PRESERVING THE LEGACY
THE HOTEL PONCE DE LEON AND FLAGLER COLLEGE

By

LESLEE F. KEYS

A DISSERTATION PRESENTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
OF THE UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA
2013
To my maternal grandmother Lola Smith Oldham, independent, forthright and strong, who gave love, guidance and support to her eight grandchildren helping them to pursue their dreams.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My sincere appreciation is extended to my supervisory committee for their energy, encouragement, and enthusiasm: from the College of Design, Construction and Planning, committee chair Christopher Silver, Ph.D., FAICP, Dean; committee co-chair Roy Eugene Graham, FAIA, Beinecke-Reeves Distinguished Professor; and Herschel Shepard, FAIA, Professor Emeritus, Department of Architecture. Also, thanks are extended to external committee members Kathleen Deagan, Ph.D., Distinguished Research Professor Emeritus of Anthropology, Florida Museum of Natural History and John Nemmers, Archivist, Smathers Libraries. Your support and encouragement inspired this effort.

I am grateful to Flagler College and especially to William T. Abare, Jr., Ed.D., President, who championed my endeavor and aided me in this pursuit; to Michael Gallen, Library Director, who indulged my unusual schedule and persistent requests; and to Peggy Dyess, his Administrative Assistant, who graciously secured hundreds of resources for me and remained enthusiastic over my progress.

Thank you to my family, who increased in number over the years of this project, were surprised, supportive, and sources of much-needed interruptions: Evan and Tiffany Machnic and precocious grandsons Payton and Camden; Ethan Machnic and Erica Seery; Lyndon Keys, Debbie Schmidt, and Ashley Keys. Most importantly, heartfelt gratitude and affection to Thomas McDonald, my cherished friend, partner, and confidante, who listened patiently when I rambled with new information, motivated me through the challenges along the way, and accompanied me on excursions to discover many of the people, places and settings that enriched this effort.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.................................................................................................................. 4

LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................................... 9

ABSTRACT....................................................................................................................................... 13

CHAPTER

1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................... 15

   Background ................................................................................................................................. 17
   Structure of the Study ................................................................................................................. 26

2 METHODOLOGY ......................................................................................................................... 29

   Use of a Case Study Approach for Historic Preservation Topics ........................................... 31
   Documenting the Hotel Ponce de Leon ..................................................................................... 39

3 THE HOTEL PONCE DE LEON IN CONTEXT THE PRESERVATION
   MOVEMENT AT THE NATIONAL, REGIONAL, STATE, AND LOCAL LEVELS... 46

   Early Private Historic Preservation Efforts in the United States ........................................... 47
   United States Historic Preservation Legislation and Policy ..................................................... 54
      Antiquities Act of 1906 .......................................................................................................... 55
      Historic Sites Act of 1935 .................................................................................................... 56
      National Trust for Historic Preservation ............................................................................. 58
      National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 and Related Federal Legislation ................... 60
      Federal Laws Addressing Archaeological and Maritime Resources .................................... 63
      Financial Incentives for Historic Preservation ..................................................................... 64
   Preservation and Planning in the South ..................................................................................... 66
   The State of Florida’s Early Historic Preservation Commitment ............................................ 68
   The State of Florida’s Later Historic Preservation Commitment ........................................... 70
   Historic Preservation and the City of St. Augustine ................................................................. 72

4 EARLY HISTORIC PRESERVATION EFFORTS IN ST. AUGUSTINE .................. 75

   St. Augustine Historical Restoration Program ................................................................. 82
      Additional Mid-20th Century Initiatives in St. Augustine .................................................... 89
   St. Augustine Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission .................................... 92
   The Quadricentennial Anniversary and the Restoration ....................................................... 98
   St. Augustine Restoration Foundation, Inc............................................................................... 113
   St. Augustine Preservation Efforts after the Quadricentennial Anniversary ....................... 118
5 CREATING A PALACE IN PARADISE THE MEN WHO MENTORED A MASTERPIECE ................................................................. 123

Henry Flagler in Florida .......................................................................................................................... 131
The Architects, Artisans and Inventors ................................................................................................. 134
  John Merven Carrère and Thomas Hastings, Jr. ............................................................................. 135
  Bernard Maybeck ............................................................................................................................. 141
  Emmanuel Masqueray ....................................................................................................................... 147
  James McGuire and Joseph McDonald ............................................................................................. 149
  William Kennish .............................................................................................................................. 151
  Louis Comfort Tiffany ......................................................................................................................... 152
  Maitland Armstrong ......................................................................................................................... 156
  Thomas Edison ................................................................................................................................. 158
  George Willoughby Maynard .......................................................................................................... 161
  Herman Schladermundt ..................................................................................................................... 163
  Virgilio Tojetti ................................................................................................................................. 164
  Auguste Pottier and William Stymus ................................................................................................. 167

6 “THE MODERN WONDER OF THE ANCIENT CITY” HENRY FLAGLER’S HOTEL PONCE DE LEON .......................................................... 170

Pioneering Use of Materials ............................................................................................................... 172
“An American Palace” ......................................................................................................................... 181
Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................... 195

7 A SPANISH RENAISSANCE PALACE IN A SPANISH COLONIAL PARADISE .. 197

Artists, Authors, and Entertainers .................................................................................................... 207
  Martin Johnson Heade and the Artists’ Studios .............................................................................. 208
  William Henry Jackson and Thomas Moran .................................................................................. 210
  Helena Modjeska and the Shakespearian Heroines ....................................................................... 212
  Writers ........................................................................................................................................... 212
  Entertainers ................................................................................................................................... 214
Sports at Flagler’s Hotels ..................................................................................................................... 216
Ponce Serves as Home Field to the Cuban Giants ........................................................................... 220
Discerning Clientele ........................................................................................................................... 222
The Hotel Ponce de Leon on the Eve of the 20th Century ............................................................ 226
A New Century and a New Role for the Hotel Ponce de Leon ...................................................... 229
John D. Rockefeller Returns to Florida .............................................................................................. 231
The Roaring 20s, Roads, and a Reprieve for a Gilded Age Hotel .................................................... 232
Decline of Tourism and Travel .......................................................................................................... 233
Training the Military: The Ponce as Founding Home for the Coast Guard Reserve ..................... 236
The Final Chapter for a Grand Hotel ................................................................................................. 240
Imitation is … Flattery: The Influence of the Hotel Ponce de Leon .............................................. 247
  Flagler House ............................................................................................................................... 248
  Flagler Hotel ............................................................................................................................... 249
Copper Queen .......................................................... 250
White Mountains Hotels ........................................... 251
Henry Flagler’s Impact on Florida ................................ 253
Resort and Transport Business Partners Henry Flagler and Henry Plant ...... 255
Key West Extension – International Transportation Links for Flagler’s Resorts .......................................................... 258

8 PRESERVING A PALACE IN PARADISE ........................................ 260
Ponce de Leon Hall .................................................. 263
Rehabilitation of Ponce de Leon Hall.............................. 267
Kenan Hall ................................................................... 270
Grand Parlor .................................................................. 273
Executive Wing .......................................................... 276
Ponce Hall Facilities .................................................... 277
Flagler College Restoration Campaign .......................... 279
Dining Hall ............................................................... 280
Rotunda ...................................................................... 297
Continuing Preservation Efforts ...................................... 304
Perimeter Wall .......................................................... 304
Courtyard ..................................................................... 306
Ponce de Leon Hall .................................................... 307
Edison Boiler Building and Artists’ Studios ...................... 310
Solarium ..................................................................... 313

9 A MOST BEAUTIFUL COLLEGE CAMPUS .................................... 319
Historic Campus Facilities ........................................... 323
Markland House ....................................................... 323
Lewis House Planned Unit Development ........................ 326
Union Generals’ House ............................................... 327
Thompson Hall .......................................................... 329
Wiley Hall ................................................................... 332
Markland Cottage ....................................................... 334
Palm Cottage ............................................................. 336
Anderson Cottage ....................................................... 337
Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings ...... 339
65 and 66 Cuna Street ................................................ 340
New Campus Facilities ............................................... 341
Commitment to Historic Preservation .......................... 342
Research for Ensuring Authenticity and Accuracy ......... 346
Fundraising as a Component of Accuracy ..................... 348

10 CONCLUSION ................................................................. 352
APPENDIX

A  FLAGLER COLLEGE RESTORATION CAMPAIGN ............................................. 363
B  FLAGLER COLLEGE PUBLIC GRANTS AND RECOGNITION ........................... 365
C  HISTORIC ST. AUGUSTINE PRESERVATION BOARD MEMBERS AND TERMS .................................................................................................................. 367

LIST OF REFERENCES .......................................................................................... 369

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH .................................................................................... 426
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td>Alligator Border Florida Hotel Ponce de Leon, St. Augustine, Florida</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Exterior view facing north from the Lightner Building Tower</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, St. Johns County, Florida</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-3</td>
<td>Municipal dock, Bridge of Lions, and the Atlantic Ocean</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>The Old City Gate, St. Augustine</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td>Fatio House, St. Augustine, St. Johns County, Florida</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-3</td>
<td>Casa del Hidalgo when it was newly constructed in 1965</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-4</td>
<td>LBJ at St. Augustine 1963</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>Ambassador Andrew Young donating Civil Rights Archive, Flagler College</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-1</td>
<td>Ponce [de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla.]</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-2</td>
<td>Ponce de Leon Day Celebration, 1885</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-3</td>
<td>View of dining room, facing south - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla &amp; Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-4</td>
<td>The City of Ivory</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-5</td>
<td>Carrere and Hastings: 381 Hotel Ponce de Leon, St. Augustine, Fla. Elevation, E. L. Masqueray, Draughtsman</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-6</td>
<td>Photocopy of an old, undated photograph (original in files of Hotel Ponce de Leon) construction of dining room rotunda - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla &amp; Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-7</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon, construction of corner towers</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>Parlors of the Ponce de Leon</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-9</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon Dining Room</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-10</td>
<td>“The Ponce de Leon, rear view”</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-11</td>
<td>“The View of the Ponce de Leon”</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-12</td>
<td>Ponce de Leon Hall Dining Hall</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5-13 Tojetti Frescoes in the Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, FLA ..................... 165
6-1 Court of the Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla ........................................ 170
6-2 Copper flashing, Hotel Ponce de Leon ............................................................... 177
6-3 Presbyterian Memorial [i.e. Flagler Memorial Presbyterian] Church, St. Augustine ....................................................................................................................... 179
6-4 Exterior view looking north from gate - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla & Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL ..................... 181
6-5 The west tower of the Hotel Ponce de Leon Hotel .............................................. 183
6-6 Parlors of the Ponce de Leon Hotel ................................................................. 187
6-7 Entrance to the Dining Room, Hotel Ponce de Leon, Flagler College ..................... 189
7-1 Concert Hour, Court of Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla ....................... 197
7-2 Florida Sub-Tropical Exposition, Jacksonville, Florida ....................................... 201
7-3 Movie Making at the Hotel Ponce de Leon, St. Augustine, Florida ...................... 207
7-4 Giant Magnolias on a Blue Velvet Cloth ............................................................... 208
7-5 Standard Oil trustee Henry H. Rogers and his close friend Mark Twain .............. 213
7-6 Band assembled on the veranda at the Ponce de Leon Hotel – Saint Augustine, Florida .................................................................................................................. 214
7-7 People Playing Golf by Fort Marion, St. Augustine, Florida (1902) .................... 219
7-8 1887 Cuban Giants ............................................................................................... 220
7-9 Telegram from Alexander Graham Bell to Mabel Hubbard Bell, March 29, 1889 ...................................................................................................................... 225
7-10 Florida State Building. World’s Columbian Exposition. 1896 ......................... 227
7-11 Joseph P. Kennedy, Sr. with sons Joseph P. Kennedy, Jr. (left) and John F. Kennedy (right). Palm Beach, Florida, 1931 ................................................................. 233
7-12 George Zaharias, Babe Didrickson Zaharias and her poodle at St. Augustine when she was U.S. and British Amateur Champion, 1947 ......................... 235
7-13 SPARs at Ponce Hotel, U.S. Coast Guard ........................................................... 237
7-14 Jacob Lawrence in his Coast Guard uniform ...................................................... 239
7-15  This Will Hurt Me More Than Its Hurts You, Route 66 television episode ........ 240
7-16  Group Portrait at St. Augustine’s Easter Celebration – Saint Augustine, Florida, ......................................................................................................................... 243
7-17  “Flagler House” John Conway, Sullivan County Historian.............................. 248
7-18  The Flagler Hotel and Country Club, So. Fallsburg, N.Y.............................. 249
7-19  Copper Queen Hotel ..................................................................................... 250
7-20  Mount Pleasant House .................................................................................. 251
7-21  The Mount Washington Hotel, Bretton Woods, New Hampshire.............. 252
8-1   Aerial Photo of Ponce de Leon Hall, Flagler College .................................... 261
8-2   Coast Guard building on West Lawn - Art Department ................................. 264
8-3   Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor, Flagler College ....................... 265
8-4   Kenan Hall ..................................................................................................... 271
8-5   Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor .................................................. 274
8-6   Ponce de Leon Hall ....................................................................................... 297
8-7   Evidence of Hurricane Ivan ........................................................................... 307
8-8   Artists’ Studios Building ................................................................................ 310
8-9   On the roof of the Ponce de Leon ................................................................. 313
8-10  Hotel Ponce de Leon Cross Section ............................................................. 314
8-11  Flagler College 400 Rotunda ........................................................................ 315
9-1   Ponce de Leon Hall, Flagler College ............................................................ 320
9-2   Juan Ponce de Leon (Chad Light) Florida Gov. Rick Scott, Cabinet Members and Ketterlinus Students ................................................................. 321
9-3   Markland (Dr. Andrew Anderson House), n.d. [ca. 1978] ............................ 323
9-4   Union Generals’ House, Flagler College ...................................................... 327
9-5   Ponce de Leon Cottage/Thompson Hall ....................................................... 330
9-6   Casa Amarylla/Wiley Hall ............................................................................. 332
9-7  Billiard Building/Markland Cottage ................................................................. 334
9-8  Power House/Palm Cottage ................................................................................ 337
9-9  Anderson Cottage/Crisp-Ellert House ................................................................ 337
9-10 Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings, Flagler College .......... 339
9-11 Dr. William L. Proctor Library ............................................................................. 342
9-12 Hanke Hall ......................................................................................................... 346
Henry Flagler’s opulent Hotel Ponce de Leon, now Ponce de Leon Hall and centerpiece of the Flagler College campus, dominates the St. Augustine, Florida, skyline. Thanks to the College’s commitment, the Hotel stands in a high state of preservation. Correspondingly, Flagler College boasts a campus recognized for architectural uniqueness and aesthetic beauty due to the former Hotel’s commanding role anchoring a campus showcasing historic buildings.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon enjoyed worldwide attention at the time of the opening in 1888 and sustained success through the first four decades, declining slowly over the next four. The founding of Flagler College in 1968 on the heels of St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary commemoration in 1965 and adoption of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 launched preservation of the Hotel and companion buildings.

