enterprise generated a series of commercial myths. This volume also describes the Harvey Indian Department's relationship with US museums.

James David Henderson's article, “Meals by Fred Harvey: A Phenomenon of the American West” accepts much of the Harvey legend as fact although he relies heavily on Harvey press releases. Henderson’s, 1966 study was the first published monograph

---

10 At the turn of the 20th century, many were convinced that native cultures would not survive the influx of settlers and industrial changes the railroads were bringing to the southwest.
to focus on the Fred Harvey Company’s history. His short journal article deals mainly with the early entrepreneur ship of Fred Harvey and his Harvey Houses.

Chapter 4 is devoted to the architectural development of national parks obtained from NPS documents and related books on National Park architecture going into greater detail regarding the work of the NPS architects and the landscape architecture. Those contributing to early park architecture and controlling the initial park development were Charles P. Punchard Jr. (1918-1920), Daniel Ray Hull (1920-1927) and Thomas C. Vint (1922-1961), along with Herbert C. Maier, the AAM trailside museum architect (1921-1928) and a NPS administrator (1933-1962). These NPS visionaries helped oversee the initial development of parks and establish the 1916 style known as NPS Rustic, occasionally called “Parkitecture” (Frankenberg & Garrison, 2002).

In 1921 at MVNP, the newly appointed Superintendent, archeologist and photographer, Jesse Logan Nusbaum and his wife Aileen designed the director’s facility and museum in the architectural style of the ancient Native American ruins found in the area (Frankenberg and Garrison, 2002).

---

11 Items have appeared in “Hospitality Magazine” a publication for the Restaurant and Hotel professionals.

12 NPS literature indicates that Herbert C. Maier respecting “Mary Jane Colter’s rim style” design. From the 1917 US Forest Service plan proposing the South Rim village complex at Grand Canyon, “no structure should be built without M.E.J. Colter’s approval.”

13 NPS prefers Rustic to “Parkitecture” by way of email from J. Garrison AZ SHPO

14 Jesse L. Nusbaum became superintendent of Mesa Verde National Park (MVNP) on May 21,1921. The NHR Landmark nomination for the Mesa Verde Administrative District are the superintendent’s residence, the post office, the park headquarters building, the old community building (now the ranger station), the museum, and the ranger club (now the park library). Following M.E.J. Colter’s example, all of MVNP Nusbaum era buildings of the 1920s were constructed in the pueblo style and many of the details of these structures are derived from prehistoric sources rather than historic ones.
The Bright Angle Lodge (1935) and surrounding cabin village is defined as "National Park Rustic" (Berke, 2002, p. 18). Early 1930s photographic examples of the Grand Canyon Village showing M.E.J. Colter's architecture and Plan on the South Rim, shown in Figure 4-15, is acknowledged in Albert Good's NPS 1938, Park and Recreation Structures, Harvey H. Kaiser's 1997, Landmarks in the Landscape: Historic Architecture in the National Parks of the West, and NPS historical documents and scholarly journals.\(^\text{15}\)

In 1980, Virginia L. Grattan wrote the first biography, *Mary Colter, Builder Upon the Red Earth*, currently found in a new edition on the shelves of the Grand Canyon Association's stores. She states that, "Colter's philosophy was that a building should grow out of its setting, embodying the history and flavor of the location. It should belong to its environment as though indigenous to that spot" (Grattan, 1980, p. 59). Confirmed in both Berke and Grattan, M.E.J. Colter's designs for the FH/SF were "not visualized" until she had researched the area's history and culture contributing to a sense of place her buildings convey. The information in Appendix A lists by year all the properties M.E.J. Colter worked on and/or designed and those demolished indicating only a few examples of her buildings exist outside of Grand Canyon.\(^\text{16}\) All of her remaining structures are listed on the NPS National Register of Historic Places (NRHP).

Arnold Berke's biography of M.E.J. Colter contains color photographs of Grand Canyon by Alexander Vertikoff as well as archival black and white images. Berke is a retired senior editor of "Preservation" the journal of the National Trust for Historic

\(^{15}\) Cited in numerous NRHP nomination forms, NPS publications, various journal publications, and American University dissertations.

\(^{16}\) The information for Appendix A was taken from Virginia Grattan (1980, p. 125).
Preservation and an authority on M.E.J. Colter. He maintains that, “Hermit’s Rest (1914)
was Colter’s most original design…her first essay in her unique style and firmly
demonstrates her skill in architectural design and site planning.”

He also contends that Colter deserves status as a “pioneer practitioner of the
architecture that came to be known as National Park Service rustic,” a method that
would dominate construction in US parks until the early 1940s (Berke, 2002, p. 117).
Berke’s biography is more descriptive and a correct research study of Colter’s work
from 1902 – 1954 with FH/SF Railway than Keith L. Bryant, Jr. (1974).\(^\text{17}\)

During the 1920s and 1930s the first NPS directors Stephen Mather (1918-1922)
followed by Horace M. Albright (1922-1933), employed architects and landscape
architects to design buildings, structures, roads, trails and other features in the US
National Parks that followed Grand Canyon examples. According to James Garrison of
the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), “Lookout Studio definitely set the
standard for all park architecture to follow. Hermit’s Rest set a separate and higher
standard for all of Colter’s own work” (Frankenberg & Garrison, 2002).\(^\text{18}\)

Colter’s early Grand Canyon architecture helped pioneer and reinforce the
approach to the design known as “National Park Rustic”…that emphasized simplicity,
and Linda McClelland (1993) both state that Colter was a contributor to this period of

\(^\text{17}\) From Arnold Berke (2002, p. 18) Colter’s works were to have a special influence on architecture within
the national parks, the growth of which paralleled the rise of the American travel industry. See footnote on

\(^\text{18}\) “From Robert. Frankeberger and James Garrison. “Rustic Romanticism to Modernism, and Beyond:
Architectural Resources in the National Parks”, Forum Journal. Summer, 2002: 8-21. This statement was
reaffirmed in my personal conversations with Garrison.
NPS architecture. As noted, by NPS Historical Architect, Merrill Ann Wilson," rustic" was a function of its time.

This little noticed movement in American architecture was a natural outgrowth of a new romanticism about nature and our country’s western frontiers. The conservation ethic slowly took hold in this atmosphere of romanticism. Part of this ethic fostered the development of a unique architectural style. Perhaps for the first time in the history of American architecture, a building became an accessory to nature. Early pioneer and regional building techniques were revived because it was thought that a structure employing native materials blended best with the environment. No [other] single government agency has to date been responsible for such a revolutionary break in architectural form.

The NPS *Park and Recreation Structures* (1938) a single volume was originally published in 1935 as a three-part guide *Park Structures and Facilities* for producing all US park architecture. The three-volume survey used over 500 illustrations, measured drawings and photographs as examples of America’s park structures, and was directed by Albert C. Good in his Washington NPS office and Herbert C. Maier, as NPS director of the Rocky Mountain District in Colorado. Maier selected the photographs and Good was the consultant for the National Park Service when both books were originally published. The evaluation of the single volume in text, photographs and examples of building drawings reference all types of park architectural projects in states across the country, along with Nation Parks. In the 1930s and 1940s, many NPS structures were constructed under the supervision of Good and/or Maier. Although no credit is given to any architect, in the section on “Lodges” two pages are devoted to plans and photos of M.E.J. Colter’s Bright Angle Lodge and Cabins (Good, 1938, p. 54-55).

Michael Anderson is the Grand Canyon historian and the author of several Grand Canyon histories, published by Grand Canyon Association (GCA). His books include;

---

19 http://npshistory.com/publications/park_structures_facilities/ack.htm
Living at the Edge: Explorers, Exploiters and Settlers of the Grand Canyon Region, (1998); Polishing the Jewel: An Administrative History of Grand Canyon National Park, (2000); and Along the Rim: A Guide to Grand Canyon’s South Rim from Hermits Rest to Desert View (2001), and are the best resources for early Grand Canyon History that includes Grand Canyon museum archival photographs, and where to find the locations of the rustic architecture on the canyon south rim. In 2002, Anderson was project director for Grand Canyon’s first history symposium from which he compiled and edited the proceedings for publication by GCHA, entitled A Gathering of Grand Canyon Historians, published November 2005. One of the proceeding’s chapters focused on Grand Canyon architect, M.E.J. Colter.20

Numerous trade and university press books have dealt with the history, policies, and scenery of the NPS nevertheless, just a few have focused exclusively on the built environment and landscape architecture. Two of these, Linda Flint McClelland’s (1993) Presenting Nature: The Historic Landscape Design of the National Park Service 1916-1942 and Ethan Carr’s (1998) Wilderness by Design: Landscape Architecture and the National Park Service, originated within the Park Service.21 The third is by Harvey H. Kaiser (1997) Landmarks in the Landscape: Historic Architecture in the National Parks of the West financed by a grant from the National Endowment for the Arts. The texts

---

20 David C. Frauman Chapter Eight: “Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter, Grand Canyon Architect: Stories in Stone” pgs. 43-47

21 Linda McClelland Presenting Nature: The Historic Landscape Design of the National Park Service, 1916-1942. Her research was first published in 1993 by the Government Printing Office in an abbreviated format and under this title. McClelland is well grounded in her field, displaying knowledge gained as senior historian for the NRHP. Ethan Carr is PhD, FASLA, associate professor of landscape architecture at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. He is a landscape historian and preservationist specializing in public landscapes, particularly municipal and national park planning and design.
and photographs of these three books often overlap. However, the authors approach their subjects from different angles.

NPS historian McClelland writes that early NPS design ethic spurred a growing appreciation for the use of native materials for construction and for naturalistic plantings. Her book is an explanation of the transformation of landscapes into parks and areas into places. She maintains this ethic of design was referred to as “rustic” using the treatment of the natural features of the landscape for the style of structures and buildings “drawing heavily on the nineteenth-century naturalistic tradition of landscape gardening on private grounds and urban parks that valued scenic views, variations in topography, and natural features.” McClelland confirms Mary Colter was “skilled in architecture, landscape design and decorative arts…Colter was the quintessential practitioner of the Arts and Crafts movement” (Berke, 2002, p. 17).22

Landmarks in the Landscape: Historic Architecture in the National Parks of the West (Chronicle Books: San Francisco, CA, 1997) is a large “coffee table” book by author Harvey H. Kaiser, including his photographs of the “built environment” as they fit within the “natural environment” of the park system. However, this is not just a “picture book” as Kaiser spends a lot of time relating the history of each park and the structures known as “National Park Rustic” architecture in both text and photos.23

---


23 Harvey H. Kaiser is the President and founder of Harvey H. Kaiser Associates, Inc. (HHK), a consulting firm providing services in architecture, urban planning, and facilities management. He served for more than twenty years as a higher education administrator at Syracuse University, as a Senior Vice President and University Architect and as Associate Professor in the School of Architecture and Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs. He is the author of many books, including Great Camps of the Adirondacks and Landmarks in the Landscape.
Kaiser relies heavily on NPS materials for his study as he highlights the most important buildings in each park with his photographs to identify the various sites. He enables his reader to understand what a particular structure is, who built it, for whom; and why it looks the way it does. Devoting his first chapter to “A Sense of Place,” Kaiser examines the preservation history of the late 1800s that protected natural resources by the promotion of the Federal Forest Reserve Act of 1891.24

In *Wilderness by Design: Landscape Architecture & the National Park Service* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press), Ethan Carr (1998) was given the assignment to develop an analysis of the design and cultural significance of the built environment to the NPS landscape architecture known as the “National Historic Landmark Theme Study.” He points out that until universities began setting up landscape programs at the turn of the 20th century, the early office of Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr in Brookline, Massachusetts, was the main training ground for landscape architects in this country. Carr discusses the developments outside the National Park System as well as within including architecture in four state parks.25

Both Carr and Kaiser go into detail regarding M.E.J. Colter’s contribution to Grand Canyon architecture and the design of the Grand Canyon Village. Kaiser devotes four pages to Colter’s architecture (with his color photographs) including her site plan of the Bright Angle Lodge “designed as a small village of cabins centered around a rustic one-story main lodge…skillfully incorporating historic structures (that) was unusual for

---

24 The Forest Reserve Act of 1891 was signed into law by President Benjamin Harrison. In 1905, those reserves became the charge of the Bureau of Forestry, renamed the US Forest Service. The purpose of the Act was to monitor the overall health of forests in the US, the first time the federal government took an active role in making some forests off-limits for logging and other uses.

25 Ethan Carr, PhD, FASLA, is an associate professor of landscape architecture at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. He is a landscape historian and preservationist specializing in public landscapes, particularly municipal and park planning and design and is former staff historian for the NPS.
national parks” (Kaiser, 1997, p. 222). This site plan included in both Carr and Kaiser is valuable to this study as it is the same unidentified design plan included in the NPS 1938 *Park and Recreation Structures* as shown in Figure 4-15.

In comparing these three sources, McClelland’s book is the most comprehensive, Kaiser’s the most picturesque, and Carr’s is the most probing, although at times it is difficult to grasp Carr’s narrative line. Nevertheless, each volume falls short of an in-depth evaluation of the achievements of the AT&SF Railway, the FHC and the site-specific architecture of M.E.J. Colter. Ethan Curr does more to discuss some details of Herbert C. Maire’s museum architect and referring to M.E.J. Colter’s 1914 architectural details she used while developing the Grand Canyon “rim zone.” Together the three books are excellent resource for understanding the early physical development of the built environment in the park system following the Organic Act of 1916.26

**Analyzing the Information**

M.E.J. Colter’s works had gone virtually unnoticed until Virginia Grattan’s 1980 biography, partly because she was a female architect working within two large companies and the remoteness of her architecture. Using forms from native cultures to draw ‘Easterners’ to Grand Canyon she created tourist enticing Sense of Place commercial building for the FH/SF partnership. Following the nominated of her Grand Canyon architecture in 1985 to the NRHP, Colter’s position in architectural history became recognized as significant.

---

26 The Act was signed into law on August 25, 1916, by President Woodrow Wilson, and is located in Title 16 of the US Code – that states: Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives of the US of America in Congress assembled, That there is hereby created in the Department of the Interior a service to be called the NPS. Rep. William Kent (I) of California and Sen. Reed Smoot (R) of Utah sponsored the act. First NPS Director Stephen Mather was in charge of supervising and maintaining all designated national parks, battlefields, historic places, and monuments.
Prior to the establishment of the NPS, private individuals, the railroads, their concessioners, and the US army constructed buildings in the nation’s parks. These early post-settlement structures were often built for necessity without concern for the park’s natural surroundings. During this era, some railroad architects designed buildings that resembled European and eastern US Adirondack architecture styles. Later NPS landscape architects allowed the environment to influence their projects.

The literature indicates that M.E.J. Colter's architecture of Hopi House (1905), Lookout Studio and Hermit's Rest (1914), Phantom Ranch (1921), Desert View Watchtower (1932) and Bright Angel Lodge (1933-1935), would have substantial influence on the design of US national and state park structures for more than two decades. Commissioned in 1904 to design her first structure on the Grand Canyon south rim, the historic 1899 Hopi Village of Old Oraibi was her inspiration. The FH/SF hired Hopi builders to construct the authentic “Hopi House” gift shop in the Hopi vernacular architectural tradition.

The literature states that the first national park landscape engineers, Charles Punchard and Daniel Hull, both met with M.E.J. Colter on several occasions. The US Forest Service recognized the architectural precedent set by the FH/SF Railway with the El Tovar Hotel (1905), and the AT&SF Depot (1909). Colter’s Hopi House (1905), Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio (1914) also established as an architectural theme that was followed by the NPS after 1919 in the development of the first NPS buildings at Grand Canyon National Park.27

27 Design plans created by the Forest Service in 1916 indicates that the newly formed NPS planned to follow the Grand Canyon Village plan designed with the aid of M.E.J. Colter working for the Santa Fe Railway and their concessioner, the Fred Harvey Company. These fragile historic documents are located in the Grand Canyon Museum archives as digital copies.
Chapter 5 concentrates on Colter’s research of the prehistoric Native American architecture in the Southwest for her Grand Canyon structure producing a Sense of Place with her designs of Hopi House and the Desert View Watchtower. Colter was designing her exceptional style of architecture while employed by the independent partnership of the FH/SF Railway. Nevertheless, she was not recognized outside of the US Forest Service and the FH/SF organization for her contribution to Grand Canyon architecture prior to 1919 when the canyon became a National Park.28

The Watchtower at Desert View is an example of Colter’s dedication to the numerous towers that she spent many months researching to locate the most characteristic features of the ancient Native builders. As a teacher, Colter employed the “native voice” of Fred Kabotie’s artwork to educate Grand Canyon visitors on the Hopi culture. As a woman, she earned the respect of the Hopi people in order to share their religious legends with the tower visitors. In 1933, she was the only white person in attendance when the Hopi elders blessed her Watchtower.29

Conversations with members of the Hopi and Navajo today are essential to my research as the “native voice” is important to a Sense of Place at Grand Canyon. Some conversations are with decedents of Hopi who were involved with Colter’s architecture and in some way worked for FHC. In some instances it has been necessary to gain the trust of these individuals before beginning an in depth conversation. While others are more willing to be involved in getting the story of their culture correct.

28 Pres. Theodore Roosevelt set aside 1,279 square miles as Grand Canyon National Monument/Grand Canyon Game Reserve (ca. 1906-10). The US Forest Service managed the monument from 1908 until 1919 when it became a National Park.

29 “De-Ki-Veh” (1933, September 13). Program for blessing of the kiva at the Desert View Watchtower, Grand Canyon. Phoenix, AZ: Heard Collection
CHAPTER 3
THE FRED HARVEY COMPANY

This Chapter deals with: the Fred Harvey Company (1887-1968), the formation of a partnership with the AT&SF Railway as their concessioner, the site of the Grand Canyon South Rim, and the talents of artist, designer and architect, M.E.J. Colter. The FHC and the AT&SF Railway organized during a historical period. It was a time when the railroads, eastern travelers and the indigenous communities of the Southwest were all associated elements in a relationship that would continue for three-quarters of a century.

The development of railroads into the West following the American Civil War years helped the city of Saint Paul, MN grow beyond the original settlements established around the Mississippi River steamboat landings where the Colter family home was located when M.E.J. Colter lived while growing up.¹ When she left San Francisco following her graduation from the CSD in 1890, the railroads were the largest employer in the country. However, it would be almost 18 years before Colter's talents would become involved with the FH/SF Railway alliance.

Who was Fred Harvey?

The story begins with Frederick Henry Harvey (1835-1901) who partnered with one of America’s largest railroads, the AT&SF Railway, and how his family business became the great refining force of the American West.² From the 1870s through the

¹ The American Civil War (1861-1865) or the ‘War Between the States’ contributed to the development of the railroads. It was the first war in which railroads were a major factor. By 1861, 22,000 miles of track had been laid in the Northern states and 9,500 miles in the South.

² In 1859 chartered in Kansas as the Atchison & Topeka Railroad Company they built a rail line from Topeka, KA, to Santa Fe, NM, and then to Gulf of Mexico. In 1863, the railroad changed its name to the AT&SF Railroad. Also known as the Santa Fe Railway, by the late 1890s they had nearly 9,000 miles of track connecting Chicago and Los Angeles, becoming one of the world’s longest railroad systems.
1940s, the Harvey system was known for dramatically raising standards wherever they arrived, because of Harvey's commitment to perfect service, excellent food and high quality accommodations. Stephen Fried (2010, p. xvii) considers Fred Harvey the founding father of the food service industry and the first widely known brand name in America.

Who was Fred Harvey? In the early 1880s the AT&SF Railway with the name Fred Harvey was notably responsible for tourism to the western US. The Fred Harvey House eating establishments and hotels were along the Railway from Chicago to Los Angeles. Some like La Fonda in Santa Fe, NM were built away from the railroad tracks while the El Tovar Hotel with interior designs by M.E.J. Colter and her historic Bright Angel Lodge are situated on the South Rim in Grand Canyon National Park (GCNP).

On the 27 of June 1835, Fred Harvey was born in London, England. Documents indicate young Frederick Henry Harvey was baptized in the Church of England at St. Martin's in the Fields in London, and the early years of his life was apparently spent in London. His father; Charles Harvey a Soho tailor, was declared "insolvent" when Fred was eight years old, however; there is no mention of the circumstances for his father's indebtedness. According to Stephen Fried (2010, p. 3) Charles was married to Helen Manning Harvey, who may have been of Scotch descent. Fried states, they also had two daughters and "if Charles was an attentive parent is open to speculation." Listed in

---

the 1851 British census, Fred was living with his Aunt Mary who had a stable income. In
1853 hoping to avoid service in the British army, he immigrated to the United States.

_In Appetite for America: Fred Harvey and the Business of Civilizing the Wild West—One Meal at a Time_ author Stephen Fried states that young Harvey acquired an early education into the fashionable restaurant business in New York City. Having little money upon arrival in the US, Harvey found his first job as a two-dollar-a-week “pot-walloper” or dishwasher in New York City at a Café, operated by Henry Smith and Tom McNell observing the restaurant business (Fried, 2010, p. 5). Not satisfied with life in New York City, in 1855 Harvey moved on to New Orleans, the culinary capital of the south. Fearing the oncoming war between the states and having no desire to serve in the US Southern army, he moved on to St. Louis where he worked at the Butterfield Hotel owned by Abner Hitchcock (Fried, 2010, p. 6).

By 1858, Harvey had applied for US citizenship and on July 27 Hitchcock was witness to Harvey renouncing his British ties by taking the oath of allegiance to the US (Fried, 2010, p. 7). Acquiring a partner, an Irish immigrant named William Doyle, Harvey took over the Merchants Dining Saloon and Restaurant in the center of Saint Louis.\(^5\) With the security of his own growing business, a partner and Dickson Brown as cook, He left for England in October 1859 planning to return with his father and younger sister,

---

\(^4\) From Stephan Fried (2010) _Appetite for America: Fred Harvey and the Business of Civilizing the Wild West—One Meal at a Time_. I have found this book to be a very reliable source for correct facts.

\(^5\) According to Fried (2010, p. 7) Doyle ran the saloon while Harvey concentrated on the dining room. The location was somewhere in the vicinity of the now famed Saint Louis Arch.
Eliza. He also returned with a blond, Dutch bride in her mid-twenties named Ann (Fried, 2010, p. 7).

In 1860, St. Louis became a boarder city between the North and the South. With Abraham Lincoln sworn in as President and the fate of the state of Missouri undecided the prosperous business seemed doomed. To make matters worse, Doyle joined the secessionist army taking all the money Harvey had saved. Henderson states that in order to recoup his loss, Harvey went to work for a Captain Rufus Ford’s Missouri River Packet Line making shipments between St. Louis and Omaha, Nebraska. Sometime later, Harvey became ill with an attack of typhoid fever while on this job. Following a very slow recovery, in 1862 he returned to work for his friend.

Stephen Fried confirms that, not much was known about Ann Harvey until she died of complications from childbirth in the fall of 1862. Now Harvey had two small baby boys needing care and within four months of Ann’s death Fred Harvey and Barbara Sarah “Sally” Mattas were married on February 20, 1863. However, the Harvey family Bible specifies an earlier date to indicate “Sally” as mother of Eddie and Charles (Fried, 2010, p. 14). Just as the Civil War was ending in 1865, a scarlet fever epidemic reached

---

6 After a few weeks, Charles Harvey returned to England, but Eliza remained and married Henry Bailey, a British immigrant bookkeeper. Fried (2010, p. 8)

7 According to Stephen Fried (2010, p. 8) the amount of money was over $1,300 that would be valued at $32,774 today

8 Prior to the expansion of railroads before the Civil War several types of steamboats carried a wide range of cargoes to river ports. The Missouri River was the border between trains and stagecoach and the packet boats shuttled back and forth. Many of the boats had restaurants to feed the passengers.

