

AN EXECUTIONAL AND CULTURAL ANALYSIS OF TELEVISION ADVERTISEMENTS  
IN PAKISTAN

By

IRTIFA NASIR

A THESIS PRESENTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL  
OF THE UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT  
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF  
MASTER OF ADVERTISING

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA

2008

© 2008 Irtifa Nasir

To my mother who prays for me 24/7 and still thinks my grades are a result of *my* hard work, my perfect husband who let me pursue my dream even if that meant staying apart for two years and my supportive in-laws who supported my decision to study abroad in spite of social implications.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank everyone and anyone who has directly or indirectly, consciously or subconsciously, and knowingly or unknowingly helped me cross this great milestone in my life.

First and foremost, I would like to express my most heartfelt appreciation and gratitude to my thesis adviser Dr. Marilyn Roberts; without her continuous guidance, help and support, I could not have dared to write a 50+ page research paper, let alone a 100+ page thesis! I am grateful to her for patiently putting up with my anxiety attacks and nervous tantrums and assuring me of my abilities all along.

I would also like to thank my committee members, Dr. Robyn Goodman and Dr. Jorge Villegas, for their valuable input and constructive critique; they helped me get over the frightening misconceptions I had been fed about getting thrashed in a proposal defense. They are great teachers and I wish I was an undergrad and could take more classes with them.

I would like to thank all my friends, Michelle, Arsalan, Saqib, Elaine, MJ... and everyone else, who made my life so much easier and more colorful, eventful and beautiful. They have helped me all along, put up with my eccentricities and still remained unwavering in their love and support. I salute them for their resilience.

Last but not the least, I would like to thank my mother and my husband for trusting my abilities and letting me avail this once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to pursue my dream. They are my strength and the pillars of my life; in fact, without them I am pretty much a nonentity.

God, I thank thee for all of the above and more.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>page</u>
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	4
LIST OF TABLES .....	7
ABSTRACT .....	9
CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION .....	10
Purpose of the Study .....	11
Significance of the Study .....	12
Methodical Approach .....	13
Research Overview .....	14
2 LITERATURE REVIEW .....	16
What Is Culture? .....	16
Brief History of Pakistan .....	17
Cultural Analysis of Pakistan .....	18
Religion .....	19
Social Organization .....	20
Globalization Trends .....	21
Cultural Arts .....	22
Food and Drink Consumption Culture .....	22
Overview of Advertising in Pakistan .....	24
History .....	24
Current Scenario .....	27
Characteristics of Pakistani Advertisements .....	29
Television Networks in Pakistan .....	30
Frameworks for Cultural Analysis .....	32
Pakistan's Rankings on Hofstede's Dimensions .....	34
Power Distance .....	34
Masculinity .....	34
Individualism .....	35
Uncertainty Avoidance .....	36
Long-term Orientation .....	36
Cultural Studies in Advertising .....	37
The Stewart and Furse Framework .....	43
Research Questions and Hypotheses .....	45
Execuational Characteristics .....	46
Cultural Values .....	50
Other Exploratory Cultural Variables .....	50
Hypotheses .....	51

3	METHODOLOGY .....	53
	Unit of Analysis .....	54
	Sampling Design.....	54
	Coding Categories and Variables .....	57
	Pretest and Coding Procedure.....	58
	Inter-coder Reliability.....	59
	Data Analysis.....	62
4	FINDINGS.....	63
	Description of the Sample of Commercials.....	63
	Research Questions.....	66
	Execuational Characteristics .....	66
	Cultural Values .....	89
	Other Exploratory Cultural Variables .....	95
	Hypotheses.....	97
5	DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS .....	99
	Descriptive Results .....	99
	Dominant Execuational Characteristics .....	100
	Descriptive Characteristics.....	100
	Dependent Relationships with Channel of Commercial .....	102
	Dependent Relationships with Product Category.....	103
	Dominant Cultural Values .....	105
	Descriptive Results.....	105
	Dependent Relationships with Channel of Commercial .....	107
	Dependent Relationships with Product Category.....	107
	Other Exploratory Variables.....	110
	Hypotheses.....	111
	Women in Western Clothing in Edible Items Commercials .....	111
	Language of Text by Brand Origin .....	111
	Limitations.....	112
	Future Research .....	114
	Conclusion .....	115
APPENDIX		
A	THESIS CODE SHEET .....	117
B	CODE BOOK .....	126
LIST OF REFERENCES .....		140
BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH .....		146

## LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table</u>	<u>page</u>
1 Holsti’s (1969) Inter-Coder Reliability.....	59
2 Distribution of Sample by Source of Commercial.....	63
3 Sample Distribution by Brand Origin.....	64
4 Sample Distribution by Length of Commercial.....	64
5 Sample Distribution by Channel of the Commercial.....	64
6 Sample Distribution by Product Category .....	65
7 Sample Distribution of Edible Items.....	65
8 Product Categories by Channel.....	66
9 Distribution of Visual Devices Presence .....	67
10 Distribution of Language of Text in Commercial.....	67
11 Substantive Supers by Product Category .....	68
12 Surrealistic Visuals by Product Category .....	68
13 Language of Text in Commercial by Product Category .....	69
14 Auditory Devices Presence.....	69
15 Rhymes, Slogans and Mnemonics by Product Category .....	70
16 Unusual Sound Effects by Product Category.....	71
17 Distribution of Music and Dancing Presence .....	71
18 Music Style by Product Category .....	72
19 Dancing in Commercial by Channel of Commercial.....	72
20 Music Creates a Mood by Product Category .....	73
21 Music Present as a Major Element by Product Category .....	73
22 Music Style by Product Category .....	74
23 Distribution of Commercial Appeals or Selling Propositions .....	74

24	Commercial Approach in Sample.....	76
25	Brand Differentiating Message in Sample.....	76
26	Commercial Approach by Product Category.....	77
27	Brand-differentiating Messages by Product Category.....	77
28	Dominant Commercial Format.....	78
29	Commercial Format by Product Category.....	79
30	Typology of Broadcast Messages in Sample.....	80
31	Typology of Broadcast Messages by Product Category.....	80
32	Dominant Commercial Setting.....	81
33	Commercial Setting by Channel of Commercial.....	82
34	Commercial Setting by Product Category.....	82
35	Commercial Tones in Sample.....	83
36	Dominant Commercial Tone by Product Category.....	84
37	Dominant Commercial Structure.....	85
38	Dominant Commercial Structure by Product Category.....	86
39	Commercial Characters Presence in Sample.....	86
40	Commercial Characters by Channel of Ad (N=214).....	87
41	Commercial Characters Presence by Product Category (N=214).....	89
42	Presence of Cultural Values.....	90
43	Presence of Cultural Values by Channel of Commercial.....	91
44	Presence of Cultural Values by Product Categories.....	93
45	Presence of Females in Western Clothing.....	95
46	Portrayal of Women in Western Clothing by Product Category.....	96
47	Religious Reference in Sample.....	96
48	Female Characters Clothing by Edible Items (n=122).....	97

Abstract of Thesis Presented to the Graduate School  
of the University of Florida in Partial Fulfillment of the  
Requirements for the Degree of Master of Advertising

AN EXECUTIONAL AND CULTURAL ANALYSIS OF TELEVISION ADVERTISEMENTS  
IN PAKISTAN

By

Irtifa Nasir

May 2008

Chair: Marilyn Roberts  
Major: Advertising

The primary purpose of this study was to explore the creative executional characteristics and dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani television advertising. The study also examined any significant differences in the executional characteristics and value appeals among Pakistani terrestrial and satellite television channels and differences in commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items.

The methodology chosen is content analysis. The unit of analysis is the individual television commercial aired on PTV (terrestrial), GEO TV (satellite) and ARY Digital (satellite) between 2002 and 2007. Hofstede's cultural dimensions were used as the theoretical framework for cultural analysis.

The findings suggest that cultural values portrayed across different channels tend to stay the same. However, the executional characteristics as well as cultural values tend to differ significantly in commercials for different product categories. Also, Pakistani food and drink category commercials overall generally tend to contain younger models and emphasis on being youthful and young and use affable language to communicate with the audience.

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

In the words of Marshall McLuhan "Historians and archaeologists will one day discover that the ads of our time are the richest and most faithful reflections that any society ever made of its entire range of activities" (BrainyQuote, 2007).

What makes Pakistani advertisements so distinctly 'Pakistani'? This study aims to understand the underlying cultural dimensions manifest in television commercials on terrestrial and satellite television channels as well as across product categories in Pakistan and examine how reflective they are of the existing cultural values of Pakistan.

From an industry perspective, from the days when advertising was restricted to graffiti on the walls, printed messages in the newspapers and handbills (Aslam, 2000) to the day when concepts like '360 degrees Advertising' and 'Brand Activation' have become commonplace, Pakistan has come a long way. The growth of the advertising industry is inseparably linked to Pakistani media development over the past 60 years. Starting off with the press being the only medium of advertising available to advertisers and leading up to the recent years, the rapid proliferation of media choices and emergence of new distribution channels poses great challenges to advertising and media professionals. The industry is growing at an unprecedented rate; a few Pakistani advertisements also have received honors at the Abby Awards in India (Pak Tribune, 2005, June 27). Several local advertising agencies are affiliated with prominent multinationals such as McCann-Erickson, Young and Rubicam, I-Com and Saatchi and Saatchi. Recently, following JWT Pakistan's footsteps, the multinational agency Ogilvy and Mather setup independent operations in Pakistan. The All Pakistan Newspapers Association (APNS) instituted awards for excellence in print advertising in 1981 while the advertising publication Aurora instituted Pakistan's first electronic media awards in 2007.

Pakistan's GDP experienced a strong average yearly growth of 7% over 2002-2007 making it one of the fastest-growing economies in Asia. Per capita income increased by an average of 13% per annum over 2002-2007 while real private consumption expenditure grew by an average of 7.4% during 2003-2007, indicating the emergence of a strong middle-class with growing buying power. Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) grew by 37% in 2006-2007 touching US\$ 4.16 billion, as compared to US\$ 3.2 billion in 2005-2006. Telecom, energy, banking and finance, and food and beverages accounted for almost 80% percent of FDI growth. This indicates investors' confidence in the long-term profitability from production activities in Pakistan (Government of Pakistan, 2007).

In the past six years, extensive structural reforms, macroeconomic stability and quick, strong and continuous economic revival has made Pakistan an ideal country for foreign investment. However, Pakistan still suffers from a image problem which has been further aggravated by foreign media depicting it as a society with religious extremism, oppression of women and children, political turmoil, mass illiteracy, high conservatism, hatred towards the West, etc. (Alam, 2005). This distorted image may not only discourage the foreign investor from investing in Pakistan, it can also make it difficult for the international marketer to understand the true society and culture of Pakistan, its people, emerging social and consumption trends and technologies. The lack of knowledge can make it very difficult for a prospective foreign investor to design appropriate communication for successfully marketing and selling its products/services in Pakistan. There is an information gap that needs to be filled.

### **Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this study is to highlight the recurring executional characteristics and elements of Pakistani television advertising and to examine how television advertisements portray the culture of Pakistan. Although every country possesses a national culture, some sub-cultural

differences may exist owing to factors such as demographics, geographic location, socio-economic status, education level, etc. These differences may reflect in advertisements targeted to these audiences. Therefore, rather than just looking at Pakistani TV commercials as a whole, this study will explore TV commercials from terrestrial and satellite channels in Pakistan and among different product categories to highlight any differences in the characteristics and value appeals used in those commercials.

Television is the medium of choice because television in Pakistan enjoys a popularity unmatched by any other medium of mass communication in the country. In the words of Shoaib Qureshi (2005, June), an advertising guru in Pakistan, “Even at a national level, a Pakistani is as much a follower of the ‘Electronic Religion’ as he is of Islam” (p. 18). According to advertising spending figures for the fiscal year July 1, 2005 to June 30, 2006, television advertising owned a 38% of the media mix as compared to 46% owned by print media (Aurora, 2006, December). However, television still remains the most influential medium in view of the fact that the literacy rate in Pakistan for people aged 15 and over hovers around 48.7% with 61.7% men and only 35.2% women being literate (Ghauri, 2006, July 28). Television is the best medium that breaks through the barriers of literacy and reaches out to the entire population regardless of education level and therefore enjoys a more heterogeneous audience compared to print media.

### **Significance of the Study**

In advertising research, culture-portrayals in advertisements have generally been measured as a function of cultural values (e.g., Olayan & Karande, 2000; Ahmed, 1996; Milner & Collins, 2000; Cho, Up, Gentry, Jun & Kropp, 1999; Singh & Baack, 2004). While many studies have analyzed the differences in cultural values portrayed in advertisements from a cross-national perspective (e.g., Olayan & Karande, 2000; Ahmed, 1996; Milner & Collins, 2000; Cho, Up, Gentry, Jun and Kropp, 1999; Moon & Chan, 2005, Zhang & Neelankavil, 1997), there has been

little research on the variations in cultural values depicted in the advertising content aired across different vehicles on an advertising channel. More specifically, there has been no study based on the variations in cultural values depicted in advertisements aired on a country's satellite television channels in comparison to terrestrial television channels and how they relate to the accepted cultural/sub-cultural values of that society. A literature gap exists in this area.

Moreover, no recognized academic literature exists in relation to Pakistani advertising – a booming industry in contemporary Pakistan. This exploratory study will provide a stepping stone for future researchers who wish to further explore Pakistani advertising and carry out cross-cultural comparisons with other countries.

According to the famous novelist Norman Douglas, “you can tell the ideals of a nation by its advertisements” (Norman Douglas Quotes, 2007). Over the past century, this idea has been emphasized by various social scientists through research in cultural anthropology, sociology, marketing, mass communication, cultural studies and semiotics (Ahmed, 1996). Also it has been shown that advertising appeals that use local cultural cues, i.e. an adaptive communication strategy, elicit considerably greater positive attitudes than those that do not (Zhang & Gelb, 1996; Gregory & Munch, 1997; Singh & Baack, 2004). Edward T. Hall (1981) holds that “the chances of one's being correct decrease as cultural distances increase” (pg. 76). Therefore, this study will help foreign multinationals looking to enter the Pakistani market to understand the dominant cultural values within Pakistani advertising to enable them to adapt their marketing communication to the acceptable culture and emerging trends.

### **Methodical Approach**

The variables for this content analysis have been derived from Stewart and Furse's (1986) study of effective television advertising, Cheng (1997), Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp (1999), Moon & Chan (2005), Albers-Miller & Gelb (1996) and Hofstede, Pederson and

Hofstede J. (2002). Hofstede's cultural dimensions and studies of advertising effectiveness form the theoretical framework for this research. The sample has been derived from the media banks of Synergy Advertising (Lahore) and Orient McCann-Erickson (Lahore). The sample represents advertisements from three product categories comprising carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items, aired on three television channels comprising PTV (terrestrial owned by state), GEO TV (satellite channel owned by local media group) and ARY Digital (satellite channel owned by pan-global group).

### **Research Overview**

This thesis has been organized in chapters as follows: Chapter 1 is a brief overview of the study and how this research is hoped to make a contribution to advertising literature. Chapter 2 consists of a literature review that starts off by defining culture, a brief overview of the history of Pakistan and insights into the country's social, cultural and religious characteristics. This is followed by a discussion of the Pakistani advertising industry including its history and the current scenario. The chapter moves on to a discussion of the different cultural frameworks that exist for this type of study, a detailed description of Hofstede's cultural dimensions and its importance in the current study. Previous studies of culture portrayal in advertising are discussed and finally, the research questions and hypotheses for this study are proposed.

Chapter 3 describes the methodology that has been used in this research, starting off with a brief overview of content analysis, the sampling design, the variable analysis framework and coding categories with definitions, coding and pre-testing procedures, reliability measures and finally the data analysis method.

Chapter 4 consists of the findings from this quantitative content analysis. Frequency tables, cross-tabulations and chi-squares results also are presented.

Chapter 5 deals with a discussion and implications of the findings, limitations of this study, and lastly, suggestions for future research and conclusion are offered.

## CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

### **What Is Culture?**

To date, several variations of the definition of ‘culture’ and ‘cultural values’ have been documented. In the simplest of words, de Mooij (2004) describes culture as the “glue that binds groups together” (p. 26). It defines a social grouping and embodies all the common attitudes, beliefs, ideas, customs, roles, institutions and social organizations shared by its members who live together in the same geographic region in the same historical period (de Mooij, 2004).

According to E.B. Taylor, culture is “a complex whole, which includes knowledge, belief, art, morals, law, custom, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by individuals as members of a society” (as cited in Mueller, 2004, p. 106). In other words, individual behavior is controlled by a set of pre-defined procedures that are by and large adhered to by the members who share a common culture. In the same vein, in his book ‘Culture and Organizations – Software of the Mind’, Geert Hofstede (1994), one of the most well-known and widely-quoted social researchers in cross-cultural marketing research, defines culture as the ‘collective mental programming’ (p. 5) that forms the basis for the differentiation between members of different groups or categories. Also, one is not born with culture; it is inherited from one’s external environment and is then internalized (Mueller, 2004). It is also different from human nature on the one side and from an individual’s personality on the other. Hofstede (1994) says that human nature is what all human beings have in common – it includes universals like love, anger, hate, joy and sorrow; how we choose to express these feelings is influenced by culture. Similarly,

one's personality is something that is partly genetic and partly determined by one's unique experiences as well as culture (Hofstede, 1994).

Individuals' values are basically a combination of the characteristics of their unique individual personalities and the shared characteristics of the group they belong and thus patterns of association of values can vary considerably between the individual level and the collective level (de Mooij, 2004). For example, in Pakistan, the color green is associated with different values on the two levels – it stands for purity on one hand and on the other, it stands for nationalism and patriotism to Pakistan.

For the purpose of this discussion, it is safe to assume that although there is a diverse range of individual personalities in any society, the predominant one is taken to represent national culture (de Mooij, 2004). According to Hofstede, it can be debated that societies are more consistent in character than nations and thus the definition of common culture might not be applicable on nations. However, there are quite a few integrative forces within every nation, such as mass media, dominant language, etc. that make such an extrapolation possible (de Mooij, 2004).

### **Brief History of Pakistan**

Pakistan is a relatively new entity on the world atlas and was formed out of the partition of the Indian sub-continent in 1947. The country is located in an area which was home to the great Indus Valley and Harappa civilizations some 4,500 years ago and also came under great Buddhist influence from the Central Asian Kushan Empire (Background Notes: Pakistan, 2007). In 711 A.D., Muslim traders introduced Islam in the subcontinent which was then followed by the vast Muslim Mogul Empire, which ruled the subcontinent from the 13<sup>th</sup> to the 18<sup>th</sup> century. This period influenced the architecture, cuisine, and language of the region, the effects of which can be seen in Pakistani culture

even today (Country Profile: Pakistan, 2005). After the collapse of the Mogul Empire, much of the subcontinent came under a British imperialist rule, which affected the socio-economic system as well as the culture of the subcontinent in many ways. One of the most obvious examples of British influence that can still be seen today is status of English as the official language in the subcontinent.

There were two dominant religions in the subcontinent i.e. Hinduism and Islam, but over time, due to the development of antagonistic feelings between Muslims and Hindus, Pakistan was formed as a separate homeland for Muslims in 1947 (Country Profile: Pakistan, 2005).

Although a democratic republic, Pakistan has been under military rule for more than half its existence – from 1958-1972; 1977-1985 (Mumtaz & Mitha, 2003). After a bloodless military coup in October 1999 to date, the country has been under the leadership of General Pervez Musharraf. The social, political and economic consequences of such extended periods of dictatorship have been immense. The effects manifest themselves in the shape of sharp inequality within the social classes and geographical regions, with power and wealth concentrated in the hands of the few (Mumtaz & Mitha, 2003). Moreover, Pakistan also has been under the deep-rooted undemocratic influence of feudal lords who enjoy considerable control over politics and the economy since Pakistan's inception (Warner, 2003).

### **Cultural Analysis of Pakistan**

Pakistan is a relatively new entity on the political map, but its diverse array of sub-cultures and values find their roots in hundreds of years of history. Pakistani culture, as we study it today, is a product of its religious affiliation (i.e. Islam), its Indian origins, British colonialism and indirect American influences (Warner, 2003).

## **Religion**

Pakistan is a predominantly Muslim country with 97% of the population following the religion of Islam, while Christians, Hindus and Parsis (a Zoroastrian sect) are the religious minorities (Background Notes: Pakistan, 2007). According to Hofstede's research, Muslim countries rank relatively higher than others on the Power Distance index (ITIM International, 2003). This is illustrated by the fact that the Islamic religion in Pakistan generally has a bearing on most aspects of society, culture and the law. The 'Shariah' or Islamic law is the basis for legal and juridical structure and violations of the Islamic laws has stern implications. Islamic extremism is seen rampant in educational institutions as well, with Jaamat-e-Islami, the youth wing of Pakistan's biggest Islamic party, resiliently controlling not just student activities (Economist, 2006, July), but also influencing curriculum, course syllabuses, faculty selection and degree programs in almost all of Pakistan's 50 public universities (Baker, 2006, October 16).

Due to the gradual emergence of an educated middle class in the country, several new private educational institutions have appeared and the concept of Madrassahs (Schools with only rigid Islamic teachings) is being criticized in educated circles with the reasoning that these Madrassahs were just creating unemployment and militancy in society (Hamid, 2004). President Pervez Musharraf has paid particular attention to this issue and holds that "there is no place for extremism, terrorism and sectarianism in our country as these would disrupt our development activities," (The News, 2007, September 30). He is taking measures to increase literacy and curb unemployment to counter militant inclinations amongst the youth.

## **Social Organization**

The social organization of the country is predominantly based on a Baradari (family kin) system, wherein the Baradari serves as the distinct identity for its members and provides social protection to them. Members form strong ties with persons within their Baradari and also with other social groups they identify with (Warner, 2003). Family obligations play a very integral role in the lives of Pakistanis. Responsibilities towards family are broad-based, including both financial support and active involvement in collective rituals and traditions. A strong sense of dependency and need for security is characteristic of Pakistanis, which follows from their highly collectivist approach to social life.

According to Ramsey Naja, Chief Creative Officer, JWT Middle East and Africa, Pakistan is a collectivist society that attaches great importance to the group rather than the individual (Baig, 2007a). Similar to the Arab world, the society is built around the family. Decisions and opinions are shaped through mutual consent of the group, not the individual (Baig, 2007a). In a country with a predominantly collectivist culture, familiarity bears significant value; the tried and tested is often preferred over the untried – the exotic. This makes it very difficult for advertisers to breakthrough the walls of tradition that are erected by the highly collectivist Pakistani consumers (Baig, 2007a).

However, as the educated middle-class is expanding, a trend towards a nuclear family system is being noticed especially in the large metropolises of the country (Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad), owing to the quickening pace of life and increasing job competition due to economic development.

Generally, Pakistani masses seem to be apprehensive of making decisions on their own for fear of disapproval from their social surroundings and thus depend on other

normative forces to steer their lives for them (Warner, 2003). For instance, the majority of Pakistanis still believe in arranged marriages wherein the bride or the groom is selected by parents or other elders in the family. This kind of attitude of submission to authority also has been reinforced by the political scenario in the country.

### **Globalization Trends**

One cannot fail to notice the permeating influences of American media, society and organizational culture in Pakistan. With access to many American channels like HBO, MTV, etc., the rapid permeation of the internet amongst the masses, and the adoption of American syllabi in many private colleges around the country, a majority of Pakistanis are in some form being exposed to American cultural values and thought processes, which is slowly injecting a sense of materialism and consumerism amongst them (Warner, 2003).

Talking about media more specifically, the diversity of foreign media has exposed the average Pakistani to foreign advertising and brand culture. Belonging to a nation which is struggling to develop economically and is dependent on foreign aid from the more 'successful' or powerful countries for its progress, the average Pakistani has become an 'aspirant' by nature; and foreign media has fueled his/her aspirations to experience a better life similar to what Western media has portrayed to him/her (Faizi, 2007).