In 1968, with assistance from Henry Flagler’s heirs, Flagler College was founded. The Hotel Ponce de Leon, a complex of five interconnected buildings, served as the principal campus facility. In the years since then, Flagler College has invested upwards
of $60 million in preservation of Ponce de Leon Hall and campus historic buildings, becoming a national leader in historic preservation.

The year 2013 marked the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s 125th anniversary and the 500th anniversary of the discovery of Florida by Spanish explorer Juan Ponce de Leon. Also, the year marked completion of a preservation effort initiated in 1971 to enable full use of the former hotel. The building is remarkable architecturally, yet simultaneously challenging for use due to its size, scale and complexity of construction—making the building’s preservation more significant.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon’s transformation into an academic building led the College to include additional historic buildings in its preservation commitment. The College’s heightened academic stature parallels the institution’s increased commitment to preservation of the campus.

Beyond Flagler College’s use of historic buildings, preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon influenced efforts in St. Augustine and throughout Florida. Design review, fundraising, creative use of spaces, heritage tourism, and marketing for historic properties – all have been affected by activities related to preservation of the Ponce.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

This research project breaks new ground by examining the Hotel Ponce de Leon, its design, construction, decoration, and social history, through the lens of historic preservation. The study addresses the iconic role that the building plays in St. Augustine, a city internationally known for its Spanish colonial history and a community that has embraced historic preservation for more than a century. That preservation story is portrayed as well. The timing of the study is intentional and fortunate as both the hotel building and the city are the emphases of commemorative events that introduced new research and newly-available sources on each topic.¹

Figure 1-1. Alligator Border Florida Hotel Ponce de Leon, St. Augustine, Florida

The year 2013 serves as a watershed date as the 500\textsuperscript{th} anniversary of Spanish explorer Juan Ponce de Leon’s landing off the coast of present-day Florida. Simultaneously, 2013 is the 125\textsuperscript{th} anniversary of the opening of the Florida resort hotel that bears his name, the Hotel Ponce de Leon in St. Augustine. Both of these are parts of multi-year commemorations that include the 50\textsuperscript{th} anniversary in 2014 of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the 450\textsuperscript{th} anniversary in 2015 of the founding of St. Augustine, and, in 2016, the 100\textsuperscript{th} anniversary of the National Park Service and the 50\textsuperscript{th} anniversary of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

Known as Ponce de Leon Hall, the former Hotel Ponce de Leon stands as one of Florida’s most recognized architectural gems and is the centerpiece of Flagler College. The liberal arts institution was founded in 1968, in part, as a means to provide a viable economic use that would foster the preservation of the hotel building.

The building anchored the city’s downtown from the time it opened in 1888. After 125 years, the building continues to command the skyline, attracting many thousands of visitors to experience the art and architecture of the Gilded Age and a unique campus setting for a higher education institution.

In honor of the anniversaries, important new scholarship is taking place. New primary sources have become available that strengthen the effort. An example of these sources is the Carrère and Hastings’ drawings of the Hotel Ponce de Leon. These documents are recognized nationally as one of the rare extant collections of the architects’ works. The documents were conserved as the result of a collaborative effort between Flagler College and the University of Florida through a Save America’s Treasures grant administered through the National Endowment for the Humanities.
Several collections of private papers have become available in recent years that led to either verification of historical documentation as in the case of the Thomas Edison Papers at Rutgers University or enabled more depth of analysis. This was the situation with the Frederick Nichols Papers at the University of Virginia in regard to his interview with Bernard Maybeck. Also, Charles Hosmer’s Papers at the University of Maryland brought new insights into early historic preservation efforts in St. Augustine. Records at the Jekyll Island Club added a new link in the social network of wealthy industrialists that traveled from New York and New England to spend the winters in Florida.

Construction of the Ponce was addressed within the framework of the post-Civil War era with an emphasis on architecture, engineering, technology, and fine craftsmanship. The building’s revitalization, a process spanning nearly half a century, represented a demonstrable commitment to preservation and conservation values that developed nationally during the same time frame. Thus, the building contributes to the understanding of the preservation movement in the United States throughout that era.

The preservation effort for the former hotel was examined within the context of the historic preservation movement in the United States, including preservation initiatives in the South. In addition, this qualitative analysis addressed the role that Flagler College’s preservation commitment played in relation to historic preservation in St. Augustine. Finally, the information gleaned in studying preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon can benefit preservation and adaptive use of other historic structures.

**Background**

Henry Morrison Flagler with founding partners John D. Rockefeller, Sr., and his younger brother William Rockefeller created the nation’s most successful company, Standard Oil. John D. Rockefeller, Sr., became America’s first billionaire, and the
Rockefeller family continues to be known both nationally and internationally for its business, political, and philanthropic interests.

In fifteen years the business partners amassed fortunes and controlled oil interests sufficient to enable Flagler in 1882 to pursue a new career while maintaining ties with Standard Oil and an increasing number of business partners. He envisioned transforming Florida, the southernmost frontier, into a vacation fantasy, an “American Riviera” with its centerpiece St. Augustine recognized as the “Winter Newport.” Flagler’s Hotel Ponce de Leon, an architectural masterpiece that was both fortress and palace, stood as the most creative of his enterprises.

The flagship of Flagler’s Florida empire was his initial venture, the Hotel Ponce de Leon, which incorporated state-of-the-art construction with technological innovations and modern conveniences, all to satisfy his discerning guests’ most extravagant wishes. The building, an imaginative and exuberant expression representative of America in the Gilded Age, launched a career that spanned a time twice that of Flagler’s direct involvement with Standard Oil. He considered the Hotel Ponce de Leon as his most important accomplishment.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon met Henry Flagler’s expectations and those of his guests. According to architectural historians Laurie Ossman and Heather Ewing “Carrère and Hastings … introduced modern concrete technology to America—by building the West’s largest monolithic dome since the Pantheon—and created the largest fully electrified building complex to date.” In a 1909 interview, with construction of his overseas railway through the Florida Keys well underway, Flagler maintained that building the Hotel Ponce de Leon had been his greatest challenge. Beginning with
completion of the Ponce in 1887, and then with his hotels in Ormond Beach, Jacksonville, Palm Beach, Miami, Nassau, and Havana, and the Florida East Coast Railway, Flagler influenced development in Florida to a level that today many experts consider to be unequalled. His initial project, the Ponce, remains one of the nation’s most remarkable buildings.  

The Ponce anchored St. Augustine’s downtown and revived a depressed tourism economy in a city that had relied on that economic force for much of the 19th century. In addition to the success of the Ponce, St. Augustine benefitted from development of nearby neighborhoods known today as the Model Land Company, Lincolnville, the Abbott Tract, and North City. His investments inspired development beyond the city limits and at the beaches. He established recreation and athletic competitions as leisure activities. With Flagler’s extensive transportation network of railroads and steamships and his participation in construction of the Atlantic Intra-Coastal Waterway system, Florida became a preeminent national and international vacation destination, with St. Augustine serving as the gateway.

Architects John Merven Carrère and Thomas Hastings are recognized for designing the Hotel Ponce de Leon. The project, their new firm’s first commission of what would be more than 600 projects, is considered to be their most creative effort. Similarly, the structure’s other principal actors, the architects, builders, designers, and artisans, recognized the critical importance to their careers of their participation.

---

Remarkable for the era and the location, the frontier of Florida, the building introduced to the world a talented and creative team and challenged them to hone their skills and talents. In addition to Carrère and Hastings, architect Bernard Maybeck supervised construction. As his contributions to the building’s design have been discounted or addressed as anecdotal information only, this work covers the subject in greater depth, incorporating research into sources previously unexplored or unavailable.

Early in his glass-designing career Louis Comfort Tiffany created the building’s 79 art (stained) glass windows and conceived the interiors. Thomas Edison’s United Manufacturing Company provided thousands of electric lights for the largest incandescent system at that time. Pottier & Stymus, New York’s long-standing interiors firm, orchestrated the elaborate marble, oak woodwork, and opulent furnishings. Their protégé Virgilio Tojetti and renowned muralist George Maynard created the ceiling decorations for the Rotunda, Grand Parlor, and Dining Room.

Response to the opening of the Hotel Ponce de Leon was strong, and Flagler responded by commissioning an additional hotel, the Alcazar. At the end of the 1888-1889 winter season Flagler purchased the nearby and newly-opened Hotel Cordova as well. The three hotels shared an intersection at the western edge of St. Augustine’s downtown, a commanding location from which the developing resort trade flourished. From the time of the hotel’s opening until the height of the Great Depression the Hotel Ponce de Leon hosted a variety of important national and international visitors including Flagler’s business colleagues, social and political leaders, and members of the entertainment community.
The Hotel Ponce de Leon, a creative and exuberant reflection of the optimism and economic vitality of the Gilded Age, launched a new and lengthy chapter in Flagler’s life. He bricked streets, installed sewers, fostered arts and culture, and introduced sports to Florida. Trolley car lines were extended from town to North Beach, now recognized as Vilano Beach, and South Beach, incorporated later as St. Augustine Beach. Flagler transformed St. Augustine and, over the next four decades, the east coast of Florida into an “American Riviera.” Historian Thomas Graham noted, “the real Riviera was a week away from New York across a stormy Atlantic. St. Augustine, ‘a bit of old Europe drifted over and cast ashore’ was only a short twenty-four hours distant.”

Flagler developed the Florida East Coast Railway as a means to link his resort hotels. Through the State’s legal land development program, essentially a pass through of federal land, Flagler received 250,000 acres of land in North Florida, significantly more than other railroad developers. As Flagler moved down the east coast with his hotel empire, he received more than double the legally-mandated number of acres for development of his rail lines. As political pressure tightened the land development process, Flagler maneuvered surreptitiously around the legal requirements, acquiring 3,000,000 acres of land in the sunshine state.

In the early twentieth century the Hotel Ponce de Leon operated as a resort hotel linking wealthy Northerners and Europeans who traveled the East Coast of the United States, from New England or Long Island through Newport and Georgia’s Jekyll Island.

---


Club to the sunny climate of Florida. Many visitors preferred to continue their sojourns southward along the newly-opened US1 to Palm Beach and Miami as the winter chill descended southward. Despite that trend, St. Augustine remained a tourism destination for visitors that admired the city’s European appearance and heritage.

In 1929 the Stock Market Crash threw the building and St. Augustine into economic jeopardy. Attempts to market the community as what would today be termed a heritage tourism destination helped keep the community and the Hotel Ponce de Leon open throughout the 1930s. This effort partnered the National Park Service, Florida State Government, Carnegie Institution of Washington, D.C., and private organizations such as the St. Augustine Historical Society. Though the program was unsuccessful in its effort to reverse the economic downturn, the Hotel Ponce de Leon remained a social center of the community and drew visitors, though in significantly smaller numbers.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon survived World War II as a military training facility, the founding headquarters for the Coast Guard Reserve. Military activities did little to foster long-term preservation of the building; however, the continued use of the structure achieved minimal maintenance of the facility. Fortunately, post-war travelers rediscovered St. Augustine with former service men and women bringing their families through Florida to see the remarkable Spanish town and the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

During the 1950s local, state and national politicians and entrepreneurs established a series of organizations to work toward St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary commemoration in 1965. With New York hosting the World’s Fair in 1964, St. Augustine showcased the “nation’s oldest city” and encouraged the world to rediscover Florida’s Spanish heritage the following year. In addition, a backlash against the 1950s
“decade of destruction”—federal programs, such as urban renewal and interstate highway construction—fostered a renewed interest in patriotism and history. Out of this era grew the framework that institutionalized the nation’s preservation program culminating in passage of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.5

This 400th anniversary served as the motivation for dramatic physical changes to St. Augustine. A master plan was developed and a public/private/institutional partnership committed approximately $6,000,000 in physical improvements to the community. The Catholic Church renovated the Cathedral Basilica, constructed a new church Mission de Nombre de Dios, and erected a 208’ tall cross overlooking the Matanzas River (Intra-coastal Waterway) honoring the 1565 landing. The National Park Service redeveloped its property along the bayfront to accommodate visitors to the Castillo de San Marcos. The State of Florida and private organizations began efforts that resulted in preservation or reconstruction of about 50 Spanish colonial properties—owned by the State of Florida or the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc. Most of these are north of the Plaza de la Constitución. The St. George Street business district linked these properties to the federally-owned Government House. Southwest of the Plaza St. Johns County Government reclaimed the Hotel Cordova as the Courthouse.6


Within this preservation framework and time frame Flagler College was founded and headquartered in the Hotel Ponce de Leon. From that beginning in 1968 and over the next twenty years, the College struggled to grow as an educational institution, balancing the needs of students with those of historic campus buildings that had witnessed deferred maintenance.

In the early years of Flagler College the campus was centered on the Hotel Ponce de Leon property. Male and female students lived in former hotel rooms, segregated by gender within the east and west wings, respectively. Hotel security and administrative offices accommodated similar functions for the College. The Dining Room, renamed as the Dining Hall, served as the cafeteria. The Artists’ Studios that had an intermediate stage as offices for FEC executives became art classrooms and faculty offices. As the library grew to meet campus needs, the use moved from the 400 Rotunda to the Grand Parlor, then to Kenan Hall.

In honor of the Centennial Anniversary of the Hotel Ponce de Leon in 1988 the College implemented an ambitious restoration campaign, drawing together as a national advisory committee many of the nation’s foremost architects, museum directors and conservation experts. Chaired by Lawrence Lewis, Jr., Henry Flagler’s great-nephew and Flagler College’s founder, the committee developed a program that guided preservation efforts and remains in place today.

Restoration began with the building’s most elaborate rooms, continuing into the 1990s. The Grand Parlor, Dining Hall and Rotunda were returned to their Gilded Age grandeur. Preservation efforts continued as did acquisition of historic buildings to be incorporated into the campus. In 2013 the College completed restoration of the building
with a dramatic rehabilitation of the Solarium, the room under the central dome known historically as the 400 Rotunda, and the flanking fourth floor wings. This effort coincided with the College’s year-long celebration of the 125th anniversary of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, 1888-2013.