9 Fred Harvey’s obituary stated he “worked for the Missouri River Packet Company under Captain Rufus Ford for several years during the Civil War until he was taken seriously ill and suffered a long time with typhoid fever.” St. Louis Globe Democrat (Missouri), February 1901.

10 Fried (2010) Fred Harvey purposely fictionalized his past marriage for the sake of his young boys.
the Harvey household taking the life of both boys. Fred and “Sally” Harvey had other children, (Bryant, 1974, p. 108) daughters Sybil, Marie and Minnie, Ford Ferguson, and Byron Harvey, Sr.¹¹

In the early 1800s criticism of the slow mail delivery by horse and stagecoach, prompted the US postmaster general to move the mails by trains.¹² Harvey was hired as a government postal clerk using the first equipment to sort mail on trains out of New York and later traveled as a freight agent for the Burlington Railroad. ¹³ By 1875, Fred Harvey was a family man living in Leavenworth, Kansas and employed by the Chicago, Burlington, and Quincy Railroad (Berke, 2002, p. 39). As a railroad employee, he was subjected to the poor accommodations and unpalatable food served to the railroad passengers (Fried, 2010, p. 42). Over the next 20 years, he travelled westward while moving higher in the railroad industry (Fried, 2010, p. 13). However, he never forgot his years in the restaurant business.

According to Fried, Harvey’s fastidious English taste was repulsed by dry unpalatable biscuits, inedible ham and old weak coffee found at train stations. Along with the unacceptable food, he endured rest stops in below standard accommodations provided for railroad employees. Believing passengers as well as employees deserved

¹¹ These three Fred Harvey children, Minnie, Ford Ferguson, and Byron Harvey, Sr. would later play major roles in the FHC following Fred’s death in 1901.

¹² The US Congress officially designated all railroads as official postal routes on July 7, 1838. The railway post office, commonly abbreviated as RPO, was a railroad car that was normally operated in passenger train service as a means to sort mail in route, in order to speed delivery. The RPO was staffed by highly trained Railway Mail Service postal clerks, and was off-limits to the passengers on the train.

¹³ The Burlington Route served a large area but its primary connections encompassed Chicago, Minneapolis–Saint Paul, St. Louis, Kansas City and Denver.
better food, service and lodging only reinforced his idea to revolutionize railroad food and service. Harvey devised a strategy that would change railroad passenger travel.

Harvey talked with his bosses at Burlington Railroad about operating their eating establishments in Illinois, Missouri, and Kansas. Stephen Fried (2010, p. 47) asserts that although not interested they suggested he approach the smaller, newer AT&SF Railway with his ideas.¹⁴ In 1876, Fred Harvey leased their twenty-seat lunchroom on the second floor of the Topeka, Kansas depot (Fried, 2010, p. 49).

As the AT&SF Railway expanded westward, they provided the buildings for the Harvey House restaurants, serving meals twice a day at passenger train stops. The Harvey Company also established newsrooms and lunch counters at stations owned by subsidiaries of the AT&SF. In the 20th century the FHC grew until it had restaurants, hotels and lunchrooms throughout the southwest (AZ and NM) originating in Kansas to Oklahoma, and Texas. Harvey Houses would also appear wherever the Santa Fe built major terminals including Chicago and Saint Louis. Harvey continued to improve service as the establishments grew until his death in 1901 and carried on by his sons.

**The Santa Fe Railway Partnership**

In 1834, the federal government began to grant rights-of-way to railroads for a width of 60-100 feet through public lands.¹⁵ The rights-of-way included the use of water, earth, stone, and timber on adjacent public land for railroad construction. An 1875 law

---

¹⁴ The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway, often abbreviated as Santa Fe or AT&SF, was one of the larger railroads in the US. Chartered in February 1859, the railroad reached the Kansas-Colorado border in 1873 and Pueblo, CO, in 1876.

¹⁵ Resolution of June 25, 1834, Ch. 3, 4 Stat. 744. In 1850, Congress began to subsidize construction of certain railroads by granting them title to millions of acres of the public lands. In the late 1860s, the public oppose giving vast tracts of the public domain to railroads. In 1871, Congress ceased granting subsidy lands to railroads. Federal grants of railroad rights-of-way continued well into the twentieth century.
provided for rights-of-way but no additional land grants.\textsuperscript{16} By 1910, there were 140,000 train stations in the US and the majority of the population in the southwest was concentrated around them. Passed on May 20, 1862, the Homestead Act accelerated the settlement of the western territory by granting adult heads of families 160 acres of surveyed public land for a minimal filing fee and 5 years of continuous residence on that land.\textsuperscript{17} In 1862, President Abraham Lincoln also signed into law the Pacific Railroad Act and the Morrill Act that promoted transportation and higher education as well as western development.

When Fred Harvey took his idea to President Thomas Nickerson of the AT&SF, he was enthusiastic about the proposal. On a handshake, Harvey opened his first rail stop restaurant in Topeka, Kansas, on the second floor of the little red AT&SF Railway depot.\textsuperscript{18} The development of the FHC and the AT&SF Railway reveals a connection between changes in transportation, eating establishments and the advancement of a consumer culture based on advertising. The AT&SF called itself the railroad that featured “Meals by Fred Harvey,” a novel means of advertising food service.\textsuperscript{19}

Good food, good cooking, spotless dining rooms, and courteous service, were introduced by Fred Harvey in his first Harvey House, brought a booming business that pleased the AT&SF Railway, its passengers and the Topeka residents. In his book on

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{16} Act of Mar. 3, 1875, 18 Stat. 482 (1875) (granting railroads the right of way through public lands).
\item \textsuperscript{17} Act of May 20, 1862, Ch. 75, § 1, 12 Stat. 392. http://www.nathankramer.com/settle/article/homestead.htm.
\item \textsuperscript{18} From Bryant (1974, p. 17) usually called just the "Santa Fe," was originally planned to run from Atchison, Kansas, on the Missouri River, to Santa Fe, the capital city of NM, and then points west.
\item \textsuperscript{19} From Stephen Fried.2010 \textit{Appetite for America: How Visionary Businessman Fred Harvey Built a Railroad Hospitality Empire That Civilized the Wild West}. New York: Bantam Books.
\end{itemize}
the *History of the AT&SF*, Bryant asserts that the “architecture was crude, but the food and service were not.”

Closely following the historic Santa Fe Trail as shown in Figure 3-1, the AT&SF Railway was more than a railroad. Amid competition to open up western territory, the AT&SF entered NM in December 1878 eventually serving Arizona, California, Colorado, Illinois, Iowa, Kansas, Louisiana, Missouri, Nebraska, New Mexico, Oklahoma, and Texas. By 1889, the Railway gave Fred Harvey an exclusive contract to manage and operate all eating-houses, lunch stands, and hotel facilities as the AT&SF’s rail lines moving further west of the Missouri River (Bryant, 1974).

In 1896, the AT&SF Railway began to devote itself to the idea of the heritage of America, the wilderness of the West and the Native American people. The adaptation of the Southwestern indigenous people into their corporate image proved to be an important step for the AT&SF image.\(^2\)\(^0\) To promote the Southwest to travelers the Railway constructed most of its passenger stations in the same style as local Pueblo/Spanish architecture.

No organization would have a greater impact on the American Southwest than the FH/SF partnership. The AT&SF and the FHC was a mutually beneficial alliance. Fred Harvey provided fine dining services along the AT&SF line while allowing the FHC free use of the railroad to ship fresh food and supplies, thus providing passengers with quality food stops. The FHC would hire, train and supervise the personnel, prepare the food and provide the service. The partnership’s innovative advertising also made the

\(^2\)\(^0\) From *Dream Tracks: The Railroad and the American Indian 1890 – 1930*. T.C. Mc Luhan (1985, p. 19)
AT&SF Railway and “Meals by Fred Harvey” a worldwide brand (Bryant, 1974, p. 118), drawing thousands of visitors to the American Southwest.  

Fred Harvey maintained a small office at the depot in Leavenworth where he presided over his rapidly growing chain of Harvey Houses (Bryant, 1974, p. 109). By 1882, the AT&SF and Harvey’s first luxury resort hotel opened in NM built to take advantage of scenic mountains and the local hot springs. Bryant states (1974, p. 111), the Queen Ann style Montezuma Hotel was the largest wooden structure in the country and a resort committed to the growing trend in health tourism. However, the Montezuma resort had an image problem resulting from the Railway effectively advertising the location as a health facility. Author Stephen Fried states that the Railway mistakenly chose to promote the naturally occurring hot springs in the area as a resort while tourists perceived it as a hospital.

On the morning of January 17, 1884, the Montezuma hotel exploded into flames and burned to the ground in less than forty minutes (Fried, 2010, p. 102). An insurance settlement prompted the AT&SF to quickly hire Chicago architect Daniel Burnham to redesign the hotel, however; Fred Harvey was more interested in his other restaurant holdings. The AT&SF not only transported goods and people, it created a new image

---

21 Their partnership pioneered innovative marketing techniques in the 1900s that are still in use today in the travel industry. Many of the company’s ads and posters are now works of art and valued by collectors.

22 From: Fried (2010, p. 101) many assumed that the Montezuma was a health facility full of sick people.

23 Although hot springs were thought to have healing powers the AT&SF tourists avoided the location.

24 Daniel Hudson Burnham, FAIA (1846–1912) of the Chicago firm of Burnham and Root, claimed the hotel was built in the wrong place. Formed in 1873, the firm had produced modern buildings as part of the Chicago School.
of the Southwest and utilized that image to promote tourism strengthening its corporate organization.

By 1901 the first passenger train from Williams, AZ arrived at the AT&SF Grand Canyon South Rim depot replacing the stagecoach as the main transportation to the area. By the nineteenth century, tourism was considered a leisure activity of Eastern Americans of European descent rarely from the working class. The AT&SF Railway anticipated the need for a hotel of the caliber of the Harvey Houses represented along the route. The FH/SF Railway realized constructing a hotel close to a natural attraction such as Grand Canyon would entice more eastern tourists to ride trains.

**Harvey Hotels, Restaurants and Harvey Girls, a Harvey Trademark**

Established in 1878, Fred Harvey's first hotel and eating house combination was in Florence, Kansas and represented an evolving period in the Harvey system's history. The Clifton House offered a full service AT&SF Railway stop providing fine food, lodging and service to railroad workers and the traveling public, as well as a dining facility to the local community. Harvey’s main goal as an entrepreneur was to provide good food and good service for railroad travelers and he became immensely successful at essentially developing America’s first chain of restaurants, the Harvey House.

---


26 A “tourist” is defined as “one who travels for pleasure;” as “a consumer away from home;” “a passive observer of staged spectacles;” or “someone who travels to experience unfamiliar surroundings.”

27 In 1877, Fred Harvey bought the Clifton Hotel in Florence, Kansas for $5,370. It was the first Harvey House to offer sleeping accommodations in addition to a restaurant. It is now a museum. In 1878, the second one opened in Florence in what would become a chain of Harvey House.
In 1881, dissatisfied with the fighting male waiters and damage they caused to his House in Raton, NM Harvey fired the male staff and management and hired family friend, Tom Gable as the replacement manager. His idea was to substitute the male waiters with attractive young women who would be known as the “Harvey Girls,” a Harvey Company trademark.  

The FHC became famous for recruiting single females from around the country to staff their lunchrooms and Harvey House dining rooms. A young woman could get away from home and have a “career” at a time when the only “respectable” jobs for women was school teachers, nurses and/or possibly secretaries. The “Harvey Girls” served from an extensive menu on delicate china, with sterling silverware, Irish linen tablecloths and napkins with fresh cut flowers on the table.

With “Harvey Girls” the “eating houses” were able to feed train travelers at a time before dining cars. Long before fast food restaurants train passengers were well fed and back on the train in ten minutes (Fried, 2010). He began employing single white educated young women as waitresses to his remote restaurant outposts. In 1883, the Harvey organization recruited women through advertisements in Eastern papers.

Wanted: Young women 18 to 30 years of age, of good moral character, attractive and intelligent, to waitress in Harvey Eating Houses on the Santa Fe in the West, Wages, $17.50 per month with room and board Liberal tips customary. Experience not necessary Write Fred Harvey, Union Depot, Kansas City, MO.

However, the Harvey Company did not want just any girl they wanted eastern girls of quality who would relate to the needs of the diners. Head of personnel Alice Steele held an important executive position for the entire Harvey Company, interviewing and hiring

---

28 The Gables and the Harveys lived on the same block in Leavenworth, KA. Fred had known the family when Tom was a teenager working in the Leavenworth post office. At thirty-one Tom married with one child, Fred felt that Tom was a good choice to manage his eating business (Fried, 2010, p. 86).
the “Harvey Girls” (Fried, 2010, p. 262). In the early 1900s, their pay was increased to $25 per month. At that time, waitressing was regarded as a low class profession, a belief that Harvey sought to dispel, and the pay compared favorably to what men were making in similar professions (Poling-Kempes, 1991).

Thousands applied but only the best were hired; for many of these young women, it would be the first time they had left home. In the 1900s, “Miss Steele” and “Miss Mary Colter” were among the highest-ranking women in corporate America (Fried, 2010, p.262). Fried confirms that Miss Steele “was a combination model agent, women’s college recruiter…nobody in the country better understood the experience of America’s new working women.” The contributions of “Harvey Girls” to the success of the “Harvey image” encouraging the FHC to hire M.E.J. Colter, an artist, trained as a designer who was well versed in southwest culture and arts.

For the FHC there was no misunderstanding that the young ladies who worked at the Harvey House were very respectable. “Harvey Girls” were required to go through a strict training period and issued an official starched black and white uniform of a skirt no more than eight inches off the floor, opaque black stockings and black shoes creating a contrast to women who worked in other establishments. A “Harvey Girl’s” hair was kept plain and simple and tied with a regulation white ribbon. Makeup of any sort was absolutely forbidden (Fried, 2010, p. 89).

The Harvey system provided lodging for the “Harvey Girls” that represented the family structure where customary proprieties would be maintained. House matrons were hired to provide the “Harvey Girls” with guidance and enforce Harvey’s Victorian moral standards. Many firsthand accounts from “Harvey Girls” emphasized "the closeness"
and "sisterhood" among waitresses. Stephen Fried writes that, “Harvey Girls” became a feature of the FHC, setting the standards for cleanliness and politesse that created a civilizing effect on the often rough male customers in "the territories." The literature states that, they not only helped civilize the Wild West but also populate it, as thousands of "the Girls" married their bachelor customers and settled down in the West.

By 1883, seven years after he opened in Topeka, Fred Harvey controlled seventeen eating establishments on the main AT&SF Railway line. The Harvey Company’s center was in the western territory general office of the AT&SF in Kansas City. One of the major improvements was the innovation of refrigerated boxcars that made it possible to serve passengers fresh meat and vegetables. The railroad carried all the produce and supplies to the Harvey restaurants at no cost. One of the reasons for the Harvey Houses’ success was the ability to serve fresh, high quality meat, seafood, and produce at remote locations across the Southwest. Trains would deliver beef from Kansas City, seafood and produce from southern California year around.

Harvey’s policy was “maintenance of standard, regardless of cost.” By 1889, Harvey had a signed contracted partnership with the AT&SF Railway and was given exclusive rights to manage and operate all their eating establishments, lunch stands, and hotel facilities along the Railway west of the Missouri River. By the late 1880s, Harvey had extended his restaurant and hotel chain from Chicago to Los Angeles.

Over the years, Fred Harvey’s health had always been an issue. From family histories and references, imply that “during the Civil War he was taken seriously ill and suffered a long time with typhoid fever." In his late fifties Fred began to integrating his

sons, Ford and Byron into the hotel and restaurant business. According to Fried, his last years were spent at various European spas, where he attempted to find relief from chronic neuralgia and from the cancer that would kill him. Early in 1901, his health deteriorated and he returned to his Leavenworth home where he died.\textsuperscript{30} An item in the Kansas City ‘Star’ newspaper following his death affirms that Fred Harvey set a goal to “always surpass the average.”

After his father’s death, Fred’s son Ford took over the operation of the company.\textsuperscript{31} Ford Harvey made it his company’s mission to protect and promote the landscapes and cultures of the Southwest. Author Fried emphasizes that in Ford’s mind these two contradictory ideals to protect a place such as the Grand Canyon was to promote it and the indigenous cultures of the area. Prior to becoming a national park, the Grand Canyon was only a natural scenic wonder. The FHC recognized the potential of using architecture as a marketing strategy and both the Railway and Harvey’s sons believed that constructing structures as destinations close to a natural attraction would entice tourists to ride the train to Grand Canyon. In 1901 the first AT&SF passenger train from Williams, AZ arrived at the Railway’s depot on the Grand Canyon South Rim.

In the nineteenth century, tourism was considered a leisure activity of Eastern Americans of European descent that were rarely from the working class.\textsuperscript{32} A “tourist” has been defined as “one who travels for pleasure;” as “a consumer away from home;”

\textsuperscript{30} Fred Harvey passed away February 9, 1901, Leavenworth, KS. It is assumed he died of complications of an intestinal cancer.

\textsuperscript{31} From: Stephen Fried (2010) Ford Harvey was named after Fred Harvey friend, Captain Rufus Ford.

“a passive observer of staged spectacles;” or “someone who travels to experience unfamiliar surroundings.” For this reason the Railway and the FHC went forward with plans to develop a tourist destination at Grand Canyon. The AT&SF understood the need for a hotel of the caliber represented by the successful Harvey Houses. Desiring to keep the visitors longer, the FH/SF organization envisioned an impressive hotel in the spirit of the Eastern resorts and the former Montezuma Hotel.

The AT&SF Railway would construct the new El Tovar hotel and the guest facilities and restaurant would be under Ford Harvey’s supervision.\(^{33}\) Chicago architect Charles Whittlesey was hired to design a chalet style hotel. However, Whittlesey had never been to the canyon. His original plan for the hotel had protruding porches and balconies jutting out over the South Rim.\(^{34}\) Although the design would create impressive views of the canyon and add to the visitors’ experience, it also had the potential to destroy the canyon rim.

In May 1903, President Theodore Roosevelt made his first trip to the Grand Canyon aware of efforts to build on the land and mine the region for minerals. He spoke at a public event saying, “The Grand Canyon has a natural wonder which, so far as I know, is in kind absolutely unparalleled throughout the rest of the world. I want to ask you to do one thing in connection with it in your own interest and in the interest of

\(^{33}\) El Tovar was named for Spanish explorer, Pedro de Tovar one of the first white men to see Grand Canyon.

\(^{34}\) Charles Frederick Whittlesey (1867-1941) was a Chicago architect known for his work in the southwest, and for pioneering reinforced concrete in California. In 1900, he was Chief Architect for the AT&SF Railway and traveled the Western US for the company building depots and hotels. In 1905, he presented his paper, “Concrete Construction” at an AIA meeting. By 1906, he was appointed chair of the committee to revise Los Angeles's building code, especially regarding reinforced concrete construction.
the country to keep this great wonder of nature as it now is." Roosevelt proclaimed that the Grand Canyon was “the one great sight that every American should see.”

By the time M.E.J. Colter received a commission to plan a “curio shop” to sell Native American arts and crafts as well as design the El Tovar interiors, the hotel construction had been relocated away from the rim. Opening in 1905, Colter’s replication of a Hopi pueblo adjacent to the hotel was intended as a “curio shop.” Guests at El Tovar had the opportunity to watch Native American dances and craft demonstrations at Hopi House and learn about native cultures by exploring the interior design and architectural detail she integrated. Although the vernacular style chosen by Colter was primarily commercial and intended to stimulate interest in Native American goods, visitors often viewed Hopi House as a museum rather than a FHC “curio shop” intended for the tourists to purchase the Native American arts and crafts.

When the El Tovar opened in 1905, the 125-guest room log and stone structure was called “one of the fanciest hotels west of the Mississippi.” Stephen Fried calls it “the most in demand hotel in the world.” He notes the hotel books rooms thirteen months in advance and that many people plan entire southwestern trips to Grand Canyon around El Tovar room availability (Fried, 2010, p. 407). The hotel has “hosted many famous people including presidents” and continues to operate in the Fred Harvey tradition.

---

35 From a transcript of May 6, 1903 Theodore Roosevelt Grand Canyon speech

36 Theodore Roosevelt used his authority to protect wildlife and public lands by creating the United States Forest Service (USFS) and establishing 150 national forests, 51 federal bird reserves, 4 national game preserves, 5 national parks, and 18 national monuments by enabling the 1906 American Antiquities Act. As President, Roosevelt protected approximately 230 million acres of public land.

37 In the 1990’s, Amfac bought out Fred Harvey at Grand Canyon and merged its holdings with other US National Park concessions. Xanterra South Rim, L.L.C. continues the Fred Harvey name and has set the standard for ecologically sound resorts that complement, not harm, their natural surroundings. They are also the largest provider of “in-the-park lodging.”
The 1915 San Diego World’s Fair

The 1915 Panama-Pacific International Exposition in San Diego, California was held in the city’s historic urban Balboa Park to celebrate the completion of the Panama Canal. San Diego was the first US port of call for ships traveling north after passing westward through the canal. The fair planners wanted to create an atmosphere of “Spanish Colonial Revival” and California’s “indigenous historical vernacular style” adopted from the Franciscan missions up the California coast.

The AT&SF Railway intended to produce a recreation of southwestern “Indian life” in a commercial exhibit to educate tourists and promote rail travel to the Grand Canyon and book trips by “Harvey Car” from the La Fonda Hotel in Santa Fe, NM to the actual pueblo locations. Financed by the railway and created by a number of FHC staff, the “Indian Village and Painted Desert” was on a “five-acre mesa” at the northern end of the exposition.

Beginning with the World's Columbian Exposition in 1893, Native American craft persons and simulated pueblos were established exhibits at US World’s Fairs. “Indian villages” had been erected at Buffalo’s 1901 Pan-American Exposition and St. Louis’s Louisiana Purchase Exposition in 1904, so the idea of an “Indian village” at Balboa Park was not novel. However, the AT&SF Railway with FHC’s participation in the project was unusual. Railway executives assumed that the sight of the “fast disappearing culture of

38 The 1915 Panama-California Exposition focused on Spanish influence and western US culture. San Francisco and New Orleans also were planning fairs to celebrate the opening of the Panama Canal. Only San Francisco continued with a fair that lasted only one year.

39 The FHC “Detours” were trips designed for AT&SF passengers from the La Fonda Hotel in Santa Fe, NM to pueblos and artist studios.

40 On May 1, 1893, the gates opened at the World’s Columbian Exposition, aka Chicago World's Fair.
American Indians” from AZ and NM living and working in replicas of their native environment and homes would induce tourists to visit the real thing (Kropp, 1996, p. 40).

In 1913, Colter was designing and supervising the construction of Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio. The FH/SF Railway also give her the assignment of creating a model of the “Painted Desert” exhibit for the 1915 Exposition. She created numerous drawings from photographs and fabricated a wax model of her plan for the area. To promote the event, three plaster copies of the model were made and sent to important AT&SF Railway stations.41 On March 24, 1914, a photo of the model appeared in the San Diego Union newspaper advertising the coming event (Berke, 2002, p. 104).

AT&SF Railway shipped authentic materials such as southwestern cholla cactus, sagebrush and yucca, used for the construction to the site from Colorado.42 Two large sections of Native American dwellings were erected, named after Zuni and the Taos Pueblos. There were ceremonial kivas, beehive-shaped outdoor ovens for bread baking, Navajo hogans, Apache teepees, and cliff dwellings set in brightly colored rock intended to look like the AZ Painted Desert. The cliffs were created of wire and colored cement over a wooden frame, sculpted to resemble rock. There were faced open courtyards and corrals for sheep and horses. The AT&SF Railway estimated the construction costs at about $200,000 (San Diego Union, article 1 January 1915).