However, according to Shahnour Ahmed, industry veteran and CEO of Spectrum Communications (Pvt.) Ltd., in spite of all the modern trends and Western values that Pakistanis are imbibing from the media, Pakistan still largely remains a conservative society. Advertisers should realize that trying to go against the basic cultural values and norms of society reduces the value of the message as an incentive for consumers. Out-of-

the-box award-winning advertisements may not always be the most effective consumer-centric advertisements (Defining the past, 2005, June).

### **Cultural Arts**

The cultural arts of Pakistan are changing much more rapidly than what is generally assumed. For instance, Pakistan has gained great fame in the area of music. This is just part of the rapid revolution of the arts and media, which has taken over the country since new media laws liberalizing broadcasting policies were established in Pakistan by President Pervez Musharraf in 2002 (Hoffman & Rehmat, 2007, May 25). In recent years, Pakistan has witnessed rapid cable and satellite pervasion, combined with increasing economic growth, especially in the advertising, telecom, apparel, textiles and cement industries (Menen, 2006, March 23). All these factors combined have set off a new wave of cultural revival and modernization which is not just limited to the country's Westernized elites. Rather, it is a mass culture and is being created in the major metropolitan areas of Pakistan (Hamid, 2004).

### **Food and Drink Consumption Culture**

Modern Pakistani culture is a synthesis of its Aryan, Dravidian, Greek, Scythian, Hun, Arab, Mongol, Persian, and Afghan roots (Khan, 2006, March 23). The influence of each of these races can be felt in Pakistani cuisine and consumption culture.

Pakistani women believe that the way to a man's heart is through his stomach. Cooking is considered to be a foremost duty of every female in the country and girls are taught how to cook right from when they are teenagers. In majority of Pakistani families, prospective grooms' families place a lot of importance on how well the girls can cook and serve food in order to be considered for marriage. Pakistani food is known to be rich in spices and herbs and 'Masala' or 'Seasoning' is the most important ingredient in all

Pakistani foods. Due to the quickening pace of life in urban areas especially with an increasing number working women, pre-seasoned masalas (all in one spice mixes) have become very popular in the country (Irshad, 2003, December 1). Most Pakistani dishes are either deep-fried or cooked in ample amounts of cooking oil or Ghee (a thicker more traditional form of oil). Although rice is very popular in Pakistan, wheat is considered the staple food and is used to make bread called 'Roti' or 'Chapati', which is an indispensable accompaniment of all meals (Khan, 2006, March 23).

The religion of Islam also bears a great influence on eating habits of Pakistanis. The consumption of pork and alcohol is strictly prohibited in Islam. These items are not publicly sold or marketed in Pakistan. Sales are restricted to non-Muslims only (Pakistan Food, n.d.). These restrictions have channeled the tastes and consumption habits of Pakistanis in other directions. For instance, carbonated soft drinks have become part of the culture in Pakistan, especially amongst the youth in both rural and urban areas such that they make up the highest per capita consumption in Pakistan (Business News, 2006, April 17). Moreover, traditional liquid concentrate drinks like 'Rooh-Afza' and 'Jam-e-Shirin' are considered essential in every Pakistani home especially in rural areas during summers (Euromonitor International, 2007a, February). Also, with the increase in health awareness amongst consumers, demand for fruit juices and bottled water also has increased drastically.

Tea and milk also form an integral part of Pakistani culture. The great majority of Pakistanis drink at least a morning and an evening cup of milk tea daily, even during summers. Serving milk tea to every guest is an essential part of Pakistan's hospitality

code. This strong demand has made Pakistan the world's largest importer of tea and the 7<sup>th</sup> largest tea consumer in the world (Euromonitor International, 2007b, February).

## **Overview of Advertising in Pakistan**

### **History**

For almost a decade after Pakistan's inception in 1947, the advertising domain was controlled by a few large foreign-based advertising agencies. The press was the only medium of advertising available. Client budgets were severely limited. There was a great dearth of trained and skilled professionals and production facilities were almost non-existent (Orient Advertisers, 1988). This was not a surprising scenario at that time given that most of the nation's attention was directed towards nation-building efforts and overcoming problems that any newly formed country goes through. Commerce and industry faced stunted growth initially during the first decade after Pakistan's formation.

In the next few years, this picture started to change dramatically. New commercial and industrial ventures cropped up. The consumer market started taking shape and this created a growing demand for better and innovative advertising. Rapid developments also took place on the media side (Orient Advertisers, 1988). Radio Pakistan started its commercial services, which was followed by the launch of the first state-owned television station, Pakistan Television (PTV), in Lahore in November 1964. The Pakistan Television Network (a public limited company with all shares residing with the Government of Pakistan) dominated television till around 1990, when STN became available to Pakistani viewers (Television Mania, 2005, June).

Since 1999, the number of TV channels in Pakistan has increased significantly with the formation of new media policies. Earlier, the only Pakistani TV channels comprised the state-run PTV, PTV World and Channel 3, which were owned by the Pakistan

Television Corporation Limited (PTV Network) (Cyber City Online, 2004). Due to a long-drawn Islamist Military dictatorship in Pakistan by General Zia-ul-Haq in the 80s, numerous media policies and censor laws were drastically affected. For example, some of the extremely strict rulings on broadcast media included:

- No physical contact between male and female – not even between siblings or mother and son.
- TV plays were barred from showing married couples sharing a bed.
- Playwrights were banned from using the word ‘jamhooriat’ (democracy).
- Making fun or even critiquing the army and the clergy was not allowed.
- Female singers were only allowed minimum physical movement while singing on TV.
- Female newscasters and announcers were not allowed to wear makeup on screen.
- No ads could show models blowing a bubble gum or licking an ice-cream cone.
- Females could be shown in only 30% of the total time of the commercial (Paracha, 2005).

These strict media laws had a very long-lasting impact on Pakistani advertisements through the times. Even though today these censorship laws do not hold as they were, a subtle yet very noticeable difference can still be seen in the content run on the state-owned television channels and those broadcast on the newer privately-owned TV channels.

At the start of the new millennium, the Pakistan Electronic Media Authority (PEMRA) realized the dearth of electronic media and issued licenses to several new private satellite channels and television networks to meet the growing demands of viewers in the hope of propelling Pakistani electronic media to meet international standards (Television Mania, 2005, June). This also provided advertising with the much

needed push and opportunity to grow and develop in order to meet and maintain the same standards that were being established by these modern private media ventures.

According to advertising industry veteran, Shahnoor Ahmed, there is a world of difference between the advertising industry scene today and that in the seventies. In the seventies for example, advertisers had to send copy to independent typesetters to get it composed and if there were modifications in the copy, advertisers had to go to the typesetters to get them done (Defining the past, 2005, June). Usually, one could find personnel from different agencies sitting with the same typesetter competing for his services (Defining the past, 2005, June). Moreover, in those times, print was the dominant media for most campaigns. PTV was the only television channel in Pakistan and was very inflexible and set out rigid regulations for advertisers to follow. For example, advertisements on PTV were only accepted on 35 mm film (Defining the past, 2005, June).

The past provided the advertising industry in Pakistan with a number of factors that propelled it to where it stands today. Even in its early days, multinational companies saw Pakistan as favorable grounds for investment. Industries and manufacturers within the country grew substantially to take their operations beyond regional boundaries. Moreover, there was a mass exodus of skilled labor from Pakistan to the Middle East in the 1970s, which greatly increased purchasing power within the country. Also, globalization and the spread of international media brought in the Western concept of consumerism that was quickly adopted by the Pakistani people, as it gave them a culturally warranted feeling of affluence and superiority (Aslam, 2000).

## **Current Scenario**

In the past 60 years of Pakistan's existence on the map of the world, the market for consumer goods, durables, capital goods and services has grown phenomenally. This is quite an evolutionary achievement for a country that had virtually no infrastructure just a little more than half a century ago. This growth is not limited to the size and demand of the consumer market. It can also be seen in the development and specialization of marketing tools and trends that are quickly propelling the market to a level at par with global standards.

Pakistan's advertising expenditure is amongst the most optimistic in Asia, experiencing an average yearly growth of around 25% (WPP, 2007). Moreover, the Pakistani economy has seen a growth of 7% in 2006 and earned it a position amongst the fastest growing economies in Asia. In 2007, foreign investment is projected to be close to \$3 billion, the highest in Pakistan has ever experienced (WPP, 2007). Michael Maedel, President of JWT believes that Asia boasts of some of the strongest emerging economies in the world, led by China and India at the forefront and followed by the next generation of countries that include Vietnam, Indonesia and Pakistan in that order. With huge amounts of investment pouring into these countries, he believes that Pakistan has also crossed over to the next stage in the evolution of communications wherein consumer spending has increased substantially and is predicted to double in the recent future (Baig, 2007b). Pakistan also being strategically located between the Middle East and the rest of Asia, acts as a bridge between these two rapidly developing regions (WPP, 2007).

However, academically speaking, there has been no formal research on the budding advertising industry; no conceptual framework has ever been applied to measure the creativity, effectiveness or content of Pakistani ads. The majority of advertising agencies

do not use formal market research for even large-scale campaigns. Clients are well aware of this but the lack of a proper research framework and infrastructure makes such an option infeasible at the current time. According to Ahmed Zaki, Director Operations of the Evernew Group (affiliated with Dentsu), most advertising is being done based on gut feel and the data that is available is usually not reliable (Personal Communication, 1<sup>st</sup> August, 2007). However, Ammar Rasool, Creative Director at JWT Pakistan, holds that a lot of multinational brands already established in Pakistan do base all their marketing efforts on research. Moreover, he believes that most of the advertisements made in Pakistan are very consumer-targeted. If it is a product for use in the kitchen, the advertisements will always show housewives in a household setting and most of the times, the advertisements are depicting stereotypical roles (personal communication, 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2007). It is worthy of note that Pakistani advertisements have won quite a few awards in the international arena (Abby Awards in India, for example). Several new multinational companies have entered the country, mostly due to a recent telecommunication boom (new international telecom giants like Telenor and Warid Telecom entered Pakistan in 2004). The advertising industry is undergoing rapid expansion and development. Also, P&G, Unilever, Pepsico and other market giants are spending millions of rupees every year in face of the media explosion that has given viewers a multitude of new channels and print media options to choose from.

As of October 19, 2006, Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) has issued licenses to 18 private satellite TV channels out of which 14 are already in operation (Daily Times, 2006, October 19). This sudden expansion of private

TV stations has brought an end to more than 5 decades of the state-run broadcast company Pakistan Television Network's virtual monopoly of TV broadcasting.

However, according to Miles Young, Chairman of Ogilvy & Mather Asia Pacific, "There is no country in the world where the gap between external perception and reality is so extreme" (WPP, 2007). Even though Pakistan has undergone unprecedented progress economically and socially and has been greatly affected by globalization, it is still perceived as a backward country because so little is known about it. This is especially true in the area of advertising.

### **Characteristics of Pakistani Advertisements**

According to an informal survey of 500 respondents (male/female, sec A/B, different age groups) conducted by Synergizer, a leading advertising magazine, the most recalled advertisements were not only 10 years or older but also jingle-based. The top brands that invoked instant recall included State Life Insurance, Naurus Instant Drink Mix, Dentonic Tooth Powder and Lipton Yellow Label owing to the simplicity, catchiness and repetition of their jingles, which made these advertisements unforgettable to most Pakistanis (Mandviwalla, 2007).

Syed Faisal Hashmi holds that almost 80% of Pakistani advertising is formula-based in claim, idea and execution leading to creative mediocrity in the industry (Hashmi, 2007). Also, according to Ahmed Kapadia, CEO of Synergy Advertising in Pakistan, most of Pakistani advertising is visually oriented with very little emphasis on the actual big idea; the form takes precedence over the content (Marketing Association of Pakistan, 2005). In a personal interview, Ammar Rasool, Creative Director of JWT Pakistan commented that over the past few years, Pakistan has come to a point where in terms of production value, sound and picture quality, graphics and cinematography, Pakistani

advertising can easily compete with international advertising. However, in terms of ideas and content, Pakistani advertising lags far behind due to Pakistan not being a very experimental or arts-driven society (Personal communication, 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2007).

According to Mazhar Salam, Account Director at Red Communication Arts in Pakistan, most of Pakistani advertising is mediocre and portrays characters in stereotypical roles because there are risks associated with altering the accepted social, religious and political norms and going against them can result in a serious backlash. Even some kinds of humor might end up hurting religious sentiments or offend a political faction. Advertisers need to be careful in what they show (Personal communication, 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2007).

### **Television Networks in Pakistan**

Following the previous discussion about the changing face of Pakistani culture, a discussion of the current shift in the overall outlook of advertising in Pakistan will now be presented. The shift could be due to several factors: the advent of new multinationals with a more affluent consumer base (and thus more educated and open to innovation), public acceptance of President Musharraf's theory of 'Moderate enlightenment' i.e. a suggestion that the Muslim world needed to pursue the path of moderation and enlightenment in order to break free from its present deadlock (Shuja, 2005), or modernization trends caused by increased exposure to the outside world through rapid proliferation of new media and satellite networks.

This change is apparent in both the long-established terrestrial TV channels as well as the new satellite ones. An important fact to note is that the major terrestrial channel PTV is state-owned and the most popular satellite channels Geo TV and ARY Digital are private-owned. As a terrestrial channel, it has the highest reach and viewership comprising all strata, segments, income groups and ages (Interview with the Head, 2005,

June). This is because satellite channels are only accessible to viewers through cable subscription while PTV, being terrestrial, is openly accessible to anyone with a television set.

Pakistan's population is close to 166 million. More than two thirds live in rural areas in around 125,000 villages across the country (Mohsin, 2005, July-August). In terms of TV viewership, 78% of the urban population in Pakistan watches TV. Out of these, 13% are occasional viewers while 65% regularly watch TV at least 4 days a week. In the rural areas, 49% of the population watches TV. The total cable and satellite viewership in Pakistan, according to Gallup, is 53% for urban areas and 13% for rural areas (Business Recorder, 2007). In terms of advertising expenditure for the fiscal year 2005-2006, the total advertising expenditure for satellite channels was Rs. 3.81 billion, i.e. US\$ 63.5 million (64%) and Rs. 2.15 billion, i.e. US\$ 35.83 million (36%) for terrestrial channels (Aurora, December 2006).

Private TV channels are not permitted to broadcast terrestrially and cable viewership is very low in rural areas. Thus PTV, being a state-owned terrestrial channel, holds a virtual monopoly in all rural areas of Pakistan. This results in a larger rural audience, compared to satellite TV channels like GEO and ARY Digital that are watched mostly in larger metropolitan areas (Fatah, 2005). It is believed that PTV's viewership in urban areas has been reduced drastically since the introduction of better quality and more global private satellite channels, the most popular amongst which are Geo TV and ARY Digital. However, urban families belonging to the lower income groups still prefer to watch PTV as it is available to them without any subscription fee.

This brings up an interesting dichotomy considering that most satellite viewer-ship is drawn from urban viewers who can afford to subscribe to cable TV channels while most terrestrial viewer-ship is drawn from rural areas or the lower SES groups who cannot afford subscribing to cable. Also, in terms of content, according to Imran Ansari, Head of Sales and Marketing for PTV Network, PTV is different from private satellite channels because it depicts the true culture of Pakistan as opposed to private satellite channels who are always trying to copy Indian channels in terms of content (Interview with the Head, 2005, June). Another difference is that the most popular satellite channels, GEO TV and ARY Digital are up-linked from Dubai Media City in the UAE therefore avoid the strict telecast regulations of the government of Pakistan and broadcast relatively uncensored programming (Fatah, 2005).

### **Frameworks for Cultural Analysis**

Culture has always been an important topic of research. For the purpose of this study, a number of cultural typologies were analyzed based on how popular they were in business literature and how effectively their cultural value categories or dimensions have been operationalized to reliably represent the cultural values depicted in advertisements.

A few tested conceptual frameworks that already exist for cultural analysis are:

- Kluckhohn and Strodtbeck's (1961) five value orientations and their variations - 1) human nature (good, mix of good and evil, neutral and evil), 2) man-nature orientation (subjugation, harmony and mastery), 3) time orientation (past, present and future), 4) activity orientation (being, being-in-becoming and doing), and 5) relational orientation (lineality, collaterality and individualism) (pg. 12)
- Trompenaars' (1994) seven categories of work-related values derived from Parson's five relational orientations and an application of Kluckhohn and Strodtbeck's value orientations to countries – 1) Universalism vs. particularism, 2) achievement vs. ascription, 3) individualism vs. collectivism, 4) emotional vs. neutral, 5) specific vs. diffuse, 6) time orientation and 7) orientation to nature (pp. 10-11)

- Edward Hall's (1981) patterns of culture in accordance with 1) context, 2) space, 3) time and 4) meaning
- Hofstede's (1991) five cultural dimensions – 1) Power distance, 2) Individualism-Collectivism, 3) Masculinity-Femininity, 4) Uncertainty avoidance and 5) Long-term orientation (Confucian Dynamism)
- Schwartz's seven motivational domains – 1) Conservatism, 2) Intellectual autonomy, 3) Affective autonomy, 4) Hierarchy, 5) Mastery, 6) Egalitarian commitment and 7) Harmony (cited in: Watson, Lysonski, Gillan and Raymore, 2002)

Also, a new framework for cultural analysis still in the validation stage has been developed by Singh (2004) and it proposes 3 broad-based levels of cultural dimensions – 1) Perceptual, 2) Behavioral and 3) Symbolic.

Out of all the afore-discussed frameworks, Hofstede's model of cultural dimensions was the first empirically and conceptually developed framework for cultural analysis (Watson, Lysonski, Gillan and Raymore, 2002). Only the Hofstede and Shwartz models provide scores for a range of countries to enable the analysis of consumption data (de Mooij, 2004). Historically, Hofstede's cultural dimensions have been extensively used in international marketing research (Albers-Miller & Gelb, 1996; Raghu, Abel & Salvador, 1999; Milner & Collins, 2000; Singh & Baack, 2004). Simon Holt, a well-known global advertising consultant is quoted in de Mooij (2004) to have said that Hofstede's dimensions are:

“...absolutely made for mass marketing, an area where individual personality is of very secondary importance, and what you really want is reliable, true, but gross generalizations. You need to know what most people in a country are like and how most of them will behave in response to certain stimuli.” (p. 30)

According to Singh and Baack (2004), Hofstede's dimensions are the most appropriate framework for international advertising research because:

- They have been replicated and validated in several studies of cultural theory and cross-cultural analysis.

- Sondergaard established in 1994 through in-depth analysis of various studies that Hofstede's dimensions were stable across populations and time.
- Clark suggested in 1990 that a few dimensions overlap in most cultural typologies and Hofstede's dimensions cover most of the commonly used dimensions of cultural analysis.

In addition, research done by Milner and Collins (2000) also supports the idea that Hofstede's cultural framework is practical enough to be used in the analysis and selection of country specific advertising appeals.

Based on the above reasons, Hofstede's cultural dimensions provide an appropriate framework to apply in this study.

### **Pakistan's Rankings on Hofstede's Dimensions**

Hofstede (1994) defines the five dimensions as follows:

#### **Power Distance**

It is the extent to which the less powerful members of a society accept the inherent inequalities in their society. It can range from low to high. Some typical indicators of this dimension are the degree of importance attached to social status and the degree of respect for elders, figures of authority, etc (Hofstede, 1994).

Pakistan ranks relatively high on power distance according to Hofstede Power Distance Index (ITIM International, 2003) implying that surrendering to authority is common in the country and a wide inequality exists between social classes.

#### **Masculinity**

It is the opposite of femininity and represents a society in which social and gender roles are clearly distinct. Men are generally assertive, tough, and aspire to material success; women on the other hand are modest, tender and concerned about the quality of life (Hofstede, 1994). Also, there is high importance attached to achievements,

competition and heroism (Swaidan and Hayes, 2005). In a feminine society on the other hand, both men AND women are supposed to be modest, tender and concerned with the quality of life. Gender equality is common and individuals are people-oriented, less aggressive and more nurturing (Hofstede, 1994).

Pakistan ranks about equal on masculinity and femininity dimensions (ITIM International, 2003) implying that the quality and quantity of life both are equally coveted in Pakistani culture. So, on the one hand, values like competition, assertiveness and desire for more are important in Pakistani culture, while on the other hand, values like caring for others, hospitality and aesthetic values are also characteristic of the national culture. Also, there is higher representation of females in politics.

### **Individualism**

It is the opposite of collectivism and represents a society in which there are weaker bonds between individuals, everyone is expected to look after oneself and his/her own immediate family only (Hofstede, 1994). There is a strong emphasis on 'I' rather than 'Us' and these societies tend to have a weaker social framework. Moreover, individualistic society members attach higher value to personal independence and personal goals and also have a high need for personal achievement (Swaidan and Hayes, 2005). On the other hand, collectivism is represented in a society wherein people are integrated into strong cohesive in-groups right from birth and are unquestionably loyal to these in-groups in return for a lifetime of belonging and protection (Hofstede, 1994).

Pakistan ranks very low on individualism (ITIM International, 2003) implying that it is fundamentally a collectivist culture and people are well meshed into organized groups and so everything is seen in the context of 'us' not 'I'. This endangers people's

personal lives and individual goals and aspirations because normative forces govern individual lives to a high degree.

### **Uncertainty Avoidance**

It goes from low to high and is defined as the extent to which the members of a particular culture feel endangered by uncertain or unknown situations (Hofstede, 1994). It is also indicated by the degree to which people are uncomfortable with innovation, change or novel situations as well as their willingness to adopt strict codes of conduct (Swaidan and Hayes, 2005). High uncertainty avoidance, for instance, is indicated by the practice of unquestioning 'blind' faith and belief in absolute truths, the intolerance of deviant ideas and behaviors, the reluctance to take risks and bigotry or unwillingness to accommodate others beliefs or religions.

Pakistan ranks very high on uncertainty avoidance (ITIM International, 2003) implying that they like to stick to the tried and tested, are ethnically more homogenous, value traditions over innovations and are more religiously rigid.

### **Long-term Orientation**

It is the opposite of short-term orientation and is indicated by the fostering of virtues oriented towards more future rewards (Hofstede, 1994). Long-term oriented societies have a more forward-looking approach to things, are defined by the values of thrift, hard work, respect for relationships and perseverance and have a more motivated and progressive mentality. This is opposed to short-term orientation which is characterized by a rather static mentality, high importance attached to 'face-value', tradition, social obligations, dwelling in the past and present with less concern about the future (Swaidan and Hayes, 2005). Together, the two poles form a dimension of national cultures called Confucian Dynamism.

Pakistan ranks lowest in the world on long term orientation (ITIM International, 2003) implying that they are not forward-looking and have a short-term outlook towards life. However, in a study on Confucian dynamism, it was found that Pakistan is an outlier when it comes to its ranking in the Confucian dynamism dimension. Unlike other similar countries like Bangladesh who rank relatively higher on this index, Pakistan scores a zero which is an anomaly and the reason is uncertain (Yeh & Lawrence, 1995). Therefore since a valid comparison cannot be drawn on this dimension between Pakistani culture and culture portrayed in Pakistani advertisements this study will only focus on the other four dimensions.

### **Cultural Studies in Advertising**

A wealth of research data is available to validate the inseparable association of culture and advertising content across the globe. Country-specific advertisement appeals are generally kneaded with varying degrees of national cultural values, symbols, norms and characteristics (Mueller, 1987).

According to quite a few empirical studies, it has been shown that advertisements are relatively more persuasive if they reflect some degree of local culture-specific values than those that are more standardized (Gregory & Munch, 1997). To motivate someone, a message should relate to the person's goals, wants and needs – an advertising appeal is what fulfills that need (Mueller, 1987).