The longevity of senior administrators’ and trustees’ tenures with Flagler College influenced the College’s preservation policies and activities. The two most senior administrators William L. Proctor and William T. Abare, Jr., who each joined Flagler College in 1971, served as driving forces for the preservation of the campus for more than 40 years. Founder, trustee, and Kenan descendant Lawrence Lewis, Jr. and his sister Mary Lily Kenan “Molly” Lewis Wiley demonstrated their commitment to the institution from its founding until their deaths in 1995 and 2010, respectively. Trustees John Bailey, Sr., Frank Upchurch II, and Howell Melton, Sr., completed forty years of service with the institution in 2011. These trustees participated in the St. Augustine community during the 400th or Quadricentennial Anniversary, with Mr. Bailey as mayor of St. Augustine. These people provided a legacy for the hotel and the College.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon’s preservation has been accomplished so effectively that many visitors to the property assume that maintenance has been uninterrupted. They infer that the building did not require restoration or rehabilitation. While this is admirable, presenting the story of the building’s preservation provides a body of knowledge that can be beneficial to future efforts and can assist in fostering an appreciation for the benefits of historic preservation.

The institutionalization of the historic preservation movement began the decade before the American Bicentennial Anniversary in 1976 and had become a driving force
nationally by 1988 the Centennial year for the hotel. This development of national policy which included states and localities influenced and supported consideration of preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon. Furthermore, St. Augustine’s experience with historic preservation dating back to the early decades of the 20th century, revived in the 1950s, and demonstrated in the 1960s, laid a strong foundation for additional preservation efforts in the community.

In addition to the preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, the College accepted ownership of nearby historic buildings, many of which shared a history with the Hotel Ponce de Leon. These enabled the College to grow, though requiring creativity at times to accommodate academic uses in former residential buildings. Flagler College is considered by experts as the strongest academic institution committed to historic preservation in Florida; some have extended that accolade to a national level.

**Structure of the Study**

This study is composed of four functional sections. Chapters 1 and 2 serve as the pro forma elements. Chapter 1 introduces the study topic and outlines the project. Chapter 2 presents a brief analysis of descriptive case study theory including its appropriateness for use as a framework for the project. Examples of historic preservation case studies are included.

Chapters 3 and 4 provide contextual background for the study. Chapter 3 addresses laws and policies at the federal, state and local levels. The roles of public and private projects are presented. Specifically, the well-known preservation examples of Mount Vernon and Williamsburg are detailed and the lesser-known efforts in Boston and Los Angeles.
Chapter 4 includes an extensive analysis of St. Augustine’s preservation efforts. For a century the city has incorporated historic preservation and heritage tourism to serve as the community’s principal economic engine. From early private efforts to public/private partnerships in the 1930s, to the effort that began in the 1950s sponsored by the State of Florida, to the most recent iteration that includes the University of Florida, St. Augustine has experienced a wealth of preservation initiatives.

Chapters 5, 6 and 7 address the era that the Hotel Ponce de Leon was constructed and used as a luxury hotel. Information in Chapter 5 justifies the statement that the Ponce is the only building in the world to incorporate the talents of the team of men who created and built the structure. Many scholars have written about construction of the building. This study recognizes those efforts, adds new material, and investigates newly-available primary sources.

Chapter 6 incorporates sources, many contemporary with construction of the Ponce, to illustrate the building’s importance from a construction standpoint, particularly in the use of concrete, Portland cement mortar, and terra cotta. Engineering firsts in the use of hydro-electric power and incandescent lighting are featured.

Chapter 7 presents a portion of the building’s social history, reflecting the significance that the building holds for people, St. Augustine residents and visitors alike. The building hosted a broad range of guests, including six men who were at the time of their stays or after that time U.S. Presidents. This is in addition to guests who were socially, politically or professionally prominent. That history reinforces the importance of the hotel and set a standard that continued with the building’s post-hotel transition.
Chapters 8 and 9 tell the preservation story. Specifically, Chapter 8 addresses preservation of the former hotel in its new incarnation as Ponce de Leon Hall, centerpiece of Flagler College founded in 1968. Physical changes are described that were necessary to accommodate new academic uses, including the types of decisions that were part of the process and the consultants that were responsible for the preservation work. Primary sources include unpublished correspondence and reports and archived news articles. Informal interviews figure heavily into this chapter.

Chapter 9 explores the preservation story that goes beyond Ponce Hall to the historic buildings that comprise two-thirds of the College’s campus and nearly all of the academic facilities. This is a unique collection of buildings linked by time, construction, and function. All of the historic buildings are listed in the National Register of Historic Places and are within the jurisdiction of the City of St. Augustine’s preservation ordinances. Most of the new buildings are designed to be architecturally compatible with the historic campus. With a strong preservation ethic in place, the College’s efforts have resulted in national recognition as one of the nation’s most beautiful campuses.

Chapter 10 summarizes the knowledge gleaned through the study and places the preservation effort in a national context. The importance of the Ponce was reinforced, particularly with the new knowledge gained through the investigation of additional primary sources. The role of the Hotel Ponce de Leon in a regional heritage tourism framework is noted as well.
CHAPTER 2
METHODOLOGY

A case study is a qualitative research approach that was selected to provide a framework for the exploration of the preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon. The approach enables effective assessment and evaluation. This research process addresses a topic in a focused manner and can be used to generalize results, thereby enabling transferability to other situations. The end product is new knowledge about the particular topic being studied and information that could assist in research for other projects. The results can provide a perspective on a project for which research has already been initiated.¹

The case study process relies on substantial data collection. Many times, the data is collected at the site of the activity, at a natural setting, instead of in a controlled setting. Also, the process is organic. As the data compilation proceeds the project may evolve in response to where the data leads, requiring the researcher to respond with more data collection, new questions, or refined interpretation.

The information obtained requires strong organization by the researcher to enable an ordered presentation. Once the data is collected and evaluated, a strong narrative can tell a compelling and comprehensive story. The information gleaned through this approach should be verifiable, not in the sense of replicating an experiment. Another researcher could review the data and reassemble the narrative.

Data collection incorporates the use of a wealth of primary and secondary sources. Typically, archival and documentary materials, public records, maps and

photographs, informal interviews, and oral histories are components. Physical examination of a building or site under study can provide new information as well. The value of incorporating human experiences in the research adds unpredictability, variety, and authenticity, “Researchers are interested in the meanings people attach to the activities and events in their world and are open to whatever emerges.” Impressions, emotions, and experiences become part of the data collection inventory. Also, the participants can add validity to the narrative.2

This methodology boasts several strengths. The case study approach enables an in-depth investigation of a singular element, particularly one about which only cursory studies have been made or which new information is anticipated. Fellow and Liu, in treating research related to the construction industry state, “Descriptive case study is aimed at systematically identifying and recording a certain phenomenon or process.” A case study employs a descriptive or interpretive methodology to explore an activity comprehensively through the voices of participants. With regard to the study of an historical activity, the participants could be those contemporary to the origin of that historical activity and those involved with the project from its origin throughout its development and use...and demise, as relevant.3

A potential challenge in case study methodology involves the researcher’s responsibility to maintain professional integrity during the conduction of the study, recognizing that personal background and experiences will inherently affect the project, “the inquirer typically [is] involved in a sustained and intensive experience with

2Ibid., 143.

participants. This introduces a range of strategic, ethical, and personal issues...” The case study researcher must take great care to conduct as thorough and complete a data collection effort as possible. Another way to sustain validity through the research process is to explore a variety of strategies in the evaluation of the data and present both the supporting and contradictory information.4

The relatively small number of individuals included in the data collection study could introduce questions of validity in the study. This is in comparison to quantitative studies which involve large percentages of respondents. A case study is narrowly-focused as well and may rely heavily on documentary sources supplemented with information gleaned from informal interviews with experts or similar participants.

Use of a Case Study Approach for Historic Preservation Topics

This study placed the Hotel Ponce de Leon within the context of the preservation movement in the United States and within the framework of historic preservation and heritage tourism in St. Augustine, Florida. In a community that boasts rigorous design review standards and abundant cultural resources representing significant eras in the nation’s history, the methods and techniques used in preservation of the hotel and its conversion for a new purpose attain greater importance.

The new information learned through this study can inform other large-scale adaptive use preservation projects. The inclusion of a nationally-recognized team of experts for oversight, consideration of technical and materials issues, incorporation of fundraising and marketing efforts, and use of a phased approach can bring viability to monumental projects. The unique artistic nature of the hotel building contributed to the

4Ibid., 184.
complexity of the endeavor and made the success of the effort more significant. The national attention that the building garnered during initial stages of preservation twenty-five years ago has been renewed during the final phase of restoration completed in 2013, attracting new audiences to witness the achievement.

A case study is a valid methodological approach that enables analysis of primary sources such as informal interviews. This framework has been used successfully in studying historic preservation efforts in communities throughout the United States and internationally. The framework can bring richness to the study that would be difficult if another methodological framework was used. Some examples of this are illustrated.

This case study drew on information from a variety of sources, launching from Charles B. Hosmer Jr.’s classic monograph, *Preservation Comes of Age: From Williamsburg to the National Trust, 1926-1949* that chronicles the dominant perception of early historic preservation efforts. Hosmer gives little regard to St. Augustine’s early attempts at historic preservation in the 1930s, following a prevalent Northeastern scholarly bent in favor of traditional English-based historical cities. This attitude prevails in the understated portrayal of St. Augustine’s role in the nation’s settlement.

In contrast, author Kenneth Severens argues in *Southern Architecture* (1981) that the South communicates a sense of place unlike other regions in the country, “Of the ten colleges designated as National Historic Landmarks, seven are in the South, and no section of the country has been more influential than the South in campus
planning." He considers the former Hotel Ponce de Leon as a component of the new south, “the beginning of the hedonistic attraction to Florida.”

Christopher Silver’s study of neighborhood planning in cities of the South added to the context, particularly in addressing the South distinctly and through an assessment of changes in government policy responding to grassroots citizen efforts. Ary J. Lamme in *America’s Historic Landscapes: Community Power and the Preservation of Four National Historic Sites* (1989) reevaluated the importance of St. Augustine, and James D. Kornwolf in *Architecture and Town Planning in Colonial North America* (2002) studied the role of St. Augustine’s town plan in the arena of community development.

Historic Preservation in the United States grew out of the social change that took place in the country during the 1960s, a time that questioned established traditions and emphasized inclusiveness and tolerance. While many Americans prefer to live in “new” dwellings, they have come to appreciate the “old.” Significant numbers of people choose to live or work in buildings that are 50, 100, 200 or more years old. Construction trades help to sustain economic vitality particularly in times of recession by maintaining building stock, including historic structures. Cultural resources are vehicles that illustrate chapters in the history of the nation. Annually, millions of heritage tourists demonstrate the relevance of these resources.

As a national social movement historic preservation in the United States is approaching its first half century of institutional life. The documentary record of individual preservation projects, of neighborhood revitalization, economic development in historic districts, cultural resource management, designed landscapes, preservation

---

plans—all of these are contemporary activities within the memory of many Americans. For much of this era, successful historic preservation efforts have been measured by the numbers: properties listed in the National Register of Historic Places; Certificates of Appropriateness issued for work in local historic districts; projects processed for federal review and compliance; heritage tourism visitors to experience a historic property; dollars invested in urban neighborhoods; grant funded projects completed; archaeological sites protected; or acres of farmland preserved. These and other quantifiable variables are presented as testimonials to the movement’s success.

Impassioned baby-boomers that invested their finances and sweat equity into urban neighborhoods in the 1970s and 1980s are now grandparents. Their children may be historic preservationists intellectually, but they have yet to demonstrate the emotional commitment that characterized their parents’ involvement. These grandchildren were born into a disposable, immediate gratification, virtual reality, social media-savvy society. The decision of this generation accept responsibility for their heritage as demonstrated through conservation of physical and cultural resources will help to determine the future of the preservation movement.

The manner in which resources of the recent past are addressed is exemplary of philosophical considerations affecting the practice of historic preservation today. Practitioners, especially architects and interior designers, embrace preservation of post-World War II resources. Particularly in urban areas or communities that developed during this time frame, and now that the resources are within the 50-year window for National Register consideration, dialogue is increasing. DOCOMOMO, the acronym for
Documentation and Conservation of the Modern Movement, provides an educational forum for discussion about significance and retention, or loss of, these resources.

Many historic preservationists who entered the field from other disciplines are less enthusiastic in championing preservation of these resources. National Trust 2012 Crowninshield Award winner and internationally-known preservation economist Donovan Rypkema commented in 2009 at an international symposium held in New Harmony, Indiana, that he did not mind if others chose to preserve mid-century modern resources, “just don’t call it historic preservation.” As the preservation movement expands to embrace more diverse resources, demonstration of relevance is important for social, political, and economic success.

As with many social movements historic preservation in the United States has waxed and waned in effectiveness. Preservation tends to be politically neutral with both major political parties supporting initiatives. During the 1980s when President Reagan recommended no appropriation each year, public pressure enabled Congress to override that decision. In contrast, during the first Obama administration the Save America’s Treasures program was eliminated after having experienced bi-partisan support since its implementation in the 1990s.

In 2008 the National Academy of Public Administration published a study that was commissioned by the National Park Service. The report, Saving Our History: A Review of National Park Cultural Resource Programs was the result an in-depth analysis and made a number of findings, including “the panel found that a 2005 reorganization of the cultural resources program in Washington resulted in a disengaged and ineffective leadership team.” A rebuilding phase anticipated to take a
decade or more began in 2009, and a more recent study indicates positive results with rebuilding of programs continuing.\(^\text{6}\)

In 2010 the National Trust began a major restructuring under new President Stephanie Meeks consolidating functional and geographic operations and examining strategically the institution’s property stewardship responsibilities. To the extent that all of the major national preservation organizations remain viable and work together to set policy for preservation in the 21\(^{\text{st}}\) century will influence efforts at local levels.

In 1988 James Marston Fitch noted, “our experiential relationship with architecture is fundamentally of a different order from that of the other arts.” Resources in the built environment have the ability to inspire a wealth of emotional reactions. School children bring magnets to the Jefferson County Courthouse in downtown Louisville, Kentucky, to test the walls for metal; they generate echoes in the dome; they feel the filigreed stair railings as they run up and down the cast iron staircase. These are honest, unfiltered, extraordinary experiences, yet the building is regaled as a textbook example of Greek Revival-style architecture.\(^\text{7}\)

Case study research can incorporate cultural and aesthetic values into the study of preservation, enabling a heightened understanding of the resource and the environment that created and sustained that resource. Engaging the human spirit into conservation of cultural heritage can generate an emotional investment by the children.


and grandchildren of baby-boomers into the process. This can enrich the experience and ensure that historic preservation thrives as an expression of the nation’s heritage.