41 Arnold Berke (2002, p.104, n.21 p. 298) San Diego Union article of March 14, 1914 discusses the model and has a photo of Jesse Nusbaum, Herman Schweizer of the FHC, and S.C. Payson. The San Diego Union, March 24, 1914 only mentions Mary Colter as an interior designer. I was only able to obtain a very poor photocopy from Arnold Berke.

42 Cylindropuntia is a genus of cacti, containing the cholla (pronounced choy-a), native to northern Mexico and the Southwestern United States. Cholla cactus represent more than 20 species of the Opuntia genus (Family Cactaceae) in the North American deserts. Cholla is a term applied to various shrubby cacti of this genus with cylindrical stems composed of segmented joints. Known for their barbed spines that attach to skin, fur, or clothing, they are most feared and hated cacti in the southwest desert.
Families from San Ildefonso Pueblo in NM were hired by Herman Schweizer to assist with the construction as well as a number of crafts persons from various Pueblos who worked and lived for two years at the exhibit. They demonstrated their skills of jewelry making, bread baking, blanket weaving, and pottery making, as well as performing traditional dances and ceremonies. The native people who worked at the Painted Desert Exhibit were paid a salary, housed and fed, and allowed to sell their crafts directly to the public (Kropp, 1996, p. 40). The prominent San Ildefonso potters, Julian and Maria Martinez who are well known by collectors for their “black ware,” lived at the exhibit (Berke, 2002, p. 105).

While Colter was involved with her two Grand Canyon structures, the Railway hired photographer and archaeologist, Jesse L. Nusbaum (1887-1975) at $100.00 a month as supervisor of construction for the exhibit. Since Colter was busy at Grand Canyon, Nusbaum was in the limelight during the construction taking credit for all aspects of the exhibit in interviews with the area newspapers. Following the release of Nusbaum’s interviews, Schweizer sent him a harsh letter reprimanding him for assuming full credit for creating the exhibit. Schweitzer had to remind Nusbaum that

---

43 San Ildefonso potters Julian and Maria Martinez and Hopi potter Nampeyo.

44 Jesse Nusbaum was a self-taught amateur photographer, accompanying archaeologist on expeditions to South America and the American Southwest. With a degree from State Normal School in Greeley, Nusbaum was hired by NM State Normal in Las Vegas, to teach science and manual arts.

45 Howard, K. L. and D.F. Pardue. *Inventing the Southwest: The Fred Harvey Company and Native American Art* (1996, p. 75). The Fred Harvey Company was upset with Nusbaum for taking credit for the Painted Desert design – letter from Herman Schweizer

the AT&SF Railway and the FHC had a number of staff people involved in the planning and implementing of the San Diego fair project.47

Before the Antiquities Act of 1906, the Department of the Interior had under its jurisdiction seven national monuments of historical and archaeological interest, including Hovenweep and Mesa Verde. When appointed director of MVNP in the 1920s, archeologist Jesse Nusbaum took a Native American approach when designing his residence and other NPS buildings. He and his wife Aileen were both involved with the preservation movement in the southwest that was centered in Santa Fe, NM. I contend that M.E.J. Colter was an influence on Nusbaum from the 1915 “Painted Desert” project when designing buildings at Mesa Verde. The Nusbaums would have also known about her indigenous-inspired architecture on Grand Canyon.48

Jesse Nusbaum had moved to Santa Fe NM in 1909 and become one of the first employees of the Museum of NM and the School of American Archaeology, both under the directorship of Dr. Edgar L. Hewett.49 As an anthropologist, Nusbaum would have shared M.E.J. Colter’s interest in indigenous style architecture. In 1921 as MVNP first superintendent, he planned that park’s first service buildings complementing the park’s

47 Letter from Schweizer “gently” admonishing Jesse Nusbaum for taking “exclusive credit for the project” located in the Heard Museum Harvey Collection related to The San Diego Union article that proclaimed, The Design Team for the Exhibit included Herman Schweizer, John F. Huckel, Edgar Lee Hewett, and Mary Colter.

48 Numerous NPS historical documents state M.E.J. Colter’s 1914 designs of Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio led to the NPS “rustic” form of architecture and have influenced all park structures throughout the US. Photographs of her architecture at GCNP in 1938 NPS publication, Park and Recreation Structures.

49 Edgar Lee Hewett (1865–1946) was an American archaeologist and anthropologist whose focus was the Native American communities of New Mexico and the southwestern US. He is best known for his role in gaining passage of the Antiquities Act.
abundant cliff dwellings.\textsuperscript{50} Nusbaum was also pre-occupied with preserving the MVNP pre-history archeological structures of his park. His chose indigenous building materials, as Colter had done by studying the prehistoric Puebloans’ located in the park. Nusbaum’s buildings were based on the surrounding “Anasazi” structures that has guided all of the future structural development of MVNP.\textsuperscript{51} The design of the superintendent’s residence and the way it is physically sited evokes Colter’s Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio from 1914 on Grand Canyon, emerging from the landscape as classic vernacular buildings of regional style.

\textbf{Mary Colter Hotels Outside of Grand Canyon}

In the late 1890s, women became more involved in public matters creating an increased presence of women in the workplace once appropriate only for men. M.E.J. Colter was a contemporary of other female architects such as Marion Manley (1893-1984) in Miami Florida and Julia Morgan (1872-1957) in California.\textsuperscript{52} Before women had the right to vote, it was unprecedented for a woman to manipulate a large company. Nevertheless, from 1902 to 1949, Colter was a significant architect/interior designer of

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{50} The first project at MVNP designed/built by Jesse Nusbaum (1887-1975) and his first wife, Aileen, was the superintendent’s house, based on Hopi mesa architecture. The Nusbaum structure was possibly inspired by M.E.J. Colter’s, Hopi House that opened in 1905 at Grand Canyon, AZ.
  \item \textsuperscript{51} Considered an offensive adjective the preferred term is Ancestral Puebloan. “Anasazi” was the name first given by archaeologists to the “cliff dwellers” of the Mesa Verde ruins. Nevertheless, it refers to the prehistoric classification of American Indian inhabitants of the canyons located in northern AZ, NM and southwestern Colorado.
  \item \textsuperscript{52} Marion Manley, Miami’s first woman architect, spent her career battling for commissions and for the recognition she deserved. Julia Morgan born in San Francisco and grew up in Oakland, California. One of her first residential commissions was to remodel and complete Phoebe Hearst’s Hacienda del Pozo de Verona in Pleasanton, CA. In 1919, William Randolph Hearst hired Morgan to work for him at San Camino. Although she was a prolific designer, she is remembered most for her work at “Hearst Castle.”
\end{itemize}
tourism related architecture within a major organization. Grattan writes that, at an early age Colter was a determined, tenacious and positive person using willpower to get her way. Although well known within the FH/SF alliance, Colter was scarcely recognized as a major architect during her lifetime. The FHC would approve her concept drawings for a project, submit them to the railway and the AT&SF architects would execute the working drawings. The railway always owned the building nevertheless, all operations for the business were the Harvey Company’s responsibility.

Hired permanently by the FHC in 1910, M.E.J. Colter furnished the interior of El Ortiz (Figure 3-3), the adobe hacienda hotel in Lamy, NM, designed by the AT&SF architect Louis Curtiss. She chose heavy Spanish-style furniture, Navajo rugs and Native American objects. Richard Melzer (2008, p. 42) states that this Harvey House was called “the littlest hotel in the littlest town.” There was a small open “placita” surrounded by the lobby on the front side and most of the 12 rooms were on two of the other sides. After a brief stay the author of the Virginian, Owen Wister wrote to the manager of El Ortiz, “a private house of someone who had lavished thought and care upon every nook…temptation was to give up all plans and stay a week for the pleasure

53 From Grattan (1980, p. 102). Mary Colter retired from the AT&SF in 1944 after twenty-nine and one-half years but remained with FHC as a decorator and designer for new projects at La Fonda and the NPS Painted Desert Inn.


55 The majority of M.E.J. Colter building drawings were often signed by Edward A. Harrison the AT&SF Railway’s chief architect. Harrison signed the working plans for the El Navajo Hotel in Gallup, NM

56 The Spanish style Hotel was demolished in 1943 a result of lack of business during WWII.
of…resting in such a place.”

In 1913, while involved with the creation of the AT&SF Railways “Painted Desert” exhibit, she was creating her signature site-specific Hermit’s Rest and Lookout Studio for the FHC. This ‘rim style’ architecture built on the Grand Canyon South Rim would come to the attention of the US Forest Service and effect the future park “rustic” style architecture nationwide during the late 1920s – 1940 that followed the 1916 Organic Act and make an impression on early NPS landscape architects.

Before the Grand Canyon became a National Park, M.E.J. Colter’s architecture make an impact on Forest Service personnel. A cohesive rim village existed because of the precedent set by the Railway, the FHC and Colter. The Forest Service 1916 Grand Canyon Village Plan states that the FHC/SF Railway architect, “M.E.J. Colter should be consulted regarding any new structures” planned for construction. Colter also began contributing to the innovation of the AT&SF Railway’s “Southwest Style,” a distinct combination of buildings and interiors inspired by a blend of Mission Revival, Spanish Colonial and Native American content.

Colter’s first major hotel design blending Pueblo Revival and early Art Deco style was the El Navajo Hotel in Gallup, NM, opening in 1918 and expanded in 1923. Her

57 From: Richard Melzer (2008, p. 42) Images of America: Fred Harvey Houses of the Southwest. (Courtesy L.A. Reed)

58 A directive in the 1916-1917 Grand Canyon Village Plan

59 Based on architect M.E.J. Colter’s design Harrison’s signature appears on the final drawings as the approving railroad official.

60 Art deco, is an eclectic artistic design style that began in Paris in the 1920s and flourished internationally throughout the 1930s and into the World War II era.
distinctive structure combined regional Native American motifs with the streamline aesthetics of emerging modern design. Author Arnold Berke implies that it was a “marriage of modernism and regionalism” (Berke, 2002, p. 131). The building interior also incorporated several reproduced altered Navajo sand paintings on the interior lobby walls.61 Figure 3-4 and Figure 3-5 are archival photographs of the El Navajo exterior and the interior lobby wall sand paintings respectively. Although some Navajo people made objection to Colter’s use of the religious ceremonial sand paintings, the hotel was dedicated during a blessing ritual with local Navajo singers and “medicine men” to purge the works of evil spirits (Berke, 2002, p. 137).

The El Navajo increased awareness of local Native American groups, who afterwards refused to allow further exploitation of their traditional art forms. The Depression and WWII (1929-1945) brought tourism to a near standstill putting a halt to AT&SF Railway hotels and following WWII the rise in auto travel spawned the roadside motels. In 1957, the hotel portion of El Navajo was destroyed to widen Route 66 and by 1970, Interstate 40 had bypassed many towns the AT&SF Railway had built. Both El Ortiz and El Navajo were demolished before Colter death, while the majority of her remaining Native American inspired buildings are located within the GCNP.

Colter also combined her Pueblo/Deco style in other installations, as evident in the AT&SF Union Station (1939) in Los Angeles.62 She did not design the entire station complex, but did create spaces for the FHC restaurant and a Deco style cocktail lounge.

61 Sand paintings were considered a sacred art by the Navajo people and had been unseen by most Americans causing a controversy over their display to the public.

62 In 1939 the AT&SF, Union Pacific, and Southern Pacific completed construction of the $11 million ($164 million today) Los Angeles Union Station. Considered the last great railroad station in America, it was also the last structure the FHC was hired to run all the restaurants and retail stores.
Stephen Fried describes the Harvey restaurant shown in Figure 3-6, “it had a spectacular arched ceiling that brought to mind the inside of Jonah’s whale, spacey Deco fixtures, and a dazzling floor, which appeared to be random zigzags and geometrics until you stepped back and realized it was actually a block-long Navajo blanket made of linoleum tiles.” The Los Angeles Union Station is still in operation although the dining room and lounge designed by Colter are used only by reservation for large gatherings and wedding receptions.

La Fonda in Santa Fe, NM

Initiated in 1607, Santa Fe is the second oldest city established by European colonists in the US. In 1573, the King of Spain, Philip II, decreed an extensive set of rules for the building of towns and cities in the Americas. These ordinances declare that “all new towns must have a central plaza surrounded by important buildings with portales or arcades, and from which the principal streets, be laid out in a grid pattern” and known as “The Law of the Indies.” Like all early Spanish city, Santa Fe was basically laid out following the “Laws of the Indies” by having a central plaza.

However, because of the independent nature of earlier settlers on the frontier, most towns in the US territories did not totally adhere to the “Law of the Indies” plan.

Constructed in 1610, the Palace of the Governors is the oldest seat of state government in the US. The structure has spanned the north side of the city of Santa Fe’s Plaza for nearly 300 years and was the terminus of El Camino Real, the Spanish

63 Only St. Augustine, Florida, founded in 1565, is older.

64 Signed in 1573, the Laws of the Indies is considered the first wide-ranging guidelines towards design and development of Spanish Colonial communities. This urban disposition had as Spanish precedent and there are some references in the Laws that “the four corners of the main square must look at the four dominant winds in order to avoid that the streets at the square were exposed to the wind.”
Royal Road from Mexico City, the Santa Fe Trail, and the Old Pecos Trail in the territory of NM. The Santa Fe Trail was primarily a commercial highway connecting Missouri and Santa Fe, NM. Between 1821 and 1880, it was an international commercial highway used by Mexican and American traders.

Between 1540 and 1600, the first Spanish settlement in colonial NM was imagined as a historical projection of the Spanish Requonquista. During this period of Spanish occupation, the Pueblos endured eight successive waves of violent raids by the Spanish colonists. In 1680, Pueblo Indians revolted against the estimated 2,500 Spanish colonists in NM, killing 400 of them and driving the rest back into Mexico. The conquering Pueblos sacked the city of Santa Fe burning most of the buildings, except the Palace of the Governors. The Palace remained home to the Spanish, Mexican and American governors throughout these countries' control of the NM territory.

---

65 During the Spanish period in America, royal roads tied colonial regions with Mexico City. The El Camino Real de los Tejas was the only primary overland route from what is now Mexico, across the Rio Grande to the Red River Valley in what is now Louisiana. www.nps.gov/elte/historyculture

66 The Santa Fe Trail was a 19th-century transportation route through central North America that connected Independence, Missouri with Santa Fe, New Mexico. Pioneered in 1821 by William Becknell, it served as a vital commercial highway until the introduction of the railroad to Santa Fe in 1880.

67 The Spanish Reconquista was the reconquering of the Spanish lands to Catholic hands. La Reconquista was the Christian Spanish recovery of Spain from Islam (the Moors) after 700 years of occupation. It was achieved by a series of military victories.

68 The Pueblo Revolt of 1680—also known as Pope’s Rebellion—was an uprising of most of the indigenous Pueblo people against the Spanish colonists in the province of Santa Fe de Nuevo México. The Spanish Colonial era (1610-1680), native Pueblo Indians occupied the Palace of the Governors (1680-1693), during the Pueblo Revolt followed by the Spanish from 1693-1821, the Mexican period (1821-1846), American occupation (1846), the Confederacy (for a few days in 1862) during the Civil War, and the subsequent formation of the New Mexico Territory. The Palace was the territorial capitol until 1886 and governor's residence until 1909.
Spanish language spoken by nearly a quarter of a million people throughout NM and southern Colorado is an ancient dialect that is largely Castilian in origin.\(^{70}\)

In 1909, the structure was turned over to the School of American Archaeology and the newly formed Museum of NM. Renovated during different periods, the adobe structure of primarily Spanish-Pueblo Revival style, has some Territorial-style elements remaining the same. It was designated a NRHL in 1960 and an American Treasure in 1999.\(^{71}\) According to Virginia Grattan (1980), the Spanish adapted “Pueblo architecture to their own needs using Moorish elements with Native American… natural materials, pine logs and adobe mud.” However, the combination of Spanish-Pueblo style architecture has dominated the area and is known as the Santa Fe Style.\(^{72}\) Colter gained inspiration from the early city of Santa Fe, NM architecture, the Palace of Governors as shown in Figure 3-2, and the use of the “Law of the Indies” in the city’s Plaza plan.\(^{73}\) The Plaza remains Santa Fe’s historic, cultural and geographic center.

---


\(^{71}\) National Historic Preservation Act of 1996 is administered by the NPS in the National Center for Cultural Resources Stewardship and Partnership Programs. The National Register is the nation's official list of districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects in both public and private ownership that are significant in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture. [http://www.nps.gov/nr/](http://www.nps.gov/nr/) The NRHP is the official list of the Nation's historic places worthy of preservation. Authorized by the NHP Act of 1966, the NPS NRHP is part of a national program to coordinate and support public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect America's historic and archeological resources.

\(^{72}\) The “Pueblo Revival” movement brought the term “Santa Fe style” into the architectural lexicon. Starting in the early 20th century, its peak was in the 1920s and 30s. Architect John Gaw Meem is often called “The Father of Pueblo Revival.” The renovated La Fonda Hotel was the center for the FHC “Indian Detours.”

\(^{73}\) “Laws of the Indies” are the body of laws issued by the Spanish Crown for the Americas and possessions of its empire. The laws are composed of decrees issued over the centuries and the important laws of the 16th century in an attempted to regulate the interactions between settlers and the native population.
One of Colter’s most distinctive interior contributions was her collaboration with Santa Fe, NM architect, John Gaw Meem (1864 – 1983) during the expansion of the La Fonda Hotel. Santa Fe city records indicate an inn, or fonda, was on this same corner since the city’s founding.\(^74\) The current structure was constructed in 1922 by the Rapp architectural firm in Santa Fe that supported a principle to maintain the Santa Fe, Spanish, or Pueblo style of architecture.\(^75\) It became a Harvey House in 1926 as a prime example of Spanish Pueblo Revival architecture.\(^76\) Meem added a six-story bell tower seen in Figure 3-7, a fifth floor, and new wings along Water Street and the Old Santa Fe Trail, while Colter worked with area crafts persons to achieve authentic Spanish and Native American interior details.\(^77\)

Her special touches included hand painted glass ceiling tiles, tin and copper lighting fixtures as shown in Figure 3-8 A), colorful tiles from the Batchelder Tile Company in Los Angeles shown in Figure 3-8 B), and hand carved and hand painted furniture done by local artisans.\(^78\) She designed inviting rooms in a hacienda style with

\(^74\) Architect John Gaw Meem has been called “The Father of Pueblo Revival.”

\(^75\) The Rapps of Carbondale, Illinois, were the only family in history to have produced four noted architects in one generation followed by three in the next.

\(^76\) The fonda (inn) on Santa Fe’s Plaza was a popular landmark at the end of the Santa Fe Trail from the Mexican-American War, Civil War, and the AT&SF Railway expansion. In 1912, NM became a state and the old buildings in the city were dilapidated. Following a fire in 1919, the old fonda was demolished and in 1920, the new La Fonda was designed by architects T.H. Rapp, Wm. M. Rapp and A.C. Henrickson. By 1926, the AT&SF Railway purchased the hotel and leased it to the FHC. Today, La Fonda’s architecture remains a benchmark of Santa Fe style.

\(^77\) From Virginia Grattan (1980, p. 52) one of the first elevators in Santa Fe was installed. Prior to work on La Fonda, Colter had been in an auto accident in Kansas City and was confined to a wheelchair while designing the La Fonda interiors.

\(^78\) Ernest Batchelder was an artisan and craftsman who designed stoneware pavers in Pasadena, California between 1909 and the depression era of the 1930’s. The Heritage Tile Company, Oak Park Illinois, is committed to the most authentic, historically accurate tiles for restorations and new projects

https://batcheldertile.com/
each guest room having its own plan and fireplace, no two rooms were alike (Grattan, 1980, p. 52). Colter’s fireplaces were not only functional but were a part of every design. See Appendix B for several examples of distinctive fireplaces.

Sculptor Arnold Rönnebeck (1885 – 1947) was commissioned by M.E.J. Colter to design the lobby fireplace in La Fonda. In 1949, her last La Fonda project for the FHC was “La Cantinita,” a new cocktail lounge that is now a pastry shop. By then she had retired and was a Santa Fe, NM resident. For the La Cantinita fireplace, she used repurposed handmade bricks from the old NM capital. To get the right affect, Colter had the bricklayers create a sloppy and irregular wall so it would look old (Grattan, 1980, p. 106).

From 1926 to 1936, the Harvey Company entered into the ethnic tourist trade by offering the “Indian Detours” to AT&SF passengers. The “Detours” were one to three day bus and “Harvey Car” trips to significant Indian pueblos and ruins, Santa Fe artist’s studios and scenic areas. Young women, shown in Figure 3-9, called “couriers” or tour guides, conducted these tours. The trips were arranged from La Fonda to cultural, archaeological, and geological sites. The “couriers” were college-educated women who had traveled to Europe and spoke foreign languages. Like the “Harvey Girls” they went through 4 months of full-time training, including lectures and field tours to provide

---

79 Arnold Roonebeck (1885 – 1947) was a German-born American modernist artist. Between 1908 and 1914, Rönnebeck worked in Paris, a pupil of French figural sculptors Aristide Maillol (1861-1944), Emile Antoine Bourdelle (1861-1929), and Auguste Rodin (1840-1917). He also maintained a friendship with Spanish artist Pablo Picasso (1881-1973), then pioneering cubist representation in his paintings, drawings, and collages. He was introduced to modernist impresario and gallerist Alfred Stieglitz (1864-1946) and exhibited at his gallery known as 291. He married painter Louise Emerson (1908-1980) in New York in 1926 and moved to Denver, CO and served as director of the Denver Art Museum until 1930.
extensive background on state history, botany, biology, culture, geography, geology, and archeology during the course of a trip

Today, La Fonda’s architecture remains a benchmark of the Santa Fe style and thrives in part due to tourists and local artists. The restaurants, shops and museums surrounding the Plaza serve as a gathering place for locals, area artists, and tourists, both international and American.

La Posada in Winslow, AZ

In 1854, Illinois Senator Stephen Douglass proposed the Kansas-Nebraska Act to support his vision of a railroad to carry larger quantities of commodities from the west to his home state.80 After lengthy debating Congress passed H.R. 357, creating the Territory of AZ, and on February 24, 1863 President Abraham Lincoln signed it into law.81 Two weeks later M.E.J. Colter was born. Berke writes that by the early 1920s, “M.E.J. Colter was one of the most knowledgeable professionals about Indian cultural ways and artifacts.” She had amassed a superior personal collection of baskets, jewelry and pottery and was a regular visitor at pueblos and ceremonial gatherings (Berke, 2002, p. 140).

La Posada, The Resting Place, opened in 1930 just after the stock market crash and not a good time for tourism. M.E.J. Colter’s finest hotel was intended as the Arizona

80 The Kansas-Nebraska Act drew new borders for Kansas and Nebraska and allowed its citizens to decide the inclusion or exclusion of slavery by popular sovereignty within their boundaries. Northern abolitionists viewed the Act as a provocation against the policy of incremental abolitionism. Abolitionist leaders such as Frederick Douglass took a more revolutionary role. The nullification of the 1820 Missouri Compromise led to violent instability and became the most significant turning point to the American Civil War that broke out in 1861.

headquarters for the AT&SF Railway located within a day’s drive of the state’s big tourist attractions including Grand Canyon, the Petrified Forest, Painted Desert and the Hopi Mesas. The sprawling hotel and railroad station was the most lavish commission of her career. The Spanish Colonial Revival hacienda was the last of the great railroad inns that the AT&SF Railway built for the FHC. Her story created the fictional family history, their lifestyle, how the home came to be built and how the last heir, losing his money in the depression, sold the family hacienda to the FHC that opened it as a hotel.