According to Pollay, advertising does not employ and echo all cultural values (1986, April). He coined the metaphor 'the distorted mirror' for advertising, saying that in commercials, some values are reinforced far more frequently than the others. So advertising reflects cultural values but it does this on a rather selective basis such that

those values serve the advertiser's interests and most readily relate to the products being advertised (Pollay, 1986, April).

In advertising research, culture-portrayal in advertisements has generally been measured as a function of cultural values (e.g., Olayan & Karande, 2000; Cho, Up, Gentry, Jun & Kropp, 1999; Zhang & Gelb, 1996). Olayan and Karande (2000) carried out a content analysis of magazine advertisements from the United States and the Arab World to examine cross-cultural differences in the advertising content of these two drastically different cultural environments. The researchers examined existing views about the role of religion in forming values, the level of individualism and whether the culture is high or low context. They found that though people are less frequently depicted in Arabic ads, there is no difference in the extent to which men or women are portrayed. Women are mostly featured in ads for products that directly relate to women and are shown wearing long conservative dresses. Moreover, Arabic ads have less information content, less price information and less comparative advertising than US magazine ads (Olayan and Karande, 2000).

Cho, Up, Kwon, Gentry, Jun and Kropp (1999) conducted a quantitative content analysis of Korean and American TV commercials to examine differences in underlying cultural dimensions in both theme and execution between North American and East Asian advertisements. The cultural dimensions included individualism/collectivism, time orientation, relationship with nature and contextuality. The study suggested that although individualism and collectivism are portrayed in commercials from both countries, individualism is more dominant in U.S. commercials. U.S. commercials also tend to use more direct commercial approaches reflecting the low-context nature of American

culture. Also, Korean and U.S. commercials almost equally stress oneness with nature which reflects the increasing environmental consciousness in the US (Cho, Up, Kwon, Gentry, Jun and Kropp, 1999).

Another study conducted by Zhang and Gelb (1996) explored effects of collectivistic and individualistic advertising appeals in US and China. The findings suggest that culturally congruent appeals are more effective (China being collectivistic and US being individualistic) generally, but culturally incongruent appeals may work if the advertising appeal matches the product use condition. According to this study, advertisements for products that are used privately such as toothbrushes can utilize individualistic appeals effectively, even if such appeals are incongruent with the accepted cultural values (Zheng and Gelb, 1996). In the case of Pakistan, according to Mazhar Salam, Account Director at the advertising agency Red Communication Arts in Lahore (Pakistan), the effectiveness of advertising appeals also depends on the brand being advertised. Western advertising appeals can work for certain product brands such as Levis jeans, depending on what sort of brand image one is trying to convey through the ad (personal communication, 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2007). Also according to Boddewyn, Soehl and Picard (1986), standardization of advertising appeals across cultures is a comparatively more viable option for industrial products than for consumer products, which need to be adapted to consumers' lifestyles, values, practices and norms. Likewise, according to Douglas and Urban (1977) non-durable products such as food products, household cleaning products or other products related to household roles require greater adaptation to the target country's culture because they need to be customized in accordance with local tastes and habits. Also other products which are directed at minority segments such

as health foods or herbal perfumes may be more standardized especially if they are targeted at affluent or more sophisticated customers (Douglas and Urban, 1977).

While most cross-cultural research is based on highly contrasting cultures (e.g., Olayan & Karande, 2000; Zheng & Gelb, 1996, Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun & Kropp, 1999), a few authors have also studied cross-cultural differences between similar cultures (e.g., Javalgi, Cutler & White, 1994; Tse, Belk and Zhou, 1989). Javalgi, Cutler and White (1994) dealt with the issue of standardization of print advertising across three culturally similar countries of the Pacific Basin which included Japan, Taiwan and South Korea. The study suggested that regionalization of advertising content based on geographic proximity or shared heritage may be counter-productive. This is especially true in terms of the visual devices and communication appeals in the print advertisements. Also international advertisers should concentrate on building a high status image and use quality appeals to advertise their products in these countries. This is truer in the case of Japan as it is a rapidly progressing nation with an increasingly affluent consumer market that is concerned more with quality rather than price (Javalgi, Cutler & White, 1994).

Tse, Belk and Zhou (1989) compared the different consumption appeals used in ads from Taiwan, Hong Kong and the PRC (China), three countries with similar language and a shared cultural heritage. They found that the cultural values depicted in the ads from these three regions were distinct from each other, due to differences in the societies' attitudes towards consumerism which have been shaped by the differences in political and economic influences in the three countries (Tse, Belk and Zhou, 1989).

While many studies have analyzed the differences in cultural values portrayed in advertisements from a cross-national perspective, there has been little research on finding the variations in cultural values within a country. One such study was conducted by Cheng (1994) to find out the dominant cultural values manifest in Chinese magazine advertisements from 1982 and 1992, and to also point out the changes in cultural values over a 10 year time period. The study found that ‘modernity’, ‘technology’ and ‘quality’ were the predominant cultural values manifest in Chinese advertisements over this time period. The study also found that while the occurrence of values that were symbolic in nature or suggestive of human emotions increased with time, utilitarian values or those centering on product quality decreased with time (Cheng, 1994). Another study (Cheng, 1998) which content analyzed Chinese television commercials from 1990 and 1995 sought the same purpose and also examined the similarities and differences across the two media. The researcher chose this time period because it also allowed an analysis of the effects of some new advertising laws implemented in 1995 and how they affected the cultural values portrayed in Chinese advertisements. The researcher found that ‘modernity’ was still the dominant cultural value that remained stable throughout the time period, while the value of ‘quality’ lost its importance over this period. Moreover, according to this research, the value of ‘tradition’ was more frequently seen in advertisements for food and drink categories (Cheng, 1998), thus emphasizing the fact that product category does moderate the extent to which cultural values have to be adhered to in creating advertisements.

Gregory and Munch (1997) studied the effects of variations in cultural norms and familial roles depicted in advertisements in the highly collectivist Mexican culture. They

found that generally advertising appeals that were consistent with the local cultural norms and societal roles generated greater favorability and higher purchase intentions. More interestingly, they also found that depicting advertising appeals consistent with the typical roles of Mexican society (e.g. showing man as bread earner) had a greater persuasive impact for high-involvement decision making products (e.g. automobiles). Depicting appeals consistent with familial norms (e.g. eating together) had a greater persuasive impact for low-involvement decision making products (such as gelatin dessert). Moreover, the study showed that for products wherein the mother facilitates the preparation process, depicting both role and familial norms increase the effectiveness of the advertisements (Gregory and Munch, 1997).

Han and Shavitt's (1994) study of advertising appeals in individualistic and collectivist societies showed that advertising appeals emphasizing individualistic benefits and preferences were not only more prevalent in US magazine advertising, they were also more persuasive than collectivist appeals in the US. In contrast, advertising appeals emphasizing in-group benefits, harmony and integrity, were not only more prevalent in Korean magazine ads, they also were more persuasive than individualistic appeals in Korea (Han and Shavitt, 1994). The study's findings suggested that goals associated with the use of a product also play a role in determining the effectiveness of culturally congruent or incongruent advertising appeals. According to the authors, products which are shared in use (e.g. soft drinks, groceries, coffee, tea) can employ both collectivist and individualistic appeals depending on the value assigned to individual versus collective benefits in the target culture. However, for personal use products (such as fashion

apparel, cosmetic, wine) which offer individual benefits only, collectivist appeals might not work in even collectivist cultures (Han and Shavitt, 1994).

### **The Stewart and Furse Framework**

As discussed, Pakistani advertising is a completely untouched subject in international literature. Therefore, in addition to exploring cultural elements, this research seeks to also measure the typical characteristics, in terms of executional elements, formats and devices in Pakistani advertisements.

The coding categories for analyzing the executional characteristics of commercials were derived from Stewart and Furse's (1986) study of the effects of advertising executional factors on advertising performance. The study involved the content analysis of 1,059 television commercials on 155 unique executional variables identified based on past research and preliminary testing. This was followed by copytesting of each commercial with hundreds of consumers to identify the executional elements of effective advertisements (Stewart and Furse, 1986). For this research however, only the executional variables were employed.

Quite a few past studies have used the Stewart and Furse (1986) coding framework to analyze the content of television commercials (e.g. Dixit, 2005; Hsu, 2005; Senkova, 2005). Most of them have involved the content-analysis of award-winning television commercials from and across different countries. Dixit (2005) employed the Stewart and Furse (1986) coding framework to examine award-winning print and television commercials from India, Pakistan's closest neighbor in terms of geographical proximity as well as cultural similarities. The research found that the use of music and humorous commercial tone was prevalent in a majority of award-winning Indian television commercials. Also, the dominant commercial format was to show the product in use or

by analogy. Print advertisements on the other hand used more surrealistic visuals, visual memory devices, visual taglines as well as a more relaxed, laid-back and fun commercial tone. The only similarity the research highlighted was that both print and television advertisements were dominantly set outdoors, usually in the marketplace (Dixit, 2005).

Hsu (2005) conducted a content analysis of award-winning TV commercials from the 20<sup>th</sup> to 25<sup>th</sup> Times Advertising Awards in Taiwan using Stewart and Furse's (1986) coding framework. The research identified the dominant executional elements in Taiwanese award winning commercials and compared the results to the Stewart and Furse (1986) study to find out whether the Taiwanese sample contained the executional elements considered 'effective'. Some conflicts were identified between the two studies suggesting that award-winning 'creative' advertisements might not be the most 'effective' (Hsu, 2005).

Senkova (2005) analyzed 170 Russian TV advertisements from the Moscow International Advertising Festival to discover specific advertising strategy elements and advertising appeals in Russian award-winning advertising. According to the study, typical Russian award-winning commercials were humorous in tone, employed an affective transformational creative strategy, with attributes/ingredients, product performance and enjoyment being used as the dominant promise or appeal. Also award-winning and non-award-winning advertisements were different mostly in the use of humor, unique selling proposition strategy and visual devices.

Gagnard and Morris (1988) analyzed Clio award-winning commercials from 1975, 1980 and 1985 to identify trends over a ten year time period and then compared the results with earlier effectiveness studies. The researchers found that Clio award-winners

do not hold the same characteristics that have been identified in effective TV commercials. This implies that award-winning television commercials may not necessarily perform well in the actual market.

Kover, James and Sonner (1997) conducted a study comprising both Effie award winning and non-award-winning TV commercials and recorded responses of creative professionals and general viewers towards those commercials. The results showed that creatives showed greater positive responses to award-winning commercials while the general viewers favored commercials that elicited feelings of personal enhancement, regardless of being award-winning or not. This suggests that creatives show greater positive attitudes towards commercials that meet professional criteria rather than consumer-effective criteria. Therefore, award-winning advertisements may not always reflect consumers' preferences.

In the case of Pakistan, electronic media awards are a relatively new phenomenon and a large enough pool of award-winning advertisements does not exist to allow for a sizeable sample. For the purpose of this study therefore, a general sample of actual recorded advertisements from different television channels has been used for analysis. Whether they are award-winning or not is not known. However, they represent acceptable Pakistani advertising and a study of their executional characteristics is a first step towards gaining an understanding of Pakistani advertising in general.

### **Research Questions and Hypotheses**

The goal of the current study is to explore the creative executional characteristics and dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani television advertising and examine their occurrences with respect to terrestrial / satellite television channels and product

categories. Based on previous research and the literature reviewed, the following research questions are proposed:

### **Executorial Characteristics**

#### **Visual devices**

**Research question (1a).** What are the characteristics of visual devices used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (1b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of visual devices with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (1c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of visual devices with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

#### **Auditory devices**

**Research question (2a).** What are the characteristics of auditory devices used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (2b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of auditory devices with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (2c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of auditory devices with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

#### **Music and Dancing**

**Research question (3a).** What are the characteristics of music and dancing used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (3b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of music and dancing with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (3c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of music and dancing with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial appeals or selling propositions**

**Research question (4a).** What are the dominant commercial appeals used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (4b).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial appeals with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (4c).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial appeals with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial approach**

**Research question (5a).** What is the dominant commercial approach used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (5b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial approach with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (5c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial approach with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial format**

**Research question (6a).** What are the dominant commercial formats used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (6b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial formats with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (6c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial formats with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Typology of broadcast messages**

**Research question (7a).** What is the dominant typology of broadcast messages used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (7b).** What are the significant differences in broadcast typology with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (7c).** What are the significant differences in broadcast typology with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial setting**

**Research question (8a).** What are the dominant commercial settings used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (8b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial settings with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (8c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial settings with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial tone and atmosphere**

**Research question (9a).** What are the dominant commercial tones used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (9b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial tones with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (9c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial tones with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial Structure**

**Research question (10a).** What are the dominant commercial structures used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (10b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial structures with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (10c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial structures with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Commercial characters**

**Research question (11a).** What are the commercial characters dominantly used in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (11b).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial characters with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (11c).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial characters with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Cultural Values**

**Research question (12a).** What are the dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani television commercials?

**Research question (12b).** What are the significant differences in dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani TV commercials on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (12c).** What are the significant differences in dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani TV commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

### **Other Exploratory Cultural Variables**

**Research question (13a).** What are the characteristics of women's clothing portrayed in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (13b).** What are the significant differences in women's clothing portrayed in the commercials with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

**Research question (13c).** What are the significant differences in women's clothing portrayed in the commercials with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

**Research question (14a).** How often are religious references made in television commercials in Pakistan?

**Research question (14b).** Is there a significant relationship between the presence or absence of religious references and the channel the commercial is aired on?

**Research question (14c).** Is there a significant relationship between the presence or absence of religious references and the channel the commercial is aired on?

### **Hypotheses**

Also, although this is an exploratory study, a few hypotheses can be proposed. According to Han and Shavitt (1994), the presence or absence of culturally congruent advertising appeals is also determined by the goals that the target market associates with the use of a product. Also, according to Olayan and Karande (2000), in Arab commercials, women are generally shown for products that directly relate to women and are depicted wearing the traditional Arab dress. Therefore, in Pakistan, being a Muslim country, commercials for food items which are generally targeted at housewives may contain more traditionalistic women. Therefore, for commercials which contain female characters the following hypothesis will be tested:

**Hypothesis 1.** Commercials for edible items will contain more women in traditional clothing than in Western clothing.

Language is a reflection of a country's culture (de Mooij, 2005) and therefore is part of its identity. Hence it can be assumed that products with a domestic brand origin are more likely to use Urdu only as the dominant language of text in commercials while products with a Western brand origin are more likely to employ English only as the dominant language of text. This allows for the following hypotheses:

**Hypothesis 2.** Urdu only will be used as the dominant language of printed text on screen in commercials for products with a domestic brand origin.

**Hypothesis 3:** English only will be used as the dominant language of printed text on screen in commercials for products with an international brand origin.

### CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY

To explore the proposed research questions, the method of quantitative content analysis is employed. Quantitative content analysis has been explained as the method of studying an area of subjective nature by classifying the qualitative information such that it can be manipulated quantitatively (Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp, 1999).

Krippendorff (1980) defines it as “a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from data to their context” (pg. 21). According to Holsti (1969), a content analysis is any procedure that is used to draw inferences by coding specified characteristics of messages objectively and systematically (pg. 14).

Content analysis can be used to describe content and to test hypothesis derived from theory. It is considered an unobtrusive and non-reactive measurement method that also makes it possible to conduct longitudinal studies as well as reduce large amounts of data to numbers whilst retaining meaningful differences in the data. (Riffe, Lacy, & Fico, 2005). According to Holsti (1969), content analysis is most useful under 3 circumstances: when it is difficult to access data and the researcher only holds documentary evidence; when the subject’s own language plays a significant role in the study; and lastly, when the amount of material to be examined is too large to allow the researcher to single-handedly analyze it (pp. 15-17).

It has been widely used to study content in a variety of fields including marketing, media studies, literature, ethnography, cultural studies, gender studies, sociology, psychology, etc. (Busch, et al., 2005). It is the most widely used method for cross-cultural research and other exploratory studies about advertising content in general (e.g. Moon & Chan, 2005; Kalliny & Gentry, 2007; Javalgi et al, 1994; Senkova, 2005).

The purpose of the current study is to discover the executional characteristics and the patterns of dominant cultural values in Pakistani TV commercials. By comparing and analyzing the advertisements' content and relating the results to previous literature about Pakistani culture, the goal is to determine how the culture portrayed in Pakistani TV commercials relates to the culture of Pakistan per se. Content analysis is the most appropriate method to quantitatively measure the various research dimensions and to analyze them systematically and objectively.

### **Unit of Analysis**

For this study, the unit of analysis was the individual television commercial aired on one of the three Pakistani TV channels including PTV, Geo TV and ARY Digital from the year 2002 to 2007.

### **Sampling Design**

The population comprised all Pakistani TV commercials collected in DVD format from the respective media banks of two advertising agencies, namely Synergy Advertising and Orient McCann-Erickson. Due to the high cost of obtaining media monitoring tapes from independent media agencies, the TV commercials for this study were derived from the general media records/collection (also called media banks) of the mentioned advertising agencies. Synergy Advertising is a young local advertising agency established in 1999 and affiliated with i-Com, the world's largest network of independent advertising agencies. Orient McCann-Erickson is one of the first advertising agencies in Pakistan established locally in 1953 and later affiliated with McCann-Erickson Worldwide in 1993. The commercials from Synergy Advertising represented 17 product categories and 15 television channels, while those from Orient McCann-Erickson represented nine product categories and 13 television channels.

The commercials were arranged year-wise and product category-wise on the DVDs. First, non-probability purposive or relevance sampling was used to separate all television commercials (n=534) aired between the years 2002 to 2007. This time frame was chosen for a couple of reasons. Firstly, Pakistan has not undergone any change of government or major political turmoil since 2002, i.e. when General Pervez Musharraf declared himself President of Pakistan. The catalyst of social change has remained the pursuit of 'moderate enlightenment' since 2000. Secondly, the government's media liberalization policies officially took effect from 2002, the same year when GEO Network, the most popular satellite television network, was launched. Lastly, culture generally remains stable over a long period of time and therefore portrayal of culture is assumed to stay relatively consistent over a period of five years. Next, because this study aims to analyze the cultural variations in the commercials aired on terrestrial and satellite TV channels in Pakistan, TV commercials aired on PTV – terrestrial channel (=108 commercials), Geo TV – satellite channel (=99 commercials) and ARY Digital – satellite channel (=94 commercials) were separated for analysis. This was done by viewing each TV commercial and identifying the TV channel through the channel logo on the recorded commercial. These comprised a total of 301 TV commercials. Commercials aired on other channels were excluded due to a very small representation in the sample population. Commercials aired on Geo TV and ARY Digital were extracted for analyzing satellite channel ads. These two companies differ in their corporate background with GEO being owned by 'Jang' the largest Pakistani news media group, and ARY Network owned by the Dubai-based ARY Group of Companies. Geo was established and started transmission in 2002 for the Pakistan market. It gained popularity among Pakistanis

worldwide for its round-the-clock news coverage and challenging the political status quo. ARY started off its services in UK in 2000 to cater to Pakistanis living in Europe. In 2001 ARY also began its transmission in Pakistan and other parts of Asia, gaining popularity as an infotainment channel (Television Mania, 2005, June). By analyzing commercials from these two satellite channels, any differences between satellite channels itself can be highlighted.

Lastly, purposive or relevance sampling again was used to further reduce the sample to represent commercials across three product categories including carbonated beverages (n=90 commercials), non-carbonated beverages (n=48 commercials) and edible products (n=91 commercials). The sample consisted of a total of 229 television commercials at the start of the coding process. The other product categories were removed due to a comparatively much smaller representation in the sample to allow statistically significant findings for the respective product categories. Previous research on the effects of product category and product usage on cultural appeals in advertising suggests that non-durable, consumer products with shared usage will contain more culture-specific advertising appeals than otherwise. According to Han & Shavitt (1994), soft drinks, tea, milk, coffee, groceries (edible items), baby food, etc. are all shared in nature and therefore commercials for these products will be more culturally adapted on the collectivism/individualism dimension. However, according to Pollay (1986, April), cultural values or characteristics of the commercials may differ based on the advertiser's interests and how they most readily relate to the products being advertised. The target market for carbonated beverages for example is mostly the youth whereas for edible

items it is mostly housewives. Therefore, differences in the target market for the product category may influence the cultural and executional characteristics of the commercials.

During the coding process, duplicate advertisements aired on the same TV channel were eliminated, while those appearing on different TV channels were not excluded from the study. This led to a final sample of 214 commercials. The rationale was because the entire purpose of the study is to analyze culture as portrayed in the advertisements on the three channels. Thus similar commercials on different TV channels are separate entities and every commercial broadcast on them constitutes a distinct and measurable sampling unit.

### **Coding Categories and Variables**

In developing a systematic framework for a content analysis, factors such as exclusiveness, exhaustiveness and parsimony of coding schemes and categories have to be kept in mind (Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp, 1999). In using a multi-layered framework such as Hofstede's 5 cultural dimensions, some coding categories for some of the dimensions may run into a conceptual overlap due to their strong role in shaping those dimensions. However, the cumulative measures of the Hofstede's dimensions will be used for the results of this study. Thus, the overlapping of categories between different dimensions should not skew the results.

According to Pollay (1983), culture also plays a role in determining which categories will appear most often in advertising appeals and which ones, though applicable in other cultures, might be redundant in the one under study. Also, the frequency with which different advertising appeals occur in advertisements should also be used to select the best coding categories for a coding scheme.

The commercials were coded for executional characteristics as well as cultural values. The coding scheme for the executional characteristics was based on the Stewart and Furse (1986) coding framework. The coding categories for this study were derived from Steve Marshall's (2006) doctoral dissertation that employed part of the Stewart and Furse coding framework to examine advertising message strategies and executional devices in US television commercials from award-winning campaigns from 1999 to 2004. Also, the cultural values for this study were derived from past studies by Cheng (1997), Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp (1999), Moon & Chan (2005), Albers-Miller & Gelb (1996), and Hofstede, Pederson and Hofstede J. (2002). In addition, a few country-specific exploratory cultural variables were also added to facilitate a broader analysis of Pakistani television commercials. The coding instrument can be found in Appendix A.

### **Pretest and Coding Procedure**

The content analysis was performed by two coders – the researcher (fluent in Urdu and English – female – native but raised in the Middle East) served as primary coder. Another native individual, fluent in Urdu and English, born and raised in Pakistan (25-30 age-group male) served as secondary coder. This not only helped eliminate gender bias in the study, but the presence of the secondary coder also ensured that the primary researcher's foreign upbringing does not impair results.

A codebook containing the precise operational definitions of all the categories and dimensions was developed as a reference tool to enable both coders to code the advertisements based on similar criteria (See Appendix B). The primary coder trained the secondary coder to use the codebook by explaining each category thoroughly and removing any ambiguities in regard to the exact meaning of every category.

Next, the coders practiced using the coding sheets by coding non-sample advertisements and compared results with each other to clarify doubts that arose due to judgment and interpretation differences due to the subjective nature of a number of coding categories.

Lastly, the pretest was carried out with the coders to streamline the coding categories, remove redundancies and determine inter-coder reliability. The pretest contained 10% of the sample (roughly 25 advertisements) and these were given to the coders to code and then compare their results with each other.

### **Inter-coder Reliability**

Inter-coder reliability refers to whether the coders are coding the advertisements the same way (are they assigning the same codes to similar stimuli). The most popular method of determining inter-coder reliability is Holsti's (1969) formula:

Reliability =  $2M/(N_1 + N_2)$  where  $N_1$  and  $N_2$  are the total number of coding decisions made by coder 1 and coder 2 respectively and  $M$  is the total number of agreements between the 2 coders. Table 1 exhibits the reliability results for each of the coded categories. Acceptable reliability was established at > 80% before the actual study was conducted (Kassarjian, 1977).