Additional examples where case study methodology has been used to study historic preservation topics include Richard Moe and Carter Wilkie’s work Changing Places (1997). This work assessed preservation campaigns to maintain Virginia’s Manassas Battlefield and the musical heritage of Memphis, Tennessee. Scholars Max Page and Randall Mason in Giving Preservation a History (2004) provided a fresh perspective of preservation efforts in major cities, i.e. New York, Boston, Chicago, Providence, Charleston, Denver, and Santa Fe. Historian Andrew Hurley studied St. Louis in Beyond Preservation: Using Public History to Revitalize Inner Cities (2010). Interior designer Erin Cunningham employed a case study approach for her dissertation, “Preserving with Purpose: Narratives of Settlement Women and Historic Interiors at Hull House and on Henry Street” (2010). In each of these examples the study subjects were specific while the results illustrated transferability. 8

Just as the practice of historic preservation is undergoing revision, so is the theory underpinning historic preservation. Sociologists, psychologists, and historians, public historians, and anthropologists argue for recognition of individuals and intangible resources in relation to historic preservation efforts.

As historic preservation educator Michael A. Tomlan noted in Preservation of What, For Whom? (1997) a social science approach was undertaken in the 1930s during the New Deal programs with the compilation of state histories. During that era a

---

connection to people was critical and their history was critical to generating patriotism and confidence that the nation would survive and succeed. This social science approach witnessed resurgence in recent years as a means to enhance historic preservation as an experience for people.⁹

In 1988 ethnographic studies were incorporated formally into federal policy through the National Park Service as a means to engage underrepresented populations in cultural resource management. In the 1990s anthropologists conducted two ethnographic case studies related to African-Americans and heritage tourism. Both studies were undertaken within academic frameworks. The studies and their results indicated relevancy for a case study approach as a valid theoretical methodology through which to assess specific historic preservation efforts.

The National Park Service undertook a study as part of planning an interpretative program for part of Natchitoches Parish in northwest Louisiana. “A Brief Ethnography of Magnolia Plantation: Planning for the Cane Run Creole National Historical Park” addressed a property owned by the Hertzog family since 1787. The study dealt with a 19-acre parcel that had remained undeveloped and continued in the Hertzog family.¹⁰

University of Virginia anthropologists conducted the Colonial Williamsburg study which centered on both the internal workings of the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation and an external evaluation of visitor experiences and interpretation. In this case, the


properties in question were privately owned and managed, a preservation business model for Colonial Williamsburg begun in 1926 by John D. Rockefeller, Jr.\textsuperscript{11}

In both cases researchers were located geographically near the study area, enabling cultural familiarity with each area. An objective of each project was to influence interpretation of the historic sites, particularly to heighten the roles of minority populations. Another focus of each study was to evaluate the “sense of place.” This was more analytically-described in the Magnolia Plantation study than was done in the Colonial Williamsburg study.

Both studies added to the knowledge base with the Magnolia Plantation initiative delving deeply into the racial context. The NPS study provided a valid and replicable model from which additional research could be undertaken at that property or translated into research at another property. NPS earned praise for its ethnographic studies such as the Magnolia Plantation project.

Each study took advantage of extensive primary and secondary sources, though the Williamsburg study team did not have access to the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation records. Both studies incorporated interviews of subjects familiar with each site to gain additional perspectives and new knowledge. Each study was successful as the information gleaned was included in revised interpretation for the subject properties, enabling a broader and stronger heritage tourism experience.

\textbf{Documenting the Hotel Ponce de Leon}

Having been involved in St. Augustine’s preservation as an employee of the State of Florida, then as a non-profit museum director, and finally as staff and faculty of

Flagler College, provided an opportunity to use the knowledge gained in the community over many years. Familiarity with and access to research repositories and little-known sources afforded a deeper level of primary source investigation. Addressing the project from the perspective of an historian and a practicing historic preservation professional for more than thirty years influenced the research and the writing of the text.

Several collections of private papers and other primary source documents such as issues of *Scientific American* and *Engineering News* and *New York Times* articles added new information or depth to the research. Documents from the Walter Fraser Papers and records of the St. Augustine Foundation related to the preservation effort in St. Augustine were made available and incorporated into the text.

Existing research that addressed preservation activities at the Ponce during the era between 1929 and 1968 relied primarily on secondary sources. Physical maintenance of the buildings and setting were undertaken during this era, but capital outlays were precluded due to financial considerations. Research from that period was aided by informal interviews. These provided valuable and otherwise unobtainable background about the last years of the building’s use as a hotel.

Information about the preservation of the Ponce and additional campus buildings exists primarily in Flagler College documents, archival repositories, and in private collections. Fortunately, a number of people who have been involved with the property through activities in St. Augustine or at Flagler College consented to participate in informal interviews, enabling first person information to enhance documentary records. Interviews with Flagler College administrators William Proctor and William T. Abare, Jr. as well as numerous College trustees and alumni revealed unique information.
The timing for this project was particularly relevant as Flagler College was celebrating the 125th anniversary of the Hotel Ponce de Leon throughout the year 2013. Also, in 2018 the College will celebrate the fiftieth anniversary of its founding. In preparation for both anniversaries staff and faculty at the College began research on the history of the building, conservation of documents pertaining to the building’s construction, and changes to the hotel property that accomplished transformation to an academic institution.

As the substantive portions of the dissertation project were completed, the College called for a celebratory work on the Ponce describing the wealth of architectural detail in the building and enriched with new photographs. Though the timing added challenges to completion of the dissertation, the project required research that might not have been pursued and provided a fortunate experience.

In 2013 Flagler College completed restoration and rehabilitation of the Ponce, a project that had been launched more than forty years ago. Assisting with the preservation projects that have been accomplished since 2005 brought an “insider’s” perspective, enabled a rapport to be developed with other team members and the construction crews. All of these people were very helpful to the research.

In 2009 Flagler College partnered with the University of Florida Smathers Libraries to conserve and create the “Carrère & Hastings Digital Collection,” with funding through a Save America’s Treasures grant administered by the National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH). This dissertation afforded the first academic opportunity for this new information to be used.
Similarly, the University of Florida undertook another conservation project that provided assistance with this research topic. “Unearthing St. Augustine’s Colonial Heritage: An Interactive Digital Collection for the Nation’s Oldest City” brought forth a number of twentieth century documents as well as those addressing the colonial period. These primary sources aided in understanding St. Augustine’s long interest in historic preservation and the efforts that took place throughout much of the last century.

Several primary sources provided background on St. Augustine, on Florida, and on the early years of the Hotel Ponce de Leon. These included collections of private papers or archives previously unavailable or not readily accessible include those of: historian Charles Hosmer; University of Maryland; architect Frederick D. Nichols, University of Virginia; architect Bernard Maybeck and writer Mark Twain (Samuel Clemens), University of California-Berkeley; and inventor Thomas Edison, Rutgers University. The archives of the Jekyll Island Club verified the social links between the Club and the Ponce. The family of Walter Fraser made available his correspondence which added to the background on St. Augustine’s early preservation history. Craig Thorn’s architectural record provided important documentation of the first major exterior preservation effort for the Ponce, restoration of the towers.

Research into the hotel and the early years of Flagler College built on Caroline Castillo (Crimm)’s master’s thesis, “Two Gilded Age Hotels: The History, Restoration and Adaptive Use of the Tampa Bay and Ponce de Leon Hotels in Florida” (Texas Tech, 1986) and Rafael Crespo’s dissertation, “Florida’s First Spanish Renaissance Revival” (Harvard University, 1987), both of which were completed as preservation activities for the Hotel Ponce de Leon were in their early phases. Thomas Graham’s research on
Henry Flagler and the St. Augustine hotels detailed local context from which the preservation study could be launched. Particularly pertinent for its contributions to social history was Susan Braden’s *The Architecture of Leisure: The Florida Resort Hotels of Henry Flagler and Henry Plant* (2002).

Architect Channing Blake’s dissertation, “The Architecture of Carrère and Hastings” provided an early analysis of the firm’s contributions to architecture (Columbia University, 1976) and was followed by the elaborate work by Mark Hewitt, Kate Lemos, William Morrison, and Charles Warren, *Carrère and Hastings: Architects* (2006) and most recently, by the works commemorating the zenith of their partnership, Henry Hope Reed and Francis Morrone’s *The New York Public Library: The Architecture and Decoration of the Stephen A. Schwarzman Building* (2011) and Laurie Ossman and Heather Ewing, *Carrère and Hastings: The Masterworks* (2011). These volumes served as a foundation for the architects of the Ponce and their contemporaries.


In addition, Elizabeth Varner’s master’s thesis “Bolstering a National Identity: President Andrew Johnson’s Pottier and Stymus Furniture in the United States Treasury Department” (2008) added insight into the interior design firm’s work. Bryant Tolles’s extensive research on historic hotels and resorts throughout the United States placed the Hotel Ponce de Leon in a national context.

The Library of Congress’s immense photo collections, now online and conveniently accessible, as well as *New York Times* articles added a depth to the study of the Ponce’s years as a hotel. Numerous other newspapers, now online as well, provided new threads to pursue in the research and added breadth to several chapters.

Discussion of the Cuban Giants baseball team in relation to the role of the players and the Ponce was aided by a variety of recent sources on Negro League baseball. Player Sol White’s *History of Colored Baseball* reprinted in 1995 launched a number of scholarly studies including Leslie Heaphy’s, *The Negro Leagues* (2003); Michael Lomax’s *Black Baseball Entrepreneurs* (2003); Neil Lanctot’s work *Negro League Baseball* (2004); Bill Kirwin’s *Out of the Shadows* (2005); Lawrence Hogan’s *Shades of Glory* (2006); and Gregory Bond’s extensive dissertation *Jim Crow at Play* (University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2008). Additional research into this subject could lend more insight into late 19th century race relations in St. Augustine.

Discovering the history of race relations in the community was assisted by David Colburn’s *Racial Change and Community Crisis: St. Augustine, Florida, 1877-1980*

Though possibly a bit unusual for an academic research project, some of the topics covered introduced variety and humor to the effort and some surprises to the results. Specifically, the segment on the hotels whose owners either took advantage of the Flagler name or the Ponce design may seem superfluous. The point of including this section and a number of social history elements aided in establishing the context into which the Ponce is placed.
CHAPTER 3
THE HOTEL PONCE DE LEON IN CONTEXT
THE PRESERVATION MOVEMENT AT THE NATIONAL, REGIONAL, STATE, AND LOCAL LEVELS

Preservation of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, commonly known as and hereafter referred to as the Ponce, coincided with a major chapter in the historic preservation movement in the United States. Social change related to individual freedoms and liberties characterized the decade of the 1960s followed by the nation’s Bicentennial Anniversary in 1976. The preservation effort for the Ponce built on these earlier events. Interest in the nation’s natural and scenic resources increased through the Keep America Beautiful program. Simultaneously, heritage tourism in Florida developed dramatically through St. Augustine’s Quadricentennial or 400th Anniversary celebration in 1965. The success of preservation efforts on behalf of the Ponce rode the crest of the wave of the nation’s patriotism. This was demonstrated through historic preservation becoming public policy at the federal, state and local levels as a component of land use and town planning.

A variety of actions had taken place throughout the 19th century and early decades of the 20th century that laid a foundation for preservation of the Ponce. A brief review of the development of historic preservation in the United States, the South, Florida, and St. Augustine provides background for understanding the framework in which decisions were made that enabled the Ponce’s revitalization. Public policy decisions influenced preservation of the building fostering an environment conducive to institutional commitment and financial investment necessary to accomplish preservation and conservation to secure the building’s future.
Early Private Historic Preservation Efforts in the United States

In all cases the impetus for preservation was a reaction to social and cultural changes taking place in the nation that transformed the physical character of the landscape. In many cases patriotic themes were part of the effort, particularly for those projects taking place during the era of the nation’s centennial anniversary. The era was marked by reunification of the nation after the end of the Civil War and Reconstruction. Also, in the twentieth century many of the nation’s industrialists aspired to secure their own “places in American history” by making connections with the founding fathers.¹

The first recognized historic preservation effort took place in 1816 when the city of Philadelphia responded to citizen pleas and acquired Pennsylvania’s threatened Old State House. Though the effort was successful in that the building remained standing, Independence Hall had lost character-defining features and architectural details,

including the tower, wings and paneling in the original rooms. Indeed, even after a commitment to save the building had been achieved, woodwork was removed from the room where the founding fathers authored the Declaration of Independence and Constitution. In 1828 restoration efforts began, and a few years later the re-born building with a reconstructed tower silhouetted the skyline once again.²

That same year, 1828, Newport, Rhode Island, rededicated the restored Touro Synagogue, renamed to honor the family that helped found the synagogue and provided $10,000 (nearly $200,000 now) to fund the project. The work stands out among 19th century preservation projects as exemplary in quality of workmanship and for sustaining the oldest synagogue in the United States.³

In 1853, a few short years before the nation was torn apart in civil war, South Carolina native Ann Pamela Cunningham began a crusade to save founding father George Washington’s Mount Vernon. His Virginia plantation and final resting place, both visible to the public from the Potomac River, had assumed iconic roles representing him, his era, and a young nation.

Cunningham, a frail, unmarried and single-minded woman characterized by a contemporary “as small, serious, intelligent and quite bewitching,” succeeded after three failed governmental attempts. She created an organization comprised entirely of women, of whom one in each state served as state chair. Washington’s great grand-


niece Catherine Daingerfield Willis Murat, widow of Napoleon’s nephew Achille Murat, served as the Florida state chair from her Tallahassee home Belleview. 4

Collectively, these women inspired thousands of donations and secured in fewer than the negotiated five years the $200,000 needed (or nearly $6 million in current U.S. dollars) to purchase the property. Possibly equally as important, the effort pulled together a fractured nation, if only temporarily, enabling sectional strife over slavery to be set aside for a common achievement. The Mount Vernon Ladies Association of the Union continues to own and operate the property, responding over the decades to the changing needs of preservation and interpretation. 5

Though Mount Vernon had been rescued for more than a century, the property’s views and vistas—those available to George and Martha Washington from their veranda overlooking the sloping lawn and the Potomac River—became threatened in the 1970s. A nuclear power plant was proposed for the open land to the east of Mount Vernon. Public pressure prevailed to retain the setting and maintain the property’s context. Development pressures continue to threaten Mount Vernon, resulting in the property’s placement on the World Heritage Watch List.