To create the lavish setting Colter created the legend for the building’s life as “the grand hacienda of a wealthy Spanish landowner and his family who lived in Arizona for 120 years occasionally enlarging the structure until it finally resembled the present hotel.” Virginia Grattan stated that Colter, “could not visualize the design of a building or plan its decoration until she had thought out its history.” Her fantasy guided every aspect of her architectural design. Considered by Colter to be her masterpiece, she surpassed herself on the two-million dollar project ($40 million today), designing everything from staff uniforms, to the furniture, decor and china, and the gardens (Grattan, 1980 & Berke, 2002). Although compelling, her story is only a fabrication created to set the stage for yet another sense of place; however, without the story, some of the magic is missing.

On the other hand, the real story is worth the telling. Typical of the fate of many Harvey Houses and other station buildings, the furnishings Colter had personally selected were sold off and the building divided into AT&SF Railway offices. Ultimately, after having served as the Railway headquarters, La Posada officially closed in 1957.

82 Restorations of La Posada and its history can be seen on the web site: http://www.laposada.org/
The building was nearly demolished in 1994, after being threatened many times with abandonment. Californian, Allan Affeldt visited the hotel that year and decided to help local preservationists save it. The task entailed negotiating for 3 years with the railroad to resolve various legal and environmental issues, and financial obstacles. In 1997, the La Posada LLC purchased the property.\(^\text{83}\)

The new owners, Allan Affeldt and his artist wife, Tina Mion, spent a year living in the abandoned 80,000-square-foot hotel. Using old photographs and with support from the city of Winslow, La Posada was restored and with a wealth of historical artifacts reopened as one of the Nations Historic Hotels.\(^\text{84}\) It has been transformed into a tourism and cultural attraction having an acclaimed fine-dining restaurant in the Harvey tradition. Allan Affeldt has since made plans to purchase and restore other Harvey House Hotels.\(^\text{85}\) A master student in historic preservation could pick-up on this project as future research for a thesis or dissertation.

**The Harvey Company Indian Department and Native American Collection**

During the 19th century, Anglo settlement and the railroad expansion meant imminent change for the people of the Pueblos. In *Inventing the Southwest: the Fred Harvey Company and Native American Art*, Kathleen Howard and Diana F. Pardue (1996) imply that the changes brought about by Anglo culture made it impossible for Native Americans to maintain the cultural isolation they had been able to sustain

---

\(^{83}\) Allan Affeldt filed La Posada LLC as a Domestic in the State of California and is no longer active. This corporate entity was filed on Friday, September 8, 1995 as recorded in documents filed with the California Secretary of State.

\(^{84}\) It was listed on the National Register of Historic Places March 31, 1992, Ref.#92000256 In April 1997, the estimated cost of restoration was $12 million to Allan and his wife Tina Mion.

\(^{85}\) Allan Affeldt bought the 25,000-square-foot La Castaneda in Las Vegas, NM March 2014 for $400,000.
following the Spanish arrival. Native Americans living in Pueblo country saw the natural resources, including abundant plant and animal life, which was diminishing as more Euro-Americans moved westward.

While the US government was trying to assimilate Native Americans, the FHC/SF Railway was promoting a different image of southwestern indigenous cultures and their arts, instead of the “wild Indians” and cowboys of buffalo country. In an era when movies and books were creating a stereotype of the “Indian” complete with feathers and buckskin, the FHC was attempting to educate tourists about the different customs, languages, and cultures, and encouraging tourists to take part in real experiences and to value the Native American’s time and labor (Curtin, 2011, p. 386). No organization has had a greater impression on the American southwest as the FHC/SF Railway. This partnership essentially created the image of the southwest most Americans know today.

As the AT&SF Railway made its way across “Indian Country” the passengers had the opportunity to interact with Native Americans at AT&SF "train stops.” Pueblo people would line the station platform selling their crafts, jewelry, pottery, and other tourist oriented souvenirs adding to the travel’s experience. The AT&SF Railway depots offered a profitable location for numerous groups to sell their distinctive arts and crafts to these curious eastern railway travelers (Gratten, 1980, p. 8).

The FHC practically invented the commercially successful tourist-oriented “Indian store” before the AT&SF Railway extended tracks from their hotel in Williams, AZ to the

---

86 A companion book for the 1996 Heard Museum exhibit “Inventing the Southwest: the Fred Harvey Company and Native American Art” related to 6,000 objects donated to the museum in 1978 from the Fred Harvey Indian Department collection and the personal collection of Byron Harvey III.
Grand Canyon south rim.87 Within the FHC was an organization to purchase and promote Native American arts and crafts. Beginning in 1901, FHC Vice President John F. Huckel, who was married to Harvey's daughter Minnie, was an ardent collector of Native American art. At one time, he was one of the largest purchasers of Navajo rugs for resale. The literature indicates that Minnie Harvey Huckel was responsible for initiating the FHC Indian Department.88

The first Native American sales began with some native jewelry at the Harvey restaurant counter in Gallup, NM by Herman Schweizer manager and hobbyist art dealer. The AT&SF Railway and FHC is acknowledged as having established the marketing of Native American goods and the Southwestern style. The FHC’s involvement in the “curio” trade also affected major museum collections. The company controlled and curated much of the country’s Native American art market in the early 20th century.

Schweizer would often reject half a shipment of blankets from a local trader as “poor quality,” not up to FHC standards of quality. The market may have driven the business, but “preserving the Harvey quality image was pre-eminent” (Howard, 1996, p. 97). Hopi potters, Navajo weavers, and Zuni jewelers living in communities along the AT&SF Railway route were encouraged by Schweizer to weave rugs and blankets, make silver and turquoise jewelry and produce pottery to sell through the FHC stores

---

87 The first AT&SF train arrived at the Grand Canyon Depot 1901.

88 From Stephen Fried, 2010, p. 337, after her father’s death Minnie “wielded a great deal of power” and was very persuasive.
and in their museum exhibit areas at the Alvarado “Indian Building” in Albuquerque and Hopi House at Grand Canyon.  

Schweizer worked for the Huckel's as head of the Department and was called "The Harvey Anthropologist," although he lacked an academic education (Berke, 2002, p. 57). In 1902, he was to oversee the creation of the Alvarado Hotel “Indian Building” in the Albuquerque depot along with the assistance of Minnie and John Huckel. It is not clear from the literature how teacher and artist M.E.J. Colter came to the attention of the FHC. She was however, commissioned as a freelance interior designer to arrange the museum quality objects and the “curio shop” sales area.

Some of the most collectable work by Puebloan potters and Navajo weavers today demonstrated their crafts for the FHC at Expositions and sales locations. With the creation of the Harvey Indian Department, Native Americans were also employed as salespeople and demonstrators at selected FH/SF locations. Another purpose of the

---

89 Herman Schweizer, a native of Germany was hired to manage the museum/sales room and to be the company's collector of Indian art and crafts. Schweizer was considered "Harvey's anthropologist" although he had no credentials in the field.

90 The scientific community did not buy into Schweizer’s assumed identity as an ethnologist, regarding him as a commercial trader. He traveled throughout Indian Country, obtaining the best examples of Navajo rugs and jewelry, Pueblo pottery, and baskets from tribes in California and along the Colorado River. He also collected objects from Plains and Alaskan Indian tribes.

91 The Alvarado Hotel was an example of “Old World Charm,” built in the Spanish mission style with broad verandas, patios, and pools. The hotel was named after Hernando de Alvarado, Commander of Artillery in Coronado's Southwest expedition. C. F. Whittlesey designed the 118-room hotel and M.E.J. Colter decorated the Indian building museum and “curio shop” located between the depot and the hotel.

92 Some literature implies that M.E.J. Colter was in San Francisco visiting a FHC location and inquiring about a position. Other sources contend that Minnie Harvey Huckel was Colter’s mentor.

93 Pueblo pottery matriarchs, such as Nampeyo of Hano and Maria Martinez, realized the monetary potential of pottery while employed by the FHC. They also recognized the demise of their old ways due to drought and encroaching modernization.
Harvey Indian Art Department was to educate the Anglo public by distinguishing between good quality Native American arts and crafts and inferior imitations.

Schweizer frequently made buying trips to reservations and trading posts sending the best items to Hopi House. Author Grattan states that, “prominent people like William Randolph Hearst and George Horace Lorimer, editor of the Saturday Evening Post, were frequent visitors to the canyon, collecting fine pieces of Indian art.” For more than three decades, Hearst accumulated over four hundred Native American objects from the FHC through their Indian Department. Hearst collected a broad range of Native American art and Navajo textiles requiring only the best and in large quantities (Blomberg, 1996, p. 143). However, Schweizer often had difficulty obtaining payment from Hearst whose account ran into five figures for purchases of “unique character” Navajo blankets.94

Stephen Fried states, in order to keep up with the demand, Schweizer would go on buying sprees to obtain whole collections wherever he could find them and often commissioned silver jewelry that was lighter weight for the tourist preference. Some art experts today believe some historical Navajo rugs may have been saved from extinction by Schweizer’s saving them in the HC “vault” (Fried, 2010, p. 187).

M.E.J. Colter started accumulating an extensive collection of Native American jewelry and artifacts when she began working for the FHC, often buying items at cost through the company.95 According to Grattan, she often designed jewelry items and


95 Quote from M.E.J. Colter’s friend Frank Waters, “Her collection of old baskets, and Navajo and Zuni silver, are the best I have ever seen” (Waters, Masked Gods: Navaho and Pueblo Ceremonialism, 1950:105.)
had Native American crafts persons make them to her specifications. Grattan recounts, Colter was fascinated by Indian jewelry and "always wore lots of it herself – rings on every finger and several necklaces at once" (Grattan, 1980, p. 109). In 1952, her jewelry collection was displayed for the public at the Laboratory of Anthropology in Santa Fe, NM. The Indian Arts Fund gave her a preview party and Grattan states that, “On this occasion, she wore her most spectacular pieces.” In 1955, after her retirement to her home in Santa Fe, Colter began to have her collection of over 500 pieces of jewelry appraised and to catalogue things she planned to bequeath to MVNP. She also provided financial assistance to MVNP to make exhibition cases to display her jewelry in their museum.

96 M.E.J. Colter’s “Will” insisted that her collection be exhibiter to “emphasize the culture of the Indians of the Southwest, from prehistoric times to the most modern developments, as shown in their artifacts used for personal adornment.”
Figure 3 - 1. Map of the Old Santa Fe Trail with the AT&SF Railway closely following the route of the historic Santa Fe Trail.

Figure 3 - 2. A) Santa Fe NM Palace of Governors photo c.1822 B) photo c.1900s. Structure designated a NHL in 1960 and an American Treasure in 1999.
Figure 3-3. A) Exterior of El Ortiz Hotel in Lamy, NM c. 1910 B) Harvey Girl at the Fred Harvey lunch counter at El Ortiz Photos: NAU Fred Harvey Collection

Figure 3-4. El Navajo Hotel (left) and AT&SF Railway Depot (right) exterior Gallup, NM

Figure 3-5. El Navajo interior Navajo sand paintings NM History Archives FHC files
Figure 3-6. The 1939 M.E.J. Colter Pueblo Deco style Fred Harvey Restaurant located in Union Station Los Angeles California 2014 photo by Steve Hymon

Figure 3-7. Architect, John Gaw Meem 1925 tower and top floor addition to La Fonda Hotel on the Plaza in Santa Fe, NM 2014 photo by author
Figure 3-8. A) 1949 La Fonda’s “Cantinita” metal light fixture designed by M.E.J. Colter  
B) California tile in La Fonda women’s restroom, both 2014 photos by author

Figure 3-9. 1930s FH/SF “Detours” Couriers at La Fonda Hotel the AT&SF Railway and 
FHC transportation offices Photo from NM Historical archives #046971
Figure 3-10. Views of La Posada the restored historic M.E.J. Colter hacienda style hotel Winslow, AZ exterior photos by author 2012
CHAPTER 4
THE NATIONAL PARKS BEGINNINGS

The United States National Parks were born in the mid-1800s with a vision of a relatively small group of people. Naturalist John Muir’s (1838–1914) widely published writings and advocacy became the driving force behind the creation of several national parks.¹ “No temple made with human hands can compare with Yosemite,” wrote Muir, who crusaded for the creation of that national park (Albright, 1999, p. 33). How could a man-made environment compare with such a “natural wonder?” His activism helped to preserve the Yosemite Valley, Sequoia National Park and other Northwest wilderness areas. He founded the Sierra Club, one of the most important conservation organizations in the US.

The US Congress and President Abraham Lincoln (1809–1865) placed the Yosemite area under the protection of California during the Civil War. In 1872 Lincoln’s former general, President Ulysses S. Grant (1822–1885), made Yellowstone America’s first national park. During this period, M. E. J. Colter was growing up in St. Paul, MN and by 1883 she graduated from Saint Paul High School. In that same year, the Northern Pacific Railway was completed from St. Paul to Portland, allowing easier visitor access to the Yellowstone area (Grattan, 1980, p. 4).

At the same time wealthy industrialist, Stephen T. Mather (1867–1930) gathered a group of influential men to lobby for a federal agency might oversee America’s new

¹ Muir’s letters, essays, and books of his adventures in nature, especially in the Sierra Nevada Mountains of California, have been read by millions.
national parks. Mather organized a Sierra Nevada pack trip for a group of reporters and businessmen, including National Geographic Editor Gilbert H. Grosvenor (1875–1966). Grosvenor and the National Geographic Society got behind Mather’s park service plan and dedicated the April 1916 issue of *National Geographic Magazine* to the national parks to “further promote the values of park resources” to the American public.³

Mather’s then assistant, Horace Albright states that Grosvenor ensured every member of Congress received a copy by messenger as the “Organic Act” legislation was being considered (Albright, 1999, p. 143). When the NPS was created in 1916, Mather became its first director and began to protect the parks “unimpaired for the enjoyment of future generations, and to promote their use by all people.”⁴ Writer Wallace E. Stegner (1909–1993) called the National Parks “the best idea we ever had” making sure that America’s greatest natural treasures belong to everyone and will remain preserved forever.⁵

President Theodore “Teddy” Roosevelt (1858–1919) was one of the park system’s greatest supporters. Figure 4-1 is of John Muir with Roosevelt in 1903 while on a camping trip to Yosemite. During his presidency from 1901 to 1909, five new parks

---
² Mather’s vigorous efforts to build public and political support for the parks helped persuade Congress to create the NPS within the Organic Act of 1916. Appointed the first NPS director in May 1917, Mather continued to promote park access, development, and use by contributed generously to the parks using his personal fortune from the Thorkildsen-Mather Borax Company. Horace Albright was Mather’s assistant and became the second NPS director following Mather’s death in 1930.

³ From Albright (1999, p. 143) the entire issue focused on the wonders of America, with a heavy emphasis on national parks. Some pages were in full color. Gilbert H. Grosvenor was given the name “Tenderfoot”

⁴ [https://www.nps.gov/parkhistory/online_books/sontag/grosvenor.htm](https://www.nps.gov/parkhistory/online_books/sontag/grosvenor.htm)

⁵ Wallace Earle Stegner was an American historian, environmentalist, novelist, and short story writer. He has been called “The Dean of Western Writers.” In 1972 he won the Pulitzer Prize and in 1977 the US National Book Award.
were established, as well as 18 national monuments, 4 national game refuges, fifty-one bird sanctuaries, and over 100 million acres (40 million hectares) of national forest. His administration is known as the beginning of the “Progressive Era” that was a period of widespread social activism and political reform across the US. ⁶

**Architecture - The Early National Park Years**

According to NPS records, the distinctive features of early architecture in the National Parks were the blending of traditional European architecture with the park landscape. However, the earliest post-settlement buildings in national park settings, or in areas that later became national parks, was architecture built without consideration for the natural resources. The US Army had jurisdiction over Yosemite Park from 1891 to 1914, followed by a brief period of civilian stewardship. By 1900, the floor of Yosemite Valley was cluttered with a haphazard village development to serve the needs of the local residents and those energetic visitors who made it to the park. The pioneer architecture was vernacular in style mostly utilitarian log cabins used by stockmen, miners, and loggers.

In 1886 when the US Army began their occupation of Yellowstone, they constructed Fort Yellowstone with building plans and details similar to those in other military facilities. There were three stages of construction at Fort Yellowstone. In 1891, the first clapboard buildings were built. Figure 4-2 shows one of the historic structures built in 1897 as the Fort expanded to a two-troop fort. Figure 4-3 is an example of the last stone structures built in 1909 when the fort's capacity was 400 men or 4 troops.

Following the establishment of the NPS in 1916, the Army moved out. However, by 1917

---

⁶ Presidents Theodore Roosevelt, 1901-09, William Howard Taft, 1909-13, and Woodrow Wilson, 1913-21 are called the "Progressive Presidents"; their administrations saw intense social and political change in US society. The main objective of the Progressive movement was eliminating corruption in government.
the Army returned to finish their duty to the end of 1918. Since that time, historic Fort Yellowstone has been the park’s headquarters.  

Built originally in 1891, the Yellowstone Lake Hotel was designed by Washington, D.C. architect N.L. Haller. It was re-designed and expanded in 1903 by Robert Reamer, the Northern Pacific Railway architect of the Old Faithful Inn. His design included a clapboarded Colonial Revival structure and three porticoes that overlook the lake. Shown in Figure 4-4, it is the only example of such construction in a national park that remains today. Designated a NHL in 2015, the Lake Hotel is the oldest hotel in Yellowstone and one of a small number of the Colonial Revival-style of grand resort hotels erected during the “Golden Era.” During this period there was a focus on regional character and local history with a variety of architectural influences including Colonial, English, Swiss chalets, Spanish, and Mission Revival styles.

**Architecture – 1916 the Organic Act and the National Park Service**

Between April 24 and 25, 1912, during the House hearings on H.R. 22995, the first basic discussion of the purposes of a NPS or bureau occurred. However, how the scenic values were to be preserved or how “scenery” was to be defined is not clear. In 1911, the Century Company issued a new Dictionary and Cyclopedia that become the favored reference of Congress...[T]his authoritative dictionary added a definition of scenery that included “picturesque or pictorial point of view.”

---

7 The Mammoth Hot Springs Historic District has statewide significance as the administrative and concession headquarters of the largest national park in WY. Fort Yellowstone is listed as a NHL District, the highest designation.

Whatever source is used, “scenery” is tied to “a place,” or “feature” that often involves more than one “object” and derives special value from the combination of those objects, as viewed from some human vantage point.\(^9\) Arguments for the creation of the NPS coincided with efforts to promote Grand Canyon to national park status. Once the US Forest Service was established on the South Rim, visitors to the Southwest considered the chasm a national park.

The Organic Act of 1916 created the National Park Service (NPS). The early NPS architecture was accomplished with the aid of landscape architects who experimented with stone and logs to construct buildings in a natural way, following the example set by landscape architect Frederick Law Olmsted, Sr. (1822-1903).\(^{10}\) Early reformers, including Olmsted Sr. urged the US Congress to draft protection for the Yosemite Valley. His 1864 report on Yosemite was the first systematic justification for public protection of natural areas. His son, Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr. (1890-1957) is responsible for the establishment of formal training of landscape architects and for the standards of the profession today.\(^{11}\) He modeled the national park concept according to the mission statement in the 1916 Organic Act that established the NPS agency. “To conserve the scenery and the natural and historic objects and the wild life therein and to provide for the enjoyment of the same in such manner and by such means as will leave them unimpaired for the enjoyment of future generations.”

\(^9\) Relating to natural scenery, having beautiful or pleasant scenery as a scenic park providing or relating to views of impressive or beautiful natural scenery

\(^{10}\) Frederick Law Olmsted Sr. (1822–1903) considered one of America’s pioneer landscape architects; best known as the creator of major urban parks, such as New York’s Central Park.

\(^{11}\) Frederick Law Olmsted Jr. (1890–1957) was instrumental in the American West in the conservation and management of land, water and scenic resources. One of his greatest accomplishments was his 1928 survey guiding the acquisition of land for California’s state park system.
While early NPS architects adopted popular styles of architecture, most of the early railroad grand resort hotels were typically designed without respect for their immediate natural surroundings. Concessioners in the national parks, such as those in Yellowstone Park and Grand Canyon were in place before the park service came into being. Under NPS first Director, Stephen T. Mather policies were put in place to conserve the landscape and that all new built features would harmonize with the park’s environment (McClelland, 1998).

Some railroads and their designers appropriated the 1880s Adirondack style designs to lure Eastern tourists on their trains to western park destinations. Old Faithful Inn at Yellowstone, the El Tovar Hotel (1905) built by the AT&SF at Grand Canyon, and Glacier National Park Lodge (1913) constructed by the Great Northern Railway in Northwestern Montana were a few of the railroad great hotels. NPS historians have stated that the great inns and hotels of the early National Parks were influenced by the frame-and-timber construction, and the Swiss and Scandinavian style architecture reminiscent of the early great camps of the Adirondacks (McClelland, 1998).\(^\text{12}\)

The Mission Revival was an appropriate response to the southwestern landscape. However, it was only one of many styles associated with the Craftsman Movement (1900 to 1930). The English Cottage, Bavarian Lodge, Swiss Chalet, the Colonial Revival or Shingle Style of the east were often incorporated into the various

\(^\text{12}\) From NPS nomination form description: The architecture of the Great Camps is characterized as "Adirondack Rustic," demonstrating a conscious design response to the natural setting. The use of native building materials, the interplay of separate, specialized structures within an irregular wooded landscape, and carefully crafted features contrived to convey a primitive, rustic appearance are the dominating characteristics of each property identified as a Great Camp located in Northeast New York.
landscapes. As of 2014, Yellowstone National Park is home to five examples of NPS “rustic” architecture as the Old Faithful Inn seen in Figure 4-5, the Northeast Entrance Station, and the Norris, Madison, and Fishing Bridge museums designed for the American Association of Museums by Herbert C. Maier, all listed on the NRHP. 

Figure 4-6 is an example of the Great Camps inspired by the British Arts and Crafts Movement, the American Craftsman style and the Swiss chalet design. According to Linda Flint McClelland, Reimer combined aspects of the shingle style, Tudor and the chateau style in a “rugged mountain of shingles, stacked and peeled logs and stone” to create the Old Faithful Inn. The interior of the main hall has a “vast cathedral-like volume defined by a forest of peeled log columns and beams.”

By 1911, Reamer rejected the log construction when designing the Yellowstone Canyon Lodge in Figure 4-7, showing the influence of the Prairie School and Japanese architecture in the horizontal emphasis of the exterior shingling, window bands and the continuity of the roof. When the modern Yellowstone Canyon Village was built in the 1950s, the older Hotel had deteriorated and was beginning to slide into the canyon. After being sold for salvage, it mysteriously burned before it could be dismantled.

The Belton Chalet (1910) was the first hotel built at Glacier National Park. In 1913, the “See America First” advertising campaign of the Great Northern Railway was designed to draw Eastern tourists who usually traveled to Europe by created an “American Alps” using Swiss-inspired hotels and small chalets (Sellers, 1997, p. 20).

---

13 The Shingle style is sometimes referred to as an outgrowth of the Victorian Queen Anne style influenced by the early shingle buildings of New England colonies.

14 The NRHP is the Nation’s official list of historic places worthy of preservation. Authorized by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, the National Register is a national program to support public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect our historic and archeological resources.
The Great Northern system was bought out in the 1930s. During the Great Depression the Belton Chalet in Figure 4-8 housed Civilian Conservation Corps crews who built the “Going to the Sun” Road that is still the only road through the heights of the park. In the 1970s, the Belton Chalet was listed in the National Register.