Table 1. Holsti's (1969) Inter-Coder Reliability

Category	Holsti's
Scenic Beauty	1.00
Beautiful Characters	0.86
Ugly Characters	1.0
Graphics and Computer-generated Visuals	0.95
Surrealistic Visuals	1.0
Substantive Supers	1.0
Visual Tagline	1.0
Visual Memory Device	1.0
Language of Visual Text in Commercial	0.95
Rhymes, Slogans or Mnemonic Devices	1.0

Table 1. Continued

Category	Holsti's
Unusual Sound Effects	0.95
Spoken Tagline	1.0
Music in Commercial	1.0
Music as a Major Element	0.95
Music Style	1.0
Music Creates a Mood (vs. Background Only)	0.86
Music is a Brand Jingle	0.95
Dancing in Commercial	1.0
Dominant Commercial Appeal/Selling Proposition	0.81
Rational or More Emotional Appeal	0.86
Brand Differentiating Message	1.0
Dominant Commercial Format	0.81
Typology of Broadcast Messages	0.76
Dominant Commercial Setting	1.0
Where is the Commercial Setting?	0.95
Dominant Commercial Tone	0.86
Dominant Commercial Structure	0.86
Principal Character(s) Male	0.90
Principal Character(s) Female	0.95
Principal Character(s) Child/Infant	1.0
Principal Character(s) Celebrity	1.0
Principal Character(s) Actor Playing Role of Ordinary Person	1.0
Principal Character(s) Real People	1.0
Principal Character(s) Creation	1.0
Principal Character(s) Animal	1.0
Principal Character(s) Animated	1.0
No Principal Character(s)	1.0
Characters Identified with Company	1.0
Background Cast	0.95
Celebrity in Minor Role	1.0
Animal in Minor Role	1.0
Created Character or Cartoon Character in Minor Role	1.0
Real Person in Minor Role	1.0
Recognized Continuing Character	0.90
Presenter/Spokesperson on Camera	1.0
Direct Comparison with Other Products	1.0
Indirect Comparison with Other Products	1.0
Puffery or Unsubstantiated Claims	1.0
Collective Integrity	0.86
Interdependence	0.86
Collective Benefits	0.86
Collectivism	0.90
Patriotism	1.0

Table 1. Continued

Category	Holsti's
Popularity	1.0
Succorance	0.86
Independence	0.86
Distinctiveness	0.81
Self-sufficiency	0.81
Self-gain	0.90
Individual Benefits	0.81
Beauty	1.0
Health	0.95
Individualism	0.86
Uniqueness	0.95
Respect for the Elderly	0.86
Social Status	0.86
Formality	0.81
Humility	0.90
Economy	0.90
Power Aversion	1.0
Power Equality	1.0
Casualness	0.81
Convenience	0.76
Competition	0.95
Effectiveness	0.90
Wealth	1.0
Work	1.0
Courtesy	0.86
Family	0.81
Nurturance	0.81
Natural	0.95
Modesty	0.86
Enjoyment	0.76
Safety	0.76
Technology	1.0
Tradition	1.0
Tamed	0.86
Adventure	0.90
Magic	0.81
Youth	0.86
Sex	0.90
Religious Reference/Symbolism	1.0
Ad Origin	1.0
Women in Western Clothing	1.0
Overall Reliability	0.93

## **Data Analysis**

After completing the coding procedures, the data was entered in to SPSS (Statistical Package for the Social Science) and statistical analysis was conducted on it. Frequency tables were drawn to analyze the occurrence of variables across television networks and also across product categories/sub-categories. Also chi-square tests were run to determine statistically significant relationships between the variables to answer the research questions and hypotheses.

## CHAPTER 4 FINDINGS

The basic purpose of this study was to explore the executional characteristics and cultural values portrayed in Pakistani TV advertisements. This chapter reports the basic descriptive statistics for the sample containing TV advertisements from the three Pakistani television stations PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV across the product categories of carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items. It also includes statistical chi-square tests of the research questions and hypotheses proposed in light of existing literature.

Some variables including ‘brand origin’, ‘specific international brand origin’, length of ad’, ‘specific product types’, ‘music style’, ‘dominant commercial setting’ and ‘dominant commercial structure’ were recoded by combining categories in order to ensure that the minimum cell size was large enough for tests of statistical significance. Also in all other cases, only variables and categories that met the minimum sample size criteria of 5% (eleven commercials) were considered for further analysis.

### **Description of the Sample of Commercials**

Out of the 214 commercials coded, there was an almost equal representation of commercials from the two sources the sample was drawn from, with 106 commercials from Synergy Advertising and 108 from Orient McCann-Erickson (Table 2).

Table 2. Distribution of Sample by Source of Commercial

Source of Commercial	Frequency	Percent
Orient McCann-Erickson	108	50.5%
Synergy Advertising	106	49.5%
Total	214	100%

In the sample, 115 commercials were for domestic brands while 98 were for Western brands of products (Table 3). One commercial however had an East-Asian brand origin (Red Bull).

Table 3. Sample Distribution by Brand Origin

Brand Origin	Frequency	Percent
Domestic	115	53.7%
Western	98	45.8%
East-Asian	1	0.5%
Total	214	100%

In terms of the length of the commercial, the majority of the commercials (61.2%) were 30 seconds or less in length while 38.8% were longer than 30 seconds (Table 4).

Table 4. Sample Distribution by Length of Commercial

Length of Commercial	Frequency	Percent
≤ 30 Seconds	131	61.2%
> 30 Seconds	83	38.8%
Total	214	100%

In terms of the channel the commercials were aired on, PTV had a higher representation of commercials with 80 commercials (37.4%) from PTV, 69 from Geo TV (32.2%) and 65 from ARY Digital (30.4%) and (Table 5).

Table 5. Sample Distribution by Channel of the Commercial

Channel	Frequency	Percent
PTV	80	37.4%
Geo TV	69	32.2%
ARY Digital	65	30.4%
Total	214	100%

There were three product categories analyzed in this study (Table 6). Carbonated beverages and edible items had almost similar representations with 82 commercials (38.3%) for carbonated beverages and 86 for edible items (40.2%). However, non-

carbonated beverages represented around one-fifth of the sample with just 46 commercials (21.5%).

Table 6. Sample Distribution by Product Category

Product Category	Frequency	Percent
Edible Items	86	40.2%
Carbonated Beverages	82	38.3%
Non-carbonated Beverages	44	21.5%
Total	214	100%

Among edible items, around 67.6% of the products were cooking products or condiments such as edible oil (55.8%) and spices and food mixes (10.8%), while 23.4% of the edible items belonged to the snacks and confections category which is usually targeted at children (Table 7).

Table 7. Sample Distribution of Edible Items

Edible Items Type	Frequency	Percent
Edible Oil and Ghee	48	55.8%
Snacks and Confections	20	23.3%
Spices and Food Mixes	9	10.8%
Other	5	5.8%
Baby Food	4	4.7%
Total	86	100%

Table 8 shows a cross-tabulation of the sample by product category and the channels on which the commercials were aired. Statistically significant differences were discovered between product categories by channels with half of the commercials on PTV (50.0%) belonging to the carbonated beverages category while more than half of the commercials on ARY Digital (53.8%) and 44.9% of the Geo TV commercials representing the edible items category. Also, non-carbonated beverages had a higher representation on PTV (20 commercials) as compared to ARY Digital (11 commercials) or Geo TV (15 commercials).

Table 8. Product Categories by Channel

	PTV (%)	ARY Digital (%)	Geo TV (%)	Total (%)
Carbonated Beverages	40 (50.0%)	19 (29.2%)	23 (33.3%)	82 (38.3%)
Non-Carbonated Beverages	20 (25.0%)	11 (16.9%)	15 (21.7%)	46 (21.5%)
Edible Items	20 (25.0%)	35 (53.8%)	31 (44.9%)	86 (40.2%)
Total	80 (100.0%)	65 (100.0%)	69 (100.0%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (4, n=214) = 13.78, p < .05$

### Research Questions

The basic purpose of the study is was to discover the dominant executional and cultural characteristics of the sample of commercials. Also, the study sought to examine any statistically significant differences in the above-mentioned characteristics with respect to the channel the commercial was aired on and category of the advertised product.

### Executional Characteristics

The executional characteristics that were analyzed in this study include: visual devices, auditory devices, music and dancing, commercial appeals and selling propositions, commercial approach, commercial format, typology of broadcast messages, commercial setting, commercial tone and atmosphere, commercial structure, commercial characters and comparisons.

### Visual devices

**Research question (1a).** What are the characteristics of visual devices used in television commercials in Pakistan?

Table 9 illustrates the frequencies and percentages highlighting the presence of visual devices in the sample. Visual memory devices (93.5%) were used in almost all of the commercials in the sample, closely followed by graphic displays (84.6%) used in more than four-fifths of the sample.

Table 9. Distribution of Visual Devices Presence

	Frequency	Percent
Visual Memory Device	200	93.5
Graphic Displays	181	84.6
Substantive Supers	72	33.6
Surrealistic Visuals	59	27.6
Beautiful Characters	44	20.6
Visual Taglines	38	17.8
Scenic Beauty	15	7.0
Ugly Characters	7	3.3**

\*\*sample size criteria violation (N=214)

According to Table 10, English only was the most commonly used language of text in the overall sample (39.7%) followed closely by Urdu only (34.6%). Around one fourth of the commercials also used a combination of Urdu and English visual text (25.7%).

Table 10. Distribution of Language of Text in Commercial

Language of Text in Commercial	Frequency	Percent
English	85	39.7%
Urdu	74	34.6%
English and Urdu Mix	55	25.7%
Total	214	100%

**Research question (1b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of visual devices with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

None of the visual devices had a statistically significant relationship with the channel the commercial was aired on. The chi-square results are as follows: Scenic beauty ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.23, p = n.s.$ ), beautiful characters ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.92, p = n.s.$ ), ugly characters ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.15, p = n.s.$ ), graphics and computer-generated visuals ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.67, p = n.s.$ ), surrealistic visuals ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.60, p = n.s.$ ), substantive supers ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.57, p = n.s.$ ), visual taglines ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.38, p = n.s.$ ), visual memory devices ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.89, p = n.s.$ ) and language of printed text in commercial ( $X^2 (4, n = 214) = 8.97, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (1c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of visual devices with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

Out of the nine measure visual devices, substantive supers ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 11.00, p < .01$ ) (Table 11) and surrealistic visuals ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 27.25, p < .01$ ) (Table 12) portrayed statistically significant differences across product categories. Substantive supers were found more than expected in commercials for edible items with almost half (46.5%) of all edible items commercials employing substantive supers. Surrealistic visuals had a more than expected presence in carbonated beverages commercials with 47.6% of all carbonated beverages commercials employing some surreal imagery in them.

Table 11. Substantive Supers by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	19 (23.2%)	13 (28.3%)	40 (46.5%)	72 (33.6%)
Absence	63 (76.8%)	33 (71.7%)	46 (53.5%)	142 (66.4%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2(2, n = 214) = 11.00, p < .01$

Table 12. Surrealistic Visuals by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	39 (47.6%)	5 (10.9%)	15 (17.4%)	59 (27.6%)
Absence	43 (52.4%)	41 (89.1%)	71 (82.6%)	155 (72.4%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	(100%)

$X^2(2, n = 214) = 27.25, p < .01$

The chi-squares for visual devices that did not portray significant differences across product categories include scenic beauty ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.79, p = n.s.$ ), beautiful characters ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.58, p = n.s.$ ), ugly characters ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.05, p = n.s.$ ), graphics and computer-generated visuals ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.40, p = n.s.$ ), visual

taglines ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.45, p = n.s.$ ), visual memory devices ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.69, p = n.s.$ ) and language of printed or visual text in commercial ( $X^2 (4, n = 214) = 20.12, p = n.s.$ ).

Also, as shown in Table 13, there was a statistically significant association between the language of the text used and product category of the commercial. Urdu only was predominantly used in almost half of the carbonated beverage commercials (46.3%), English was the only language used in more than half (58.7%) of non-carbonated beverage commercials and a mix of English and Urdu was predominantly used in commercials for edible items (60%).

Table 13. Language of Text in Commercial by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Urdu	38 (46.3%)	13 (28.3%)	23 (26.7%)	74 (34.6%)
English	28 (34.1%)	27 (58.7%)	30 (34.9%)	85 (39.7%)
English and Urdu Mix	16 (19.5%)	6 (13.0%)	33 (38.4%)	55 (25.7%)
Total (%)	82 (100.0%)	46 (100.0%)	86 (100.0%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (4, n = 214) = 20.12, p < .01$

### Auditory devices

**Research question (2a).** What are the characteristics of auditory devices used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 14, rhymes, slogans and mnemonics were very commonly used in the sample commercials (82.7%). Sound effects were used in around one-fourth of the commercials (27.1%).

Table 14. Auditory Devices Presence

Auditory Device	Frequency	Percent
Rhymes, Slogans or Mnemonics	177	82.7%
Unusual Sound Effects	58	27.1%
Spoken Tagline	25	11.7%

**Research question (2b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of auditory devices with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

None of the auditory devices exhibited any significant relationship with channel of the commercial. The chi-squares from the cross-tabs between the auditory devices variables and ‘channel of commercial’ are as follows: Rhymes, slogans and mnemonics ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.84, p = n.s.$ ), unusual sound effects ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.62, p = n.s.$ ) and spoken tagline ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.11, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (2c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of auditory devices with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

Rhymes, slogans and mnemonics (Table 15) as well as unusual sound effects ( $X^2 (2, n=214) = 25.56, p < .01$ ) (Table 16) exhibited a statistically significant relationship with product category. An overwhelming number of edible items’ commercials (93.0%) and non-carbonated beverages’ commercials (89.1%) used some form of rhymes, slogans or mnemonics. However, carbonated beverages’ commercials employed a less than expected amount of rhymes, slogans or mnemonics in them (Table 15). The variable ‘spoken tagline’ did not exhibit any statistically significant relationships with product category ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 4.29, p = n.s.$ ).

Table 15. Rhymes, Slogans and Mnemonics by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	56 (68.3%)	41 (89.1%)	80 (93.0%)	177 (82.7%)
Absence	26 (31.7%)	5 (10.9%)	6 (7.0%)	37 (17.3%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (2, n = 214) = 19.64, p < .01$

Almost half of the carbonated beverages' commercials (46.3%) employed some kind of unusual sound effects as compared to just 10.9% in non-carbonated beverage commercials and 17.4% in edible items' commercials (Table 16).

Table 16. Unusual Sound Effects by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	38 (46.3%)	5 (10.9%)	15 (17.4%)	58 (27.1%)
Absence	44 (53.7%)	41 (89.1%)	71 (82.6%)	156 (72.9%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (2, n = 214) = 25.56, p < .01$

### Music and dancing

**Research question (3a).** What are the characteristics of music and dancing used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 17, music was present in almost all the commercials (99.1%) in the sample. More than half of the commercials in the sample used music to create a certain mood in the commercial, such as suspense, romance or happiness, rather than just use it as a background. However, dances were not very common with just 10.3% of the commercials containing dancing in them.

Table 17. Distribution of Music and Dancing Presence

	Frequency	Percent
Music in Commercial	212	99.1%
Music Creates a Mood	122	57.0%
Music is a Brand Jingle	63	29.4%
Music as Major Element	59	27.6%
Dancing in Commercial	22	10.3%

According to Table 18, Western and other non-Pakistani music styles were most commonly used in the commercials in the sample (42.9%). However, the combined usage of traditional and contemporary Pakistani music made up just over half (51.1%) of the music style employed in the commercials.

Table 18. Music Style by Product Category

	Frequency	Percent
Western and Others	91	42.9%
Traditional Pakistani	64	30.2%
Contemporary Pakistani	57	26.9%
Total	212	100%

**Research question (3b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of music and dancing with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

There were statistically significant differences found for the variable ‘dancing in the commercial’ with respect to the channel of the commercial (Table 19). Dancing was employed more often than expected in commercials aired on Geo TV (17.4%) and minimally in commercials aired on PTV (5.0%).

Table 19. Dancing in Commercial by Channel of Commercial

	PTV (%)	ARY Digital (%)	Geo TV (%)	Total (%)
Presence	4 (5.0%)	6 (9.2%)	12 (17.4%)	22 (10.3%)
Absence	76(95.0%)	59 (90.8%)	57 (82.6%)	192 (89.7%)
Total (%)	80 (100%)	65 (100%)	69 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (2, n = 214) = 6.28, p < .05$

However, there was no statistically significant association between any other variable in the ‘music and dancing’ category and channel of the commercial. The chi-squares for the other variables are as follows: Music in commercial ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.38, p = n.s.$ ), music as a major element ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.57, p = n.s.$ ), music style ( $X^2 (4, n = 212) = 4.25, p = n.s.$ ), music creates a mood ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.41, p = n.s.$ ) and music is a brand jingle ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.19, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (3c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of music and dancing with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

There was a statistically significant relationship between product category and the variables ‘music creates a mood’ ( $X^2(2, n=214) = 20.65, p < .01$ ) (Table 20) and ‘music present as a major element’ ( $X^2(2, n=214) = 8.23, p < .05$ ) (Table 21). According to Table 20, music was used to create a mood in a majority of the carbonated beverages’ (73.2%) and non-carbonated beverages commercials (60.9%) but was not used as often as expected in commercials for edible items.

Table 20. Music Creates a Mood by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	60 (73.2%)	28 (60.9%)	34 (39.5%)	122 (57.0%)
Absence	22 (26.8%)	18 (39.1%)	52 (60.5%)	92 (43.0%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2(2, n = 214) = 19.73, p < .01$

According to Table 21, music was present as a major element in around two-fifths of the commercials for non-carbonated beverages (39.1%) and a little less than one-third of the commercials for edible items (31.4%). However, carbonated beverages had less than the expected number of commercials (17.1%) with music as a major element in them.

Table 21. Music Present as a Major Element by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Presence	14 (17.1%)	18 (39.1%)	27 (31.4%)	59 (27.6%)
Absence	68 (82.9%)	28 (60.9%)	59 (68.6%)	155 (72.4%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2(2, n = 214) = 8.23, p < .05$

There was a statistically significant relationship between music style and product category with 62.5% of carbonated beverages commercials employing Western or other non-traditional styles of music while almost half of edible items commercials (47.7%) employed the traditional Pakistani music style (Table 22). However, only a few carbonated beverages’ commercials (7.5%) used traditional Pakistani music in them.

Table 22. Music Style by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Western and Others	50 (62.5%)	19 (41.3%)	22 (25.6%)	91 (42.9%)
Traditional Pakistani	6 (7.5%)	17 (37.0%)	41 (47.7%)	64 (30.2%)
Contemporary Pakistani	24 (30.0%)	10 (21.7%)	23 (26.7%)	57 (26.9%)
<b>Total</b>	<b>80 (100%)</b>	<b>46 (100%)</b>	<b>86 (100%)</b>	<b>212 (100%)</b>

$X^2 (4, n = 212) = 36.99; p < .01$

There was no statistically significant relationship however between product category and music in commercial ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.25, p = n.s.$ ), music is a brand jingle ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.65, p = n.s.$ ) and dancing in commercial ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.56, p = n.s.$ ).

### Commercial appeals or selling propositions

**Research question (4a).** What are the dominant commercial appeals used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 23, product reminder as main message' was the dominant commercial appeal (22.0%). This was followed by the 'enjoyment' appeal (18.2%) and 'product performance or benefit as main message' appeal (15.4%).

Table 23. Distribution of Commercial Appeals or Selling Propositions

	Frequency	Percent
Product Reminder as Main Message	47	22.0%
Enjoyment Appeal	39	18.2%
Product Performance or Benefits as Main Message	33	15.4%
Achievement	25	11.7%
Excitement, Sensation and Variety	21	9.8%
Attributes or Ingredients as Main Message	19	8.9%
Psychological/Subjective Benefits of Product	12	5.6%
Social Approval	8	3.7% **
Welfare Appeal	5	2.3% **
Self-Esteem or Self-Image	2	0.9% **
Sexual Appeal	2	0.9% **
Safety Appeal	1	0.5% **
Comfort Appeal	0	0.0% **

\*\*sample size criteria violation

Appeals which did not fulfill the minimum sample size criteria of 5% were removed from further analysis.

**Research question (4b).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial appeals with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

In conducting cross-tabs between commercial appeal (that met the minimum sample size criteria) and channel of the commercial, the appeal ‘psychological or subjective benefits of product as main message’ did not fulfill the minimum expected cell count criteria and was removed from analysis. However, no statistically significant relationship was found between the remaining commercial appeals and channel of the ad ( $X^2 (10, n = 184) = 16.20, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (4c).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial appeals with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

No statistically significant relationship was found between commercial appeals and product category even after removing all categories that did not meet minimum cell criteria ( $X^2 (2, n = 86) = 0.59, p = n.s.$ ).

### **Commercial approach**

**Research question (5a).** What is the dominant commercial approach used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 24, more than half of the commercials in the sample utilized a predominantly emotional commercial approach (57%) while less than one fourth utilized a more rational appeal (23.4%).

Table 24. Commercial Approach in Sample

Rational or More Emotional Appeal	Frequency	Percent
More Emotional	122	57%
More Rational	50	23.4%
Balance of Rational/ Emotional	42	19.6%
Total (%)	214	100%

Also, only 12.1% of the sample commercials employed any brand-differentiating messages in them (Table 25), while a majority of the commercials contained mostly generic claims not unique to the brand or product being advertised.

Table 25. Brand Differentiating Message in Sample

Brand Differentiating Message	Frequency	Percent
Present	26	12.1%
Absent	188	87.9%
Total (%)	214	100%

**Research question (5b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial approach with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital & Geo?

The relationships between the commercial approach variables, ‘emotional or rational appeal’ ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.16, p = n.s.$ ) and ‘brand-differentiating message’ ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.26, p = n.s.$ ) with ‘channel of commercial’ were not statistically significant

**Research question (5c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial approach with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

The relationship between commercial approach and product category was statistically significant. An emotional approach was taken more often than expected in carbonated beverages, while a rational approach was taken in edible items more often than expected (Table 26).

Table 26. Commercial Approach by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non- Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
More Emotional	62 (75.6%)	24 (52.2%)	36 (41.9%)	122 (57.0%)
More Rational	9 (11.0%)	11 (23.9%)	30 (34.9%)	50 (23.4%)
Balance of Rational/ Emotional	11 (13.4%)	11 (23.9%)	20 (23.3%)	42 (19.6%)
<b>Total (%)</b>	<b>82 (100.0%)</b>	<b>46 (100.0%)</b>	<b>86 (100%)</b>	<b>214 (100%)</b>

$X^2 (4, n = 214) = 21.52; p < .01$

Product categories also exhibited a significant association with the presence of brand-differentiating messages with a greater number of edible items' commercials (22.1%) carrying unique claims or brand-differentiating messages about the product. Carbonated beverages' commercials on the other hand had a negligible presence (3.7%) of brand-differentiating messages.

Table 27. Brand-differentiating Messages by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non- Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Present	3 (3.7%)	4 (8.7%)	19 (22.1%)	26 (12.1%)
Absent	79 (96.3%)	42 (91.3%)	67 (77.9%)	188 (87.9%)
<b>Total (%)</b>	<b>82 (100.0%)</b>	<b>46 (100.0%)</b>	<b>86 (100%)</b>	<b>214 (100%)</b>

$X^2 (2, n = 214) = 14.02; p < .01$

### Commercial format

**Research question (6a).** What are the dominant commercial formats used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 28, demonstration of product in use or by analogy was the most commonly used commercial format (19.2%) in the sample followed by continuity of action (16.8%) and announcement (15.9%). Eleven commercial formats were removed from further statistical analysis due to small sample size thus yielding seven total measured appeals.