Mount Vernon’s rescue inspired other efforts, though none was as successful. These included: 1856-Andrew Jackson’s Hermitage; 1873-George Washington’s New Jersey headquarters; and 1878-Valley Forge. Monticello, Thomas Jefferson’s residence, proved to be the most dramatic and lengthy effort, and one that combined a


5 Ibid., 46 – 48.
property associated with a national hero with architectural significance for the buildings. The project required nearly a century from 1836 to 1923 to ensure the property’s future as a museum. Women’s organizations founded in the late 19th century such as the Daughters of the American Revolution and The National Society of The Colonial Dames of America grew out of the nation’s centennial anniversary in 1876. The organizations acquired properties and used Cunningham’s state model as their basis for fundraising on behalf of the properties.⁶

In 1859, the year after the Ladies completed the purchase of Mount Vernon, John Hancock’s heirs offered his home in Boston to the state. Governmental inaction at the state and local levels resulted in the building’s loss and inspired a flurry of demolitions. A dramatic reversal to this pattern took place in 1876 with women putting forth the bulk of the effort and securing the funding. Preservation and planning scholar Michael Holleran argues,

Boston’s greatest contribution to American preservation was saving the Old South Church. The significance of the Old South campaign was that, despite overwhelming odds, it worked. It was the first time Americans challenged the culture of change head-on and won. The building occupied some of the most valuable real estate in America; its owners were hostile to its continued existence; demolition had actually begun before the preservation effort got under way. If the Old South could be saved, anything could.

In turn, this success launched a campaign to preserve a variety of resources illustrating Boston’s cultural heritage, cemeteries, landscapes, park land, and buildings old and

---

nearly new. Less than a decade after its construction Richardson’s Unitarian Brattle Square church required public attention and adoption by a new congregation.\textsuperscript{7}

As the nation continued to develop after the Civil War, the wealth of the Gilded Age was exhibited frequently in construction of high style residences with elaborately-decorated interiors, particularly with antiques and art. The wealthy became participants in a series of efforts to illustrate their interest in the nation’s heritage and to establish their legacies as patrons of the arts and culture.

In 1888, thirty years after Cunningham’s successful campaign, the Association for the Preservation of Virginia Antiquities (APVA) was established, introducing a statewide perspective. In 1910 William Sumner Appleton, inspired by that model, expanded it and founded the Society for the Preservation of New England Antiquities (SPNEA). The organization oversaw preservation of nearly fifty buildings. Each had architectural importance and maintained economic viability, operating privately. Preservation reflected the value system and the political situation of the times. Public impression superseded accuracy. Over time, an appreciation for early construction methods prevailed, resulting in heightened accuracy in preservation techniques. Today, the organization is known as Historic New England.\textsuperscript{8}

Virginia’s colonial capitol Williamsburg had declined for more than a century when, between 1903 and 1907, Dr. William A. R. Goodwin, rector of Bruton Parish Church there, undertook preservation of colonial buildings and construction of Wythe


\textsuperscript{8}Murtagh, 18. Holleran, 115 – 16.
House. Goodwin returned to Williamsburg in 1923 and envisioned a far more ambitious program to regenerate the community—restoration of the colonial city.⁹

Four years later, after approaching several wealthy industrialists, Goodwin was afforded an opportunity that proved unparalleled, “when Mr. [John D.] Rockefeller [Jr.] first visited Williamsburg, twenty-three buildings, including a high school, a grammar school, a dry-cleaning plant, and the main line of the Chesapeake and Ohio Railroad occupied the site of the Palace and its gardens.” Ultimately, to recreate the 18th century community Rockefeller gave to Colonial Williamsburg $68.5M over 30 years from 1927 until he died in 1960. Also, Rockefeller spent a month each in spring and fall annually at Williamsburg witnessing progress. In 1935 the Architectural Record published a special issue dedicated to restoration of Williamsburg, noting that the project was well underway with infrastructure improvements completed to reflect the colonial city and modern incongruities removed from the area. In 1956, the following count was taken: restored: 82 buildings and 83 gardens; reconstructed on original foundations: 404 buildings; and razed or relocated: 720 buildings. The goal was an 18th century community. Most buildings constructed after that date were razed or relocated.¹⁰

The Williamsburg model served as a basis for preservation in the form of creation of historic villages. In 1929 Mystic Seaport in Connecticut was established to portray colonial maritime history. Following World War II a series of communities developed to emphasize colonial history: 1946-Old Sturbridge Village and 1947-Plimoth (Plymouth)


Plantation, both in Massachusetts; and in 1950-Old Salem, North Carolina. In all cases the stories reflected predominant thinking at the time, emphasizing traditional interpretations of American history. These villages supplied economic stimulation to the communities through generating tourism based on patriotic fervor.

Henry Ford embraced preservation starting in 1923 with acquisition of the Wayside Inn in Sudbury, Massachusetts, then his most notable preservation endeavor. At Greenfield Village in Dearborn, Michigan, he brought together a national collection of properties he considered to reflect American culture, such as his good friend Thomas Edison’s Menlo Park, New Jersey, laboratory and the Wright Brothers Bicycle Shop in Dayton, Ohio. He had the buildings disassembled from their original locations, moved, and reassembled. These nationally important landmarks were exhibited in a single location, enabling appreciation of entire segments of American life. Ford’s goal was to provide a broad educational experience, a laboratory, in a single location. The Village opened in 1933. In honor of Ford’s 150th birthday in 2013, the village returned to use of an early name for the museum. The Henry Ford features a tagline, “America’s Greatest History Destination.”

Individual preservation efforts took place throughout the nation. In 1920 the U.S. Army War College conducted a survey of battlefields. In 1924 the San Antonio Conservation Society rescued the Greek Market House, and that same year the State of Indiana accepted title to, and the following year opened as a museum, the Lanier Mansion on the Ohio River in Madison. In 1927 in Youngstown, New York, Old Fort

---

Niagara’s first preservation efforts began, and California passed the nation’s first bond issue related to preservation. Immediately before the Stock Market crash in October of 1929, Tombstone, Arizona held its first fundraiser to assist the city’s efforts to preserve the region’s history and culture. A few months later Spanish culture gained attention with the opening of the Olvera Street district in Los Angeles. Additional efforts began nationwide, and as the Depression deepened the federal government assumed a stronger role, partnering with many communities.¹²

Concentrated efforts were particularly strong in the South, especially Virginia, with an emphasis on sites related to military actions. In 1935 Congress joined forces with Virginians, appropriating $100,000 in federal funds for the McLean House’s reconstruction, the site at Appomattox Court House where Robert E. Lee surrendered to Ulysses S. Grant, officially ending the American Civil War.¹³

**United States Historic Preservation Legislation and Policy**

A variety of measures have been incorporated into public policy at the federal, state, and local levels since the mid-19th century to support preservation. The federal government’s legal and financial investment in the heritage of the nation can be traced to public policies that established national parks in the mid-19th century. Yellowstone, Yosemite, Sequoia, and Mount Rainier, all are located in western states with vast natural and scenic resources that faced threats from mining, development of railroads,

¹²Ibid., 1245 – 49.

¹³Ibid., 1251.
and land use changes accompanying settlement by citizens. Protection of these lands resulted in limited conservation of archaeological and built resources.\textsuperscript{14}

A variety of laws adopted over the past century and interpreted since that time influenced historic preservation theory and practice in the United States. Early legislation focused on properties under the jurisdiction of the federal government. After World War II, the U.S. and numerous European countries, appalled by the physical devastation to cities wreaked by the war, employed policies and adopted laws to protect world heritage, including resources—both natural and manmade—in the United States judged to hold universal importance. Today, protections for resources on and under land and water attempt to address the complexity of contemporary society.

\textbf{Antiquities Act of 1906}

Broad historic preservation legislation in the United States dates to Theodore Roosevelt's administration and the Antiquities Act of 1906 which addressed federally-owned or controlled properties. The act authorizes the President to designate properties as national monuments, to make provisions for archaeological investigations, and to impose penalties for desecration of historic or prehistoric ruins.\textsuperscript{15}

One of the early uses of this legislation that affected St. Augustine came in 1924 with designation of Fort Marion (Castillo de San Marcos) and Fort Matanzas as national monuments. Since then, this legal vehicle has protected many National Park Service properties that include historical or archaeological resources. In 2012 consideration

\textsuperscript{14}Taylor, et al, 30 – 31.

\textsuperscript{15}Antiquities Act of 1906, 16 USC 421-433, accessed December 17, 2011, \url{http://www.nps.gov/history/local-law/fhpl_antiact.pdf}.
was given in Congress to repeal of the Antiquities Act and opening protected federal lands in the Western states for mining and similar activities. Overwhelmingly, citizens opposed this proposal. The law remained intact.\textsuperscript{16}

![figure](image.png)

Figure 3-2. Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, St. Johns County, Florida

**Historic Sites Act of 1935**

President Franklin Roosevelt’s Depression-era economic plan created the Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS), a New Deal program created in 1933 to provide work for unemployed architects, draftsmen, and engineers. Plans, photographs and related documents chronicled construction of America’s built environment,

establishing a national archive for thousands of buildings. The results illustrated the need for legislation to identify, document, and plan for the nation’s heritage.\textsuperscript{17}

The program was conducted through a partnership between the National Park Service, the American Institute of Architects, and the Library of Congress. In St. Augustine 28 buildings were documented in the years prior to the City’s 400\textsuperscript{th} anniversary in 1965. These included the Castillo de San Marcos at the north end of the Spanish colonial downtown. South of the Plaza de la Constitución three properties open to the public were documented, the Gonzalez-Alvarez House (known as the Oldest House), the Llambias House, and the Ximenez-Fatio House. Five Flagler-era buildings including the Hotel Ponce de Leon were documented. Over the history of the HABS program which continues today, more than 35,000 buildings have been recorded.

The Rockefeller family provided funding to the federal government to enable background research based on a methodology used by European nations to protect their historic resources. Resulting legislation established historic preservation as a federal priority for nationally-significant resources of “exceptional value” and set as policy the acquisition by the federal government of these properties as appropriate. This added properties to the National Park system. In addition, private properties were identified and documented to further their preservation. Beginning in 1960 these properties received a new designation of National Historic Landmark (NHL).\textsuperscript{18}


In St. Augustine properties such as the Cathedral Basilica, the Gonzalez-Alvarez (Oldest) House, and the Llambias House received NHL designation. Following a comprehensive approach, the original colonial city plan was designated as a NHL district. The boundaries reflected the importance of the Plaza de la Constitución as the center of the Spanish city and the interrelatedness of church and state: military landmarks the Castillo de San Marcos on the north and the St. Francis Barracks on the south, the Matanzas River on the east, Cordova (originally Tolomato) Street on the west. The free black settlement of Fort Mose, north of the city, was added.

National Trust for Historic Preservation

World War II and Roosevelt’s death delayed additional federal preservation efforts for the next decade. The post-war years introduced a number of measures that resulted in major land use and transportation changes throughout the United States. Recognizing that efforts such as Mount Vernon, major private preservation efforts had led the nation for a century by this time, the U.S. government entered into a public-private partnership to foster additional private investment in the nation’s heritage. In 1949 Congress chartered the National Trust for Historic Preservation. This private, not-for-profit organization championed historic preservation on a variety of levels.\(^{19}\)

The National Trust initiated new programs, acquired properties, and provided preservation expertise through a series of regional offices. Part of Mount Vernon known as Woodlawn Plantation became the first acquired property. For the next fifty years Congress appropriated funds to cover about twenty percent of the National Trust’s budget. In 1998 the National Trust became self-sustaining. Also in 1998 the Save

America’s Treasures program, a partnership between the National Trust, National Park Service, and National Endowment for the Humanities, benefitted properties with national importance and encouraged private investment to match public funds.

Figure 3-3. Municipal dock, Bridge of Lions, and the Atlantic Ocean

St. Augustine projects benefitted from National Trust staff and consultants’ expertise, through small grants, and from national publicity. St. Augustine’s 1927 bascule design Bridge of Lions is one example of National Trust assistance to a local community. Located adjacent to the center of the St. Augustine Town Plan NHL district east of the Plaza de la Constitución, the 1,545-foot span across the Intra-Coastal Waterway connects downtown with Anastasia Island. The historic bridge was threatened for more than a decade with demolition and replacement with a contemporary structure. The National Trust’s 11 Most Endangered Properties listing for 1997 drew attention to the situation and encouraged federal agencies to work together for a compromise. The resulting reconstruction reflected the original design of the bridge yet met contemporary engineering requirements for bridge safety. In 2010
Bridges and Roads magazine ranked the bridge fourth in its top ten listing of important bridge projects. During this same period the National Trust assisted with long range planning for effectively incorporating heritage tourism activities into the community. In 2012 the National Trust recognized local advocates with an award for their efforts.

National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 and Related Federal Legislation

October 15, 2011, marked the 45th anniversary of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) of 1966, sweeping legislation that passed during a decade of major social change. Following on the legal heels of the Civil Rights Act, reforms to gun control, immigration, and education, all at the height of President Lyndon Johnson’s administration, this important landmark legislation changed the physical face of the nation. Efforts by First Ladies Jackie Kennedy and Lady Bird Johnson to restore the White House and champion the Keep America Beautiful program, respectively, helped lay the foundations for the NHPA. Less than twenty years after the urban renewal legislation was adopted, buildings similar to those demolished through urban renewal became integral components in historic districts identified after adoption of the NHPA.