Gilbert Stanley Underwood (1890-1960) designed unique hotels for the Union Pacific Railroad as well as buildings for the NPS. Daniel Ray Hull, NPS chief landscape engineer, had been friends with Underwood since 1912 when they met at the University of Illinois. In 1923 NPS Director, Mather opposed Underwood’s designs for a large hotel at Zion National Park causing Underwood to redesign his plan for a smaller “rustic” lodge with outlying cottages “fashioned from native pine and stone nestled in the surrounding woodland” (McClelland, 1998).

Beginning in 1921, Hull had a chance at designing his own building at Grand Canyon Figure 4-9. According to Ethen Carr (1998, p. 121), Hull’s historic administration building would help “define what would later be described as Park Service Rustic architecture, two years before Underwood initiated his Yosemite commission.” Carr also states that, Hull “had an example of earlier “rustic” park buildings (that) M.E.J. Colter had designed at Grand Canyon for the FHC.” Carr mentions that Hull “would have been familiar with Colter’s plans for tourist cabins at Indian Gardens inserted into the 1918 Forest Service Working Plans.” The NPS photograph of Hull’s administration building from the late 1920s and Figure 4-10 showing M.E.J. Colter’s earlier cabin drawings show distinctive similarities.

---

15 From: Ethan Carr (1998). Wilderness by Design: Landscape Architecture & The National Park Service. A native of Kansas, Hull studied at the University of Illinois under Charles Mulford Robinson, a professor of “civic design” and town planning from Rochester, NY. In 1913, Hull was one of four students who worked on a city planning study for strategies in the communities of Champaign-Urbana, IL (Published in Chicago: R.E. Donnelly and Sons, 1915).
Carr states that, Gilbert Stanley Underwood’s most ambitious park lodges were built in the latter part of the 1920s at Yosemite (1927) and the north rim of Grand Canyon (1928). At Yosemite Underwood worked with Hull to develop the site. The Yosemite National Park's Ahwahnee Hotel shown in Figure 1-11 is probably one of Underwood’s greatest undertakings. The name Ahwahnee was derived from a Native American term meaning deep, grassy meadow that surrounds the hotel. The description from the National Register Nomination form states: what looks like wood siding and structural timbers between the piers is actually “concrete, poured into formwork that shapes it to look like horizontal redwood siding and large milled timbers.” The stain used on the concrete is a color similar in to pine bark and redwood lumber “that reinforces the illusion that the material is wood.”

Other Underwood lodges designed for the Union Pacific Railroad’s Utah tour were located in Cedar Breaks National Monument (1924 - razed in 1972), Bryce Canyon National Park (built between 1924 and 1925), and the North Rim Lodge (1928) in Grand Canyon National Park, Arizona. However, over time fire has taken a toll on many Underwood lodges including the Grand Canyon North Rim Lodge. Rebuilt in 1930s following the original footprint, Figure 4-12 shows the current lodge and HABS drawing done from Underwood’s originals. However, the latter structure's working drawings did not have Underwood’s signature on the rebuild plans.

The Jackson Lake Lodge (1955), also designed by Underwood, possesses exceptional national significance. The lodge and associated complex of guest cottages

---

16 When constructed in 1927-28, Grand Canyon Lodge consisted of the main lodge building, 100 standard cabins, and 20 deluxe cabins for guest accommodations. The main lodge and two deluxe cabins burned in 1932 and rebuilt during 1934-1935 using most of what remained of the stone foundation, piers, walls, and chimneys of the original building. HABS = Historic American Building Survey
were recently listed on the National Register of Historic Places for having made “significant contributions to the broad patterns of American history.” Underwood used the same materials and techniques as in his other lodges with a modern twist.

At the same time Underwood’s North Rim Lodge was destroyed by fire, M.E.J. Colter was busy redeveloping the Bright Angle Camp area on the south rim designing a new Bright Angle Lodge (1935) and cabin complex near her 1914 Lookout Studio. Unlike the Lookout Studio that was situated on the rim so that viewed from a distance it appears to be a part of the canyon itself, the pioneer style lodge is situated within a unique community of southwestern cabins. According to NPS historian, Laura Soullière Harrison, some park concession architects, like M.E.J. Colter, were designing buildings that emphasized each locale’s special sense of place and “left images as memorable as the natural spectacles themselves.”

Ethan Carr states (1998, p. 132) the sprawling complex incorporated several historic cabins in the area and maintained a low profile along the rim. The Bright Angle Lodge complex is part of the NRHP designated historic Grand Canyon Village.

Colter should be recognized as an early preservationist for her efforts to save from demolition two historic Grand Canyon cabins that she “recycled” into guest accommodations adding to the visible history of the South Rim. One cabin, the Red Horse Station, originally built as a stagecoach stop from Flagstaff, was at one time situated 16 miles (26 km) south of the South Rim. In 1901 when the Santa Fe Railway

---


18 From NRHP Number: 75000343, Survey number: HABS AZ-136 Significance: Bright Angel Lodge is of regional significance as a complex of buildings associated with and the product of architect and interior decorator Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter.
reached the South Rim, early settler Ralph Cameron disassembled the stage stop and moved it to the south rim, rebuilding it to the west of the 1890 “Buckey” O'Neill Cabin, Figure 4-13.¹⁹

In 1902, Cameron added a wood frame second floor to the log cabin first floor and named it the Cameron Hotel. From 1907, the Red Horse Station (Figure 4-14) also housed the park’s first post office. These two buildings are the only remaining structures from the 1890s stagecoach era at Grand Canyon.²⁰ In the 1938 NPS publication Park and Recreation Structures, Albert H. Good states that these “historic landmarks have established the structural theme for the Bright Angel Lodge and all its connecting and outlying cabins.”

**Creation of National Park Service 1938 Design**

Through the 1935 publication Park Structures and Facilities and the 1938 Park and Recreation Structures, both credited to NPS architectural consultant, Albert H. Good, the NPS Rustic style of architecture became the foundation for all US park structures. Guidelines and visual examples were provided so that structures would blend into the park landscapes using local building material, such as native rocks, logs, and shakes/wood shingles for visible exteriors. The Acknowledgement written by NPS Director, Conrad L. Wirth (1899 – 1993) for the 1935 Park Structures and Facilities states, “Few architects have not had very extensive experience in meeting the special

---

¹⁹ William Owen “Buckey” O'Neill (1860-1898) was a sheriff, newspaper editor, miner, politician, gambler and lawyer, mainly in Arizona. His nickname came from his tendency to “buck the tiger” (play contrary to the odds) at card games. He died at the age of 38, as a Captain under “Teddy” Roosevelt in the battle of San Juan Hill, Cuba.

²⁰ The first pioneer settlements along the rim came in the 1880s. They discovered that tourism was more profitable than mining. Early tourist accommodations were not much different from the mining camps.
demands of park structure design as applied to natural areas; nor did any volume such as this one exist anywhere.²¹

The architectural style that is termed National Park “rustic” is characterized by stone and rough-hewn timbers used in the western parks, or the adobe typical of the Native American Pueblos of the Southwest (Frankenberg, Robert & James Garrison, 2002). This designation has been given to administration buildings, park residences, lodges and cabins, bridges, fire grates, and numerous other structures. The combined 1938 revised book titled Park and Recreation Structures was published by the NPS contained more photograph examples and architectural drawings. Both editions state that NPS “rustic” “is a style which, through the use of native materials in proper scale…the avoidance of several straight lines and over sophistication, gives the feeling of having been executed by pioneer craftsmen with limited hand tools. It thus achieves sympathy with surroundings and with the past.”

M.E.J. Colter’s vision for her 1914 Grand Canyon architecture designs followed this philosophy before these 1930s guidelines were set by the NPS. In the 1938 expanded Park and Recreation Structures, Wirth acknowledged that some park structures “were created entirely independent of Service participation.” Photographs of Colter’s Lookout Studio and Hermit’s Rest (1914) were not included in either NPS architecture guide since Colter’s work was done for an independent company, the FH/SF Railway partnership; before the Grand Canyon became a National Park in 1919.

Nevertheless, under the category of “Lodges” in the 1938 expanded single volume an unidentified black and white photograph along with the plat of M.E.J. Colter’s

²¹ Conrad Lewis Wirth was the Assistant Director of the NPS in 1935. Wirth was the longest serving director of the NPS between 1951 and 1964 http://npshistory.com/publications/park_structures_facilities/ack.htm
Bright Angle Lodge complex is the same illustration shown in Figure 4-15 indicating the location of Lookout Studio (Good, 1938, p. 72). Other photographs of the cabins in the Bright Angle Lodge area are also included in the same section as examples to follow when designing park lodging (Good, 1938, pp. 73-74).

The 1975 NRHP Bright Angle Lodge nomination form states, “Although many materials and styles have been incorporated in the construction of Bright Angel Lodge, the complex is unified by the design skills of Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter into a complete and coherent little village.” The AT&SF early 1900s depot area, includes the El Tovar Hotel, M.E.J. Colter’s Hopi House (1905), Lookout Studio (1914), and the Bright Angle Lodge (1935) and village area, was originally designed for the US Forest Service suggesting the incorporation of the Law of the Indies.

Photos and floor plans of M.E.J. Colter’s tourist cabins take up two pages in the same volume under the “Cabin” section (Good, 1938, pp. 54-55). Good’s text states,

Nowhere are the potentialities for interest based on a variety of materials and forms more completely realized than in the Bright Angel Lodge and its connected dependencies on the South Rim of the Grand Canyon. The resulting informality of the ensemble is appealing in the extreme, deserving of close study, and should inspire those charged with the design of large-scale overnight housing in parks with a deep desire to create informal individuality of regional flavor in an equivalent degree.

As part of President Franklin D. Roosevelt’s New Deal construction programs, NPS director Horace Albright capitalized on the opportunity combining the president’s

---

22 This black and white photograph (c1930s) of Bright Angle Lodge and cabins taken by M. E.J. Colter from an airplane is in the GCNP Museum archives.

23 Gordon C. Kappell, Regional Historian for the USNPS Western Region Office, prepared this nomination form. The Grand Canyon Village Historic District (nominated in 1975) consists of a core area of buildings that range in date from the l890s to the mid-1930s that includes M.E.J. Colter’s Hopi House (1905), Lookout Studio (1914), and the Bright Angle Lodge complex (1935).
emergency programs with the park NPS’s needs. Post World War II created large numbers of American families arriving in their cars to visits national parks. In the early 1950s, the crisis had grown to overwhelming proportions and the small rustic-style nature centers and museums built by the Civilian Conservation Corps (CCC) in the 1930s were too small to accommodate the increase numbers of tourists.

By 1955, the Director of the NPS, Conrad Wirth, proposed a plan to improve the visitors’ experience by developing modern conveniences and implementing a method of educating the visiting public with the introduction of the “visitor center.” The “Mission 66” project was a departure from the rustic-style buildings constructed in the early years of the NPS. “Mission 66” designers adopted use of modern building materials and a contemporary architectural form when constructing the new park centers. These newer structures lack the connection to Sense of Place created by Colter at Grand Canyon.

Additional research on the work done by the CCC followed by the “Mission 66” development of NPS architecture during the post-WWII era is extensive. During this period, the NPS designers faced new challenges such as increases in materials and labor costs, post-WWII automobile ownership, and the forty-hour workweek. The change in style from the rustic style to a more modern form of architecture has made a distinction between the early developments of US national parks allowing the early architectural form to represent a historic Sense of Place for visitors.

---

24 The New Deal was a series of domestic programs enacted in the United States between 1933 and 1938, and a few that came later. They included both laws passed by Congress as well as presidential executive orders during the first term (1933–37) of Franklin Delano Roosevelt.

25 C. C. enrollees were recruited by the Department of Labor, organized and transported by the War Department, and put to work by the Departments of Agriculture and Interior. The NPS was one of the bureaus designated to receive enrollees under the Interior allotment. The number of state park C. C. C camps under NPS supervision was reduced after 1935. By 1938 there were only half as many state park camps active as there had been in 1936.
Figure 4-1. Theodore Roosevelt with John Muir during a camping trip to Yosemite c. 1903 photo Sierra Club Collection

Figure 4-2. Norris Soldier Station (now Museum of the NPS Ranger) NPS photo c.2012 part of the Fort Yellowstone National Historic Landmark designation.
Figure 4-3. NPS photo c.1909 the last US Army stone structure, now Albright Visitor Center a part of Mammoth Hot Springs Historic District & Fort Yellowstone Historic Landmark District, the first “information office” or visitor center

Figure 4-4. Constructed in 1891 Lake Yellowstone Hotel revived as a grand resort hotel of Colonial Revival style by architect Robert C. Reamer and designated a NHL 2015, is the park’s oldest hotel. Xanterra Parks & Resorts® photo
Figure 4-5. The Old Faithful Inn was designed by Northern Pacific Railway architect, Robert Reimer (designed 1903, built 1903–1904, wing addition 1913–1914, wing addition 1927–1928, addition1936) author photo 2012

Figure 4-6. An example of Adirondacks Great Camps – The Sagamore Lodge c.1883 Listed in 1976 National Register of Historic Places web photo
Figure 4-7. Robert Reamer - Yellowstone Canyon Lodge NPS demolished early 1950s

Figure 4-8. Belton Chalet - Outside the west entrance to Glacier National Park. This historic hotel was the first Great Northern Railway hotel in the area.

Figure 4-9. Daniel R. Hull “rustic” style building Landscape Division NPS offices of Xanterra South Rim. Photo from NRHP nomination form
Figure 4-10. Cabin drawings by M.E.J. Colter for project planned before WWI, Used in Colter’s 1922 Grand Canyon Phantom Ranch project

Figure 4-11. Gilbert Stanley Underwood c. 2012 Ahwahnee Hotel Yosemite National Park NPS photo One of the grand lodges in America’s National Park System.

Figure 4-12. Gilbert Stanley Underwood Grand Canyon No. Rim Lodge HABS/NPS file
Figure 4-13. Historic "Buckey" O'Neill Cabin A) c.1935 GRCA #628 during restoration B) author’s photo 2012 in Bright Angle Lodge complex

Figure 4-14. Red Horse Station historic old stage-stop & post office A) c.1903 photo NAU.PH.90.9.341 as Cameron Hotel B) c.1935 GRCA #9721 restoration at Bright Angle Lodge complex and C) author 2012 photo shows other side
Figure 4-15. Bright Angle Lodge Plan from NPS 1938 p. 72 Parks and Recreation Structures M.E.J. Colter’s 1930s aerial photograph GCNP#9538 showing the Lodge and Lookout Studio’ tower on the canyon edge.
CHAPTER 5
IN SEARCH OF ANCIENT TOWERS

Colter's interest in Native American arts and culture can be traced back to her childhood.¹ Her personal interest in indigenous cultures grew throughout her lifetime. Longtime friend and writer Frank Waters attests (1950, p.105), "Her collections of old baskets, and Navajo and Zuni silver, are the best I have ever seen. But it has always been life itself which has interested her most." She had amassed a large collection of jewelry, baskets and pottery while employed by Fred Harvey. As the company interior decorator, she had close contact with Herman Schweizer and the FHC Native American Collection creating an opportunity for her to see and often purchase choice objects at company cost.²

She made trips throughout the Four Corners region getting to know Native American craftspeople by going to Indian festivals, trading posts, and shops looking for decorative items and commission jewelry pieces for herself from individual artists.³ Even after she retired, Colter continued to visit Pueblo ceremonies and maintain her native

---

¹ Both Grattan (1980, p.110) & Berke (2002, p.27) As a child, Colter was given a set of Sioux drawings of the Battle of the Little Bighorn from 1876 done by Sioux prisoners at Fort Keogh in Minnesota. Colter considered the drawing her “most priceless and precious possession.” She donated them to the Custer Battlefield National Monument before her death.

² Schweizer questioned were some purchased items had gone and discovered that M.E.J. Colter’s name was on invoices at the wholesale purchased price. University of Northern Arizona, Flagstaff, AZ Cline Library Fred Harvey Collection - "Weekly Ledger Report of Sales---Indian Department"

³ From Arnold Berke (2002, p. 265) Colter began collecting in 1902 while working for the FHC on the Alvarado Indian Museum. By the time she retired, she had acquired over 500 pieces of jewelry and other items that ranged in age from prehistoric to the 20th century.
friendships. She was able to travel because of pensions from FH/SF Railway and a lifetime pass on the AT&SF Railway system.

**Ancient Ruins of the Southwest**

Prehistoric cultures that occupied the Southwestern US left no written record of themselves. However, they left behind remains of their existence at abundant locations, in cliff-dwellings, on rock art and artifacts that reveal their cultures. The best preserved archaeological sites and dwellings are now protected by the 1906 Antiquities Act within many Arizona, Colorado, Utah and New Mexico National Parks and Monuments. The Grand Canyon was first reported to the civilized world in 1540 by early Spanish explorers. By 1852, an expedition lead by Captain Lorenzo Sitgreaves provided the first good description of the area.

According to the NPS history, in 1858 the US War Department explored the navigable waters of the Colorado River from the south, stopping at the foot of the

---

4 M.E.J. Colter retired from the Santa Fe Railway on January 1, 1944 after 29 ½ years as architect and designer but continued as interior designer for the Fred Harvey Co. until she officially retired at the age of seventy-nine in 1948 after forty-six years (Grattan, 1980, p.104). From Grattan, (1980, p.108) Colter always had friends “who would go with her to the Indian dances. In 34 years she had never missed the Gallup ceremonials.”

5 The Antiquities Act of 1906 (U.S.C., title 16, sec. 431) states: The President of the United States is hereby authorized, in his discretion, to declare by public proclamation historic landmarks, historic and prehistoric structures, and other objects of historic or scientific interest that are situated upon the lands owned or controlled by the Government of the United States to be national monuments.

6 According to Harold S. Colten (founder of the Museum of Northern Arizona in Flagstaff) and Frank C. Baxter (1932), *Days in the Painted Desert and the San Francisco Mountains* a Guide, Lt. Lorenzo Sitgreaves’ most important discovery was the San Francisco Volcanic Field in 1851. He also wrote the first descriptions of Hualapai Indians and “Wupatki ruins.” Sitgreaves published a large-scale map that correctly located the Little Colorado River in relation to several conspicuous landmarks and tributary streams. Most historians recognize him for describing unknown country before 1851. By the spring of 1852, Sitgreaves was back in Washington, D.C., but the report of his expedition was not published until the summer of 1853. However, it failed to describe the area for a sufficient roadway and was too late to be of use to the Pacific Railroad expedition.
canyon. However, no complete exploration of the Grand Canyon had been made until 1869, when US Civil War Major John Westley Powell and a group of nine men made the first journey down the uncharted Colorado River in four small wooden boats.

Using the Antiquities Act in 1906, the US Congress set aside a national park of approximately 52,000 acres in Colorado at Mesa Verde recognized as the Nation’s major archeological reserve. MVNP has the distinction of being the only western national park created to “preserve the works of men.” To Native Americans, places where their ancestors once lived remain part of an active cultural landscape. Grand Canyon has been home to people for thousands of years and is considered sacred by many Native American groups. It continues to be home to a few tribal communities and a place of spiritual and physical enrichment to many others.

Considering M.E.J. Colter’s manual on the Watchtower and her typewritten notes of 1933 regarding various Southwest Four Corners ruins, she had studied and knew the archeology of the area and history of Grand Canyon thoroughly. Well into her sixties,

---

7 Land acquired in the Spanish American War was uncharted. In 1858, the War Department sent Lieutenant Joseph Ives on a steamboat up the Colorado River. His job was to test the navigability of the river and to scout for potential railroad routes across the southwest.

8 Civil War Major John Westley Powell became Director of the United States Geological Survey following the first Colorado River expedition.

9 Mesa Verde is Spanish for green table. The Ancestral Pueblo people made it their home for over 700 years, from CE 600 to 1300. Today the park protects nearly 5,000 known archeological sites, including 600 cliff dwellings. MVNP was established in 1906 to preserve archeological sites built by the Ancestral Puebloans. It is known as North America’s richest archeological preserve. MVNP is also a UNESCO World Heritage Site under Criterion (iii). Located in Montezuma County, Colorado, it is the largest archeological preserve in the US with more than 4,300 sites, including 600 cliff dwellings.

10 On June 29, 1906, President Theodore Roosevelt established MVNP to “preserve the works of man,” the first national park of its kind. According to the NPS, the continued preservation of both cultural and natural resources is the focus of the park’s research and resource management staff.

11 At one time four photograph albums with M.E.J. Colter’s typed information pages were located in the Watchtower kiva for Harvey Guides and visitors to learn more about the structures Colter had researched.
Mesa Verde was only one of many areas she had researched before designing the Watchtower at Desert View on the eastern canyon rim.\(^{12}\)

In addition to being one of the world’s most visited natural spectacles and a World Heritage Site, the Grand Canyon has an extensive human history. Archaeologists have found evidence of human use at Grand Canyon dating back 12,000 years and M.E.J. Colter was well read and knowledgeable of their connection.\(^{13}\) Initially five Native Americans tribes were thought to be connected to the canyon area. Currently eleven tribes have known ties to the canyon as a place necessary to their continuing cultural traditions.\(^{14}\) Native Nations own some areas bordering the canyon rims.

The Navajo Reservation is on the east end. The Hopi, located in the middle of the Navajo Reservation, are one of the oldest living cultures in documented history with an oral memoire of their past back thousands of years. The Havasupai Indian (People of the blue-green water) Reservation is on the south-central side of the Grand Canyon. The Hualapai Indian Reservation is on the southwest rim of the Grand Canyon, which is referred to as “Grand Canyon West” or the “West Rim.”\(^{15}\) Hoping to boost their economy

\(^{12}\) MEJ Colter’s 1933 letter to the Fred Harvey Transportation Department that accompanied her Manual for Drivers and Guides Descriptive of the Indian Watchtower at Desert View and its Relation, Architecturally, to the Prehistoric Ruins of the Southwest, originally published by the Fred Harvey Company and republished with photographs in 2015 by the Grand Canyon Association.

\(^{13}\) MEJ Colter cited Days in the Painted Desert and the San Francisco Mountains a Guide by Harold S. Colten (founder of the Museum of Northern Arizona in Flagstaff) and Frank C. Baxter (1932), and writings by Rev. H.R. Voth and excerpts from A.V. Kidder (1885 – 1963) in Southwest Archaeology (1924). Kidder was the foremost American archaeologist of his day involved in the study of the southwestern United States and Mesoamerica.

\(^{14}\) Those 11 tribes are the: Havasupai, Hopi, Hualapai, the Navajo Nation, Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians, Las Vegas Band of Paiute Indians, Moapa Band of Paiute Indians, Paiute Indian Tribe of Utah, San Juan Southern Paiute, Yavapai-Apache Nation, and The Pueblo of Zuni. The entire canyon is designated as a Traditional Cultural Property.

\(^{15}\) “Hualapai” (pronounced Wal-lah-pie) means “People of the Tall Pines.” In 1883, an executive order established the Hualapai reservation. They operate The Hualapai River Runners, the only Indian-owned and operated river rafting company on the Colorado River.
the Hualapai opened the “Grand Canyon Skywalk” in 2007 a horseshoe-shaped glass-bottomed walkway extends 60 feet out from their reservation over the edge of the Grand Canyon 4,000 feet below. Other groups are the Paiute Tribes of Utah, the Zuni in NM and, most recently, the White Mountain Apache of eastern AZ. The map in Figure 5-9 indicates the eleven tribes associated with Grand Canyon.