Table 28. Dominant Commercial Format

	Frequency	Percent
Demonstration of Product in Use or by Analogy	41	19.2%
Continuity of Action	36	16.8%
Announcement	34	15.9%
Creation of Mood or Image as Dominant Element	26	12.1%
Fantasy, Exaggeration or Surrealism as Dominant Element	25	11.7%
Animation/Cartoon/Rotoscope	20	9.3%
Slice of Life	13	6.1%
Vignette	6	2.8%**
Demonstration of Results of Using Product	4	1.9%**
Comedy or Satire	3	1.4%**
Testimonial by Product User	3	1.4%**
Endorsement by Celebrity or Authority	2	0.9%**
New Wave Graphics	1	0.5%**
Photographic Stills	0	0.0%**
Problem and Solution	0	0.0%**
Commercial Written as a Serious Drama	0	0.0%**
Interview	0	0.0%**
Camera involves Audience in Situation	0	0.0%**

\*\* sample size criteria violation

**Research question (6b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial formats with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

Three of the least occurring commercial formats (fantasy, exaggeration or surrealism as dominant element, animation/cartoon/rotoscope and slice of life) failed to fulfill the minimum expected cell count criteria when measured against the ‘channel of commercial’ variable. However, no statistically significant relationship was found between commercial format and channel of ad ( $X^2(10, n = 182) = 6.32; p = n.s.$ ) after removing those three categories from analysis.

**Research question (6c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial formats with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

Three of the least occurring commercial formats (fantasy, exaggeration or surrealism as dominant element, animation/cartoon/rotoscope and slice of life) failed to fulfill the minimum expected cell count criteria when measured against the ‘product category’ variable. After removing these categories, a statistically significant relationship was found between commercial format and product category (Table 29). Continuity of action was the dominant format used in carbonated beverages’ commercials (42.9%) while demonstration of product in use or by analogy was predominantly used for edible items’ commercials (48.5%). Creation of mood or image was used more often than expected in commercials for non-carbonated beverages (27.6%).

Table 29. Commercial Format by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Demonstration of product in use or by analogy	4 (9.5%)	5 (17.2%)	32 (48.5%)	41 (29.9%)
Continuity of Action	18 (42.9%)	11 (37.9%)	7 (10.6%)	36 (26.3%)
Announcement	10 (23.8%)	5 (17.2%)	19 (28.8%)	34 (24.8%)
Creation of mood or image as dominant element	10 (23.8%)	8 (27.6%)	8 (12.1%)	26 (19.0%)
<b>Total</b>	<b>42 (100.0%)</b>	<b>29 (100.0%)</b>	<b>66 (100%)</b>	<b>137 (100%)</b>

$X^2 (6, n = 137) = 31.45; p < .01$

### Typology of broadcast messages

**Research question (7a).** What is the dominant typology of broadcast messages used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 30, the sample commercials dominantly contained transformational messages (67.3%) with a more image-based, emotional or feelings approach whereas less than one-third of the commercials (32.7%) employed informational messages in them.

Table 30. Typology of Broadcast Messages in Sample

	Frequency	Percent
Transformational	114	67.3%
Informational	70	32.7%
Total (%)	214	100%

**Research question (7b).** What are the significant differences in broadcast typology with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

There was no statistically significant relationship between the broadcast typology of the commercial and the channel of the commercial ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.27; p = n.s.$ )

**Research question (7c).** What are the significant differences in broadcast typology with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

There was a statistically significant relationship found between the typology of broadcast messages in the commercials and the product category the commercial advertised (Table 31). A greater majority of carbonated beverages' commercials were more transformational in nature (81.7%), whereas commercials for edible items exhibited equal numbers of transformational and informational messages (50.0%). However, edible items contained informational messages more often than expected, while both carbonated and non-carbonated beverages contained transformational messages more often than expected.

Table 31. Typology of Broadcast Messages by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Informational	15 (18.3%)	12 (26.1%)	43 (50.0%)	70 (32.7%)
Transformational	67 (81.7%)	34 (73.9%)	43 (50.0%)	144 (67.3%)
Total	82 (100.0%)	46 (100.0%)	86 (100.0%)	214 (100%)

$X^2(2, n = 214) = 20.34; p < .01$

## Commercial setting

**Research question (8a).** What are the dominant commercial settings used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 32, more than half of the sample commercials (54.2%) were filmed indoors in man-made structures such as houses, kitchens, train, stadium, restaurants, etc. Also, around 17.3% of the commercials were filmed on no particular setting, i.e. on graphics background or other non-descript backgrounds such as black or white screens or curtains. Also, just 7.9% of the commercials showed only outdoor settings and natural environments such as hills, riversides, mountains, etc.

Table 32. Dominant Commercial Setting

Commercial Setting	Frequency	Percent
Indoors	116	54.2%
No Setting	37	17.3%
Other	24	11.2%
Both Indoors and Outdoors	20	9.3%
Outdoors	17	7.9%
Total (%)	214	100.0%

**Research question (8b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial settings with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

There was a statistically significant relationship between commercial setting and the channel the commercial was aired on (Table 33). Although indoors was the dominant setting for more than half of the commercials on PTV (51.3%), ARY Digital (55.4%) as well as Geo TV (56.4%), a less than expected number of commercials aired on PTV used a 'no setting' environment. However, commercials on PTV also exhibited other settings like roads, streets, etc. more often than expected.

Table 33. Commercial Setting by Channel of Commercial

	PTV (%)	ARY Digital (%)	Geo TV (%)	Total (%)
Indoors	41 (51.3%)	36 (55.4%)	39 (56.4%)	116 (54.2%)
No Setting	6 (7.5%)	18 (27.7%)	13 (18.8%)	37 (17.3%)
Other	18 (22.5%)	2 (3.1%)	4 (5.8%)	24 (11.2%)
Both Indoors and Outdoors	8 (10.0%)	4 (6.2%)	8 (11.6%)	20 (9.3%)
Outdoors	7 (8.8%)	5 (7.7%)	5 (7.2%)	17 (7.9%)
Total (%)	80 (100%)	65 (100%)	69 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (8, n = 214) = 24.73, p < .01$

**Research question (8c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial settings with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

When measuring commercial setting against product category, two commercial settings (outdoors and both indoors and outdoors) did not meet minimum expected cell count criteria and were removed from analysis. After the removal of those categories, a chi-square test between commercial setting and product category provided statistically significant results (Table 34). Greater than two-thirds of edible items' commercials were in an indoors setting (70.9%), while just 1.3 % of edible items' commercials, lesser than expected, were in some other setting (such as roads, streets, etc.). However, carbonated beverages utilized other settings such as streets, highways, roads, outdoor tuck shops, etc. more often than expected (25.9%).

Table 34. Commercial Setting by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Indoors	34 (58.6%)	26 (65.0%)	56 (70.9%)	116 (65.5%)
No Setting	9 (15.5%)	6 (15.0%)	22 (27.8%)	37 (20.9%)
Other	15 (25.9%)	8 (20.0%)	1 (1.3%)	24 (13.6%)
Total (%)	58 (100%)	40 (100%)	79 (100%)	177 (100%)

$X^2 (4, n = 177) = 20.57, p < .01$

## Commercial tone and atmosphere

**Research question (9a).** What are the dominant commercial tones used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 35, around 29.4% of the entire sample exhibited a happy and fun-loving tone, 13.6% had a more hard sell tone and 12.1% used a dominantly wholesome and healthy tone. However, ten of the commercial tone categories fell below the minimum sample size criteria and were removed from further analysis.

Table 35. Commercial Tones in Sample

	Frequency	Percent
Happy/Fun-loving	63	29.4
Hard Sell	29	13.6
Wholesome/Healthy	26	12.1
Rough/Rugged	18	8.4
Warm and Caring	14	6.5
Modern/Contemporary	12	5.6
Relaxed/Comfortable	12	5.6
Cool/laid back	8	3.7**
Cute/Adorable	7	3.3**
Conservative/Traditional	5	2.3**
Humorous	5	2.3**
Glamorous	4	1.9**
Suspenseful	3	1.4**
Somber/Serious	3	1.4**
Technological/Futuristic	2	0.9**
Uneasy/Tense/Irritated	2	0.9**
Old-Fashioned/Nostalgic	1	0.5**
Total	214	100.0

\*\*sample size violaton

**Research question (9b).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of dominant commercial tones with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

After removing the categories which did not meet the minimum expected cell count criteria (warm and caring, modern/contemporary and relaxed/comfortable), no

statistically significant relationship was found between commercial tone and channel of commercial ( $X^2 (6, n = 136) = 6.90, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (9c).** What are the significant differences in the characteristics of dominant commercial tones with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

After removing categories which did not meet the minimum cell count criteria (warm and caring, modern/contemporary, relaxed/comfortable and rough/rugged), statistical significant differences could be seen in the commercial tones with respect to product categories ( $X^2 (4, n = 118) = 25.63, p < .01$ ) (Table 36). The majority of carbonated beverage commercials (85.7%) had a happy and fun-loving tone, which was more than the expected number. On the other hand, edible items had a less than expected number of commercials that employed a happy and fun-loving tone. However, edible items' commercials employed a wholesome and healthy tone as well as a hard sell tone more often than expected.

Table 36. Dominant Commercial Tone by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Happy/Fun-loving	30 (85.7%)	12 (50.0%)	21 (35.6%)	63 (53.4%)
Hard Sell	5 (14.3%)	4 (16.7%)	20 (33.9%)	29 (24.6%)
Wholesome/Healthy	0 (0.0%)	8 (33.3%)	18 (30.5%)	26 (22.0%)
Total	35 (100%)	24 (100%)	59 (100%)	118 (100%)

$X^2 (4, n = 118) = 25.63, p < .01$

### Commercial structure

**Research question (10a).** What are the dominant commercial structures used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 37, front-end impact was the dominant commercial structure employed in around two-thirds of the sample (64.5%). Three commercial structure

categories including surprise or suspense at closing, humorous closing and blind lead-in were removed from further analysis due to a violation of the minimum sample size criteria.

Table 37. Dominant Commercial Structure

	Frequency	Percent
Front-end Impact	138	64.5
Message in the Middle (Doughnut)	33	15.4
Surprise or Suspense in the Middle	30	14.0
Surprise or Suspense at Closing	7	3.3**
Humorous Closing	3	1.4**
Blind Lead In	3	1.4**
Total	214	100.0

\*\* sample size violation

**Research question (10b).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial structures with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

No statistically significant relationship was found between the variables ‘dominant commercial structure’ and ‘channel of the commercial’ ( $X^2(4, n = 201) = 2.52, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (10c).** What are the significant differences in the dominant commercial structures with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

A statistically significant association was found between dominant commercial structure and product category (Table 38). Almost three-fourth of carbonated beverages’ commercials and more than a third of non-carbonated beverages’ commercials (69.0%) used the front-end impact structure. Also, edible items exhibited a less than expected use of the front-end impact commercial structure (64.7%) but used a doughnut structure (message embedded in the middle) noticeably more often (25.9%) than the other two product categories did.

Table 38. Dominant Commercial Structure by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Front-end Impact	54 (73.0%)	29 (69.0%)	55 (64.7%)	138 (68.7%)
Surprise or Suspense in the Middle	16 (21.6%)	6 (14.3%)	8 (9.4%)	30 (14.9%)
Message in the Middle (Doughnut)	4 (5.4%)	7 (16.7%)	22 (25.9%)	33 (16.4%)
Total	74 (100%)	42 (100%)	85 (100%)	201 (100%)

$X^2(4, n = 201) = 14.47, p < .01$

### Commercial characters

**Research question (11a).** What are the commercial characters dominantly used in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 39, the most commonly used principal commercial characters were actors playing roles of ordinary people (72.9%). The principal characters were females in 57.0% of the commercials and males in 54.7% of the commercials

Table 39. Commercial Characters Presence in Sample

	Frequency	Percent
Principal Character Actor Playing Role of Ordinary Person	156	72.9
Principal Character Female	122	57.0
Principal Character Male	117	54.7
Background Cast	90	42.1
Principal Character Child	41	19.2
No Principal Character	31	14.5
Recognized Continuing Character	25	11.7
Principal Character Celebrity	24	11.2
Principal Character Creation	17	7.9
Principal Character Animated	17	7.9
Character identified with Company	15	7.0
Celebrity in Minor Role	11	5.1
Created/Cartoon Character in Minor Role	10	4.7**
Animal in Minor Role	9	4.2**
Principal Character Animal	5	2.3**
Real Person in Minor Role	4	1.9**
Principal Character Real People	1	0.5**

\*\*sample size criteria violated

A number of commercials in the sample employed a background cast too (42.1%). Commercial character variables that violated the minimum sample size criteria were removed from further analysis (Table 39).

**Research question (11b).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial characters with respect to commercials aired on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

According to Table 40, the commercial characters ‘recognized continuing character’ ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 6.25; p < .05$ ) and ‘principal character celebrity’ ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 13.03; p < .01$ ) showed a statistically significant association with the channels the commercials were aired on. Both the commercial characters were found more often than expected on PTV.

Table 40. Commercial Characters by Channel of Ad (N=214)

	PTV (%)	ARY Digital (%)	Geo TV (%)	Total (%)	$X^2$	d.f.	p
Recognized continuing character	14 (17.5%)	8 (12.3%)	3 (4.3%)	25 (11.7%)	6.25	2	.04
Principal character celebrity	17 (21.3%)	4 (6.2%)	3 (4.3%)	24 (11.2%)	13.03	2	.00

However no statistically significant relationships were found between channel of commercial and the following variables: Principal character male ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.31, p = n.s.$ ), principal character female ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.02, p = n.s.$ ), principal character child/enfant ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.74, p = n.s.$ ), principal character actor playing role of ordinary person ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.16, p = n.s.$ ), principal character creation ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.34, p = n.s.$ ), principal character animal ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 11.74, p = n.s.$ ), principal character animated ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.41, p = n.s.$ ), no principal

character ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 1.43, p = n.s.$ ), characters identified with company ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 10.76, p = n.s.$ ), background cast ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.72, p = n.s.$ ), celebrity in minor role ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.37, p = n.s.$ ), and presenter/spokesperson on camera ( $X^2(6, n = 214) = 6.78, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (11c).** What are the significant differences in the use of dominant commercial characters with respect to commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

While comparing the presence of commercial characters with product category, seven statistically significant relationships were discovered (Table 41): principal character female, principal character male, background cast, principal character child, no principal character, recognized continuing character and principal character celebrity. Principal character female (69.8%) and principal character child (27.9%) appeared more often than expected in commercials for edible items, while principal character male (79.3%), principal character celebrity (24.4%), background cast (58.5%) and recognized continuing character (24.4%) appeared more often than expected in commercials for carbonated beverages. Also, more often than expected, commercials for non-carbonated beverages used children as principal characters (30.4%) or used no principal characters at all (23.9%). However, no statistically significant relationships were found between product category and the following variables: Principal character actor playing role of ordinary person ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.59, p = n.s.$ ), principal character creation ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.75, p = n.s.$ ), principal character animated ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 5.12, p = n.s.$ ), characters identified with company ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.45, p = n.s.$ ), celebrity in minor role ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 13.74, p = n.s.$ ), created character/cartoon character in minor role

( $X^2$  (2, n = 214) = 4.76, p = n.s.), and presenter/spokesperson on camera ( $X^2$  (6, n = 214) = 21.96, p = n.s.).

Table 41. Commercial Characters Presence by Product Category (N=214)

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non- Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)	$X^2$	d.f.	p
Principal character female	33 (40.2%)	29 (63.0%)	60 (69.8%)	122 (57%)	15.80	2	.00
Principal character male	65 (79.3%)	23 (50.0%)	29 (33.7%)	117 (54.7%)	35.66	2	.00
Background cast	48 (58.5%)	20 (43.5%)	22 (25.6%)	90 (42.1%)	18.76	2	.00
Principal character child	3 (3.7%)	14 (30.4%)	24 (27.9%)	41 (19.2%)	20.75	2	.00
No principal character	6 (7.3%)	11 (23.9%)	14 (16.5%)	31 (14.6%)	6.95	2	.03
Recognized continuing character	20 (24.4%)	0 (0.0%)	5 (5.8%)	25 (11.7%)	21.79	2	.00
Principal character celebrity	20 (24.4%)	3 (6.5%)	1 (1.2%)	24 (11.2%)	24.04	2	.00

## Cultural Values

**Research question (12a).** What are the dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani television commercials?

According to Table 42, ‘youth’ (64.0%), ‘enjoyment’ (52.8%), ‘courtesy’ (45.8%) and ‘collectivism’ (43.6%) were the most dominant cultural values used in that order, in the sample commercials. Cultural values such as ‘sex’, ‘tradition’, ‘work’, ‘technology’, ‘competition’, ‘power aversion’, ‘work’ and ‘beauty’ did not meet the minimum sample size criteria and were removed from further analysis.

Table 42. Presence of Cultural Values

	Frequency	Percent
Youth	137	64.0
Enjoyment	113	52.8
Courtesy	98	45.8
Collectivism	94	43.6
Effectiveness	85	39.7
Family	81	37.9
Interdependence	77	36.0
Collective Benefits	72	33.6
Tamed	72	33.6
Distinctiveness	66	30.8
Casualness	64	29.9
Health	54	25.2
Self-Sufficiency	53	24.8
Adventure	47	22.0
Individualism	45	21.0
Self-Gain	43	20.1
Independence	42	19.6
Succorance	41	19.2
Social Status	40	18.7
Formality	37	17.3
Convenience	35	16.4
Natural	35	16.4
Collective Integrity	29	13.6
Individual Benefits	32	15.0
Economy	26	12.1
Uniqueness	26	12.1
Respect for Elderly	26	12.1
Nurturance	25	11.7
Modesty	23	10.7
Power Equality	20	9.3
Humility	19	8.9
Patriotism	15	7.0
Popularity	15	7.0
Wealth	13	6.1
Safety	12	5.6
Magic	11	5.1
Sex	6	2.8**
Competition	6	2.8**
Work	4	1.9**
Tradition	3	1.4**
Power Aversion	3	1.4**
Beauty	1	0.5**
Technology	1	0.5**

\*\*minimum sample size violation

**Research question (12b).** What are the significant differences in dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani TV commercials on PTV, ARY Digital and Geo TV?

Four cultural values namely effectiveness, casualness, social status and nurturance exhibited dependent relationships by the channel of the commercials (Table 43). The value of effectiveness was present more often than expected on Geo TV (with over 50% of commercials on Geo TV portraying this value) and ARY Digital as compared to PTV. However, the values of casualness, social status and nurturance were present more often than expected on PTV with around 40% of PTV commercials portraying casualness, 28.8% portraying social status and 18.8% portraying nurturance.

Table 43. Presence of Cultural Values by Channel of Commercial

	PTV (%)	ARY Digital (%)	Geo TV (%)	Total (%)	X <sup>2</sup>	d.f.	P
Effectiveness	24 (30.0%)	26 (40.0%)	35 (50.7%)	85 (39.7%)	6.65	2	.04
Casualness	32 (40.0%)	18 (27.7%)	14 (20.3%)	64 (29.9%)	7.08	2	.03
Social Status	23 (28.8%)	11 (16.9%)	6 (8.7%)	40 (18.7%)	10.0	2	.01
Nurturance	15 (18.8%)	7 (10.8%)	3 (4.3%)	25 (11.7%)	7.52	2	.02

The following variables did not exhibit statistically significant relationships with channel of the commercial: Youth ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.25, p = n.s.$ ), enjoyment ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.84, p = n.s.$ ), courtesy ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.82, p = n.s.$ ), collectivism ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 1.55, p = n.s.$ ), family ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.54, p = n.s.$ ), interdependence ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.65, p = n.s.$ ), collective benefits ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.79, p = n.s.$ ), tamed ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.09, p = n.s.$ ), distinctiveness ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.64, p = n.s.$ ), health ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.04, p = n.s.$ ), self-sufficiency ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.11, p = n.s.$ ), adventure ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 1.32, p = n.s.$ ), individualism ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.31, p = n.s.$ ), self-

gain ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.61, p = n.s.$ ), independence ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.68, p = n.s.$ ), succorance ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.82, p = n.s.$ ), formality ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.22, p = n.s.$ ), convenience ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.15, p = n.s.$ ), natural ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.22, p = n.s.$ ), collective integrity ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.12, p = n.s.$ ), individual benefits ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.02, p = n.s.$ ), economy ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.44, p = n.s.$ ), uniqueness ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.44, p = n.s.$ ), respect for elderly ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.26, p = n.s.$ ), modesty ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.09, p = n.s.$ ), power equality ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.52, p = n.s.$ ), humility ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.86, p = n.s.$ ), patriotism ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 3.91, p = n.s.$ ), popularity ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 5.99, p = n.s.$ ), wealth ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.33, p = n.s.$ ), safety ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.20, p = n.s.$ ) and magic ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 1.91, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (12c).** What are the significant differences in dominant cultural values portrayed in Pakistani TV commercials for carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items?

Twenty three cultural values out of a total of 43 exhibited statistically dependent relationships with the product category of the commercials (Table 44). Commercials for carbonated beverages dominantly displayed the values of youth (76.8%), distinctiveness (54.9%), casualness (43.9%), adventure (43.9%), individualism (39%), self-sufficiency (36.6%), self-gain (35.4%), independence (31.7%) and social-status (30.5%).

Commercials for non-carbonated beverages dominantly displayed the values of youth (69.6%), courtesy (65.2%), collectivism (58.7%), effectiveness (56.5%), family (54.3%), interdependence (50.0%), health (47.8%), natural (34.8%) and convenience (32.6%).

Commercials for edible items on the other hand dominantly displayed the values of courtesy (64.0%), effectiveness (62.8%), family (55.8%), tamed (54.7%), collective

benefits (48.8%), youth (48.8%) collectivism (45.3%), health (36.0%) and succorance (30.2%). The value of youth is dominant in all three product categories and is also the dominant value overall. The values of convenience, natural, health, succorance, collective integrity and nurturance are present in less than 5% of carbonated beverage commercials.

Table 44. Presence of Cultural Values by Product Categories

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)	X <sup>2</sup>	d.f.	p
Youth	63 (76.8%)	32 (69.6%)	42 (48.8%)	137 (64.0%)	15.06	2	.00
Courtesy	13 (15.9%)	30 (65.2%)	55 (64.0%)	98 (45.8%)	48.03	2	.00
Collectivism	28 (34.1%)	27 (58.7%)	39 (45.3%)	94 (43.9%)	7.33	2	.02
Effectiveness	5 (6.1%)	26 (56.5%)	54 (62.8%)	85 (39.7%)	63.26	2	.00
Family	8 (9.8%)	25 (54.3%)	48 (55.8%)	81 (37.9%)	44.63	2	.00
Interdependence	35 (42.7%)	23 (50.0%)	19 (22.1%)	77 (36.0%)	12.73	2	.00
Collective Benefits	10 (12.2%)	20 (43.5%)	42 (48.8%)	72 (33.6%)	27.78	2	.00
Tamed	5 (6.1%)	20 (43.5%)	47 (54.7%)	72 (33.6%)	46.86	2	.00
Distinctiveness	45 (54.9%)	8 (17.4%)	13 (17.1%)	66 (30.8%)	36.08	2	.00
Casualness	36 (43.9%)	10 (21.7%)	18 (20.9%)	64 (29.9%)	12.43	2	.00
Health	1 (1.2%)	22 (47.8%)	31 (36.0%)	54 (25.2%)	42.84	2	.00
Self-sufficiency	30 (36.6%)	8 (17.4%)	15 (17.4%)	53 (24.8%)	9.97	2	.01
Adventure	36 (43.9%)	5 (10.9%)	6 (7.0%)	47 (22.0%)	37.60	2	.00
Individualism	32 (39%)	3 (6.5%)	10 (11.6%)	45 (21.0%)	26.40	2	.00
Self-gain	29 (35.4%)	4 (8.7%)	10 (11.6%)	43 (20.1%)	19.47	2	.00
Independence	26 (31.7%)	6 (13.0%)	10 (11.6%)	42 (19.6%)	12.34	2	.00

Table 44. Continued

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)	X <sup>2</sup>	d.f.	p
Succorance	4 (4.9%)	11 (23.9%)	26 (30.2%)	41 (19.2%)	18.28	2	.00
Social Status	25 (30.5%)	6 (13.0%)	9 (10.5%)	40 (18.7%)	12.30	2	.00 2
Formality	7 (8.5%)	12 (26.1%)	18 (20.9%)	37 (17.3%)	7.68	2	.02
Convenience	3 (3.7%)	15 (32.6%)	17 (19.8%)	35 (16.4%)	19.28	2	.00
Natural	0 (0.0%)	16 (34.8%)	19 (22.1%)	35 (16.4%)	29.52	2	.00
Collective Integrity	3 (3.7%)	10 (21.7%)	16 (18.6%)	29 (13.6%)	11.36	2	.00
Nurturance	3 (3.7%)	7 (15.2%)	15 (17.4%)	25 (11.7%)	8.45	2	.02

Cultural values that did not show a statistically significant relationship with product category include enjoyment ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.36, p = n.s.$ ), individual benefits ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.61, p = n.s.$ ), economy ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.77, p = n.s.$ ), uniqueness ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 0.63, p = n.s.$ ), respect for elderly ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.91, p = n.s.$ ), modesty ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.61, p = n.s.$ ), power equality ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 2.51, p = n.s.$ ), humility ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 1.51, p = n.s.$ ), patriotism ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 12.31, p = n.s.$ ), popularity ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 7.66, p = n.s.$ ), wealth ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 3.00, p = n.s.$ ), safety ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 10.18, p = n.s.$ ), and magic ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 9.35, p = n.s.$ ).