Credit for passage of the national legislation goes, in part, to the U.S. Conference on Mayors Special Committee on Historic Preservation as reflected in their report With Heritage So Rich. This document, as with the legislation adopted in 1935, built upon


extensive research. This time the Ford Foundation and Mellon philanthropies provided funding for the research, and the topic was loss of resources due to post-World War II development programs.22

Major tenets of the Preservation Act included: development of the National Register of Historic Places as a planning tool for local governments to document their historical and archaeological resources; formalization of the previously-established National Historic Landmarks program; creation of State Historic Preservation Offices to implement the legislation in the states; and provision of guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). As of September 30, 2010 the National Register included 86,255 total listings consisting of 1,616,138 resources.23

This far-reaching legislation, administered through the National Park Service, anchored the nation’s historic preservation program. The legislation outlined the identification and designation process for properties; encouraged planning for their preservation and protection; and established enforcement procedures. This legislation linked and fostered regulatory and incentive programs throughout the nation. The planning component of the law encouraged municipalities to enact zoning and related ordinances, designating landmarks and local historic districts. Challenges to the Preservation Act culminated in the U.S. Supreme Court upholding the legislation in *Penn Central Transportation Company v. City of New York* (1978), affirming local

---


23This is the most recent data available. National Register, accessed December 20, 2011, http://www.nps.gov/nr/.
designation as a component of a municipality’s police power and within the constitutional framework of the fifth and fourteenth amendments.\textsuperscript{24}

Companion legislation resulted in dramatic changes to the manner in which federal agencies fulfilled their legally-mandated responsibilities. Section 4(f) of the Department of Transportation Act of 1966 contained procedures for protection of historical and archaeological resources by the following entities: Federal Highway Administration, Coast Guard, Federal Aviation Administration, and Federal Transit Administration. The Act called for avoiding harm, mitigating effect and making a finding of “no feasible or prudent alternative” to justify substantially impairing the use of a resource with significance at the local, state, or national level. This legislation was responsible, in part, for the resulting compromise for St. Augustine’s Bridge of Lions.\textsuperscript{25}

The National Environmental Policy Act of 1970 (NEPA) required evaluating a proposed action to determine if it would “significantly affect quality of the human environment” with a goal of minimizing harm, a process culminating in a Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) detailed in an Environmental Impact Statement (EIS).\textsuperscript{26}

In 1971 President Richard Nixon signed Executive Order 11593 that detailed procedures and actions to be taken with regard to historical resources and implementation of NEPA. Moreover, the Order required HABS documentation to be

\textsuperscript{24}Penn Central Transportation Company v. City of New York, 438 U.S. 104 (1978).

\textsuperscript{25}Department of Transportation Act, 49 USC Section 202 and 23 USC Section 138.

prepared where a National Register listed property affected by the proposed federal action would be “substantially altered or demolished.”

**Federal Laws Addressing Archaeological and Maritime Resources**

The Archaeological and Historic Preservation Act of 1974 recognized that vast quantities of artifacts, typically on Native American lands, were being destroyed through federal projects, especially in the western states. This determination brought archaeological sites under the same identification, planning and recognition framework as the NHPA mandated. Five years later, the Archaeological Resources Protection Act of 1979 (ARPA) and its 1988 amendments required planning, management, public education, and archaeological surveys for federally-managed lands.

The controversial Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act of 1990 (NAGPRA) recognized indigenous peoples; prohibited excavation, removal, or damage to archaeological resources that contained burial sites; their sale, purchase or transport; or soliciting and procuring such items. The legislation brought state and local laws to bear, with criminal penalties imposed. Required forfeiture of artifacts complicated responsibilities.

---


29 *Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act of 1990*, 25 USC 3001. Desecration of human remains, regardless of origin, is a crime under United States law. First offenses qualified as misdemeanors; the second offense and beyond automatically qualified as felonies with prison time. Civil suits for damages were authorized to restore sites after they were damaged.
According to the United States Constitution, the federal government retains jurisdiction for admiralty and maritime issues. The Abandoned Shipwreck Act of 1987 clarified legal positions, particularly those that include resources qualifying for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The U.S. government retained title to shipwrecks on federal (submerged) lands, and a state retained title to shipwrecks on its submerged lands. Indian lands were treated correspondingly. The federal government’s sovereign immunity claimed title to warships and shipwrecks with an international component. Florida’s wealth, in number and quality, of shipwrecks since the 16th century makes this legislation important for preserving these cultural resources, many of which are located off of the state’s coasts.30

Financial Incentives for Historic Preservation

At the height of the American Bicentennial anniversary, Congress passed the Tax Reform Act of 1976. Provisions in this law added the Rehabilitation Tax Credit, a tiered tax credit system for income-producing projects rehabilitated in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. Disincentives were implemented for demolition of historic buildings during property redevelopment. A decade later Congress overhauled the tax code, eliminated the disincentives, and reduced the credits. The most significant large-scale projects in Northeast Florida to benefit from the Rehabilitation Tax Credit was Orlando hotelier Richard Kessler’s multi-million rehabilitation in the late 1990s of the former St. Johns County Courthouse, returning it to

30*Abandoned Shipwreck Act of 1987 (ASA), 43 USC 2101-2106.*
the market rate luxury Casa Monica Hotel. Similar resort projects in the Tampa and Miami areas took advantage of this incentive.31

A conservation easement is a legal mechanism to protect in perpetuity a property with significant natural or man-made (including archaeological) resources. In general, an owner voluntarily relinquishes some or all development rights and for doing so retains ownership of the property, but enjoys tax deductions based on the change in valuation of the property due to the restrictions. Condemnation can eliminate the ownership and, therefore, the easement.

The Low-Income Housing Tax Credit, a component of the Tax Reform Act of 1986, provides financial incentives to private investors for creating housing units for low-income individuals. The units may be either new construction or rehabilitation of existing building stock. This credit may be partnered with the Rehabilitation Tax Credit. In 2000 the New Markets Tax Credit was added as an incentive. Particularly after the hurricanes in subsequent years that affected the Gulf Coast states, these financial incentives have added attractive options to providing housing and broadening the demographic of those who can benefit from these incentives.

The National Heritage Program includes a financial component as well. This initiative adopted in 1984 takes a comprehensive approach to resource protection, recognizing places as National Heritage Areas (NHA) with national importance and a variety of resources—historic, cultural, natural and recreational—that may cross multiple political jurisdictions. According to Jonathan Jarvis, Director of the National Park

---

Service, this program “expands on traditional approaches to resource stewardship by supporting large-scale, community centered initiatives that connect local citizens through preservation, conservation, and planning processes.” Direct federal funds are available with the average through 2011 of nearly $150,000 per NHA. Since adoption nearly thirty years ago, forty-nine areas have been designated. Though efforts were initiated to recognize an area in Northeast Florida as the Nation’s Oldest Port National Heritage Area, an area that would include St. Augustine, to date Florida does not have a National Heritage Area.\(^{32}\)

**Preservation and Planning in the South**

In the South a distinctive recognition of a heritage and an impoverished economy, combined with an identification with place and home, persisted, whereas in other parts of the country the urge to achieve material success reached fever proportions in the 1920s. At times this romanticism on the part of southerners led to the creation of myths about the past and to appreciation of the visible reminders of the years before the Civil War.

Charles B. Hosmer, Jr., 1981

Communities in the South embraced historic preservation as a means to address downtowns and inner cities that remained as remnants of 19\(^{th}\) century antebellum life. These downtowns, though endangered by neglect and decay for decades, faced increased threats with early 20\(^{th}\) century economic programs that emphasized new development. During the same time that citizens expressed concerns for their historical resources, planning as a profession grew. Thus, in the South, planning and preservation developed along parallel tracks, though not necessarily in tandem.\(^{33}\)

---


In 1931 after a decade of preservation planning and activities, Charleston, South Carolina became the first U.S. city to implement a local preservation ordinance. Adoption of architectural design standards proved to be a strong protection tool. The former antebellum capitol of commerce and culture reacted against intrusions into the architecturally significant downtown. In particular, Charlestonians found transportation changes offensive such as street widening, filling station and parking lot construction, railroad expansion, and billboards at the city’s entry points. Moreover, historic buildings were being stripped of their woodwork and details, with materials sold as souvenirs.\(^{34}\)

Federal New Deal programs supplied expertise and funding for a comprehensive approach to Charleston’s preservation efforts. Damage from the 1938 hurricane provided additional impetus to move quickly. With additional financial assistance from the Carnegie Institution, Frederick Law Olmsted, Jr., undertook a land use study of the city. His work illustrated the strengths of the city’s architectural framework in relation to its infrastructure components. Charleston’s program became a national model.\(^{35}\)

In 1921 New Orleans celebrated the bicentennial anniversary of its French town plan. Two years later the city began an integrated planning and preservation process followed by establishment of the Vieux Carré commission. The Louisiana Chapter of the American Institute of Architects headquartered in New Orleans joined the process providing technical help. The effort to implement design review in the Vieux Carré failed temporarily to muster sufficient local support. In 1936 New Orleans rebounded,

\(^{34}\)Ibid., 236 – 39.

establishing a local historic district, expanding the Vieux Carré commission’s powers, and providing financial incentives. In 1965 the Vieux Carré Historic District was listed as a National Historic Landmark District.36

The preservation community and planners disagreed vehemently over transportation improvements along the riverfront. A multi-lane highway was proposed as part of the post-World War I national road system and revived after World War II. The topic was resurrected in 1962 and, after a seven-year battle, defeated a third time.

Over the next several years a variety of cities established local historic district zoning as the framework for their historic preservation efforts. Those in the South included: 1939-San Antonio, 1946-Alexandria, 1947-Williamsburg, 1948-Winston-Salem, and 1950-Washington, D.C.’s Georgetown.37

The State of Florida’s Early Historic Preservation Commitment

In 1959 the State of Florida addressed historic preservation on a statewide level through legislation establishing the St. Augustine Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission. Though this statement could be open to interpretation, the legal community considers the 1959 law as the State’s first action supporting historic preservation. The 1930s appropriations on behalf of St. Augustine, though using the city’s historical significance as justification for the funds, were provided due to the unique economic situation at the time. In 1967 the State of Florida responded to federal mandates that accompanied adoption of the National Historic Preservation Act. The


37Stipe and Lee, 159 – 60. Hosmer, Presence of the Past, 205.
Florida Legislature passed the Florida Archives and History Act that established direct State responsibility to fulfill requirements enumerated in the federal legislation.38

The St. Augustine Historic Restoration and Preservation Commission folded into the State of Florida’s partnership program with municipalities through the creation of Historic Preservation Boards. These entities provided professional staff and citizen advisory boards appointed by the State to direct preservation efforts in cities or county-wide. These preservation boards oversaw maintenance and preservation of State-owned historic properties in several communities including Tallahassee, Tampa, Key West, Pensacola, and St. Augustine.

Preservation boards were considered an appropriate preservation tool for nearly a dozen communities beginning with Pensacola in 1967. St. Augustine’s Commission was reconstituted as a Preservation Board, and in 1969 both St. Augustine and Pensacola came under direct responsibility of the Florida Department of State. Throughout the 1970s and 1980s additional municipalities participated. Some relationships recognized unique circumstances and were permissive rather than prescriptive as in the case of Boca Raton. Established boards continued to operate in the following locations (listed in order of creation): St. Augustine, Pensacola, Tallahassee, Key West (later Florida Keys), Boca Raton, Tampa-Hillsborough County, Broward, Volusia, Flagler, Sarasota, and Palm Beach Counties. In 1997 the State abolished the preservation boards and established three regional preservation offices in St. Augustine, Tampa, and Palm Beach County. The first two communities contained concentrations of properties owned by the State. Palm Beach County enabled south

Florida to receive services. In 2005 downsizing in the Department of State resulted in eliminating the regional programs.39

**The State of Florida’s Later Historic Preservation Commitment**

Responding to the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, Chapter 267 of the Florida Statutes provided for the State’s historic preservation responsibilities and, among other requirements, defined how protection of cultural resources would be addressed within the context of other State agencies and local governments. Similarly, each state established laws to meet federal NHPA requirements. Florida’s statute is somewhat unique in that provisions are included that are comparable to Section 106 of the NHPA by providing for an environmental review component for State actions. This statute and administrative rules (Chapters 1A-31 and 1A-32) permit underwater exploration and recovery in waters under jurisdiction by Florida. As a result, valuable research has been accomplished, and significant artifacts have been retained, conserved, and exhibited by the State.

Several states, including Florida, added financial incentives such as property tax abatement or exemptions. Adopted in 1997, Florida’s legislation provided that local governments (both city and county) could abate property taxes for up to ten years on improvements to historic properties that met the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. Both St. Augustine and St. Johns County embraced the program initially for five years; then each government extended the abatement to ten years.40


40Florida Statutes, Ch. 196.1997.
In part, this legislation and its central downtown location inspired Orlando hotel developer Richard Kessler to purchase the St. Johns County Courthouse which was the historic Casa Monica Hotel. His $17 million rehabilitation returned the landmark building to its Gilded Age splendor and provided the region with a luxury hotel. The building hosted dignitaries such as President Clinton and Ambassador Andrew Young. On April 1, 2001, Spain’s King Juan Carlos and Queen Sofia stayed; their next visit is anticipated to take place as part of the 450th anniversary commemoration.

Florida’s Special Category grant program, implemented in 1983, spurred major investment by not-for-profit organizations and government agencies. On average, public investment is matched on a 5:1 basis with private dollars. St. Johns ranks as the county in Florida that has taken greatest advantage of this program. Other states that provide similar financial incentives include Colorado, Massachusetts, Montana, New Jersey, New York and Rhode Island. Currently, Colorado is providing the largest amount of public dollars. Cumulatively, with well more than $300,000,000 authorized, Florida’s remains at the top nationally for funding committed to preservation.41

One additional Florida legislative incentive to encourage historic preservation is the Local Government and Comprehensive Planning Act, commonly referred to as Florida’s Growth Management Act of 1985. The act provided local governments with the option to include historic preservation as part of their comprehensive planning responsibilities. St. Augustine and St. Johns County have done so and collaborated on administration of historic preservation programs. In both cases, preservation of historical, architectural, and archaeological resources is linked directly with a strong heritage tourism program managed through the St. Johns County Tourist Development Council with the Visitor and Convention Bureau.  

Historic Preservation and the City of St. Augustine

Arguably, modifications to City codes could be considered the most far-reaching achievements of the local historic preservation program. Two specific ordinances influenced efforts positively and substantively over the past fifty years. In addition, both remain supported strongly and enhance heritage tourism efforts throughout the region. One of these grew out of the 400th anniversary planning. The second followed the 1976 American Bicentennial celebration.

First, the City government adopted height restrictions, limiting building heights within the jurisdictional limits of St. Augustine to thirty-five feet. “No building would ever again be taller than the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s twin towers.” Only one building, the Exchange Bank Building, built in 1922 four decades before the ordinance, rises above the limit. This legislation withstood development pressure, inspiring St. Johns County to

---


adopt similar legislation in 1998 following testimony from St. Augustine city attorney Jim Wilson and the State’s regional preservation officer Leslee Keys. With central and south Florida saturated with high-rise condos, preservation of St. Augustine’s and St. Johns County’s views and vistas distinguishes the region.\(^{43}\)

A second ordinance, St. Augustine’s Archaeological Preservation Ordinance, adopted in 1987 required all projects within the city limits to include an archaeological review component. This made St. Augustine the first city in the United States to adopt such a requirement and to employ a professional archaeologist to implement it. Many times, the effort was limited to a cursory review of the proposed work, minimal monitoring of ground-disturbing activity, and mitigation. However, in the colonial city a wealth of materials has been unearthed, public support for this activity has increased, and important learning opportunities are available for students and adults. Today, the archaeology program averages thirty investigations annually. It is one of the community’s strongest outreach programs and receives significant media coverage.\(^{44}\)

In the 1980s the City of St. Augustine buried utilities and removed vehicular traffic from St. George Street north of the Plaza, converting the narrow roadway to a pedestrian thoroughfare. Limited access remained to other streets. Today, this active business and attractions district draws many of the area’s seven-and-a-half million annual visitors.