Keith H. Basso, has written about the Western Apache’s value of location to their culture. He states the importance of places is experienced as inherently meaningful and locations are significant to their history. Places also serve as durable symbols of distant events and are an aid for remembering and constructing social traditions. Relationships to place are lived in the company of others and sensed together by agencies of myth, prayer, music, art, architecture, and recurrent forms of religion and political ritual (Basso, 1996, p. 109). Basso also discusses the Pueblo relation to the land in the form of geological locations. He addresses the idea of stories from oral traditions are tied to “imposing geological elements” so that future generations will not lose the stories because they are attached to a location (Basso, 1996, p. 64).

Who Were the Ancient Builders of the Southwest?

The land of present-day AZ is one of the oldest inhabited US areas. From the archaeological record early inhabitants lived in the Four Corners region of the Southwest.¹⁶ They were the predecessors of the contemporary Puebloans in AZ and NM.¹⁷ Archaeologists contend that three significant cultures emerged as farming

---

¹⁶ The states of Arizona, Colorado, New Mexico and Utah come together at the Four Corners.

¹⁷ Three UNESCO World Heritage Sites located in the US are credited to the Pueblos: Mesa Verde National Park, Chaco Culture National Historical Park and Taos Pueblo designated as a NHL.
societies supplementing their diet by hunting and gathering. They included the Anasazi, who erected cliff houses in northern AZ and NM, Utah and Colorado. The Hohokam (500 – 1450 CE) were pit dwellers who dug complex irrigation systems in central AZ. The Mogollon culture hunted and farmed along the riverine areas of western NM and eastern AZ. Designation of “Mogollon” comes from the Mogollon Mountains, named after Don Juan Ignacio Flores Mogollon, Spanish Governor of NM from 1712-1715 and has been attributed to the prehistoric people that had lived in the area.

The present Pueblo ancestors’ culture flourished between the 11th and 14th century and built many of the elaborate cliff dwellings such as Mesa Verde. The Anasazi are considered the ancestors of modern Southwestern Pueblo peoples, including the Hopi, Zuni and modern Puebloans. The early residents relied heavily on their relationship with “Mother Earth,” the sky, the sun and the natural elements to provide food, clothing and shelter. These ancient Pueblos thrived as a civilization; nevertheless, at the peak of their existence, they suddenly left. Although no one is completely sure why these societies collapsed, Linda S. Cordell (1943–2013) points out in her 1997 book, *Archaeology of the Southwest*, that these “people felt themselves pushed” by a

---

18 Archaeology is an important field of anthropology that is the broad study of human culture and biology. Archaeologists concentrate their studies on past societies and changes in those societies over time.

19 Early archaeological work was confined to Europe, to southwestern Asia or the so-called cradle of civilization and a few areas of the Americas. Archaeology became established as a formal discipline in the 19th and early 20th centuries. Today, archaeologists study the great cultural diversity of humanity in every corner of the world. Archaeologists still debate when a distinct Anasazi culture emerged, but the current consensus suggests they first appeared around BCE 1200. The Mogollon culture flourished from the archaic period, c. 200 CE, to either 1450 or 1540 CE, when the Spanish arrived.

20 The word “Anasazi” is Navajo for "Ancient Ones" or "Ancient Enemy." It was applied to the ruins of Mesa Verde by Richard Wetherill, a rancher and trader who, in 1888–1889, was the first Anglo-American to explore the sites in that area. Wetherill knew and worked with Navajos and understood the meaning of the word. Modern recommendation is Ancient Pueblo people or Ancestral Puebloans, the modern Hopi call them "Hisatsinom" (People of Long Ago).
combination of social and environmental changes and were “pulled to more stable weather patterns, fertile farm lands, safer communities and spiritual fulfillment.”

The NPS at Grand Canyon National Park has chosen to use ancestral Puebloans to emphasize the connection between ancient and modern people and cultures. Ongoing discovery of archeological sites found on the canyon rim and within the canyon is evidence that ancient people inhabited the Grand Canyon area.\textsuperscript{21}

A research study using tree ring technology indicates it was a mixture of environmental and societal pressures.\textsuperscript{22} The study used tree-ring data, the ideal growing conditions of traditional maize crops, and a suite of computer programs to construct a detailed map of Southwest tree growth regions from the study for the past 2,000 years as indicated in Figure 5-1. The study revealed that “natural shifts in local climate made it harder and harder to grow maize, the main food crop for the Pueblos in the ancient southwest.”

M.E.J. Colter explains in her Manual (1933) that tree-ring dating was used to verify the age of various timbers found in ruins.\textsuperscript{23} She indicates that, “Beginning with trees whose actual cutting date was known, he (Dr. A. E. Douglass) was able to devise

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{21} One site that tourists are able to visit is the Tusayan Pueblo Ruin and Museum. During the summer of 2001 with funding through the “Vanishing Treasures” program, park archeologists stabilized the ruin in an effort to protect it from ongoing degradation.
\item \textsuperscript{22} Researcher, Kyle Bocinsky, PhD states in his research, “the Pajarito Plateau of the northern Rio Grande, where growing conditions remained stable, saw a large population spike.” (Study published in the 2014 journal of Nature Communications)
\item \textsuperscript{23} The father of dendrochronology, in 1909 A. E. Douglass, hypothesized that the tree rings of the yellow pine (Pinus ponderosa) “are likely to form a measure of the precipitation” and that “individual rings of the trees are extremely well marked and leave no doubt whatever as to their purely annual or seasonal character.” Douglass began seeking prehistoric wood in an effort to extend his modern ring chronologies into the past. He collected more than 10,000 laboratory specimens during a 45 year period.
\end{itemize}
a definite historical chart for ring growth going back to 700 CE (as shown in Figure 5-2) by comparing the rings in any given tree with the chart he is able to tell when the tree was cut.”

The timbers can be used to date buildings and archaeological sites. In addition, tree rings are used to date changes in the climate such as sudden cool or dry periods. Since the beams used in the construction of structures were once trees it is possible to check their rings with the historical chart and obtain a series of dates for a large number of the ancient structures in the Southwest (Colter, 1933, p. 71).

Often faced with climate changes these ancient people were more willing to abandon their homes than abandon their way of life. In his research Dr. Bocinsky, suggests it would be “no different during modern climate change, should farmers or fishermen choose to move from region to region rather than adapt to a changing environment, the Pueblo people just moved.” Colter also noted in her Manual that in the 1930s Dr. Douglass was making a study of climate conditions in the Southwest and tree growth evidence of wet and dry periods that indicated the extent of drought periods (Colter, 1933, p. 71).

In his 1896 Smithsonian paper, "The Prehistoric Culture of Tusayan," Jesse Walter Fewkes, begins with, “The Pueblo Indians offer interesting problems to the historian, the archaeologist, and the ethnologist. Among these people are found the oldest villages of the US continuously inhabited from that time until the present day.”

---

24 The absolute dating method utilizing tree ring growth. It is based on the fact that trees produce one growth ring each year. Narrow rings grow in cold and/or dry years, and wide rings grow in warm years with plenty of moisture.

25 Kyle Bocinsky holds a post-doctoral appointment in the Village Ecodynamics Project Lab at WSU, working on a collaborative project with ASU, UNM, and UIUC to design a cyber-tool called "SKOPE" (Synthesized Knowledge of Past Environments) to assist in locating paleo-environmental data and putting them into formats useful for archaeologists and other historical scientists.
Colter quotes Fewkes regarding his research on kivas and their connections to standing towers. Dr. Fewkes found abundant means of explaining the past to the present by comparing the modern Hopi kiva ceremonial use.\(^{26}\)

In a later article, Fewkes bemoans the destruction of cliff dwellings and claims the prehistoric houses were made by the ancestors of the Hopi and Zuni and that Case Grande, a Hohokam ruin in AZ, claimed by the modern Pima (Akimel O’odham or River People) and has been since 1697 (Fewkes, 1896 pp. 279-282).\(^{27}\) Both the Pima and Papago believed they are descendants of Hohokam farmers.\(^{28}\) During the 1860s through 1880s, people began to visit the ruins with the arrival of railroads and stage coach routes that ran past Casa Grande.\(^{29}\) The damage from souvenir hunting, graffiti and vandalism raised concerns about the preservation of the Casa Grande.\(^{30}\)

Before the Antiquities Act of 1906, the Department of the Interior had under its jurisdiction seven national monuments of historical and archaeological interest that included Mesa Verde ruins.\(^{31}\) Only several pages long, the Act weakened the indiscriminate excavations on all federal land, controlled the commercialization of

\(^{26}\) The study of the Hopi comprised a good part of Jesse W. Fewkes’ contributions to ethnology. He saw the importance of the record of their calendric ceremonies.

\(^{27}\) Archaeological evidence shows their probable ancestors to have been the Hohokam, who built a network of irrigation canals for farming.

\(^{28}\) Anthropologist and historian Adolph Bandelier visited the Casa Grande ruins in 1883-1884 and reported on its condition and probable significance. The name Papago means “bean people”; however, in 1986 the Papago changed their name to Tohono O’odham, meaning “people of the desert.”

\(^{29}\) The Casa Grande National Monument is a complex that may have appeared around 1350 CE. One of the largest prehistoric structures ever built in North America, its purpose remains a mystery.

\(^{30}\) In 1903 a shelter roof of corrugated iron supported by redwood timbers was built over Casa Grande. Between 1906 and 1908 major excavations and repairs of the ruins were conducted under the direction of Jesse Walter Fewkes, Bureau of Ethnology.

\(^{31}\) The Antiquities Act became law on June 8, 1906 (34 Stat. 225, 16 U.S.C. 431-433) reflects a landmark movement to preserve and protect cultural resources and has been amended once. Section 3 of Stat. 225, 16 U.S.C. 432, allows permits for excavation to: examine, excavate and gather knowledge.
ancient objects, recognized looting as a crime, authorized the creation of national monuments, and established the principle that government should serve as steward of the Nation's cultural, historical, and natural heritage.

According to the NPS, the Antiquities Act created the basis for the federal government to protect archeological sites from looting and vandalism. The Antiquities Act is the first law to establish that archeological sites on public lands are important. This Act also provided a foundation of public policy for the preservation of historic places and structures, cultural landscapes, and other cultural resources developed during the course of the 20th century.  

Although Fewkes states in his papers that the Hopi and Zuni are the living descendants of the cliff dwellers, he persists that “cliff dwellings must be protected, not for Pueblo communities but only for the scientific endeavor.”  

Ronald F. Lee claims that the single word “scientific” in the Antiquities Act ultimately provided Congress with sufficient reason to establish dozens of national monuments (Lee, 2000, p. 240). Conversely, rather than protecting a national historic resource, the government sought to safeguard "resources" like timber, water and forests (Lee, 2000, p. 222).

The Pueblo people did little to disturb their natural environment in the process of building their dwellings. They gathered natural materials for construction, choosing to use soil and easily quarried rock. Their sensitivity to the landscape, reflected in their

32 Although the law was titled the Antiquities Act, potential national monuments did not have to be exclusively archaeological to qualify (Lee 1970: 74, p. 240; Rothman 1989: 69–70). The first monument to be proclaimed was Devil's Tower in Montana and the fourth was Petrified Forest in AZ.

33 Following Fewkes's excavations in Spruce Tree House (Fewkes, 1909), the site was opened for public visitation but saw little additional research until the year 2000.

architecture, bears testament to their value of the environment. Their resulting vernacular architectural is organic and sculptural with an intimate relationship to their world, creating a sense of place. M.E.J. Colter looked to these practices when designing Hermit’s Rest and the Lookout Studio (1914). Some of the best examples of this type of structures are at Chaco Canyon, Hovenweep National Monument and MVNP.  

“Many of the cliff dwellings at Mesa Verde are small, only one or two rooms built in alcoves or shallow caves,” writes archaeologist Larry Nordby in a paper from a presentation, The Conservation of Decorated Surfaces on Earthen Architecture (J. Paul Getty Trust, 2006). He notes that one of the largest cliff-dwelling sites is “Cliff Palace” at MVNP, one that Mary Colter researched extensively. Some features of the “Cliff Palace” were incorporated into the tower at Desert View. She researched most of these Four Corners areas including Canyon de Chelly National Monument in Navajo country, and Wupatki National Monument east of Flagstaff, Arizona.  

In the 1920s, many people in the Flagstaff area and the MNA were concerned that the archaeological resources in the Wupatki area were being destroyed and vandalized. In 1924, President Calvin Coolidge declared Wupatki a National Monument. In the early 1930s, Colter had knowledge of these ruins through her previous research

35 On June 29, 1906, President Theodore Roosevelt established Mesa Verde National Park to “preserve the works of man,” the first national park of its kind. Currently Mesa Verde has over 4,700 archaeological sites including 600 cliff dwellings and the mesa top sites of pithouses, pueblos, masonry towers, and farming structure.

36 In 1996 water seepage into the rear of Cliff Palace damaged the village and retired Research Archaeologist at MVNP, Larry V. Nordby began a preservation project to study the village.

for her other Grand Canyon buildings. She “remembered numerous ancient towers” when given the task of designing a “viewing station” at Desert View, planned for the park eastern end. Needing a better look, she arranged to charter an airplane to spot the locations of tower ruins from the air, and then go overland by “Harvey Car” to obtain a close-up view.\(^{38}\)

**Mary Elisabeth Jane Colter’s Research**

In 1905, Colter’s Hopi House opened on Grand Canyon as a AT&SF concession building for the FHC. Conceived as a place where tourists could view and buy Native American handcrafts, her designs was inspired by dwellings at Old Oraibi on the Hopi Mesa and built from local sandstone and juniper.\(^{39}\) She frequently visited Oraibi where she observed their culture as it existed and took careful notes of the Hopi architectural style and methods of construction. Her visits to both abandoned and inhabited pueblos have been documented and her lifelong study of their culture is evident in her collection of Native American art and jewelry that now survives in the MVNP Museum collection and Little Bighorn Battlefield Monument archives (Berke, 2002 & Grattan, 1980).

Colter’s first stand-alone ethno historically correct structure was at the time of its construction the first introduction for many park visitors to the architecture and life ways of native peoples of the Southwest. While demonstrating their crafts for the FHC to sell, Hopi people lived in Hopi House and Navajos lived in their adjacent hogans, example

---

\(^{38}\) M.E.J. Colter’s notes and photographs are located in the Grand Canyon Museum archives. In the late 1930s four albums with her photos and notes were on display in the Desert View Watchtower.

\(^{39}\) The village of Old Oraibi, established in 1100 CE, is considered the oldest continuously inhabited settlement in North America. It is a Hopi village in Navajo County, Arizona, US, in the northeastern part of the state. Known as Orayvi by the native inhabitants, it is located on Third Mesa on the Hopi Reservation near Kykotsmovi Village.
shown in Figure 5-3. Colter arranged the interior sales space as if they were Hopi living spaces, as shown in Figure 5-4 A. Shown in Figure 5-4 B is a recent exhibit of Navajo rugs in the Hopi House museum area.

For over 100 years, the FHC offered a curated museum quality collection of Native arts and crafts and items for sale so visitors could take something home to remember their Grand Canyon visit. The Hopi House construction was authentic; builders from Hopi were hired by the FHC to execute Colter's design using technologies and principles deeply grounded in their tradition. Hopi people build their homes with *sumi'nangwa*, all together, and *nami'nangwa*, mutual concern for others welfare. Virginia Grattan asserts that for Colter it was “an opportunity to re-create the dwelling of an ancient culture and acquaint the public with the richness and beauty of Native American art” (1980, p. 19).

Colter was a stickler for detail when she replicated the 800-year-old Third Mesa Hopi pueblo. As the architect and interior designer for the FHC, she constructed her own unique expression of the Arts and Crafts movement with the indigenous culture. Her work was a synthesis of West Coast and mid-western influences and her study of Southwestern architecture. Her Grand Canyon structures were often inspired by pueblo constructions, cliff dwellings, and towers found in the MVNP and Hovenweep National Monument ruins and the living communities existing on the Hopi Mesas.

---

40 The hogan is a sacred home for the Dine (Navajo) people who practice traditional religion. The hogan is a sacred dwelling to shelter the people of the earth, and a refuge in harmony between the sacred mountains, under the care of “Mother Earth” and “Father Sky.” Every family has a traditional hogan for ceremonies and to keep themselves in balance. The Navajos hogans are usually made of wooden poles, tree bark and mud. The doorway of each hogan opens to the east to greet the morning sun as well as good blessings. The hogans at the Grand Canyon Hopi House no longer exist.

41 Phone interview 3-25-2016 with Hopi/Apache Phyllis Yoyetewa Kachinhongva (1959- ) acknowledged that her grandfather was hired to help construct both Hopi House and Desert View Watchtower.
She took meticulous efforts to integrate her canyon facilities into the landscape, often using a clay scale model to study the exact placement of her design into the environment. Not only did she make an exact model of the proposed Watchtower, she had the AT&SF engineers build a seventy-foot framework on the location to inspect the view (Berke, 2002, p. 192). Her training as an artist and years as a teacher compelled her to insist if something was not authentic, she would insist the workers remove it and redo it to her specifications. This ethic was true with all her work but was more evident with details in the Desert View Watchtower (Grattan, 1980 & Berke, 2002).

A longtime friend and author, Frank J. Waters (1902 – 1995) described Colter as “an incomprehensible woman in pants, she rode horseback through the Four Corners making sketches of prehistoric ruins, studying details of construction, the composition of adobes and washes.”42 “She could teach masons how to lay adobe bricks, plasterers how to mix washes, (and) carpenters how to fit viga (rafter) joints” (Waters, 1950, pp. 104-105). Berke (2002) indicates that each of her building told a story, a reality constructed in Colter’s mind, a product of her ‘fastidious research’ and planning.

She created architectural spaces as if they were theatrical sets, constructing a sense of place to embellish her particular story. Her design for Hermit’s Rest (1914) was conceived as the former retreat of an “untrained mountain man using the natural timber and boulders of the area” (Grattan, 1980, p. 26). The scenery she created was woven into the setting, from a single chair to an intricately created environment. As in the construction of theatrical scenery no matter how large or small, custom-made or the

42 Frank Waters (July 25, 1902 - June 3, 1995) was an American writer and friend of Mary Colter. He is known for his novels and historical works about the American Southwest. Waters, whose father was half-Cheyenne, wrote about Native American culture and other aspects of the American West.
genuine article, Colter’s goal was to obtain the proper atmosphere, creating the Sense of Place. She even had workers smudge the giant fireplace interior with soot.

**The Desert View Watchtower**

During her years as architect and designer with the FH/SF Railway, Colter made many research trips to Mesa Verde, Chaco Canyon and other areas protected by the Antiquities Act. According to her 1933 *Manual for Drivers and Guides*, it is quite clear that she was well read in the field of archaeology. She had studied the works of leaders in the field such as Jesse Walter Fewkes and Alfred Vincent Kidder. At Grand Canyon, Colter was close to the MNA and knew of the work done by its founder Harold S. Colton. She contributed to the 1915 “Painted Desert” exhibit for the AT&SF and knew Jesse Nusbaum as a photographer and anthropologist before he became NPS superintendent at MVNP. Figure 5-5 shows photographer, Jesse Nusbaum and archaeologist, Alfred V. Kidder on a 1908 reconnaissance survey at Mesa Verde for the newly established, Archaeology Institute of America.

Colter researched among the Mesa Verde cliff dwellings at the Round Tower of Cliff Palace and the Square Tower and explored the many towers and kives at

---

43 Chaco Culture National Historical Park is a US National Historical Park and a UNESCO World Heritage Site having the densest and most exceptional concentration of pueblos in the American Southwest.

44 Alfred Vincent Kidder (1885-1963) was an American archaeologist considered the first professional archaeologist in the southwestern United States and Mesoamerica during the first half of the 20th century. In 1914, Kidder received his doctorate from Harvard University. In 1915, he initiated a long-term research program at the Pecos Pueblo in New Mexico. He was the originator of the first comprehensive, systematic approach to North American archaeology and saw a disciplined system of archaeological techniques as a means to extend the principles of anthropology into the prehistoric past. Kidder also defined the basic standards characterizing the archaeological profession of the 21st century.


46 Founded in 1879 and chartered by Congress in 1906, the AIA is North America’s oldest and largest archaeological organization. Harvard University professor Charles Eliot Norton was at the center of the intellectual and cultural “flowering of New England.” In 1879, he invited his colleagues and friends to help form a society “for furthering and directing archaeological and artistic investigation and research.”
Hovenweep National Monument. Consulting Colter’s *Manual* (1933, p. 2), A.V. Kidder has said of Hovenweep, “there are probably more archaeological sites to the square mile in this district than in any other equal area in the Southwest.” Colter wrote about the possible ancient use of the Hovenweep towers speculating that a “function of the towers is that they were designed for astronomical observations, as were the towers of the Aztecs, Mayas, and Toltecs in Mexico, Yucatan, and Peru” (Colter, 1933, p. 5).

In choosing her site for the tower Colter perceived that, perhaps at one time an ancient tower could have stood on the location. In the late 1920s, she may have also known that the Grand Canyon was being considered for constructing a possible celestial observatory. On September 30, 1928, the New York Times ran a nearly full-page article announcing that the best place in the world for an astronomical observatory was the rim of the Grand Canyon. In the summer of 1929, George Ellie Hale was trying to select a location for his planned 200-inch telescope. George Ritchey had been Hale’s master telescope designer, the man who had figured out how to build giant reflecting telescopes. Ritchey had visited the Grand Canyon in 1907 and over the years was preoccupied with the idea of building a great observatory on the canyon rim.

Following the article in the New York Times, Ritchey contacted Edwin Hubble asking him to make observation tests at the Grand Canyon. These were the years when the Mt. Wilson observatory near Los Angeles was being rendered obsolete by light

---

47 George E. Hale’s final masterpiece was the great 200-inch Palomar telescope. Hale built four telescopes first was the 40-inch refractor at Yerkes near Chicago in Wisconsin, the Mount Wilson Observatory (above Los Angeles), and finally the million-pound telescope on Palomar Mountain (near San Diego).

48 George Ritchey drew up plans for a 25-story tall observatory with a Romanesque design, and made a drawing of this observatory on the canyon rim. The New York Times proclaimed Ritchey’s plans were brilliant.
pollution. Hubble was secretive about the purpose of his visit to Flagstaff and would not admit it was related to building a telescope. All he said was that he was looking into “a proposed plan for another observing station in the Southwest.”

Colter quotes, Fewkes, saying “the (towers) were built by an agricultural people, one of the primal necessities of whom is to determine the time for planting. This can be obtained by observations of the sun’s rising and setting, and a tower affords the elevation necessary for that purpose.” Colter observed that, prehistoric towers may have been used by “indigenous priests” to determine the “calendric solar events” and the “sun houses” or “observatories” to view the movement of the sun would be a room to sun worship or the worship of the power of the sky as indicated by Fred Kabotie’s artwork in the Desert View Watchtower. “The towers may have been devoted to the worship of Father Sun or the Sky God in the underground kiva may have been to celebrate the rites of Mother Earth (Colter, 1933 p. 6).”

The Watchtower is an example of Colter’s dedication to the authenticity of the numerous tower locations she researched to select elements to include in her design (Berke, 2002, p.190 & Grattan, 1980, p.69). This went on for about six months, until she had enough information on the ruins to build a small table-sized model, replicating each bush and tree at her chosen site to check their impacts to make changes to her design.

---

49 Percival Lowell had located an observatory at Flagstaff, AZ. The Lowell Observatory was established in 1894, placing it among the oldest observatories in the US, designated a NHL in 1965.

50 Edwin Hubble to V.M. Slipher, October 5, 1928. Located in the V.M. Slipher papers, Lowell Observatory Archives (LOA). Edwin Hubble is credited with the 1929 discovery of the expansion of the universe.