Table 43 and Table 44 suggest that a majority of the dominant cultural values portrayed in television commercials aired in Pakistan have a statistically significant association with product category rather than the channel on which they are aired. When product category is used as a control variable a statistically significant association between channel of ad and the values 'social status' and 'casualness' can only be found

in the carbonated beverages category, with ads on PTV portraying a greater amount of both values. Associations for the other two product categories do not meet the minimum cell criteria. However, according to Table 8, PTV also has a significantly greater number of carbonated beverage ads than other channels and therefore this association can be attributable to product category rather than the channel of the ad. Also, when product category is used as a control variable, associations between the other two cultural values (effectiveness and nurturance) and channel of the ad do not meet the minimum cell count criteria.

### **Other Exploratory Cultural Variables**

The sample was coded for two other exploratory cultural variables that were not based on previous research. The purpose was to probe deeper into television commercials in Pakistan by analyzing certain culture-specific aspects of the country’s advertising.

**Research question (13a).** What is the frequency of women portrayed in Western clothing in television commercials in Pakistan?

According to Table 45, only 42 sample commercials (19.6%) portrayed females in Western clothing.

**Table 45. Presence of Females in Western Clothing**

	Frequency	Percent
Present	42	19.6%
Absent	172	80.0%
Total	214	100.0%

**Research question (13b).** Is there a statistically significant relationship between portrayal of women in Western clothing and channel of the commercial?

There was statistically significant relationship between channel of the commercial and portrayal of women in Western clothing ( $X^2(2, n = 214) = 4.55, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (13c).** Is there a statistically significant relationship between portrayal of women in Western clothing and product category of the commercial?

A statistically significant relationship was found between product category and portrayal of women in Western clothing (Table 46). Around 32.9% of carbonated beverage commercials portrayed women in Western clothing which was more than the expected value and comparatively much more than those portrayed in edible items' commercials (9.0%).

Table 46. Portrayal of Women in Western Clothing by Product Category

	Carbonated Beverages (%)	Non-Carbonated Beverages (%)	Edible Items (%)	Total (%)
Present	27 (32.9%)	9 (19.6%)	6 (7.0%)	42
Absent	55 (65.9%)	37 (37.0%)	80 (69.1%)	172 (80.4%)
Total (%)	82 (100%)	46 (100%)	86 (100%)	214 (100%)

$X^2 (2, n = 214) = 17.92, p < .01$

**Research question (14a).** How often are religious references made in television commercials in Pakistan?

Religious references were very rarely made in the sample commercials (9.3%) and most of the religious references or symbolism appeared in commercials aired during the month of Ramadan (religious month of Fasting).

Table 47. Religious Reference in Sample

Religious Reference	Frequency	Percent
Present	20	9.3%
Absent	194	90.7%
Total	214	100.0%

**Research question (14b).** Is there a significant relationship between the presence or absence of religious references and the channel the commercial is aired on?

There was no statistically significant relationship found between religious reference and channel of the commercial ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 0.66, p = n.s.$ ).

**Research question (14c).** Is there a significant relationship between the presence or absence of religious references and the channel the commercial is aired on?

The sample did not meet minimum expected cell count criteria due to a small number of commercials with religious reference. Therefore no statistically significant relationship could be found ( $X^2 (2, n = 214) = 2.42, p = n.s.$ ).

### Hypotheses

**Hypothesis 1.** Commercials for edible items will contain more women in traditional clothing than in Western clothing.

According to Table 48, there were a total of 122 commercials where the principal character was female. Out of these, females were used as principal characters in a total of 61 edible items' commercials. Out of these 61 commercials, only 8.2% of the commercials displayed women in Western clothing while an overwhelming 91.8% of edible items' commercials with women as principal characters, displayed women in traditional dresses. Moreover, this relationship was statistically significant with women appearing less often than expected in Western clothing in edible items' commercials. Therefore the hypothesis was statistically supported.

Table 48. Female Characters Clothing by Edible Items (n=122)

	Edible Items (%)	Others (%)	Total
Western Clothing	5 (8.2%)	23 (37.7%)	28 (23.0%)
Traditional Clothing	56 (91.8%)	38 (62.3%)	94 (77.0%)
Total	61 (100%)	61 (100%)	122 (100%)

$X^2 (1, n = 122) = 15.02, p < .01$

**Hypothesis 2:** Urdu only will be used as the dominant language of text in commercials for products with a domestic brand origin.

**Hypothesis 3:** English only will be used as the dominant language of text in commercials for products with an international brand origin.

To analyze the presence of monolingual text in domestic and international brands' commercials, the variable 'language of text in commercial' was recoded to remove all commercials with bilingual text. However, the relationship between brand origin and language of text in commercial was not significant and both the hypotheses were not statistically supported ( $X^2 (1, n = 159) = .071, p = n.s.$ ).

## CHAPTER 5 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

The main purpose of this study was to examine the dominant creative executional elements and cultural values portrayed in commercials in Pakistan. The study also sought to highlight any significant differences in the executional elements and value appeals portrayed in commercials aired on Pakistani terrestrial and satellite television channels as well as across product categories. This study is differentiated from other cultural analyses in advertising because to date, there is no existing academic literature on the subject of advertising in Pakistan and this study is intended to be a pioneer in this area of research. The sample consisted of advertisements from one terrestrial and two satellite TV channels in Pakistan and represented three product categories. The commercials were coded for executional characteristics derived from Steve Marshall's (2006) doctoral dissertation that was based on Stewart and Furse's (1986) coding framework. Hofstede's cultural dimensions operationalized by Cheng (1997), Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp (1999), Moon & Chan (2005), Albers-Miller & Gelb (1996) and Hofstede, Pederson and Hofstede J. (2002) were used to code for cultural appeals. This chapter describes the major findings from Chapter 4, discusses the limitations of this research and highlights prospects for future research.

### **Descriptive Results**

This study basically analyzed commercials for non-durable shared usage consumer products from three food and drink product categories. These included carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items. There was an almost equal representation of commercials for carbonated beverage and edible items but non-carbonated beverages constituted just about one-fifth of the total sample. There were

some differences within the edible items category with cooking products such as edible oils and spices representing a little over two-thirds of the edible items' commercials, while commercials for children's products such as confections and snacks constituted a little less than one-fourth of the sample.

There were an almost equal number of commercials from both ARY Digital (30.4%) and Geo TV (32.2%) but PTV commercials (37.4%) constituted just a little over one-third of the total sample.

There were statistically significant differences in product category with respect to channel of the commercial. Half of the commercials on PTV (50.0%) belonged to the carbonated beverages category. The bulk of commercials on ARY Digital (53.8%) and Geo TV (44.9%) belonged to the edible items category. Around one-third of Geo TV commercials belonged to the carbonated beverages category too. Non-carbonated beverages had an overall smaller representation in the sample and did not represent a major chunk of any particular channel.

## **Dominant Executional Characteristics**

### **Descriptive Characteristics**

Part 'a' of research questions 1-12 described the executional characteristics of the sample of commercials. The most dominant executional characteristics highlighted in the results were profiled to create a prototypical food and drink category Pakistani commercial. The prototypical Pakistani food and drink commercial would be: less than or equal to 30 seconds in length (61.2%) and will contain visual memory devices (93.5%) and graphic displays (84.6%). The text used in the commercial will be entirely in English (39.7%). The commercial will use rhymes, slogans or mnemonics (82.7%) and some form of music (99.1%) as well. A product reminder will be used as the main commercial

appeal (22.0%) while a demonstration of the product in use or by analogy (19.2%) will be the commercial format. The commercial will use a more emotional approach (57.0%) and a more transformational message strategy (67.3%). The commercial will be set indoors (54.2%), carry a happy and fun-loving tone (29.4%) and a front-end impact structure (64.5%). The commercial will contain a female principal character (57.0%) and a male principal character (54.7%) with actors playing the role of ordinary people (72.9%).

Surprisingly, English was the most frequently used language of the printed text on screen (39.7%) in the overall sample. Pakistan has an overall literacy rate of 48.7% and just 35.2% for females (Ghauri, 2006, July 28), and a much smaller percentage of people who can read English. In such a scenario, the higher usage of English text in TV commercials for mass products such food and beverages was unexpected.

As discussed in the literature review, some of the most recalled advertisements in Pakistan are jingle-based (Mandviwalla, 2007). However, although music was present in almost all commercials in the sample it was used as a major element in just 27.6% of the commercials and only 29.4% contained brand jingles. A small number of commercials (10.3%) contained traditional or Western dances as well. Most of them belonged to the carbonated and non-carbonated beverages which are generally targeted at younger audiences. Although Pakistan is a Muslim country, the display of dances in television commercials is expected. This is because Pakistanis are exposed to foreign media not only from the West but also from its next door neighbor, India, which has a deep-rooted culture of music and dancing, which can be seen manifest in all its television programming.

Brand differentiating messages were found in very few commercials (12.1%). According to Faisal Hashmi, around 80% of Pakistani advertising is formula-based in both idea and execution (Hashmi, 2007). This is even truer in the case of the food and drink category where most products have similar attributes and benefits. It is no surprise then that most Pakistani TV commercials use a more emotional approach (57%) rather than make rational claims (23.4%) based on the product's attributes or objective benefits. A happy and fun-loving tone was used most frequently (29.4%) which is expected considering that food and drink are considered an important aspect of Pakistan's hospitable culture and having good food and drink is the main leisure activity of Pakistanis.

### **Dependent Relationships with Channel of Commercial**

This topic discusses part 'b' of research questions 1-12. Surprisingly, most of the measured executional characteristics in the sample did not exhibit statistically significant relationships with the channel of the commercial. Only four executional variables exhibited significant variance with respect to the channel the commercial was aired on. The prominent differentiating characteristics of commercials on Geo TV included the presence of dancing and indoor commercial settings. The comparatively greater use of a graphics background instead of an actual commercial setting differentiated the commercials on ARY Digital. Lastly, a comparatively greater use of celebrities as principal characters and recognized continuing characters as part of a continuing campaign or by virtue of previous appearances set PTV apart from the other two channels. However, though these relationships are statistically significant, they lack a general trend across channels. Although it can be said that Geo TV, being a satellite

channel used more dances because it has a more liberal outlook, the same is not seen on ARY Digital which is assumed to be a more liberal channel than Geo TV.

### **Dependent Relationships with Product Category**

This topic discusses part 'c' of research questions 1-12. Most of the measured executional characteristics exhibited dependent relationships with product category. Although all three product categories belong to the food and drink category, edible items and carbonated beverages stood out as considerably different. This may be due to differences in the target audience, wherein carbonated beverage commercials are usually targeted at the youth while edible items are targeted at housewives.

Edible items were associated with substantive supers as visual devices and tended to display a combination of both English and Urdu text in the commercials. Edible items also used rhymes, slogans and mnemonics as well as traditional Pakistani music more frequently. This is expected considering housewives are more traditionalistic in nature and would have a greater relevance to traditional rather than contemporary or Western music. Edible items' commercials were also associated with an emotional appeal or a balance of emotional and rational appeals. 'Demonstration of product in use or by analogy' such as showing a woman cooking, as well as 'sales announcement' such as promotional discounts were prominent commercial formats. Informational message strategies were used more often in edible oils than in the other two product categories. These commercials also predominantly used female principal characters in indoor commercial settings. These commercials also had an almost equal likelihood of containing happy/fun-loving, wholesome/healthy and hard sell appeals although compared to the other categories, a greater percentage of the edible items' commercials had a hard sell appeal in them. This can be partially attributed to the relatively higher

number of sales announcement commercials (28.8%) found in the edible items category. Also, a comparatively higher percentage of edible items' commercials (22.1%) contained brand-differentiating messages. This was expected considering that a higher percentage of these commercials also had hard sell appeals and a more rational approach which perhaps were based on unique claims about the product attributes. Most commercials also had a front-end impact structure, although, compared to the other two categories, a doughnut structure was seen more often in edible items' commercials.

Carbonated beverages' commercials were associated with surrealistic visuals and unusual sound effects like a man falling out of the sky while enjoying Mountain Dew or Fido Dido coming out of a Seven-up bottle with an unusual sound. Also, the commercials had a greater likelihood to use Urdu as the language of text. This may be because carbonated beverages are affordable mass-targeted products with an increasing appeal in rural areas of Pakistan; thus the language in the commercials needs to be widely comprehensible. These commercials employed music to create a mood and had a greater likelihood to use contemporary Pakistani or Western and other styles of music. The majority of these commercials used a more emotional approach and transformational message strategies with continuity of action or story-telling as a dominant format. Most commercials were set indoors although compared to the other categories, carbonated beverage commercials were more likely to use other settings such as streets, roads, walkways, etc. Carbonated beverages were associated with a happy and fun-loving commercial tone and a front-end impact commercial structure. This category was also more likely to use males as principal characters along with a background cast and

recognized continuing characters such as sports endorsers or character actors from existing or past campaigns.

Non-carbonated beverages were more likely to use English as the language of the text. The reason may be that non-carbonated beverages such as packaged juices and packaged milk products are a popular concept only amongst the urban crowd, especially the more educated classes. Rural inhabitants as well as more traditional Pakistanis still prefer to use freshly prepared juices and generally buy fresh milk from the milkman rather than in packaged packets. Also, packaged non-carbonated beverages are relatively more expensive in Pakistan and only the more affluent classes can afford to buy them. Affluence is considered an indicator of more education and thus English may be practically used to target these audiences. Non-carbonated beverages commercials were also associated with rhymes, slogans and mnemonics and also used music as a major element. They were also associated with a balance of emotional and rational commercial approach with the creation of mood or image as the dominant commercial format and a wholesome and healthy commercial tone. Non-carbonated beverages also had an association with the absence of principal characters as quite a few commercials emphasized the freshness of the product by showing images of the product or the product source rather than real life characters. However, children as principal character were more likely to be used in these commercials.

### **Dominant Cultural Values**

#### **Descriptive Results**

Part 'a' of research question 12 described the portrayal of cultural values in the sample of commercials. The dominant cultural values found in the overall sample included 'youth', 'enjoyment', 'courtesy' and 'collectivism' in that order. Younger,

good-looking models and an emphasis on feeling young or achieving youthful health or energy were common in most commercials. This coupled with the almost non-existence of the values of tradition or emphasis on the qualities of being time-honored or part of a longer tradition, points towards a surprisingly high presence of the uncertainty avoidance dimension. This is contrary to Hofstede's findings about Pakistan which rank Pakistan as very high on uncertainty avoidance (ITIM International, 2003). However, this does support the fact that because Pakistan is at a developmental stage in its life, most Pakistanis have become aspirational in nature. This coupled with continuous exposure to the West through media, has triggered the gradual but continuous process of Westernization and modernization amongst Pakistanis, especially in the urban areas (Faizi, 2007). Therefore, the portrayal of higher uncertainty avoidance in Pakistani commercials, which is a characteristic of most Western cultures, may be understandable.

Enjoyment associated with the use of a product, a feminine value, was also emphasized in more than half of the sample commercials. This can be attributed to the importance and appreciation of good food and drink in Pakistan. Courtesy towards the consumer through the use of polite and affable language (e.g.: using the formal expression for 'you' i.e. 'aap' instead of 'tum'), another feminine value, was emphasized too. This is expected considering that Pakistan is a more reserved culture and the Urdu language, like French, differentiates between formal speech for strangers and casual speech for close acquaintances. The presence of feminine appeals is also supported by Hofstede's findings about Pakistani culture wherein Pakistan ranks almost equal on femininity and masculinity (ITIM International, 2003). Lastly, the value of collectivism, i.e. depicting the individual as an integral part of the group is expected considering that

Pakistan is a highly collectivistic culture according to Hofstede's rankings (ITIM International, 2003).

### **Dependent Relationships with Channel of Commercial**

Only four cultural values exhibited a dependent relationship with the channel the commercial was aired on. This was surprising because a major part of this study was based on the premise that because terrestrial and satellite channels have different viewerships and corporate backgrounds, these variations may be manifest as differences in cultural values portrayed in commercials in the three channels under discussion. Geo TV and ARY Digital were associated with the masculine value of effectiveness, i.e. portraying a product as achieving certain ends (e.g. cooking oil makes food tasty, fresh juice refreshes). PTV on the other hand was associated with casual style of speech between commercial characters (low power distance), social status associated with the use of a product (high power distance) and nurturance, i.e. emphasis on helping or taking care of the young or the elderly (femininity dimension).

Although as expected, PTV portrayed a value signifying high power distance, there is no indication of there being an overall variation in the portrayal of cultural dimensions by channel of the commercial.

### **Dependent Relationships with Product Category**

Out of the 43 cultural values measured in this study, 23 of them exhibited strong associations with product category. Carbonated beverages were associated with most of the individualistic values including distinctiveness, individualism, self-sufficiency, self-gain and independence. They also had a strong association with the low uncertainty avoidance values of youth and adventure and the low power distance value of casualness of speech between characters. However, carbonated beverage commercials were also

associated with the high power distance value of social status. This was because just a little less than one-third of these commercials portrayed the product or its use as being able to elevate the position of the user in the eyes of others. The product was generally portrayed as a symbol of being 'cool' and a means to get positive attention from others.

Non-carbonated beverages were strongly associated with the collectivistic values of collectivism, interdependence and collective benefits and the individualistic value of health benefits of the product. Also, compared to the other product categories, non-carbonated beverages' commercials had a greater likelihood of portraying the collectivistic value of collective integrity (appeals such as "your family's well-being is important to you"). Collectivism was the dominant dimension which may be due to the fact that non-carbonated beverages are healthy alternatives to carbonated beverages and therefore hold collective benefits and appeal to all age groups; this make them a more shared use category than carbonated beverages. As discussed in the literature, products that are shared in use generally use more culturally congruent appeals (Han and Shavitt, 1994) and therefore the collectivism dimension holds strong for non-carbonated beverages' commercials in Pakistan. The commercials also contained associations with feminine values including courtesy, family (showing family scenes and emphasis on the goodness of the product for the whole family) and natural (emphasis on the purity and freshness of product). The masculine value of effectiveness and convenience in the use of the product was also emphasized. This was expected considering that non-carbonated packaged beverages are a tasty yet convenient alternative to the widely consumed freshly produced unpackaged beverages. Lastly, the low uncertainty avoidance value of youth was also present in more than half of the non-carbonated beverage commercials.

Edible items generally were more likely to contain feminine values such as courtesy, family and nurturance as well as the masculine value of effectiveness of product. They were also more likely to portray the collectivistic values of collective benefits and succorance (emphasis on exchanging expressions of love, appreciation or gratitude). Also, edible items had a strong association with the high uncertainty avoidance value of tamed or domesticated characteristics of characters. Most of the edible items' commercials were for cooking products and showed women in stereotypical domesticated roles as mothers, wives or daughter-in-laws. This was expected considering that cooking is a domestic activity and the kitchen is the woman's forte especially in collectivistic cultures. This finding is also supported by previous findings by Gregory and Munch (1997) which suggested that for products wherein the mother facilitates the preparation process, depicting both role and familial norms increases the effectiveness of the commercials. The commercials also exhibited an association with the individualistic value of health and health benefits from the use of the product. This points towards a shift in the Pakistani mindset from a more purity or freshness-driven one to a more nutrition-value driven one. Although the value of youth was not significantly associated with the edible items' category, it was present in almost half of the edible items' commercials.

It is interesting to note that the use of younger models and emphasis on the rejuvenating benefits of the brand (such as depicting characters as staying young and healthy by using a certain product) was found to be a dominant cultural variable across product categories. Also, carbonated beverages' commercials exhibited less culturally congruent characteristics as compared to non-carbonated and edible items' commercials. This may be due to the fact that carbonated beverages are targeted towards the younger

audiences in Pakistan who are more liberal, receive more exposure from foreign media and are gradually adopting more Western cultural values of individualism and higher uncertainty avoidance.

### **Other Exploratory Variables**

Although the two variables ‘women in Western clothing’ and ‘religious references’ were not taken from any previous research studies, they were used to probe deeper into how specific cultural symbols or culture-specific values are used in Pakistani commercials. Western clothing for women is an emerging trend in the urban areas of Pakistan and is prevalent only in the more educated, more liberal and higher-income classes. Religion also plays an important role Pakistani society.

Only about one-fifth of the commercials portrayed women in Western clothing. In commercials where women were present as a principal character, less than one-fourth of them were in Western clothing. However, just about 10% of the commercials contained religious references. These references were used mainly in commercials aired during the month of Fasting (Ramadan) and mostly talked about discounts for consumers during that particular holy month.

There was no statistically significant relationship between women in channel of the commercial and women in Western clothing. However, carbonated beverages exhibited a strong association with women in Western clothing. This was expected considering the characteristics of the target market for carbonated beverages as discussed earlier.

Religious references did not show any dependent relationship with either the channel of the commercial or the product category.

## **Hypotheses**

### **Women in Western Clothing in Edible Items Commercials**

The first hypothesis investigated the cultural congruency of women's clothing in edible items' commercials. To examine whether women in commercials for edible items dress more traditionally, only commercials in which women appeared as principal characters were analyzed. The findings were found to be statistically significant and over 90% of women who appeared as principal characters in edible items' commercials were dressed traditionally in 'shalwar kameez' with a small shawl or wrap covering the chest area thrown around the neck. However, contrary to popular belief, the greater majority of these women did not wear a headscarf. In fact, even traditional clothing was more contemporary in nature with stylish designs and in a few cases, without a shawl or stole covering the chest. This points towards an interesting dichotomy between the general assumption or impression of the portrayal of women in commercials from Muslim countries and their depiction in Pakistani commercials. According to Olayan and Karande's (2000) cross-cultural study of Arab TV commercials, women were shown wearing long conservative dresses. However, although Pakistani commercials depicted women wearing the traditional dress (loose trouser and knee length shirt), the dresses were body-hugging in most cases, and in some cases the shirts were sleeveless as well. This is perhaps due to the vast cultural differences in Arab and Pakistani culture, which at times override the similarities in religion.