The citizens of St. Augustine undertook a visioning program in the early 1990s. Following the goals established through that process, elected officials led by Mayor Greg Baker and continued by the next mayor Len Weeks moved forward with plans to manage directly the State-owned historic properties. In 1997 when the State abolished the preservation boards and created regional offices, the first responsibility of the St. Augustine Regional Preservation Office Director Leslee Keys was to help transition management of St. Augustine’s State-owned properties to the City of St. Augustine.

From July 1, 1997 through June 30, 2010, the City operated a heritage tourism program and managed the properties. The directors of the program were: David Brandt (1997-1999), Dr. William R. Adams, Jr. (1999-2009) and Dana Ste. Claire (2009-2010). The University of Florida assumed property management effective July 1, 2010. This transition was modeled on the successful partnership in Pensacola between the State of Florida, the University of West Florida, and West Florida Historic Preservation, Inc. This new St. Augustine program was facilitated with assistance from area legislators including Senator John Thrasher and Representative Dr. William L. Proctor.
CHAPTER 4
EARLY HISTORIC PRESERVATION EFFORTS IN ST. AUGUSTINE

Preservation in St. Augustine traces its origins to the rescue of the City Gate.

According to National Park Service historian and St. Augustine native Albert Manucy, in 1827 Lt. Harvey Brown, U.S. Military Post Quartermaster at St. Augustine, halted demolition of the 1808-1809 masonry gate posts. The City had initiated demolition, to enable construction of a causeway with reused materials from the bridge and gate posts shown in the photograph. Despite Brown’s intervention, photographs indicate that most of the bridge, sentry boxes and abutment had been disassembled before work was halted. For the next 52 years, however, throughout the Indian wars, the Civil War and Reconstruction, the gate remained unrepaired. In 1879, the City undertook repairs and reconstruction.¹

In 1908 the U.S. government deeded land along present-day Orange Street to the St. Johns County Board of Public Instruction for a school building (now the School Board offices). This resulted in filling the moat and a new proposal for removal of the gate. Again, the gate remained. In 1912, led by Mayor and St. Augustine Historical Society founder and president Dr. DeWitt Webb, the City of St. Augustine obtained permission from the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers to assume responsibility for repair and maintenance of the “City Gate and its environs.” Preservation work on the gate began in 1913. With establishment of Fort Marion as a National Monument in 1935 under the auspices of the National Park Service, the gate, bridge, causeway and triangular park

area on which they all rested returned to federal management. In 1942 in honor of St. Augustine’s Spanish heritage the federal government renamed the property Castillo de San Marcos. While threatened with destruction, neglect and demolition for nearly two centuries, today millions of visitors pass through the passageway created in 1739 and marked originally by simple wooden guard shelters.²

Figure 4-1. The Old City Gate, St. Augustine

When I recall how Colonial Williamsburg has served so effectively as a symbol of the bond between English-speaking peoples on both sides of the Atlantic, I can see how valuable it will be to have a similar symbol of the cultural heritage which came to us from Hispanic-American sources. This can be a most important new symbolic bond with our Latin American neighbors, as well as with Spain.

John F. Kennedy, President of the United States, 1963
Referring to St. Augustine’s preservation program

To draw attention to this symbol of St. Augustine’s colonial past, the newly-formed National Society of The Colonial Dames of America in The State of Florida installed in 1907, with great fanfare, a tablet depicting the significance of the City Gate. Subsequent

research undertaken for the city’s 400th anniversary in 1965 resulted in the need for a new plaque. In 1972, for the 300th anniversary of the laying of the cornerstone for the Castillo de San Marcos, a new plaque was installed with greater fanfare.³

St. Augustine relied economically on historic preservation reaching back to 1911. In that year the St. Augustine Historical Society, a group founded in 1884, opened a museum on the bayfront in what was known as the Sanchez House, at the time described merely as “an old building.” A few years later that building was destroyed by fire. Also in 1911 the Society served as the driving force behind preserving Fort Matanzas south of St. Augustine. In 1913 led by Society president and New Yorker Chauncey Depew, the U.S. War Department authorized the Society to develop a program of interpretation for Fort Marion, thereby beginning heritage tourism for the nation’s oldest city. In 1918 the Society added reconstruction and restoration of colonial buildings to its activities. The Oldest House/Gonzalez-Alvarez House and the Tovar House were the organization’s first restoration projects.⁴

Florida’s fragile tourist assets were jeopardized by several devastating storms in the 1920s and 1930s several that touched St. Augustine directly. On September 30, 1920, a tropical cyclone, described at the time as, “a fierce nor’easter,” came up the Gulf and made landfall at Cedar Key before heading east across the state and into the


Atlantic Ocean at St. Augustine. Wind and rain from the storm damaged property on the mainland and eastward over the barrier islands. The oldest city recovered and hosted a celebration six months later that drew national attention.5

On February 22, 1921, a crowd of thousands gathered at the fort, winter visitors and Floridians “the largest that ever assembled in St. Augustine,” for the George Washington birthday celebration and to launch the Centennial anniversary of Florida’s acquisition as a territory by the United States. With President-elect and Mrs. Warren G. Harding in attendance, members of the Historical Society and the Colonial Dames participated, celebrating with the audience retention of Fort Marion and Fort Matanzas under federal ownership. The Colonial Dames presented four bronze tablets describing distinct eras in Florida’s history and received accolades that day by federal officials as well as commendations in newspapers in days following the event.6

Around 1904, physician Luella Day McConnell, nicknamed “Diamond Lil” during her Klondike gold rush adventures, arrived in St. Augustine. At a site about one mile north of Fort Marion Diamond Lil developed the Fountain of Youth, a tourist attraction she operated until her death in 1927. That year Walter B. Fraser bought the property. In addition to continuing the attraction, he planted orange groves and mined for titanium. In 1934, following the discovery of human burials, Fraser contacted the Smithsonian Institution. Subsequently, more than 100 burials were located. “Archaeological work


6History News, El Escribano 10, no. 1 (1973): 20. Ximenez-Fatio House Museum Archives, Triple Celebration at St. Augustine was Patriotic and Inspiring, With President-Elect Harding at Old Fort, Florida Times-Union, February 23, 1921.
since 1934 has shown that the initial site of the Nombre de Dios mission church was in the southwestern section of what is today the Fountain of Youth Park, about 165 meters southwest of the Menendez settlement area.” Florida archaeologist Kathleen Deagan has served as principal investigator at the property for nearly forty years, providing the scholarly foundation for many of the interpretive exhibits available for visitors today. The Fountain of Youth Archaeological Park evidences both early habitation and early tourism based on Florida history. The property remains under ownership of and operation by Fraser’s grandchildren.⁷

As Florida’s role as an automobile tourism destination grew, improved transportation became necessary. After nearly a decade of planning and construction, in 1927, the federal government opened US Route 1, a national road running north from Miami, Florida, up the east coast through St Augustine to Kent, Maine,

Connecting semi-tropical Florida with the north-temperate Maine, the road is the principal tourist route from the large eastern cities to the winter resorts of the South and the summer resorts of New England. Its strategic value as a military road in time of war is the conclusive element which stamps this road as the most important, everything considered, in the United States.

As U.S. 1 served as the primary north-south thoroughfare into Florida at this time, travelers entered the state from Georgia and continued through Jacksonville to St. Augustine. The route split further south to enable access to the east and west coasts.

Travelers arrived in St. Augustine by the long-established modes of water and rail and in their personal automobiles.\textsuperscript{8}

One such traveler was Ernest Hemingway who commented, “St. Augustine was about the prettiest place along that coast.” From 1928 through at least 1941 Hemingway drove routinely between his new home in Key West and his in-laws’ residence in Arkansas. When in St. Augustine he visited friends and fellow authors including John Dos Passos, who stayed at the Ponce, and Marjorie Kinnan Rawlings who, with husband Norton Baskin, operated a small lodging establishment in the former Castle Warden (now home to St. Augustine’s and the original Ripley’s Believe It or Not).\textsuperscript{9}

The Great Depression of the 1930s decimated Florida’s tourist-driven economy and hit St. Augustine hard. Key West, heavily in debt, with “at least eighty percent of its inhabitants on the welfare rolls” filed bankruptcy. St. Augustine threatened to follow Key West’s lead, leaving financial management in the hands of the state government. State government officials recognized the infeasibility of managing the operations of those two municipalities. Business leaders realized that the state’s ability to rebound economically hinged, in large part, on the ability to lure tourists and real estate investors back to the sunshine state. Both groups worked with community leaders in St. Augustine to launch


an alternate economic approach. Promotion of the city’s attractions at the Chicago World’s Fair in 1933-1934 provided a test of this strategy.\textsuperscript{10}

Through the private, non-profit Florida National Exhibits (FNE) corporation, the state sponsored exhibits for “Chicago’s 1933-1934 Century of Progress Exposition [World’s Fair], at Cleveland’s 1936-1937 Great Lakes Exposition, and at the New York World’s Fair of 1939-1940” as well as special events in New York, Atlantic City, and Philadelphia. Each of these opportunities introduced northerners to the possibilities of investing in or visiting Florida including St. Augustine.\textsuperscript{11}

Natural hazards threatened to sidetrack the interest in Florida generated during the Chicago World’s Fair. Over Labor Day Weekend 1935 a massive hurricane hit the Florida Keys. The storm destroyed the Overseas Railway connecting the islands to the mainland and resulted in the death of hundreds of people, including many out-of-work soldiers sent by the federal government to construct the parallel transportation route the Overseas Highway.

Despite damage suffered because of the hurricane, one half year later (at the end of the winter tourist season), Florida set a tourism record. Overall, Florida attracted two million visitors who generated $625,000,000 in income for the state. This success spurred Florida’s participation in the 1939 New York World’s Fair, featuring the largest site of any exhibition (118,000 square feet), that featured waterfront access and that attracted an estimated 5,000,000 visitors. This pattern of marketing national events began nearly fifty years earlier at the World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893 and


continued through the 1964 New York World’s Fair—a prelude to St. Augustine’s Quadricentennial Anniversary the following year. Tourism sustained Florida’s economy, and St. Augustine was a centerpiece of this industry.\textsuperscript{12}

\textbf{Figure 4-2. Fatio House, St. Augustine, St. Johns County, Florida}

\textbf{St. Augustine Historical Restoration Program}

St. Augustine’s assets provided the main draw for tourists. In 1933 a New Deal initiative led to establishment within the National Park Service (NPS) of the Branch of History. Dr. Verne E. Chatelain was the first chief historian. Chatelain, who possessed both a doctorate in history and a law degree, advocated an approach that reflected the continuum of a property’s history when it was being incorporated under the NPS umbrella. In addition to his early efforts with national battlefields, Chatelain was

instrumental in the drafting and adoption of the Historic Sites Act of 1935 that resulted in
the recording of thousands of historical resources nationwide.\textsuperscript{13}

On February 27, 1936, St. Augustine tourist attraction owner and mayor Walter Fraser introduced a resolution to develop a comprehensive preservation initiative in line with Chatelain’s approach. The resolution was adopted unanimously. Fraser proposed,

\begin{quote}
to investigate the possibility of making the old Spanish port of St. Augustine into a restricted area for the protection of the old narrowed streets and the quaint balconied houses... unless some steps were taken along this line, with the hope of securing federal, state, and private funds, to carry on the work of preservation and restoration, little by little the old would disappear and what is a priceless heritage would be dissipated through the lapse of time, the march of progress, or the vandalism that permits the destruction of old buildings.
\end{quote}

He appointed a citizens’ committee to pursue the program and develop an action plan.\textsuperscript{14}

In March 1936 Fort Marion’s superintendent Herbert Kahler led the Carnegie Institution of Washington’s president John Merriam on a tour through the city’s historic assets. The result of the Kahler visit and efforts by local leaders to promote preservation was a proposal to expand these efforts through a federal-local partnership with National Park Service staff and the Carnegie Institution. On October 26, 1936, the newly-constituted National Committee for the Preservation and Restoration of Historic St. Augustine held an inaugural meeting in Washington, D.C. Members included Fraser, Merriam, Kahler and Walter G. Leland, Permanent Secretary, American Council


\textsuperscript{14}Walter B. Fraser Papers, private collection.
of Learned Societies, Washington, D.C.; Judge David R. Dunham, President, St. Augustine Historical Society; The Most Reverend Patrick Harry, Bishop of the Diocese of St. Augustine; Hon. John J. Tigert, President, University of Florida; Hon. Scott Loftin, Former Florida Senator; Carita Doggett Corse, State Director, Federal Writer’s Project; Hon. Wilbur C. Hall, Chairman, Commission on Conservation and Development; A. V. Kidder, Division of Historical Research, Carnegie Institution; Herbert E. Bolton, Professor of History, University of California-Berkeley; Hon. Harry F. Byrd, Senator from Virginia; Hon. H. J. Eckenrode, Director, Division of History and Archaeology; Hon. Joshua C. Chase, President, Florida Historical Society; Verne Chatelain, Carnegie Institution; and John E. Pickering.15

Mayor Fraser introduced a proposal to preserve the nation’s Spanish culture as embodied in the physical evidence remaining in the city. He presented the National Committee’s plan to use restored historic buildings as a framework to interpret colonial life. In addition, to demonstrate community support, initial commitments of $1,000 from the St. Augustine Historical Society and $500 from Louise Wise Lewis (Henry Flagler’s niece and heir and Lawrence Lewis’s mother). The City of St. Augustine followed with a contribution over the next several months of $3,000. As a result of the meeting Merriam pledged short-term funding contingent upon implementation of a substantive development plan, emphasizing authenticity in interpretation and accuracy in

15 Restoration Summary Giving Definite Steps In Historic Movement, St. Augustine Record, July 30, 1936.
preservation within the context of a broader time period encompassing St. Augustine’s lengthy history.\textsuperscript{16}

As Eleanor Beeson reported in a \textit{Florida Historical Quarterly} article in 1937,

The St. Augustine Historical Restoration conducted under the auspices of Carnegie Institution of Washington with the cooperation of the City of St. Augustine is dedicated to the purpose of preserving and redeveloping the physical remains of the centuries of history of this region, site of the first permanent white settlement on the Atlantic seaboard…

With funding from the Carnegie Institution and contributions from donors throughout the region, the St. Augustine Historical Program was launched in two parts. One component focused on documentary research on the community, environs, and the landscape. The second segment emphasized historic property surveys and evaluation of authenticity in the historic structures. The St. Augustine property surveys and evaluations were led by national experts, including Leland, Bolton, Kidder, William E. Lingelbach, Professor of History, University of Pennsylvania; Matthew W. Stirling, Chief, Bureau of American Ethnology, Smithsonian Institution; with Merriam and Chatelain. Staff members were responsible for undertaking research. Albert Manucy, a St. Augustine native and National Park Service historian, assisted in the process.\textsuperscript{17}

Also, the Carnegie Institution provided a $500 grant for acclaimed photographer Frances Benjamin Johnston to photographically document St. Augustine’s historical resources. Her work began in December of 1936 and supplemented architectural resources.