51 From MEJ Colter note in her Manual (1933, p.6) that states, “In 1919 Jesse Walter Fewkes (1850-1930) surveyed the ‘towers’ of Hovenweep National Monument.” Fewkes was an archaeologist for the Smithsonian who wrote about the ancient towers and kivas of Mesa Verde and Hovenweep.
Colter’s research for the Watchtower may appear to be obsessive, however; it is only a hint of her planning. Well into her sixties, Colter studied on site the ancient builders’ construction methods and materials. Figure 5-6 shows Colter exploring kiva ruins during a trip photographing the Round Tower at MVNP and other archaeological sites. The Watchtower is not a copy of any one tower but in Colter’s words, a ‘recreation’ of selected features of the ancient ruins of the early pueblo people. In Chapter Four of Mary Colter: Builder Upon the Red Earth, biographer Grattan (1980, p. 59) writes, “Colter’s philosophy was that a building should grow out of its setting, embodying the history and flavor of the location. It should belong to its environment as though indigenous to that spot.”

Colter explains in her Manual that she was faced with a challenge, “First and most important, was to design a building that would become part of its surroundings; one that would create no discordant note against the time eroded walls of this promontory” and design a building to “enhance the view” (Colter, 1933, p.11). To obtain the desired result, she insisted that the rocks not be cut or worked, to retain the “weathered surfaces so essential to blend it with the canyon walls”. For Colter the details were everything. The construction workers called her, “Old Lady Colter” and viewed her attitude toward the project as one of “a very temperamental artist.” When

52 Searches through collections at various museum locations have not produced any original M.E.J. Colter field notes or sketchbooks. However; photographs taken by Colter at research sites in the 1930s are in the Grand Canyon Museum archives. In the Almanac of Architects of 2005, California architect Julia Morgan destroyed her office files when she retired in 1952. During her career, Morgan designed more than 800 buildings. Colter may have done the same when she retired to Santa Fe, NM
arriving on site, if the stonework was not to her liking the stonemasons would have to take it out and start over.\textsuperscript{53}

Colter (1933, p.13) also recognized,

\begin{quote}
The primitive architect never intentionally copied anything but made every building suit its own conditions and each one differed from every other according to the character of the site, the materials that could be procured and the purpose for which the building was intended he did not “copy”, but in every case “created” a new thing.
\end{quote}

In her \textit{Manual} Colter quipped, “The Indian builder would have joyed in making it hanging by his toenails to the very brink of the canyon rim…The modern engineer lacks his courage.” She used her ethnographic studies of the Hopi and the geological formation of Grand Canyon in designing her building as well as selecting the best features of her researched ruins to teach canyon visitors about different Southwestern ancient tower ruins. She also wanted to be sure that the “Harvey” drivers and tour guides interpreted her Watchtower structure correctly to visitors.\textsuperscript{54}

Colter states in her 1933, \textit{Manual for Drivers and Guides Descriptive of the Indian Watchtower at Desert View and Its Relation, Architecturally, To the Prehistoric Ruins of the Southwest} was written in response to visitor “questions about this and that and the other thing” asked of the FHC “drivers and guides” to the Watchtower. The original 104-page manual was her answer to their “numerous insistent questions…” that

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{53} From Arnold Berke (2002, p.195) Colter had been working on rustic stonewalls for most of her career. The Watchtower was to be her finest. It was imposable to make the tower in a ruin condition so she also created some broken down walls in the area to add atmosphere.

\textsuperscript{54} Colter, Mary E. J. (1933) \textit{Manual for drivers and guides descriptive of the Indian Watchtower at Desert View and its relations, architecturally, to the prehistoric ruins of the Southwest}. Grand Canyon, Ariz.: Fred Harvey was printed with photographs by the Grand Canyon Association under their copyright in 2015 and is now for sale in the Association stores at Grand Canyon. My citations are from a 1933 original copy.
\end{footnotes}
are short to ask often require rather lengthy answers!” She felt that there was a need to give the visitors her intelligent answers.

Colter also wanted artwork on the interior of the Watchtower that would entice the tourists to learn more about the Hopi people. She had ideas about the art but needed a Hopi artist for authenticity. She hired a young Hopi named Fred Kabotie to paint murals on the Hopi Room walls. As well as being a fine artist, he was also a guide and musician at Grand Canyon. From his autobiography Kabotie said of Colter, “a very talented decorator with strong opinions. I admired her work and we got along well, most of the time.” In 1947, Fred Kabotie would paint murals for Colter on the interior of the Painter Desert Inn. He also stated, “She was quite a woman. We didn’t always agree, but I think we appreciated each other.”

No other architect of her time has produced such a complete volume on one of their structures or has gone into such detail about the artwork and decorations. In Colter’s forward letter in the Manual addressed to the recipients of the FHC “Grand Canyon Transportation Department” she states:

You aren’t expected to learn it by heart. That’s the last thing we want! Read it, - you owe me that for pestering me with questions, - familiarize yourself with the facts to the point where you will know what you want to say to “your people” about the building.

At one time four photograph albums were on display in the Watchtower kiva shop along with Colter’s typed text explaining each image. She described the ancient kivas as “circular subterranean rooms (that) occur with towers, also indicate religious rites.

---

55 From Fred Kabotie, Hopi Artist an auto-biography as told to Bill Belknap 1977.

56 The archival photographs (c.1930s) and typed pages have been digitized and are housed in the Grand Canyon Museum archives.
The kiva survives in modern pueblo life where the same traditional designs of (the) structure still prevail. As an artist and teacher, Colter visualized her Watchtower as a means to inform the canyon visitors about the ancient towers and the Hopi culture as well as provide spectacular views of the Grand Canyon and Colorado River.

The main entrance to Colter’s tower is the kiva room that is an above ground circular plan. The ceiling is made of logs salvaged and repurposed from the old Grand View Hotel on Horseshoe Mesa at the Canyon. The logs are set in a pattern found in prehistoric Native American architecture and still used in some native structures today. Figure 5-7 are photos of the kiva ceiling and an archival photo of the Grandview Hotel.

One flaw in the tower’s design was not of Colter’s making. The AT&SF bridge designers altered her concept drawings to include a metal framework. The interior of the steel framework and stone Watchtower is entirely plastered to the top and the space is covered with murals. The Hopi Room images, painted by Fred Kabotie, depict various aspects of Hopi mythology and are of sacred importance. The other murals done by FHC artist Fred Greer are in subtle colors that purposefully soften the detail, and are copies from an 1849 discovery of prehistoric kiva art that no longer exist. Colter writes that the First Gallery Parapet on the interior walls are reproductions of prehistoric

---

57 MEJ Colter designed the kiva area above ground to open up a wide view of the Grand Canyon.

58 The internal steel framework of the Desert View Watchtower was designed and supervised by the AT&SF Railway bridge builders.

59 Colter devotes page 73 of her Manual to Hopi artist Fred Kabotie and The Hopi Snake Legend on the Watchtower, First Floor Gallery walls, illustrates the importance the Hopi tribe places on their connection to the Grand Canyon and the Colorado River.

60 From MEJ Colter Manual for Drivers and Guides (1933:74)
pictographs and petroglyphs by a young Hopi, Chester Dennis, created in the style of his ancestors (Colter, 1933, p. 49).

Over time, the elements have wreak havoc with metal and stone creating cracks (Appendix A) that would allow water to seep into the interior walls causing damage to the artwork. To prevent further damage a Condition Assessment, Treatment Plan and Structural Engineering Assessment was done early in 2000 for the NPS and their concessioner, Xantarra South Rim, LLC who was leasing the site. In 2009 (Appendix A), a further report was also prepared by Page & Turnbull, a Historic Restoration Firm in San Francisco, CA detailing all problems that would require professional historic restoration.61

Extensive historic restorations, following The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, were done by D.L. Norton Contracting, Inc. of Scottsdale, AZ were completed in 2012.62 Under the Guidelines for Restoring Historic Buildings, “repairing by stabilizing, consolidating, and conserving is recommended (Sec. of Interior, 1992, p. 119).” One of the Standards for Rehabilitation states, the historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided. Knowledge of these Standards and the methods of preserving historic properties require professionals in the field.63

61 http://www.page-turnbull.com/preservation-technology/ A 127 page Basic Design Report was prepared.

62 The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties are Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings. Developed in 1992 by cooperation with the National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers (SHPO) and reviewed by individual SHPO nationwide.

63 Historic preservation professionals may include architects, architectural historians, historians, historical engineers, archeologists, and others who have experience in working with historic buildings.
The Hopi World View

The Hopi trace their history back thousands of years. The ancestral Hopis, Hisatsinom (people of long ago), are known by archaeologists as “Anasazi,” “Hohokam,” “Sinagua,” “Mogollon,” and prehistoric cultural groups of the American Southwest. Some of the Hopi villages are among the oldest continuously occupied settlements in the North American continent. The Hopi Tribe is a sovereign nation located in northeastern AZ. Their reservation is within the Navajo reservation and occupies part of Coconino and Navajo counties, encompasses more than 1.5 million acres. The Hopi society consists of a diverse set of histories, ideas, and beliefs since there are over 30 Hopi clans, distributed among 3 mesas and 13 villages creating differences in how individual Hopis regard the canyon landscape. The Hopi are a peace-loving people who have kept their culture intact due in part to living in an isolated area. The name Hopi is a shortened form of their autonym, Hopituh Shi-nu-mu (“The Peaceful People” or “Peaceful Little Ones”). The primary meaning of "Hopi" is “one who is mannered, civilized, peaceable, and polite, who adheres to the Hopi way.”

---

64 [http://www.hopifoundation.org/the-hopi-way](http://www.hopifoundation.org/the-hopi-way)

65 The Hopi people established the Hopi Tribal Council on Dec. 19, 1936, with the adoption of the Hopi Constitution and By-Laws. According to the constitution, the Hopi Tribal Council has the power and authority to represent and speak for the Hopi Tribe in all matters for the welfare of the Tribe, and to negotiate with federal, state and local governments, and with the councils or governments of other tribes.

66 From M.J. Anderson (1998 p. 10) *Living at the Edge: Explorers, Exploiters and Settlers of the Grand Canyon Region*. The Navajo (Dine) have long used canyon resources and lived seasonally upon both rims. Today they occupy the largest Native American reservation in the US.

The Hopi World View is a concept deeply rooted in their culture's religion, spirituality, and its view of morality and ethics. To be Hopi is to strive to a concept that involves a state of total reverence and respect for all things and to live in accordance with the instructions of the “Creator or Caretaker of Earth.” The Soyal, or winter solstice is the most important ceremony of the year. It celebrates the Hopi worldview and recounts their legends. Hopi continue to observe traditional ceremonies for the benefit of the entire world, but do not discuss their beliefs with outsiders, especially with women. In 1933, M.E.J. Colter held a place of respect with the Hopi and was the only white person when the first Watchtower received the Hopi blessing and dedication.

From their oral tradition, the Hopi people have lived in Hopitutskwa and have maintained their sacred covenant with Maasaw, the ancient caretaker of the earth, to live as peaceful farmers respectful of the land and its resources. The Hopi have survived as a tribe and managed to preserved their culture, language and religion regardless of influences from the outside world due in part to the remoteness and expanse of the Hopi mesas.

By the late 1800s, the American government controlled essentially every Native American community throughout the country. The growing eastern Anglo population in the Southwest after 1850 helped create the cattle industry boom and the discovery of silver and copper deposits that placed a strain on the riverine resources and the indigenous farming infrastructure. Native people were pushed to marginal regions and no longer had easy access to traditional lands. Many native communities struggled for basic survival by hunting wild animals and gathering vegetables, fruits, and herbs.

---

An act called the Dawes Severalty Act of 1887 had shaped US/Native American policy. The Act signed by Grover Cleveland ended communal ownership of land and parceled it into pieces to be owned by individual Native Americans. This Act drastically reduced the amount of land available to the tribes and reduced the size of existing reservations making it harder for the Native Americans to live in traditional ways.

The Hopi have always viewed the land around Flagstaff and the Grand Canyon as sacred. The San Francisco Peaks north of Flagstaff are the homes of the Hopi kachina spirits who visit the Hopi Mesas for seasonal ceremonies. Agriculture has always been a very important part of Hopi culture and their villages are spread out across the mesas of the northern part of AZ in the center of the Navajo Reservation on land where their ancestors have always lived. However, the Hopi and the Navajo did not understand the concept of land being bounded and divided.

By 1887, the government had “encouraged” all Native Americans to become more like mainstream America. Hoping to turn all Native people into farmers, the federal government divided tribal lands giving individuals 160-acre parcels. The unclaimed or “surplus” land was sold, and the money was used to establish the “Indian boarding

---

69 Adopted by Congress in 1887, the Act authorized the President of the United States to survey American Indian tribal land and divided it into allotments for individual Indians. The Act broke up previous land settlements given to Native Americans in the form of reservations and separated them into smaller, separate parcels of land. By 1932, the sale of unclaimed land and allotted land resulted in the loss of two-thirds of the 138 million acres Native Americans had held prior to the Act.

70 The act remained in place until the 1934 Wheeler-Howard Act that overturned the policy and attempted to return autonomy and control to the tribal councils. The Wheeler-Howard Act also ended the sale of “excess” land to US buyers.

71 The Hopi tradition holds that the real SIPAPU is located in the very deepest part of the Grand Canyon. Through this small opening their ancestors emerged when coming up from the underworld to the outer world and through it their spirits now return when at death they go to join their ancestors. The sipapu in each Kiva is a symbol of the original sipapu of this legend.

72 The Hopi Reservation, or simply Hopi, is a Native American reservation for the Hopi and Arizona Tewa people, surrounded entirely by the Navajo Nation, in Navajo and Coconino counties in the state of Arizona, USA.
schools” where Native American children were compelled to learn reading, writing, and social habits of Euro-America.

Native Americans were required to send their children to these boarding schools where they were taught to "forget" their indigenous languages and beliefs and replace them with Euro-American principles (Adams, 1997; Hoerig, 2002). Even though the children resisted complete transformation, the experience for most native children was traumatic because it was intended to change their whole being. The schools also fragment communities, leading many traditional practices and some native languages to be lost. Hopi artist Fred Kabotie recalled in his autobiography, “I’ve found the more outside education I receive, the more I appreciate the true Hopi way.” When the missionaries would come into the village and try to convert us, I used to wonder why anyone would want to be a Christian if it meant becoming like those people.”

Kabotie was forced to attend the Santa Fe Indian School, where he said, “I was supposed to discard all my Hopi belief, all my Hopi way of life, and become a white man and become a Christian.” Like many Hopi children, Kabotie despised the school he was forced to attend. He recalled, “When you’re so remote from your own people, you get lonesome. You don’t paint what’s around you – you paint what you have in mind. Loneliness moves you to express something of your home, your background.” In 1918, John DeHuff was installed as superintendent at the government-run Santa Fe Indian School. He arrived with his wife, Elizabeth, who ran an art program in spite of

---

73 In 1920 Fred Kabotie became one of the first Hopi artists to gain national recognition when his work was shown at the annual exhibition of the Society of Independent Artists in New York City.
official school policy.\textsuperscript{75} She encouraged the young artist by giving him pencils and watercolors to create pictures of traditional life and ceremonial themes. Fred would often paint or draw the kachina figures that he quickly sold.

There is a Hopi reticence about discussing matters that could be considered ritual secrets or religion-oriented traditions. Hopi legend tells that the current earth is the “Fourth World” to be inhabited by Tawa's creations.\textsuperscript{76} The oral story states that in each previous world, the people, though happy, became disobedient and lived contrary to Tawa's plan; they fought one another and would not live in harmony. The most obedient were led (usually by Spider Woman) to the next higher world, with physical changes occurring in the people in the course of their journey, and in the environment of the next world.\textsuperscript{77}

In some of these accounts, the former worlds were destroyed along with their wicked inhabitants, while in other legends the good people were simply led away from the chaos created by their actions. Because legends are passed down by oral traditions, parts could change over time. Many accounts relate to Christian Bible passages taught at the Spanish missions such as the destruction of cities by a rain of fire because the people disobeyed or the coming of a “Great Flood.”\textsuperscript{78}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{75} Elizabeth DeHuff's teaching introduced the revolutionary idea that traditional cultures had a continuing relevance for Native peoples in the twentieth century.
\item \textsuperscript{76} According to legend, the Hopi agreed to act as caretakers of the “Fourth World” in exchange for permission to live here.
\item \textsuperscript{77} Central to Hopi ceremonialism is the kiva, or underground chamber seen as a doorway to the cave world below Grand Canyon from where their ancestors originally came.
\item \textsuperscript{78} Sodom and Gomorrah were two cities destroyed by fire mentioned in the Book of Genesis and throughout the Hebrew Bible, the New Testament and in the deuterocanonical Book of Wisdom, as well as in the Qur'an and Hadith. The ruins of Sodom and Gomorrah were discovered southeast of the Dead Sea.
\end{itemize}
When Fred Kabotie was hired by M.E.J. Colter to create artwork in the Desert View Watchtower, he referred to some legends his grandmother had told him as a child. Colter states in her Manual that, “Kabotie is saturated with the ancient lore of his people and these legends are to him a living religion.” His Hopi paintings were chosen because “they are among the oldest known to them, going back before the memory of any living Hopi and yet in constant use, (and) serve to bring the prehistoric pictographic up to date” (Colter, 1933 p.27). Colter stated in her Manual that the designs were of Kabotie’s own choosing and the explanation of their meaning take on unusual significance. With the 2015 GCA publication of Colter’s 1933 Manual, the visitor now has the opportunity to use the book with the photograph and text as a guide to the artwork in the Watchtower.

Fred’s son Michael Kabotie (1942–2009) was also a well-known artist. He was a founding member of the Artist Hopid, an organization formed in 1973 to promote Hopi arts and culture. Michael's son Ed Kabotie is also an artist and musician from the Hopi village of Shungopavi and the Tewa village of Khap'o Owinge (Santa Clara Pueblo). His music and artwork is reflective of these two dynamic cultures. Ed comes from a distinguished Hopi artistic heritage. His paternal grandfather, Fred Kabotie, and father, Michael Kabotie, are both well recognized in the Native American Art world for contributed to 20th century Hopi silver work and the visual arts. Ed carries on this

---

79 From M.E.J. Colter (1933 p.28) Kabotie is counted as one of the 3 greatest modern Indian artists.

80 M.E.J. Colter’s Manual on the Watchtower contains descriptions of all the artwork on the tower walls.

81 Ed Kabotie’s maternal grandfather, was Edward P. Dozier (1916-1971) see note 69
tradition as a painter, silversmith and a talented musician.\textsuperscript{82} He states, "My vision as an artist is to express the values, virtues, and sometimes vices of my people through the mediums of art and music."

\textbf{The Native Voice}

Often the practice of archaeology has served to displace and dismantle tribal beliefs, traditions and histories. Some individuals used their expertise to infiltrate Native American communities to obtain ritual information and materials for museums and personal gain. Until recently, outsiders have been the "authorities on the history and cultural experiences of Pueblo people" and very few archaeologist, researchers and/or anthropologists have been Native People.\textsuperscript{83}

The US government relations with tribal governments are complex layers of treaties, laws, and promises. The 566 recognized Tribal Nations have a unique status in the USA, they are not states, but are more than ethnic groups in our multi-ethnic society.\textsuperscript{84} Many Native Americans had, and still have, separate nations within the US on

\textsuperscript{82} Ed has worked with numerous museums and educational institutions as a guest speaker. He is an artist in resident at the MNA and often speaks and preforms at the Watchtower and at local AZ venues.

\textsuperscript{83} From Edward P. Dozier (1916-1971) a Tewa from Santa Clara Pueblo and the first Native American to establish a career as an academic anthropologist

\textsuperscript{84} Within the geographic boundaries of the US there are more than 566 Native American tribes and Alaska Native groups that speak more than 250 languages. Each tribe has its own culture, history and identity. According to the 2000 census, there are more than 2.4 million Native Americans and Alaska Natives. According to the 2010 Census, 5.2 million people in the US identified as Native American and /or Alaska Native, either alone or in combination with one or more other races. Out of this total, 2.9 million people identified as American Indian and Alaska Native alone. Almost half of the Native American and Alaska Native population, or 2.3 million people, reported being Native American and/or Alaska Native. http://www.tribal-institute.org/lists/nations.htm
designated reservation land. Unfortunately, when it comes to tribal relations, much of the relationships reflect the dominant history of the US government.

The passage of the Indian Removal Act of 1830 marked the systematic US federal government policy of forcibly removing Native populations away from Euro-populated areas in the eastern states, including those who were legally land owners. Before 1924, Native Americans were not citizens of the US. It was not until June of that year, that Congress granted citizenship to all Native Americans born in the US through the Indian Citizenship Act. Even after this Act, some Native Americans could not vote because the right to vote was governed by state law.

Nevertheless, this Act was just another move by the federal government to absorb native groups into the mainstream of American life. Although, some native women acquired citizenship by marrying white men or were the receipt of allotments, others received citizenship through military service during WWI, or through special treaties and special statutes. However, many who chose to leave their native communities were still not citizens, and barred from the ordinary processes of naturalization open to foreigners. Only the Navajos were able to finalize a treaty with US Congress establishing their reservation in 1868, after years of persecution by the US

---

85 From the Office of Management and Budget (OMB), “American Indian or Alaska Native” refers to a person having origins in any of the original peoples of North and South America (including Central America) and who maintains tribal affiliation or community attachment.

86 In 1851, the US Congress passed the Indian Appropriations Act authorizing the creation of Indian reservations in modern-day Oklahoma

87 Until 1957, some states still barred Native Americans from voting.

88 Some members of the white society declared that the “Indians” had successfully passed the assimilation test during wartime, and thus deserved the rewards of citizenship.
government. The 1868 Peace Commission and the Treaty allowed the Navajo to return to their homeland after four terrible years of incarceration.

It was not until a 1928 study known as the Meriam Report assessed problems of Native Americans. The report revealed to the government that its policies had oppressed Native Americans and destroyed their culture and society. These people suffered from poverty, exploitation and discrimination. The study also spurred the passage of the 1934 Indian Reorganization Act returning some surplus land to Native Americans and urged tribes to engage in active self-government. As a result, the US government invested in the development of health care, education and community structure. The quality of life on Indian reservations did improved and some Native Americans now run successful businesses, although many still live in poverty.

Tribal members are actually citizens of three sovereigns: their tribe, the US, and the state where they reside. They are also individuals in an international context with the rights afforded to any other individual. The National Congress of American Indians (NCAI) declares Native peoples and their governments have inherent rights and a political relationship with the US government that does not derive from race or ethnicity.

---

89 By 1970, Congress stopped signing treaties with native tribes.

90 The official title was the *Problem of Indian Administration* and was commissioned by the Institute for Government Research (IGR, known later as the Brookings Institution) to compile information and report on the conditions of American Indians across the country funded by the Rockefeller Foundation.

91 The *Wheeler-Howard Act (Indian Reorganization Act)* of 1934 known as the *Indian New Deal* It represents a rare attempt to rectify, on Indian terms, injustices and miscalculations of the past that had harmed native peoples.
NCAI has remained true to the original purpose of the organization, to be the unified voice of tribal nations.\textsuperscript{92}

Presently all Native Americans work hard to retain their culture while some native languages are lost.\textsuperscript{93} Retired Grand Canyon Interpretive Ranger, Phyllis Yoyetewa Kachinhongva, expresses her regret that young Hopi children are not learning the language. “Language use starts at home, but many parents don’t try to teach their children to speak Hopi.” Although she now lives at Hopi, Phyllis and her brother Darrell grew up and played on Grand Canyon. Members of her family are the fifth generation to work and live there. She stated that, her grandfather was hired by Mary Colter to build Hopi House and construct the Watchtower.\textsuperscript{94} Phyllis revealed that although she was already working as a NPS ranger, as a Hopi woman she had to get special permission from the elders in order to speak to tourists about Grand Canyon plants and the useful remedies Hopi people obtain from them.