### **Language of Text by Brand Origin**

The second and third hypotheses investigated the language of text used in commercials in relation to brand origin. The hypotheses proposed that commercials for domestic products will use Urdu as the only language of text while commercials for

international products, by virtue of their origin, will use English as the only language of text. Both the hypotheses were shown to be statistically insignificant. Surprisingly, a greater percentage of international commercials employed Urdu as the only language of text and vice versa but the association was not strong enough to hold statistical significance.

### **Limitations**

The Pakistani advertising industry is still in its early developmental stages. Moreover, 'advertising' itself is still not considered a subject for academic research in the country. It is important to note that before this study was conducted, there was no previous academic research available about Pakistan in the subject of advertising. As a result, a lot of limitations were experienced in reviewing literature, data collection and data analysis during the study.

Due to the limited nature of Synergy Advertising's and Orient McCann-Erickson's media banks, enough product categories couldn't be procured. Moreover, because the advertisements are from only two advertising agencies' media banks, they were more likely to have a greater concentration of commercials for product categories which they work with or have worked with in the past.

The total number of commercials available for sampling was too small to allow for random probability sampling and therefore convenience sampling was employed to derive the sample for analysis. Also, due to relatively lower representation of most other product categories, the sample had to be restricted to carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items. With more product categories, the analysis might have produced varying results. Additionally, because these commercials were from a general collection of advertisements rather than actual media monitoring records, the

exact year of broadcast for each commercial could not be determined. A number of commercials from relevant product categories did not indicate the channel they were aired on and had to be removed from the sample, thus reducing the sample size.

Most past research using the Stewart and Furse (1986) coding framework analyzed award-winning commercials from various countries under the premise that award-winning commercials are more effective and according to Gregory and Munch (1997) and Zhang and Gelb (1996), appeals which are culturally congruent are more effective. Thus, award-winning commercials will contain more culturally congruent appeals. However, in the case of Pakistan, advertising awards for television commercials (Aurora Awards) are a very recent phenomenon. Unfortunately, there were too few commercials to derive a representative sample for this study. Therefore the sample was based on what consumers were exposed to rather than what they are affected by.

Additionally, it is important to note that the variables used for the analysis of culture were derived directly from previous studies which have utilized Hofstede's dimensions for cultural research on other countries. As a result these variables may not have measured other dominant culture-specific values of Pakistan such as religious devotion, gender equality/inequality, etc. Even the Stewart and Furse (1986) framework used to analyze executional characteristics of the sample commercials, is more than 21 years old. Considering that the advertising industry is so dynamic and has changed so much over the past two and a half decades, this framework might not have been able to account for newer creative strategies, formats or other executional characteristics.

A couple of coding issues were also faced during the coding process. Firstly, the secondary coder was not an 'advertising' major and had initial difficulty understanding

the concepts and definitions presented to him in the code book. Even after training with more than six to eight code sheets, the reliability tests produced low reliability scores for cultural variables such as ‘enjoyment’, ‘safety’ and ‘convenience’. This was due to the vagueness of definitions and disagreements over what constitutes, for example, ‘use of a product makes the user wild with joy’ as in the case of the ‘enjoyment’ variable.

### **Future Research**

This exploratory study was undertaken with the aim of laying the grounds for future research on Pakistani advertising. This research can be the foundation of a number of other studies both Pakistan-specific as well as cross-cultural.

First, it can be used for cross-cultural studies of executional characteristics as well as cultural values between Pakistan and other similar cultures. It would be interesting to see a comparison being drawn between commercials from other Muslim countries as well as other South Asian countries that have a lot cultural similarities with Pakistan.

The current study can also be extended by adding more product categories to the data set to allow for a broader analysis of television commercials in Pakistan. Adding product categories will allow a more generalized picture of the ‘prototypical’ Pakistani commercial to appear. This research was restricted to analyzing differences in executional and cultural variables across the food and drink category. However, a broader product category set comprising other non-durable consumer products as well as other durable or industrial products might reveal even greater variations in the dominant executional characteristics and cultural values. Moreover, this study can be used as a Pakistani benchmark for other countries to compare the dominant characteristics of commercials across different product categories to understand the possibilities of using standardized international commercials in Pakistan.

Moreover, in the future, the coding framework used in this study can be used to analyze award-winning commercials from Pakistan to discover the dominant cultural values and executional characteristics that make Pakistani advertisements ‘effective’ as well as to compare the overall characteristics of award-winners with the results from this study to see how award-winners are different from non-award winning commercials.

### **Conclusion**

Over the years, Pakistani advertising has progressed rapidly and the Pakistani advertising industry is considered to be one of the most promising ones in Asia. This study is the first contribution to academic literature regarding Pakistani advertising.

The study analyzed the executional characteristics and cultural values present in Pakistani television commercials from three perspectives: the overall sample consisting of commercials from three product categories and three television channels, across television channels and across product categories.

The results indicated no meaningful differences across the three channels which included one terrestrial channel and two satellite channels. This may be due to the fact that since the political scenario in the country changed and President Musharraf introduced the concept of moderate enlightenment, even the more conservative PTV with a large rural audience came under its influence since it is a government-owned terrestrial channel. The other two satellite channels did not exhibit significant differences either although they have a more urban audience with an overall higher socio-economic status.

However, a number of differences were noticed in both executional characteristics as well as cultural values portrayed in commercials for different product categories.

Although past research considers carbonated beverages, non-carbonated beverages and edible items similar in terms of shared use non-durable consumer products, non-

carbonated beverages and edible items differed significantly on several variables. Whereas carbonated beverages portrayed higher uncertainty avoidance and individualism values, edible items dominantly contained collectivistic and feminine values. This difference most likely arises from a difference in the target audience of these product categories. In the case of carbonated beverages, the audience is predominantly the youth who have been quicker to adapt Western or global values (just like the youth all over the world). On the other hand, the audience for edible items is predominantly housewives who are responsible for cooking and taking care of their families. They are more domesticated, adhere more to traditional values and therefore most commercials targeted at them depict familial relationships and values of care and nurturance.

Overall, this study suggests that Pakistan is a country with immense cultural diversity. Although this may not be visible from a macro perspective, a deeper analysis of Pakistan's television commercials targeted at different audiences reveals the cultural differences amongst Pakistani people. Also, it is not so much a difference in the socio-economic status of audiences that accounts for these variations; it is perhaps a difference in the age-group or the psychographics of the audiences targeted by those commercials.

APPENDIX A  
THESIS CODE SHEET

V1 Ad ID# \_\_\_\_\_

V2 Coder ID \_\_\_\_\_

**V3 Source of Ad:**

<0> Orient McCann-Erickson

<1> Synergy Advertising

**V4 Brand:** \_\_\_\_\_

**V5 Brand Origin:**

<0> Domestic

<1> International

<2> Don't know

**V6 Specific International Brand Origin:**

<0> American

<1> European

<2> East-Asian

<3> Middle-Eastern

<4> Other South Asian

<5> Other

<6> Don't Know

<7> N/A

**V7 TV Channel:**

<1> PTV

<2> ARY Digital

<3> GEO TV

**V8 Length of Ad:**

<0> 10 sec

<1> 30 sec

<2> 45 sec

<3> 60 sec

<4> Other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

**V9 Product Category:**

<0> Carbonated Beverages

<1> Non-carbonated Beverages

<2> Edible Products

**V10 Carbonated Beverage Type:**

<0> Cola

<1> Lemon-based Non-cola

<2> Energy Drink

<3> Other

<9> N/A

**V11 Non-carbonated Beverage Type:**

<0> Fruit Juice

<1> Juice Concentrate/Mix

<2> Tea/Coffee

<3> Milk

<4> Water

<5> Other

<9> N/A

**V12 Edible Product Type:**

<0> Edible Oil/Ghee

<1> Spices and Food Mixes

<2> Snacks and Confections

<3> Baby Food

<4> Other

<9> N/A

**A. Visual Devices**

**V13 Scenic Beauty:**

<1> Present

<2> Absent

<3> Cannot code

**V14 Beautiful Characters:**

<1> Present

<2> Absent

<3> Cannot code

**V15 Ugly Characters:**

<1> Present

<2> Absent

<3> Cannot code

**V16 Graphics and Computer-generated Visuals:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V17 Surrealistic Visuals:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V18 Substantive Supers:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V19 Visual Tagline:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V20 Visual Memory Device:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V21 Language of Visual Text in the Commercial:**

<1> Urdu                              <2> English                              <3> English and Urdu Mix

**B. Auditory Devices**

**V22 Rhymes, Slogans or Mnemonic Devices:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V23 Unusual Sound Effects:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V24 Spoken Tagline:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**C. Music and Dancing**

**V25 Music in Commercial:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V26 Music as a Major Element:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V27 Music Style:**

<1> Traditional Pakistani  
<2> Contemporary Pakistani  
<3> Classical Western  
<4> Contemporary Western  
<5> Other  
<6> Not Applicable

**V28 Music Creates a Mood (versus background only):**

<1> Yes                              <2> No                              <3> Cannot code

**V29 Music is a Brand Jingle:**

<1> Yes                              <2> No                              <3> Cannot code

**V30 Dancing in Commercial:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**D. Commercial Appeals or Selling Propositions:**

**V31 What is the Dominant Commercial Appeal or Selling Proposition?**

- <1> Attributes or ingredients as main message
- <2> Product performance or benefit as main message
- <3> Psychological or subjective benefits of product ownership as main message
- <4> Product reminder as main message
- <5> Sexual appeal
- <6> Comfort appeal
- <7> Safety appeal
- <8> Enjoyment appeal
- <9> Welfare appeal
- <10> Social Approval
- <11> Self-esteem or self-image
- <12> Achievement
- <13> Excitement, sensation, variety

**E. Commercial Approach**

**V32 Rational or More Emotional Appeal:**

- <1> More Rational
- <2> More Emotional
- <3> Balance of Rational and Emotional

**V33 Brand Differentiating Message:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot Code

**F. Commercial Format**

**V34 What is the Dominant Format of the Commercial?**

- <1> Vignette
- <2> Slice of Life
- <3> Continuity of Action
- <4> Testimonial by Product User
- <5> Endorsement by Celebrity or Authority
- <6> Announcement
- <7> Demonstration of Product in Use or by Analogy
- <8> Demonstration of Results of using Product
- <9> Comedy or Satire
- <10> Animation/ Cartoon
- <11> Photographic Stills
- <12> Creation of mood or image as dominant element
- <13> Commercial written as serious drama
- <14> Fantasy, exaggeration or surrealism as dominant element
- <15> Problem and Solution (before/ after presentation)
- <16> Interview (person on the street or elsewhere)
- <17> Camera involves audience in situation

<18> New wave (product graphics)

### **G. Typology of Broadcast Commercial Messages**

#### **V35 Informational/Rational or Transformational/Emotional**

- <1> Informational
- <2> Transformational

### **H. Commercial Setting**

#### **V36 What is the dominant commercial setting?**

- <1> Indoors
- <2> Outdoors
- <3> Both indoors and outdoors
- <4> Other
- <5> No setting

#### **V37 Where is the commercial setting?**

- <1> Urban apartment/housing
- <2> Rural apartment/housing
- <3> Generic office/business setting
- <4> Generic restaurant setting
- <5> Foreign locale/landmark
- <6> Green pasture
- <7> Mountainous area
- <8> Other
- <9> Not applicable

### **I. Commercial Tone and Atmosphere**

#### **V38 What is the predominant commercial tone?**

- <1> Cute/ Adorable
- <2> Hard Sell
- <3> Warm and caring
- <4> Modern/contemporary
- <5> Wholesome/healthy
- <6> Technological/futuristic
- <7> Conservative/traditional
- <8> Old fashioned/nostalgic
- <9> Happy/fun loving
- <10> Cool/laid back
- <11> Somber/serious
- <12> Uneasy/tense/irritated
- <13> Relaxed/comfortable
- <14> Glamorous
- <15> Humorous
- <16> Suspenseful
- <17> Rough/rugged

## **J. Dominant Commercial Structure**

### **V39 What is the dominant commercial structure?**

- <1> Front end impact
- <2> Surprise or suspense in the middle
- <3> Surprise or suspense at closing
- <4> Unusual setting or situation
- <5> Humorous closing
- <6> Blind lead in
- <7> Message in the middle (doughnut)

## **K. Commercial Characters**

### **V40 Principal Character(s) Male?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V41 Principal Character(s) Female?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V42 Principal Character(s) Child or Infant?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V43 Principal Character(s) Celebrity?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V44 Principal Character(s) Actor Playing Role of Ordinary Person?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V45 Principal Character(s) Real People?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V46 Principal Character(s) Creation?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V47 Principal character(s) animal?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V48 Principal Character(s) Animated?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V49 No Principle Character(s)?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V50 Characters Identified with Company?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V51 Background Cast (people walking, etc.)?**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

### **V52 Celebrity in minor role (cameo appearance)**

- <1> Yes
- <2> No

**V53 Animal(s) in minor role**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V54 Created character or cartoon characters in minor role**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V55 Real person in minor role?**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V56 Recognized continuing character?**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V57 Presenter/Spokesperson on camera?**

<1> Voice-over only <2> Voice-over & on camera characters <3> No V/O (entire audio delivered by on-screen character)

**L. Comparisons**

**V58 Is there a direct comparison with other products?**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V59 Is there an indirect comparison with other products?**

<1> Yes <2> No

**V60 Is there puffery or unsubstantiated claims made?**

<1> Yes <2> No

**M. Representation of Culture in Commercial**

**Collectivism:**

**V61 Collective Integrity:**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V62 Interdependence:**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V63 Collective Benefits:**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V64 Collectivism:**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V65 Patriotism**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V66 Popularity:**

<1> Present <2> Absent <3> Cannot code

**V67 Succorance:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**Individualism:**

**V68 Independence:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V69 Distinctiveness:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V70 Self-sufficiency:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V71 Self-gain:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V72 Individual benefits:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V73 Beauty:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V74 Health:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V75 Individualism:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V76 Uniqueness:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**High Power Distance:**

**V77 Respect for the elderly:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V78 Social Status:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V79 Formality:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**Low Power Distance**

**V80 Humility:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V81 Economy:**  
<1> Present                    <2> Absent                    <3> Cannot code

**V82 Power Aversion:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V83 Power Equality:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V84 Casualness:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**Masculinity:**

**V85 Convenience:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V86 Competition:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V87 Effectiveness:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V88 Wealth:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V89 Work:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**Femininity:**

**V90 Courtesy:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V91 Family:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V92 Nurturance:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V93 Natural:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V94 Modesty:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V95 Enjoyment:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**High Uncertainty Avoidance:**

**V96 Safety:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V97 Technology:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V98 Tradition:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V99 Tamed:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**Low Uncertainty Avoidance:**

**V100 Adventure:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V101 Magic:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V102 Youth:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V103 Sex:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**Other Cultural Variables**

**V104 Women in Western Clothing:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

**V105 Religious Reference:**

<1> Present                      <2> Absent                      <3> Cannot code

APPENDIX B  
CODE BOOK

A. **VISUAL DEVICES**

**Scenic Beauty:** Does the commercial present striking scenes of natural beauty (mountains, flowing streams, etc.) at some point?

**Beautiful Characters:** Does the commercial present one or more strikingly beautiful people (a person is portrayed as being beautiful in the ad)?

**Ugly Characters:** Does the commercial present one or more strikingly ugly characters (a person is portrayed as being ugly in the ad)?

**Graphics and Computer-generated visuals:** Does the commercial use graphic displays or computer generated visuals as part of its presentation? Graphics can be computer-generated.

**Surrealistic Visuals:** Does the commercial present unreal visuals, distorted visuals, fantastic scenes like a watch floating through outer space or Fido Dido coming out of a bottle?

**Substantive Supers:** A superscript (words on the screen) used to reinforce some characteristic of the product or a part of the commercial message – for example, “50% stronger” or “3 out of 4 doctors recommend it.”

**Visual Tagline:** A visually presented statement of new information at the end of the commercial; for example, the screen shows the name of participating dealers or another product that was not the focus of the commercial shown. Corporate logos or slogans do not qualify (Example: “7-Up... live it up” doesn’t qualify).

**Visual Memory Device:** Any devices shown that reinforces product benefit, the product name, or the message delivered by the commercial – for example, time release capsules bouncing in the air, the word *Jello* spelled out with Jello Gelatin, the piece of sun in Polaroid commercials, etc.

**B. AUDITORY DEVICES**

**Rhymes, slogans or mnemonic devices:** Nonmusical rhymes or other mnemonics (memory aid devices) may be incorporated in lyrics of a song, but must also stand alone, apart from music – for example, “You’re in good hands with All-State.”

**Unusual Sound Effects:** Out of place, unusual, or bizarre use of sound – for example, the sound of a jackhammer as someone eats a pretzel.

**Spoken Tagline:** A statement at the end of the commercial that presents new information usually unrelated to the principal focus of the commercial – for example, “And try new lime flavor too”

**C. MUSIC AND DANCING**

**Music in Commercial:** Is music present in the commercial in any form?

**Music as a major element:** Do the lyrics or the focus of the music used in the commercial carry a product message? – for example, “have it your way...” or “I am a pepper...”?

**Music Style:** What is the music genre?

**Music Creates a Mood (versus background only):** Music contributes to the creation of a mood or emotion – for example, suspense, sensuality, etc.

**Music is a Brand Jingle:** Is the music a brand jingle?

**Dancing in Commercial:** Do cast members dance in the commercial?

**D. COMMERCIAL APPEALS OR SELLING PROPOSITIONS:**

**What is the dominant commercial appeal or selling proposition?**

***Attributes or ingredients as main message:*** A major focus of the commercial is to communicate something about how the product is made (for example, car in manufacturing) or ingredients (for example, the only toothpaste with stannous fluoride).

***Product performance or benefit as main message:*** A major focus of the commercial is to communicate what the product does (for example, shinier tub, fresher breath, whiter teeth) or how to use it.

***Psychological or subjective benefits of product ownership as main message:*** A major focus of the commercial is to communicate hidden or non-provable benefits of having/using the product - for example, "You will be more popular, sexier, or more confident."

***Product reminder as main message:*** The product or package is the primary message rather than any specific attribute or benefit of use.

***Sexual appeal:*** Main focus of commercial is on sexual cues.

***Comfort appeal:*** Main focus of commercial is on cues appealing to creature comforts (soft chairs, cool climate).

***Safety appeal:*** Main focus of commercial is on cues appealing to being free from fear or physical danger.

***Enjoyment appeal:*** Main focus of commercial is on cues about enjoying life to the fullest, having good food and drink, and so on.

***Welfare appeal:*** Main focus is on caring or providing for others - for example, gift giving.

***Social Approval:*** Main focus of commercial is on belonging, winning friends, obtaining approval of others.

***Self-esteem or self-image:*** Main focus of commercial is on feeling better about one's self, improving oneself, being a better person.

***Achievement:*** Main focus of commercial is on obtaining superiority over others, getting ahead, winning.

***Excitement, sensation, variety:*** Main focus of commercial is on adding excitement, thrills, variety to life, avoiding boredom.

## E. **COMMERCIAL APPROACH**

### **Rational or Emotional?**

***More rational:*** A fairly straightforward presentation of the product's attributes and claims.

***More emotional:*** An emotional appeal does not appeal to reason but to feelings.

***Both rational and emotional:*** An appeal counterpoising of rational and emotional.

**Brand differentiating message:** Is the principle message of the commercial unique to the product being advertised, or could any product make this claim? The commercial must make it clear that the message is unique; that is, the commercial must explicitly indicate the uniqueness or difference of the product.

## F. **COMMERCIAL FORMAT**

### **What is the dominant format of the commercial?**

***Vignettes:*** a series of two or more stories that could stand alone; no continuing storyline but several independent stories (which may convey the same message). Multiple interviews would be an example. Has no continuity of action.

***Slice of life:*** Interplay between two or more people, that portrays a conceivable real-life situation. There is continuity of action.

***Continuity of action:*** Commercial has a single storyline throughout with an obvious beginning, middle, and end; a common theme, character, or issue ties the whole commercial together from beginning to end. This may be an interview with a single individual, slice of life, or any other format that involves continuity of action.

***Testimonial by product user:*** One or more individuals recount their satisfaction with the product advertised or the results of using the product advertised – for example, Bill Cosby for Jello Pudding.

***Endorsement by celebrity or authority:*** One or more individuals (or organizations) advocates or recommends the product but does not claim personal use or satisfaction.

***Announcement:*** Commercial's format is that of a newscast or sportscast, sales announcement.

***Demonstration of product in use or by analogy:*** A demonstration of the product in use - for example, a man shaving in a commercial for shaving lather, women applying makeup. It also includes a demonstration of the use of the product, benefit, or product characteristic by an analogy or device rather than actual demonstration.

***Demonstration of results of using product:*** Demonstration of the outcome of using the product – for example, shining floors, bouncing hair.

***Comedy or satire:*** The commercial is written as a comedy, parody, or satire. Not only is humor an element of the commercial, but also the commercial is written to be funny.

***Animation/cartoon/rotoscope:*** The entire commercial or some substantial part of the commercial is animated. A rotoscope is a combination of real life and animation on the screen at the same time – for example, the fido dido and real actors.

***Photographic stills:*** The use of photographic stills in part of the commercial. These may be product shots, settings, or models.

***Creation of mood or image as dominant element:*** An attempt to create a desire for the product, without offering a specific product claim by appealing to the viewer's emotional/sensory involvement. The primary thrust of the commercial is the creation of a feeling or mood.

***Commercial written as serious drama:*** The commercial is written as a stage play, melodrama, or tragedy.

***Fantasy, exaggeration or surrealism as dominant element:*** The use of animation or other visual device instead of a realistic treatment to suspend disbelief or preclude literal translation on the part of the viewer.

***Problem and solution (before/after presentation):*** An attempt to define or show a problem, then indicate how the product eliminates or reduces the problem – for example “ring around collar.”

***Interview (person on the street or elsewhere):*** An interview (Q&A) is a primary vehicle in the commercial.

***Camera involves audience in situation:*** Use of camera as eyes of viewer. Camera creates participation in commercial.

***New wave (product graphics):*** Use of poster-like visuals, fast cuts, high symbolism as in Diet Pepsi.

## **G. TYOLOGY OF BROADCAST COMMERCIAL MESSAGES**

**Informational/Rational or Transformational/Emotional:** Is main message informational (rational or cognitive) or transformational (image, emotional or feeling)?

## H. COMMERCIAL SETTING

### What is the dominant commercial setting?

**Indoor:** Is the commercial setting, or a significant part of it, indoors or in other man-made structures (for example, a kitchen, garage, office, stadium or airplane)?

**Outdoors:** Is the commercial setting, or a significant part of it, outdoors (mountain, rivers, backyard, garden, or other natural setting)? Do not include unnatural environments such as stadium or home driveway.

**Other:** Not indoor or outdoor

**Both Indoor and Outdoor:** The commercial utilizes both indoor and outdoor settings.

**No setting:** There is no particular setting for the commercial; the setting is neutral, neither indoor nor outdoors.

## I. COMMERCIAL TONE AND ATMOSPHERE

**Choices include:** cute/adorable, hard sell, warm/caring, modern/contemporary, wholesome/healthy, technological/futuristic, conservative/traditional, old fashioned/nostalgic, happy/fun-loving, cool/laid-back, somber/serious, uneasy/tense/irritated, relaxed/comfortable, glamorous, humorous, suspenseful, and rough/rugged (*choices are mutually exclusive*)

## J. DOMINANT COMMERCIAL STRUCTURE

### What is the dominant commercial structure?

**Front-end impact:** The first 10 seconds of the commercial creates suspense, questions, surprise, drama, or something that otherwise gains attention.

**Surprise or suspense in middle of commercial:** Something surprising, dramatic, or suspenseful occurs in the middle of the commercial.

***Surprise or suspense at closing:*** Commercial ends with a surprise, an unexpected event, suspense, or drama.

***Unusual setting or situation:*** Product is in setting not normally associated with product purchase or use - for example, a car on top of a mountain, a contemporary wine in ancient Greece.