On January 1, 2015, the NPS took back management of the Desert View Watchtower with the intent of restoring M.E.J. Colter’s original concept for the building. By contributing to the interpretation of Grand Canyon’s past and early native culture, Colter’s architecture is also important to Grand Canyon history for the Sense of Place they convey. Interpretation is an important method used by the NPS to inspire and educate park visitors and serves as a significant means to improve stewardship of park resources and encourage civic engagement.

\textsuperscript{92} NCAI, founded in 1944, the oldest, largest and most representative American Indian and Alaska Native organization serving the broad interests of tribal governments and communities. http://www.ncai.org/

\textsuperscript{93} The Hopi language is one of the 30 of the Uto-Aztecan language family.

\textsuperscript{94} Personal telephone conversation with Phyllis Yoyetewa Kachinhongva March 2016
After the organization of US National Parks, their federal managers overlooked the political boundaries of “Indian reservations” and the tribes' ancestral affiliations to park areas. The Grand Canyon has an abundant human history but only Colter’s Hopi House and the Desert View area structures express the “Native Voice.” The Tusayan Museum and archaeological site is the only destination of its kind open to visitors on the South Rim west of Desert View. In 2001, Deputy Chief of Science and Resource Management at Grand Canyon Janet Balsom stated, “The last ten years have seen a dedication to be actively working with our neighboring tribes and including them in park management decisions.”

In 2015, Desert View Park Ranger Brian Gatlin commented, “For a long time, the Park Service has been the one developing the (signage) and having the park rangers tell the Native story through the NPS lens.” He continued, “The intent here is to take out the NPS as the intermediary voice and have the members of the relevant tribes be the primary voice.” Rather than saying, ‘This is what we know, and this is what we've been telling,’ lead interpreters are introducing this conversation, ‘We're open to doing it a different way and we’re open to doing it in your voice.’

Shown in Figure 5-10, are Lyle Balenquah (Hopi), and Jason Nez (Navajo), two Native American archaeologists working with the NPS to bring their conversation into GCNP and introduce the Native Voice into the park’s new interpretation. Since 2001,  

---

95 The ruin is one of 4000 archaeological sites recorded within Grand Canyon. Tree ring dates indicate that construction of the Tusayan Pueblo began around 1185 CE.

96 Grand Canyon National Park, P.O. Box 129, Grand Canyon, Arizona 86023 contact address

97 Remarks from May 22, 2016 NPS rededication M.E.J. Colter's Desert View Watchtower Grand Canyon

98 Jason Nez joined the NPS in 2001 as a ranger at Navajo National Monument.
Jason has become a vocal presence within the field of Native American archaeology, giving presentations and promoting cultural outreach throughout the Southwest. In addition to archaeology, he is a dedicated fire archaeologist. He coordinates activities around culturally sensitive sites, stating that, “If there’s a fire in the Canyon and there’s a prehistoric or historic structure involved I’d be the first one to be notified and get out there.”

For over 10 years Lyle Balenquah, has worked throughout the Four Corners as an archaeologist documenting ancestral Hopi settlements and their lifeways. Lyle is a member of the Greasewood clan from the Hopi Village of Bacavi (Reed Springs) on Third Mesa. As a part-time river guide, Lyle combines professional knowledge and training with personal insights about his ancestral history. He remarks, “The NPS has made a big effort to integrate our voices. A reflection of that is tribal members (are) being a part of the interpretation and scientific management of the park.” (The Grand Canyon) “Superintendent and staff have shown what can happen when that invitation to participate is honest and clear.” Lyle also points out, “The environment allows the tribes to come together to have a unified voice about park issues that are good for tribal people and it benefits the park service too.”

In 2013, GCNP founded an Inter-tribal Advisory Council. The plan has been implemented for Grand Canyon to become a leader in tribal-National Park relations empowering the eleven traditionally affiliated tribes (Figure 5-9 map shows the tribal locations) to tell their stories, develop internships and jobs, and bring sustainable tourism opportunities to their lands. By transforming Colter’s Watchtower from a gift

---

99 Lyle Balenquah has degrees (B.A. 1999, M.A. 2002) from NAU in Cultural Anthropology and Southwestern Archaeology.
shop into a place to celebrate, share, and learn about the heritage of Grand Canyon, the eleven different tribes can tell their stories and perspectives of the same place bringing the Native Voice into the interpretation of the Grand Canyon.

The Grand Canyon and NPS vision statement reflects the idea that the Desert View Watchtower serves to connect past, present, and future. Grand Canyon has been awarded a $500,000 grant from the Tribal Historic Preservation Program. The NPS states that most of the money will go to transforming the Desert View area by building an inter-tribal visitor center, and reviving the Native cultural demonstration series. Figure 5-8 shows Ed Kabotie preserving a section of his grandfather’s mural inside the eighty-four year-old historic landmark. Along with the grant there will be new interpretive programs, updated wayside signage and some remodeled buildings, all aimed at an authentic communicating of the culture, history and modern lifeways of the eleven affiliated tribes.

The GCNP rangers contend that, the Watchtower has been preserved by the NPS and the NHL status and remains a focal point for the future, and will be acting as a centerpiece for ongoing development of the Desert View area as a center for cultural heritage interpretation for tourists. The Watchtower serves as a bridge between cultures, connecting people to each other and to the canyon.

In 2016, GCNP superintendent Dave Uberuaga stated, “This project re-envisions how visitors experience Desert View and the entire park and will lead the NPS into the

100 The National Historic Preservation Act as amended in 1992 directs the Secretary of the Interior to establish a National Tribal Preservation Program.

101 From a NPS News Release: ArtPlace America recently announced that the American Indian Alaska Native Tourism Association (AIANTA), on behalf of the tribal heritage project partnership, received a grant of $500,000 to further arts and culture at Desert View in Grand Canyon National Park.
next century.” The continuing cultural demonstrations taking place in and around the Watchtower is the story M.E.J. Colter and Fred Kabotie wanted to tell the visitors. The tribal groups maintain the story is not one relegated to the past, but one that is vibrant and ongoing. The tribal voices state, “We share Desert View as a symbol to bond the peoples of yesterday, today and tomorrow. The Watchtower serves as a connection to embrace the heartbeats of our peoples and visitors far and wide with the heartbeat of the canyon saying, We are still here.”
Figure 5-1. Tree types located in the Four Corners States, Kyle Bocinsky research in 2014 *Journal of Nature Communications*

Figure 5-2. Sample chart of Chaco Canyon Tree Ring Technology
Figure 5-3. Traditional Navajo “hogans” at Hopi House GRCA #13660 c.1900s

Figure 5-4. A) c.1905 M.E.J. Colter Hopi House interior archival photo UNA
B) Exhibit of Navajo rugs at Hopi House, photo/Steve Collins
Figure 5-5. archaeologist, Alfred Vincent Kidder (middle) and photographer, Jesse Nusbaum (right) c.1908 on a survey at Mesa Verde for the Archaeology Institute of America - Denver Public Library Western History Department

Figure 5-6 M.E.J. Colter doing research at MVNP at a kiva c.1931 GCNP #17013 FHC
Figure 5-7. A) Colter’s Watchtower kiva B) kiva ceiling repurposed timbers of Grandview Hotel 2016 author’s photos C) Grandview Hotel c.1900s GRCA#06255

Figure 5-8. A) Fred Kabotie tower art on wall B) Fred’s grandson Ed Kabotie doing restoration artwork on same wall area in the Watchtower Hopi Room c. 2016
Figure 5-9 GCA Map indicating Grand Canyon 11 Traditionally Associated Tribes

Figure 5-10 Grand Canyon Tribal Medallion November 2016 talk by Lyle Balenquah, Hopi (left) and Jason Naz, Navajo (right) author’s photos
CHAPTER 6
CONCLUSION: A SENSE OF PLACE AT GRAND CANYON TODAY

As of 2014, the NPS employs 21,651 employees who oversee 413 units, of which 59 are designated national parks. Approximately 60% are currently administered by the NPS as symbols and/or evidence of our nation’s history and prehistory.\(^1\) A report from 2012 indicates that, “history is a major part of the visitors experience in two-thirds of 398 national park units making cultural resources a good return on investments.”\(^2\) On November 24, 2016, Stephanie K. Meeks, President of The National Trust for Historic Preservation stated, “Our lives really are rooted in places. Our mission is to help save those places, along with the history they made, the heritage they hold, and the stories they inspire.”\(^3\)

Place attachment is the symbolic relationship formed by people giving culturally shared emotional/affective meanings to a particular space or piece of land that provides the basis for the individual’s and group’s understanding of and relation to the environment.... Thus, place attachment is more than an emotional and cognitive experience, and includes cultural beliefs and practices that link people to place.

---Setha Low, “Symbolic Ties that Bind: Place Attachments in the Plaza.”

Why does the architecture of M.E.J. Colter still matter today? According to Virginia Grattan (1980, p. 59), “Colter’s philosophy was that a building should grow out of its setting, embodying the history and flavor of the location. It should belong to its environment as though indigenous to that spot.” She was the first architect to give National Park buildings a site-specific Sense of Place. Her Grand Canyon architecture

---

\(^1\) [https://www.nps.gov/parkhistory](https://www.nps.gov/parkhistory)


\(^3\) The National Trust for Historic Preservation has a national campaign that encourages people to celebrate the places that are meaningful to them and to their communities as “This Place Matters” a program to recognize historic places.
includes echoes of the ancient past and the cultural history of the area and its people today while connecting the early settler days of the park with the NPS.

Colter would conceptualize her building design after studying the “history and folklore” of the place it would represent. Her buildings also took their inspiration from the living Native American culture and the human experience in the landscape. Biographer Arnold Berke (2002, p. 187) states, “Each building had its own ‘reality’ constructed in Colter’s mind as the product of fastidious research and planning, then later planted in the imagination of the traveler.” Her uses of the fireplace in structures from Hopi House to the Desert View Watchtower were created from culture, fantasy, and geological features as shown in Appendix B of Hopi House and Bright Angle Lodge.  

Opening in 1905, Hopi House was M.E.J. Colter’s first complete architectural idea that took form with information from Mennonite missionary and Hopi ethnographer, Henrich R. Voth, and her own thorough study of the Hopi Village of Old Oraibi (1899). Developed as a “curio shop” for railway travelers whose interest in Southwestern Native American arts and crafts were aggressively promoted by FH/SF partnership, Colter created her version of a Hopi home, staffed with working Hopi and Navajo artisans, including the prominent Hopi-Tewa potter, Nampeyo whose name in Tewa is means “snake that does not bite.” Colter also befriended different Native American crafts

---

4 From Grattan, 1980 p. 88 See APPENDIX B-3 letter from M.E.J. Colter to NPS geologist Eddie McKee

5 Old Oraibi is one of four original Hopi villages, and one of the oldest continuously inhabited villages within the territory of the US. In the 1540s, the village was recorded as having 1,500–3,000 residents.

6 Nampeyo was a Hopi-Tewa potter who lived on the Hopi Reservation in Arizona. She used ancient techniques for making and firing pottery and used designs from “Old Hopi” pottery and sherds found at 15th-century Sikyåtki ruins on First Mesa. Her Tewa name is spelled Num-pa-yu.
persons and artists, such as the young Hopi artist Fred Kabotie, who decorated several of her buildings.\textsuperscript{7}  

Hopi builders used local canyon sandstone, natural materials and repurposed AT&SF Railway timbers when constructing Hopi House.\textsuperscript{8} Unlike the luxurious El Tovar Hotel, Colter’s Hopi House was design to blend into the surrounding environment creating a Sense of Place as if it were on the Hopi mesa. Although intended to be a “curio shop” to increase sales to Eastern travelers’ the early tourists saw it as a museum and a place of entertainment.

In 1976, the NRHP recognized Hopi House (1905), Lookout Studio and Hermits Rest (1914) and Desert View Watchtower (1933) as a National Historic Landmark District “significant for the architecture and architect, Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter.”\textsuperscript{9} Her recognition as a prominent female architect was validated after her death with the nomination and listing of her Grand Canyon buildings as well as Virginia L. Grattan’s (1980) and Arnold Berke’s (2002) biographies.

Colter’s significant position in American architecture today is important to the Grand Canyon history because of the Sense of Place they convey. Beginning with Hopi House, visitors can view the type of Native American home created on pueblo mesas,

\textsuperscript{7} Fred Kabotie also did a mural in the El Tovar Hotel and the Painted Desert Inn.

\textsuperscript{8} Colter was an early preservationist at Grand Canyon. While touring Hopi House in 2012 with Henry Kerpinski, the Xanterra Gift Shop and Gallery Manager, he pointed out repurposed timbers marked with railway telegraph numbers.

\textsuperscript{9} NRHP, Property Documentation 1986 Form: “Mary E. J. Colter Buildings Grand Canyon National Park Arizona.” San Francisco, CA: NPS Western Regional Office Division of Park Historic Preservation. Laura Souffriere. Architecture in the Parks: National Historic Landmark Theme Study. Washington, DC: Department of the Interior, NPS. 1988. The NRHP is the primary vehicle for identifying and protecting historic resources in the US. The NRHP is the official list of the America’s historic places worthy of preservation. Authorized by the 1966 National Historic Preservation Act, the NPS’s NRHP is part of a national program to coordinate and support public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect America’s historic and archeological resources.
while Hermit’s rest was conceived in Colter’s mind as a real early prospector’s canyon home, Phantom Ranch and the Bright Angle Lodge complex with the inclusion of historic stage coach era cabins is reminiscent of the pioneer days of the Southwest. Her Desert View Watchtower contains selected details she researched from ancient ruins and incorporates lost ancient drawings and Hopi artwork.

Her buildings situated on the canyon rim continue to contribute to the interpretation of the canyon’s past and early culture. Colter designed buildings that still capture the visitor’s imagination and help to create a lasting Grand Canyon visitor’s experience. To paraphrase the 1964 federal Wilderness Act, if we attract people to places, we can better preserve those wild places where we are “visitors but do not remain.”

In our rapidly growing technological world with the emphasis on how the digital world has reshaped the real one, there is a growing need for Sense of Place. Future research is needed into how the Department of the Interior’s political connection to the NPS land management and the native tribal involvement could change the way visitors will perceive our National Parks in the future. There are new questions for how the NPS will incorporate the “native voice” into interpretation of other National Parks and Monuments having connection with native people, such as Devil’s Tower.

---

10 The Wilderness Act of 1964 (Pub.L. 88–577) was written by Howard Zahnis of The Wilderness Society that created the legal definition of wilderness in the US, and protected 9.1 million acre. The US Forest Service, Bureau of Land Management, US Fish and Wildlife Service, and NPS manage wilderness areas to preserve and if necessary, restore their wilderness character. Congress has designated more than 106 million acres of federal public lands as wilderness, with 53 percent NPS lands.

11 In 1906, Pres. “Teddy” Roosevelt proclaimed Devils Tower America’s first national monument. A laccolithic butte composed of igneous rock in the Bear Lodge Mountains in northeastern WY, the summit is 5,112 feet above sea level. It is sacred to several Plains tribes, including the Lakota, Cheyenne and Kiowa. Many Indian leaders have objected to climbers ascending the monument, which is considered a desecration.
As have been revealed in the ongoing historic restorations of her Grand Canyon buildings and the revival of La Posada, Colter’s remaining buildings offer more preservation research than just this dissertation. Over 100 years old, Colter’s Lookout Studio and Hermit’s Rest have produced some interesting historic preservation challenges of their own because of their rim location.12 In 1957, following the demolition of El Navajo with its’ sand paintings and the sale of La Posada with the contents she labored over, M.E.J. Colter observed, “There’s such a thing as living too long” (Grattan, 1910, p. 111).

In her 1933 “Manual,” Colter wrote a forward letter to the FHC Transportation Department’s Drivers and Guides:

> Considerable study will be necessary to tell about the decorations in the Tower, but you’ll get lots of practice! It won’t be long before you begin to rattle off “parrot fashion” —and when it comes to that point, I won’t love you anymore!

Considering the ongoing conversation of the NPS with the native people of the area concerning her Watchtower, M.E.J. Colter would be quite pleased, as her main goal was to create both a Sense of Place and to educate the travelers about the living native cultures as well as their past. She also had a lengthy relationship with native people and had won their trust. Perhaps she would have something new to add to the ongoing conversation today.

---

12 In 2014, a personal conversation with Dave Norton indicated that extensive restoration to Lookout Studio’s foundation was necessary to keep the structure from sliding into the canyon.
# APPENDIX A
LIST OF M.E.J. COLTER BUILDINGS & INTERIOR DESIGNS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Building</th>
<th>Architect</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>Albuquerque, NM</td>
<td>Alvarado</td>
<td>Charles F. Whittlesey</td>
<td>demolished (1970)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indian Building</td>
<td>Colter as decorator</td>
<td>demolished (1970)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1905</td>
<td>Grand Canyon</td>
<td>Hopi House</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1905</td>
<td>Grand Canyon</td>
<td>El Tovar</td>
<td>Charles F. Whittlesey</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Colter decorator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>Lamy, NM</td>
<td>El Ortiz</td>
<td>Louis Curtiss</td>
<td>demolished (1943)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Colter decorator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>Union Station</td>
<td>Colter shop decorator</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Grand Canyon</td>
<td>Lookout Studio</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Grand Canyon</td>
<td>Hermit’s Rest</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>Grand Canyon</td>
<td>Phantom Ranch</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>Gallup, NM</td>
<td>El Navajo</td>
<td>M.E.J. Colter</td>
<td>demolished (1957)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>Chicago, IL</td>
<td>Union Station</td>
<td>Colter shop decorator</td>
<td>standing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td>Santa Fe, NM</td>
<td>La Fonda</td>
<td>Rapp, Rapp &amp; Henrikson</td>
<td>FHC expansion John Gaw Meem standing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|      |               |              |                            | Colter interior decorator |}
| 1930 | Winslow, AZ   | La Posada    | M.E.J. Colter             | standing                |
| 1932 | Grand Canyon  | Watchtower   | M.E.J. Colter             | standing                |
| 1935 | Grand Canyon  | Bright Angle | M.E.J. Colter             | standing                |
| 1936 | Grand Canyon  | Men’s Dorm   | M.E.J. Colter             | standing                |
1937  Grand Canyon    Women’s Dorm    M.E.J. Colter    standing
1937  Kansas City    Union Station    Colter decorator    standing
1939  St. Louis, MO    Union Station    Colter decorator    standing
1939  Los Angeles, CA    Union Station    Colter decorator    standing
1940  Albuquerque, MN    Alvarado    Colter decorator of La Cosina Cantina    demolished (1970)
1947  Painted Desert    Desert Inn    Colter decorator    standing
1949  Santa Fe, NM    La Fonda    Colter decorator of La Cantinita    standing

DESERT VIEW WATCHTOWER

Designed as part of a suite of visitor-concession buildings, the Desert View Watchtower built in 1932 sits on the Grand Canyon rim. Its poor original design allowed for deterioration through cracking and water intrusion. A large internal steel frame supports the structure, but its thermal and flexural movement had not been accounted for in the masonry exterior and interior walls. A 3-D laser scan identified the crack locations both inside and out, crack monitors analyzed the movement, and new hidden expansion joints were introduced to support subsequent repairs.

LOCATION
Grand Canyon National Park

SCOPE

HSR Desert View [http://www.page-turnbull.com/portfolio/historic-structure-reports/]
APPENDIX B
M.E.J. COLTER FIREPLACES

B-1. Two M.E.J. Colter Hopi House fireplaces – author’s photo 12-2014

B-2. M.E.J. Colter A) Bright Angle Lodge Lobby fireplace author’s photo 12-2014 and
B) Geological layer fireplace with M.E.J. Colter metalwork in Bright Angle Lodge History Room GCNP– author’s photo summer 2012
Fred Harvey
General Office, Union Station
Kansas City, Mo.

At Los Angeles, Calif.
April 1st, 1935

Mr. Eddie McKee
Chief Ranger Naturalist
Grand Canyon, Arizona

Dear Mr. McKee:

You deserted me last winter without even a

good-bye! When I found you were gone I postponed the build-
ing of the fireplaces till your return. There was a young

man who told me you had passed the job on to him. I would

have been willing to have him gather the rock if he'd been

able to come to terms with the contractor, but I was not pre-

pared to accept a substitute when it came to the building of

it.

I tried to see you before I came up to Los An-
geles on very important business, but did not succeed and ex-
pected to get back in plenty of time. But the mason is now

at the Canyon with nothing to do and I'm having to pay him

for lost time so as soon as I get back Thursday morning, I'll

have to get on the Lounge fireplace.

Won't you please, in the meantime, check the

rock Ed Cummings has collected and see if there are any im-
portant omissions. If so, Ed can get it before Thursday morn-
ing. And won't you please be on hand Thursday morning. I

know the design I want but I depend entirely on you for the

geology.

You know I am not trying to show every strata-
in every part of the whole Canyon, - only those that occur

either on the Bright Angel or the South Rim part of the Kaibab

trails. I want it to be as authentic and there fore interest-
ing as possible of course.

Apparently we are losing out on the fossil rock

for the Lobby fireplace. It is too bad for it would have been

a knockout. All the more I am interested in getting the best

results from the "rim to rim" fireplace in the Lounge and I am

counting on you for this.

Will see you soon.

Sincerely yours,

M. E. J. Colter

B-3. M.E.J. Colter letter to Eddie McKee regarding the Bright Angle Lodge geological fireplace # GRCA 75828 Grand Canyon National Park Museum Collection
B-4. M.E.J. Colter - Hermit’s Rest (1914) great fireplace Grand Canyon National Park. GRCA Museum Collection photos c.1916 A) #49404 and B) #22665

B-5. Hermit’s Rest great room fireplace, author’s husband (2016) and author (2012) Note the metalwork in the fireplace and decorative details in all four photos
APPENDIX C
MARY ELIZABETH JANE COLTER INFLUENCE?

C-1. The Lodge at Santa Fe, NM is a modern architectural design based on the ancient buildings in the area having a stark resemblance to M.E.J. Colter’s Desert View Watchtower http://www.lodgeatsantafe.com/
LIST OF REFERENCES


Grand Canyon archival photographs Arizona State University http://grandcanyonhistory.clas.asu.edu/archives.html


Kropp, P. S. (1996). ‘There is a little sermon in that’: Constructing the native Southwest at the San Diego-Panama–California Exposition of 1915. In M. Weigle & B. A.
Babcock (Eds.), *The Great Southwest of the Fred Harvey Company and the Santa Fe Railroad* (pp. 36–46). Phoenix, AZ: Heard Museum.


Santa Fe New Mexico Archival Photos www.palaceofthegovernors.org/photoarchives.html


BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Barbara Ann (Berkstresser/Sharp) Matusik began her college education at the University of Cincinnati in Ohio pursuing a degree in Applied Arts and Archaeology. After years as a mother, working as a graphic designer and freelance artist in Chicago, she moved to Florida in 1980 with her husband, Robert. Pursuing a computer education while working for a local photography studio, Barbara received a degree in Graphic Design Technology from Gainesville’s Santa Fe Community College in 1997. She earned her Bachelor of Arts in Fine Arts from the University of Florida in 2001 and entered graduate school to obtain a Master of Arts in Museology. In 2007, Barbara completed her master’s thesis and an exhibit, “Visions of Wind River” including Native American objects from the Florida Museum of Natural History Collection. Barbara entered the master’s program in Architecture at the University of Florida in 2009 to conduct research in the field of Historic Preservation, American architecture and the architect, Mary Elizabeth Jane Colter (1869 – 1958). She entered the Design, Construction and Planning PhD program in 2011, earning her PhD in 2017.