***Humorous closing:*** Commercial ends with a joke, pun, witticism, or slapstick.

***Blind lead-in:*** No identification of product until the end of the commercial.

***Message in the middle (doughnut):*** Music and/or action at the start and close of commercial with announcer copy in the middle – for example, Green Giant commercials.

#### **K. COMMERCIAL CHARACTERS**

**Principal character(s) male:** The character(s) carrying the major on-camera role of delivering the commercial message is a male. Incidental, background on-camera appearance is not applicable.

**Principal character(s) female:** The character(s) carrying the major on-camera role of delivering the commercial message is a female. Incidental, background on-camera appearance is not applicable.

**Principal character(s) child or infant:** The character(s) carrying the major on-camera role of delivering the commercial message is a child or infant. Incidental, background on-camera appearance is not applicable.

**Principal character(s) celebrity:** The character(s) delivering the major portion of the message on camera is well known either by name or face. Celebrities may be athletes, movie stars or well-known corporate figures (but not simply the identified head of a corporation).

**Principal character(s) actor playing role of ordinary person:** Must be delivering the major portion of the message.

**Principal character(s) real people:** Are one or more of the principal characters identified as real people (as opposed to actors playing a role)? This may take the form of a hidden camera or an interview.

**Principal character(s) creation:** The principal character is a created role, person, or cartoon – for example, Ronald McDonald, Pillsbury Doughboy.

**Principal character(s) animal:** Is one or more of the principal characters an animal (either real or animated)?

**Principal character(s) animated:** Is one or more of the principal characters animated (cartoon)?

**No principal character(s):** No central character or set of characters delivers a major portion of the commercial message, although there may be characters performing roles on camera relevant to the message.

**Characters identified with company:** Is one or more of the characters in the commercial symbolic of or well identified with the company manufacturing and/or distributing the product? The character may be real, created, or animated but should be identified with the company, not a specific product – for example, Keebler Elves, Green Giant.

**Background cast:** Are there people in the commercial other than the principal characters, people who serve as scenery or background – for example, people walking by, people sitting in a bar. These people are only incidental to the commercial message – that is, not active in making a product claim or demonstrating a product benefit.

**Celebrity in minor role (cameo appearance)**

**Animal(s) in minor role**

**Created character or cartoon characters in minor role**

**Real person in minor role:** May be actual consumers (specifically identified) or employees

**Recognized continuing character:** Is one or more of the principal or minor characters in the commercial recognized as a part of a continuing advertising campaign? Is the character associated with the product by virtue of previous appearances in commercials for the product?

**Presenter/spokesperson on camera:** Is the audio portion of the commercial message delivered by voice-over announcer (person not on camera), character(s) on camera, or a combination of both?

**L. COMPARISONS**

**Is there a direct comparison with other products?:** A competitor is identified by name. May also be a direct comparison with an old version of the product being advertised.

**Is there an indirect comparison with other products?:** A comparison is made between the advertised product and a competitor, but the competitor is not named.

**Is there puffery, or unsubstantiated claims made?:** Product is declared best, better, finest without identification of dimension or attribute.

**M. CULTURAL ANALYSIS:**

**Collectivism:**

**Collective Integrity:** Appeals about the integrity of or belonging to a family or social groups (e.g. “Your family’s respect is important to you...”)

**Interdependence:** Reflection of interdependent relationship with others (activities in groups, amongst circle of friends and families)

**Collective Benefits:** Emphasis on the benefits of the product or service to families or social groups

**Collectivism:** The emphasis here is on the individual in relation to others, typically in the reference group. Individuals are depicted as integral parts of the group

**Patriotism:** The love and loyalty to one's own nation inherent in the nature or in the use of a product are suggested here

**Popularity:** The focus here is on the universal recognition and acceptance of a certain product by consumers, e.g.: 'Bestseller'; Well-known worldwide'

**Succorance:** Emphasis on exchanging expressions of love (all except sexuality), gratitude, pat on the back

**Individualism:**

**Independence:** Appeals about the individuality or independence of the audience

**Distinctiveness:** Emphasis on uniqueness or originality (featuring a person enjoying being unique, standing out from the crowd, speaking one's mind)

**Self-sufficiency:** Reflections of self-reliance, hedonism or competition (featuring a person doing something by oneself)

**Self-gain:** Emphasis on self-fulfillment, self-development or self-realization of an individual

**Individual benefits:** Emphasis on the benefits to an individual consumer

**Beauty:** This suggests that the use of a product will enhance the loveliness, attractiveness or elegance of an individual

**Health:** This value commends that the use of a product will enhance or improve the vitality, soundness, and robustness of the body

**Individualism:** The emphasis here is on the self-sufficiency and self-reliance of an individual or on the individual as being distinct and unlike others

**Uniqueness:** The incomparable, unrivaled, and unparalleled nature of a product is emphasized, e.g. “We are the only one that offers you this product”.

**High Power Distance:**

**Respect for the elderly:** The commercial displays a respect for older people by using a model of old age or asking the opinions, recommendations and advice of the elders (seniors means: teachers, elders (family), higher employees, higher social class, higher education class, juniors look up to seniors for directions)

**Social Status:** The use of a product is claimed to be able to elevate the position or rank of the user in the eyes of others. The idea of prestige, trend-setting, status symbol and pride in the use of a product is conveyed

**Formality:** Style of speech is formal (use of respectful titles for seniors, husbands – wives would refer to them as ‘aap’, a more respectful way of saying ‘you’).

**Low Power Distance**

**Humility:** Emphasis on being unaffected, simple, patient, fate-accepting, resigned, down-to-earth

**Economy:** The inexpensive, affordable and cost-saving nature of a product is emphasized in the commercial

**Power Aversion:** Negative attitude towards status symbols and privileges

**Power Equality:** Equality with juniors (juniors means: students, children, younger siblings, subordinates, lower social class, lower education class)

**Casualness:** Casual and laid-back style of speech (refers to style of conversation as well as informal titles for seniors, husbands, etc.)

**Masculinity:**

**Convenience:** Emphasis on a product being handy and easy and/or quick to use

**Competition:** The emphasis here is on distinguishing a product from its counterparts by aggressive comparisons. While explicit comparisons may mention the competitor's name, implicit comparisons may use words such as 'number one' and 'leader'

**Effectiveness:** A product is suggested to be powerful and capable of achieving certain ends (e.g. cooking oil makes food tasty, clothes are comfortable)

**Wealth:** This conveys the idea that being affluent, prosperous and rich should be encouraged and suggests that a certain product or service will make the user well-off

**Work:** This value shows respect for diligence and dedication of one's labor and skills. A typical example is that a medication has regained a patient his or her ability to work

**Femininity:**

**Courtesy:** Politeness and friendship towards the consumer is shown through the use of polished and affable language

**Family:** The emphasis here is on family life and family members. The commercials stresses family scenes, getting married, companionship of siblings, kinship, being at home, and suggests that a certain product is good for the whole family

**Nurturance:** This stresses giving charity, help, protection, support, or sympathy to the weak, disabled, young and elderly.

**Natural:** Appeals about the freshness of product; reference to fruits and vegetables, farming, purity of product, organically grown, nutrition of product

**Modesty:** Showing characters being modest, shy, virtuous, naïve, innocent, inhibited

**Enjoyment:** This value suggests that a product will make a user wild with joy

**High Uncertainty Avoidance:**

**Safety:** The reliable and secure nature of a product is stressed

**Technology:** Here, the advanced and sophisticated technical skills to engineer and manufacture a certain product are emphasized

**Tradition:** The experience of the past, customs and conventions are respected. The qualities of being historical, time-honored, and legendary are venerated, e.g. “With 80 years of manufacturing experience” or “It has been adapted from ancient prescriptions”.

**Tamed:** Emphasis on the faithfulness, reliability, responsibility in attitude, sacrificing and domesticated attributes of character(s)

**Low Uncertainty Avoidance:**

**Adventure:** This suggests boldness, daring, bravery, courage or thrill

**Magic:** The emphasis here is on the miraculous effect and nature of a product, e.g. “Bewitch your man...” or “... heals like magic”.

**Youth:** The worship of the younger generation is shown through the depiction of younger models. The rejuvenating benefits of the brand are emphasized, e.g. “feel young again”.

**Sex:** The commercial uses glamorous and sensual models or has a background of lovers holding hands, embracing or kissing to promote a product

**Other Cultural Variables:**

**Women in Western Clothing:** The commercial portrays women in Western clothing

**Religious Reference:** The commercial makes any references to religion, religious events, symbols, etc.

## LIST OF REFERENCES

- Ahmed, N. (1996). *Cross-cultural content analysis of advertising from the United States and India*. Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern Mississippi, 1996. Retrieved November 17, 2006, from [www.dissertation.com/library/1120842a.htm](http://www.dissertation.com/library/1120842a.htm).
- Alam, S. A. (2005, March 12). Branding Pakistan. *The Nation*. Retrieved September 10, 2007, from <http://www.aopp.org/branding.htm>.
- Al-Olayan, F. S., & Karande, K. (2000). A content analysis of magazine advertisements from the United States and the Arab World. *Journal of Advertising*, 29(3), 69-82.
- Background Notes: Pakistan. (2007). US Department of State. Retrieved July 15, 2007, from <http://www.state.gov/r/pa/ei/bgn/3453.htm>.
- Baig, M. A. (2007a). Perspective on creative. *Aurora*, 10(3), 33.
- Baig, M. A. (2007b). Interview with Michael Maedel, President JWT International. *Aurora*, 10(2), 16.
- Baker, A. (2006, October 16). No dates, no dancing. *Time*, 168(16), 53-54.
- Boddewyn, J. J., Soehl, R., & Picard J. (1986). Standardization in international marketing: Is Ted Levitt in fact right? *Business Horizons*, 29(6), 69-75.
- Business News. (2006, April 17). *The Nation*. Retrieved September 15, 2007, from <http://www.nation.com.pk/daily/april-2006/17/bnews3.php>.
- Business Recorder. (2007). Advertising and Media Industry in Pakistan. Retrieved October 11, 2007, from <http://premium.hoovers.com>.
- Busch, C., De Maret, P. S, Flynn, T., Kellum, R., Le, S., Meyers, B., Saunders, M., White, R., & Palmquist, M. (2005). *Content analysis: Writing@CSU*. Colorado State University Department of English. Retrieved October 15, 2007, from <http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/research/content/>.
- Country Profile: Pakistan. (2005). Library of Congress. Retrieved July 15, 2007, from <http://lcweb2.loc.gov/frd/cs/profiles/Pakistan.pdf>.
- Cyber City Online. (2004). Media in Pakistan. Retrieved June 29, 2007, from <http://www.cybercity-online.net/yp/html/media.html>.
- Cheng, H. (1994). Reflections of cultural values: A content analysis of Chinese magazine advertisements from 1982 and 1992. *International Journal of Advertising*, 13(2), 167-183.
- Cheng, H. (1998). Towards an understanding of cultural values manifest in advertising: A content analysis of Chinese television commercials in 1990 and 1995. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 74(4), 773-796.

- Cheng, H., & Schweitzer, J. C. (1996). Cultural values reflected in US and Chinese television commercials. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 36(3), 27-45.
- Cho, B., Kwon, U., Gentry, J. W., Jun, S., & Kropp, F. (1999). Cultural values reflected in theme and execution: A comparative study of U.S. and Korean television commercials. *Journal of Advertising*, 28(4), 59-73.
- Cueto, E. P. (2006). *Characteristics of Florida's Hispanic advertising: A content analysis of current advertisements airing on Florida's Spanish language television*. Master's Thesis, University of Florida. Department of Journalism and Communications. Retrieved October 17, 2007, from <http://purl.fcla.edu.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/fcla/etd/UFE0013401>.
- Daily Times. (2006, October 19). PEMRA issues first Seraiki TV license. Retrieved November 11, 2006, from [http://dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2006%5C10%5C19%5Cstory\\_19-10-2006\\_pg11\\_4](http://dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2006%5C10%5C19%5Cstory_19-10-2006_pg11_4).
- De Mooij, M. (2004). *Consumer behavior and culture: Consequences for global marketing and advertising*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Defining the Past, Braving the Future. (2005, June). *Synergizer*, 3(2), 28-29.
- Dixit, Y. (2005). *Indian award-winning advertisements: A content analysis*. Master's Thesis, University of Florida. Department of Journalism and Communications. Retrieved March 12, 2006, from <http://purl.fcla.edu.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/fcla/etd/UFE0010281>.
- Douglas, S. P., & Urban, C. D. (1977). Lifestyle analysis to profile women in international markets. *Journal of Marketing*, 41(3), 46-54.
- Economist. (2006). The future looks bearded. *Business Source Premier*, (380/8485), Retrieved November 18, 2006, from <http://web.ebscohost.com.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/ehost/detail?vid=15&hid=103&sid=fdcac9e9-30d1-4ea2-8aca-b951e34302e7%40sessionmgr104>.
- Euromonitor International. (2007a, February). Soft Drinks in Pakistan. Retrieved September 11, 2007, from [http://www.euromonitor.com/Soft\\_Drinks\\_in\\_Pakistan](http://www.euromonitor.com/Soft_Drinks_in_Pakistan).
- Euromonitor International. (2007b, February). Hot Drinks in Pakistan. Retrieved September 11, 2007, from [http://www.euromonitor.com/Hot\\_Drinks\\_in\\_Pakistan](http://www.euromonitor.com/Hot_Drinks_in_Pakistan).
- Faizi, S. N. (2007). The Pirate Alternative. *Synergizer*, 4(Annual), 47.
- Fatah, S. (2005, September). The Geography of Geo. *Himal South-Asian*. Retrieved June 29, 2006, from [http://www.himalmag.com/2005/september/special\\_report\\_1.html](http://www.himalmag.com/2005/september/special_report_1.html).
- Gagnard, A. & Morris, J. R. (1988). Clio commercials from 1975-1985: Analysis of 151 executional variables. *Journalism Quarterly*, 65(4), 859-868.

- Ghauri, I. (2006, July 28). EFA global monitoring report 2006 launched. *Daily Times*. Retrieved May 15, 2007, from [http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2006%5C07%5C28%5Cstory\\_28-7-2006\\_pg11\\_1](http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2006%5C07%5C28%5Cstory_28-7-2006_pg11_1).
- Government of Pakistan. (2007). *Pakistan economic survey 2006-2007*. Islamabad: Ministry of Finance.
- Gregory, G. D., & Munch, J. M. (1997). Cultural values in international advertising: An examination of familial norms and roles in Mexico. *Psychology and Marketing*, 14(2), 99-119.
- Hall, E. T. (1981). *Beyond culture*. Garden City, NY: Anchor Press/Doubleday.
- Hamid, M. (2004, July). Reinventing Pakistan. *Smithsonian*, 35(4), 80-95.
- Han, S. and Shavitt, S. (1994). Persuasion and culture: Advertising appeals in individualistic and collectivistic societies. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 30, 326-350.
- Hashmi, S. F. (2007). The legacy of a pirate's mindset. *Synergizer*. 4(Annual), 10-11.
- Hoffman, D. & Rehmat, A. (2007, May 25). The revolution will be televised. *Internews*. Retrieved October 2, 2007, from [http://www.internews.org/articles/2007/20070525\\_internews\\_pakistan.shtm](http://www.internews.org/articles/2007/20070525_internews_pakistan.shtm).
- Hofstede, G. (1994). *Culture and organizations: Software of the mind* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). London: HarpersCollins Publishers
- Hofstede, G. J., Pederson, P.B., & Hofstede, G. (2002). Exploring culture: Exercises, stories and synthetic cultures. Retrieved May 15, 2006, from [http://library.books24x7.com.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/book/id\\_6723/toc.asp?bookid=6723](http://library.books24x7.com.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/book/id_6723/toc.asp?bookid=6723)
- Interview with the Head of Sales and Marketing of PTV. (2005, June). *Synergizer*, 3(2), 22.
- Hsu, Y. H. (2005). *Blending East and West: A content analysis of Taiwanese award-winning commercials from 1998 to 2003*. Master's Thesis, University of Florida. College of Journalism and Communications. Retrieved March 15, 2007, from <http://purl.fcla.edu.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/fcla/etd/UFE0010830>.
- Irshad, S. (2003, December 1). Food to relish. *Suite101.Com*. Retrieved June 15, 2006, from [http://www.suite101.com/article.cfm/pakistan\\_culture/104807](http://www.suite101.com/article.cfm/pakistan_culture/104807)
- ITIM International. (2003). Geert Hofstede cultural dimensions. Retrieved on: November 18, 2006, from <http://www.geert-hofstede.com>.
- Javalgi, R., Cutler, B. D. & White, D. S. (1994). Print advertising in the Pacific Basin: An empirical investigation. *International Marketing Review*, 11(6), 48-64.

- Kalliny, M., & Gentry, L. (2007). Cultural values reflected in Arab and American television advertising. *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 29(1), 15-32.
- Kassarjian, H. H. (1977). Content analysis in consumer research. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 4(2), 8-18.
- Khan, S. T. (2006, March 23). As spicy as it gets. *Gulf News Special Report: Pakistan*, 13-14.
- Kluckhohn, F. R. & Strodtbeck, F. L. (1961). *Variations in value orientations*. Elmsford, NY: Row, Peterson Company.
- Kover, J. A., James, W. L., & Sonner, B. S. (1997). To whom do advertising creatives write? An inferential answer. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 37(1), 41-53.
- Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications Inc.
- Mandviwalla, R. (2007). Jingles sell, jingle sells... Jingle all the way. *Synergizer*, 4(Annual), 21.
- Marketing Association of Pakistan. (2005). Ahmed Kapadia looks ahead. Retrieved September 15, 2007, from [http://www.map.org.pk/review/0205/ak\\_interview.htm](http://www.map.org.pk/review/0205/ak_interview.htm).
- Marshall, Steve. (2006). Advertising message strategies and executional devices in television commercials from award-winning "effective" campaigns from 1999-2004. Doctoral dissertation, University of Florida, College of Journalism and Communications.
- BrainyQuote. (2007). Marshall McLuhan Quotes. Retrieved June 15, 2007, from <http://www.brainyquote.com/quotes/quotes/m/marshallmc103149.html>.
- Menen, R. (2006, March 23). Top performers on the world stage. *Gulf News Special Report: Pakistan*, 4-5.
- Milner, L., & Collins, J. M. (2000). Sex-role portrayals and the gender of nations. *Journal of Advertising*, 29(1), 67-79.
- Mohsin, U. (2005, July-August). The rural market road-show. *Aurora*, 8(4), 14.
- Mueller, B. (1987). Reflections of culture: An analysis of Japanese and American advertising appeals. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 27(3), 51-59.
- Mueller, B. (2004). *Dynamics of international advertising: Theoretical and practical perspectives*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc.
- Mumtaz, K., Mitha, Y., & Tahira, B. (2003). *Pakistan: The background, the issues, the people*. Oxford: Oxfam GB.
- Orient Advertisers (Pvt.) Ltd. (1988). *Pakistan advertising scene 88*. Karachi: Marketing Research Department.

- Pakistan Food. (n.d.). *SAARCTourism.org*. Retrieved October 1, 2007, from <http://pakistan.saarctourism.org/pakistan-food.html>.
- Pak Tribune. (2005, June 27). Abby advertising award honors Imran Ashraf. Retrieved September 28, 2007, from <http://www.paktribune.com/ezone/newsdetails.php?id=110752>.
- Paracha, F. N. (2005). A whiter shade of green. Retrieved November 10, 2006, from [http://www.chowk.com/show\\_article.cgi?aid=00005522&channel=chaathouse](http://www.chowk.com/show_article.cgi?aid=00005522&channel=chaathouse).
- Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring the cultural values manifest in advertising. *Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 6(1), 72-92.
- Pollay, R. W. (1986, April). The distorted mirror: Reflections on the unintended consequences of advertising. *Journal of Marketing*, 50, 18-36.
- Qureshi, S. (2005, June). The television religion. *Synergizer*, 3(2), 18.
- Senkova, N. A. (2005). *Advertising message strategy in russian award-winning commercials*. Master's Thesis, University of Florida, College of Journalism and Communications. Retrieved March 15, 2007, from <http://purl.fcla.edu.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/fcla/etd/UFE0010444>.
- Shim, S. W. (2002). *Advertising appeals and culture: The difference between culturally congruent and culturally deviant individuals in Korea*. Doctoral dissertation, University of Florida, College of Journalism and Communications. *Dissertations Abstracts International – A*, 63/10, 3409.
- Shuja, S. (2005). Pervez Musharraf: The emerging leader of the Muslim world? Retrieved September 30, 2007, from [http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi\\_m2242/is\\_1669\\_286/ai\\_n13661903](http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m2242/is_1669_286/ai_n13661903).
- Singh, N. (2004). From cultural models to cultural categories: A framework for cultural analysis. *Journal of American Academy of Business, Cambridge*, 5(1/2), 95-101.
- Singh, N., & Baack, D. W. (2004). Web site adaptation: A cross-cultural comparison of U.S. and Mexican web sites. *Journal of Computer-mediated Communication*, 9(4). Retrieved May 15, 2007, from [http://jcmc.indiana.edu/vol9/issue4/singh\\_baack.html](http://jcmc.indiana.edu/vol9/issue4/singh_baack.html).
- Stewart, D. W., & Furse, D. H. (1986). *Effective television advertising: A study of 1000 commercials*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- Swaidan, Z., & Hayes, L. A. (2005). Hofstede theory and cross cultural ethics conceptualization, review, and research agenda. *Journal of American Academy of Business, Cambridge*, 6(2), 10-15.
- Tadepalli, R., Moreno, A., & Trevino, S. (1999). Do American and Mexican purchasing managers perceive ethical situations differently? *Industrial Marketing Management*, 28(4), 369-380.

- Televisión Mania. (2005, June). *Synergizer*, 3(2), 5-9.
- The News (2007, September 30). Musharraf tells madrassahs to stop promoting militancy. Retrieved September 30, 2007, from [http://www.thenews.com.pk/top\\_story\\_detail.asp?Id=6282](http://www.thenews.com.pk/top_story_detail.asp?Id=6282).
- Trompenaars, F. (1994). *Riding the waves of culture: Understanding cultural diversity in business*. New York, NY: Irwin Professional Publishing.
- Tse, D. K., Belk, R. W. & Zhou, N. (1989). Becoming a consumer society: A longitudinal and cross-cultural content analysis of print ads from Hong Kong, the People's Republic of China, and Taiwan. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 15(4), 457-472.
- Wah, L. C. (2005). Cultural influences in television commercials: A study of Singapore and Malaysia. *Journal of Promotion Management*, 12(1), 57-84.
- Warner, M. (Ed). (2003). *Culture and management in Asia*. London: RoutledgeCurzon.
- Watson, J., Lysonski, S., Gillan, T. & Raymore, L. (2002). Cultural values and important possessions: A cross-cultural analysis. *Journal of Business Research*, 55, 923-931.
- WPP. (2007). O&M moves into Pakistan. Retrieved July 23, 2007, from <http://www.wpp.com/WPP/Press/Press/Default.htm?guid=%7B92499178-DD9E-41F1-A109-9071AE7A4F22%7D>.
- Yeh, R., & Lawrence, J. J. (1995). Individualism and Confucian dynamism: A note on Hofstede's cultural root to economic growth. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 26(3), 655-669.
- Zhang, Y., & Gelb, B. D. (1996). Matching advertising appeals to culture: The influence of products' use conditions. *Journal of Advertising*, 25(3), 29-46

## BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Irtifa Nasir is a Fulbright Scholar from Pakistan. She earned her high school degree from Abu Dhabi, UAE, and her B.S. in mathematics from Lahore, Pakistan. After completing her bachelor's, she spent 2 years working in small to medium sized advertising agencies in copywriting and creative management positions. After graduating with a master's degree in advertising, she plans to return to Pakistan and pursue a career in account/strategic planning or creative management.