\textsuperscript{17}Eleanor Beeson, The St. Augustine Historical Restoration, \textit{Florida Historical Quarterly} 16, no 2 (Oct 1937): 110. V. E. Chatelain, Reports of Sub-Committees of the National Committee for the Survey and the Development of the Historical Resources of St. Augustine, Florida. St. Augustine, March 1937, Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board Archives.
documentation being undertaken simultaneously as part of the Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS). The project employed architects to prepare measured drawings of historic resources in a community, ultimately recording thousands of structures throughout the nation. In Florida much of the HABS work focused in St. Augustine, providing a valuable record particularly of Spanish colonial buildings and Flagler’s Gilded Age hotels.18

Over the next six weeks, Johnston took nearly 200 photographs, completing the work in time for an exhibition of select St. Augustine photographs at the Hotel Ponce de Leon in January 1937 and a Southern architecture exhibit at the Smithsonian Institution in February. Although her work emphasized St. Augustine’s Spanish colonial buildings thereby reinforcing the Carnegie Institution’s interest in fostering heritage tourism as part of the historic preservation effort, she included Flagler’s Victorian-era hotels as well. Educator Bettina Berch noted, “Her St. Augustine photographs were considered superb.” The documentation was a component of the larger research project that resulted in about 7,500 negatives, to form the Carnegie Survey of the Architecture of the South. The project provided a record of buildings, street scenes, and landscapes under the assumption that many of the resources would be demolished in future.19


Interestingly, in the early 1890s Johnston had achieved fame for her photographs of the White House and of the Columbian Exposition. She demonstrated her skills with architectural photography and drew notice from the nation’s architects. These included Carrère & Hastings who retained her in 1909 to represent their work in New York. Possibly this connection between the New York architects and the photographer added to her desire to include Flagler’s St. Augustine hotels in the Carnegie project three decades later.20

In 1937 Verne Chatelain’s report was submitted to the St. Augustine National Commission. The report emphasized addressing the continuum of St. Augustine’s history, recognizing that the city “is a living and growing organism” in which citizens should continue to thrive. Multiple ethnicities evident in St. Augustine’s history should be featured. A New York Times article praised the recommendations in anticipation that the results would lead to efforts to showcase more than just Fort Marion. In support of this approach articles were published in The St. Augustine Record featuring Flagler era buildings. From 1938-1940 archaeological investigations located the former walled city’s defenses. To protect these assets, the City adopted a zoning ordinance “enforcing the preservation of historic landmarks.” Although in full swing by 1940 St. Augustine’s restoration was interrupted by World War II.21

The plan included restoration of thirty-six colonial resources remaining from the estimated original 300 city structures and recreating others based on archaeological


21 Bradley Brewer, 68. Flagler Hotels Here Are Veritable Olden Spanish Palaces, St. Augustine Record, July 1, 1937. Florida’s Railroad History Should Be Carefully Preserved, St. Augustine Record, July 4, 1937.
and documentary research. In 1938 the Carnegie Institution bought the Llambias House and transferred ownership to the City of St. Augustine. The City turned over management responsibility to the St. Augustine Historical Society in 1955. The original properties anchored the historic district. The proposed restoration program mandated “a living city that had developed over many years…a total program of interpretation that would include a good museum and a real effort to give the town walking space, adequate parking, and some evidences of planned growth.”

Lack of financing plagued initial restoration and threatened to dismantle the effort. The State of Florida stepped forward with an appropriation of $50,000 in 1937, with release of funds scheduled for 1938. In fact, the community waited nearly a decade for these funds. They were released after World War II. Hesitation on the part of the Carnegie Institution to commit financial resources to a multi-year program compounded the financial situation. Institution President Merriam had retired as President Emeritus in mid-1939. Before retirement Merriam set aside sufficient financial support for Chatelain to complete in June 1940, *The Defenses of St. Augustine, 1565-1763*. Merriam’s successor, noted Massachusetts Institute of Technology engineer Vannevar Bush, reduced financial support to a level that effectively discontinued the program in its proposed form.

---


Additional Mid-20th Century Initiatives in St. Augustine

Private efforts in St. Augustine during the 1930s achieved some success. The circa 1750 coquina stone residence of royal Spanish Treasurer Juan Esteban de Peña had been owned by the Dr. Seth Peck family since 1837. In 1931 Peck’s granddaughter and only direct heir, Anna Gardener Burt, offered the property to the City of St. Augustine as a house museum. The Woman’s Exchange organization of which Miss Burt was a founding member, stepped forward to partner with the City on the project. The private organization rehabilitated the house and opened it in 1932 as the Pena-Peck House.²⁴

Judge David Ross Dunham, President of the St. Augustine Historical Society, owned his aunt’s Louisa Fatio’s Spanish colonial residence. He collaborated with his Fatio cousin, Mrs. Richard P. (Mary Goff Palmer) Daniel of Jacksonville, President of The National Society of The Colonial Dames of America in The State of Florida (NSCDA) to restore the residence. Their efforts led to preservation of the Ximenez-Fatio House the family’s sole historic house in the New World. The property opened as a house museum in 1946.²⁵

Federal government initiatives through the Works Progress Administration (WPA) assisted local projects. These included the St. Augustine Civic Center (now the Visitor Information Center) west of Fort Marion. Arguably, the most dramatic project was


construction in 1937 of the U.S. Custom House and Post Office on the west side of the Plaza de la Constitución. Designed by Jacksonville native and architect Mellon Greeley and referred to as Government House, the building incorporated extant window and door openings and vestiges of wall sections from the 18th century coquina stone Governor’s Palace. The interior evidenced the mid-20th century construction techniques, building materials, and uses.26

The inaugural public project was reconstruction of the Cubo defense line adjacent to Fort Marion (Castillo de San Marcos). In 1933 the National Park Service had assumed management of the property. William R. Kenan, Jr., Florida East Coast Railway and Hotel Ponce de Leon chief executive and brother-in-law of Henry M. Flagler, invested in reconstruction of the defense line. The project was not completed.27

In an article published in the *Hispanic American Historical Review* in 1944, Manucy wrote of the international role played by the city in representing Spain’s important and enduring claim to settlement in the New World. He noted the difficulty of funding domestic issues in the midst of World War II, “When peace does come,” he wrote, “the citizens of St. Augustine intend to see that the historical value of their town for producing sympathetic understanding of the Spanish part in the pageant of the New World is fully realized—and developed as thoroughly and accurately as it can be.”28


Private initiatives resuscitated the city’s tourism economy immediately after the war. In 1946 Chicago industrialist and collector Otto Lightner purchased the Alcazar Hotel vacant since 1932. In 1948 the Lightner Museum of Hobbies opened in the former casino wing of the Hotel and showcased Lightner’s collections. In the 1960s, the hotel section facing King Street and framing the courtyard became City Hall.29

Also in 1948 George L. Potter opened the nation’s first wax museum on the southwest corner of King Street and the bayfront, now known as the A1A Building. He filled the building with hundreds of life-size historical and legendary wax figures, many in romantic fairytale settings. One exhibit reproduced Queen Victoria holding court; another depicted John and Jackie Kennedy arriving for St. Augustine’s Quadricentennial celebration. A scaled back version of Potter’s Wax Museum remains.30

Robert Ripley came to St. Augustine in the 1930s, staying in Norton Baskin’s Castle Warden. Ripley tried unsuccessfully for years to purchase the property. His heirs succeeded; in 1950 they opened Ripley’s Odditorium. Later known as Ripley’s Believe It or Not, the St. Augustine site became the precursor of the international franchise by the same name. Although known mostly from its role as the Ripley attraction, the property


continues to be used for the same purpose. The house of Standard Oil partner William Warden’s remained accurately preserved on the exterior.  

Paralleling the effort in St. Augustine was the public-private partnership that operated during the same time to preserve Spanish resources in Monterey, California. In both cases the Carnegie Institution participated with local and state officials and community residents. Though both efforts stalled during World War II, the Monterey effort succeeded due to a coherent plan and a unified political approach.

In his seminal evaluation of the early historic preservation movement in the United States Charles Hosmer criticized the efforts in St. Augustine, “There were so many conflicting interests and goals in St. Augustine” he noted, “that it is impossible, at least up to the year 1950, to judge whether the preservation movement in the town ever was a success.” He acknowledged, however, that, “It is possible to argue that this Florida resort community did take a leading position in the preservation movement for a while simply by providing a model” for public-private efforts.

**St. Augustine Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission**

Walter B. Fraser, St. Augustine’s mayor from 1935 to 1943, during the inception of the Depression-era preservation effort, was elected to the Florida Senate in 1944. He used that statewide role to champion a reinvigorated preservation program for St.

---


32 Hosmer, *Preservation Comes of Age*, 331.

Augustine focused on Spanish colonial history. Fraser assisted in the release of State funds promised before World War II. In concert with the St. Augustine Preservation and Restoration Association, he invited Kenneth Chorley president of the New York-based Colonial Williamsburg, Inc., to visit St. Augustine. At that time Colonial Williamsburg operated on an annual budget of $2,000,000 from visitor receipts and employed 1,000 people. Chorley’s visit was in response to a request from the Restoration Association for funding from John D. Rockefeller, Jr. Chorley and his wife came on February 23, 1947, spending five days as guests of the Ponce. Chorley experienced the historic district, repeatedly visiting “every building open to the public” and spoke with about fifty tourists. He met with members of the Restoration Association. After Chorley returned to New York he provided a detailed report of his visit with recommendations to Restoration Association Acting President Judge David R. Dunham with a copy to Senator Fraser. Chorley’s report noted that Rockefeller had reiterated his commitment to continue exclusively with Colonial Williamsburg, a pledge he had made at the beginning of that project. Obviously, St. Augustine leaders had hoped that Rockefeller’s decision would be changed as a result of Chorley’s visit.34

Chorley echoed earlier opinions by national preservation experts that St. Augustine’s success required an approach based on authenticity. He recommended “more history and background material” for guided tours to gain a “coherent story of St. Augustine.” His recommendations to emphasize St. Augustine’s colonial period exclusively contrasted with earlier recommendations championing an approach that presented a broader interpretation. As he stated,

The sponsoring organization should acquire title to, or lease, all property within the boundaries of the ancient city with the possible exception of the churches.

All historic buildings existing should be restored on the outside and all which are to be opened to the public restored on the inside.

All modern structures should be removed from the area or torn down.

All historic buildings which have been destroyed should be reconstructed. Those [sic] opened to the public restored on the inside: others should have modern interiors and be rented.

All restoration and reconstruction should include outbuildings, if any, gardens, sidewalks, streets, street lighting, signs, and undergrounding of all wires.

Defense lines surrounding the area should be reconstructed.

A coordinated educational program, under the guidance of historical experts, should be established.”

He concluded his assessment with the following recommendations:

“My final suggestion is that whatever you do, you immediately re-examine the motivating purposes which underlie your present and future exploitation of St. Augustine’s historical treasures. From such reexamination I hope would come:

A A merging of all interests of all interests into a well[-]coordinated program

B A raising of your standards both as to what you are exhibiting and the manner in which you are exhibiting it

C The divorcement [sic] of commercial activities from your educational program.

D The restoration of what you now have in an authentic manner so as to give the public confidence in what you may do in the future

E The elimination of the confusion and disappointment that the average visitor goes away with
Although failing to gain Rockefeller funding, Chorley’s visit and the announcement of State funding reactivated statewide interest in St. Augustine’s restoration program.  

State-supported efforts to preserve Spanish colonial St. Augustine were rekindled in 1958 with a proposal authored by a Special Advisory Committee and the Florida Board of Parks and Historic Memorials. The plan emphasized the following points: a focus on First Spanish Period with inclusion of British and Second Spanish Period, a time frame of 1565-1821; the community would continue to serve citizens; Spanish architecture, life and culture would be reintroduced; an archival research center would be established; and property located outside St. Augustine that shares common history with the oldest city would be added to the interpretation.

In 1959, following legislation introduced by State Senator Verle A. Pope of St. Augustine, Florida established the Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission, “with an appropriation of $150,000 by the Florida legislature” to protect and restore St. Augustine’s Spanish colonial heritage and create a “Florida Williamsburg.” The Commission’s authority included the power “to acquire, hold, rent, lease and dispose of real and personal property…condemn property, engage in slum clearance, to build or rebuild historical sites and to tear down existing buildings…” Governor LeRoy Collins

---


36 Committee members included: A Curtis Wilgus, University of Florida; Roland Dean, Winter Park; Karl A. Bickel, Sarasota; August Burghard, Fort Lauderdale; and J. D. Johnson, Pensacola. Verne Chatelain emerged from retirement to serve as Executive Secretary. The Parks Board chaired by St. Augustine attorney Frank D. Upchurch included John Fite Robertson, Sarasota; Howard Odom, Marianna; Kathryn Abbey Hanna, Winter Park; and John D. Pennekamp, Miami. Mayor then Senator Walter Fraser suffered a stroke in 1958 and was bedridden the following year, remaining so until his death in 1972. Fraser interview, February 4, 2013. St. Augustine Restoration Foundation, Inc., Archives, The St. Augustine Restoration Plan. St. Augustine has Unique Restoration Commission, *St. Augustine Record*, September 8, 1965, 7B.
appointed the members of the Florida Quadricentennial Commission. They represented business and community interests from throughout the state and the nation.37

This Restoration Commission launched a major effort in 1965 coinciding with the Quadricentennial or 400th anniversary of the city’s founding. In an interview by journalist John Schaffner, executive director Newton stated, “The purpose of the celebration and the restoration of the colonial city is to focus national attention on the Hispanic origins of America in 1965 and to create in the restored Spanish city a permanent cultural bridge to the Hispanic nations.” According to the Commission's Master Plan, St. Augustine’s annual visitation numbered one million with that number projected to increase due to the anniversary. “[To] dramatize the Spanish contribution to the life and culture of the New World, and tell the story to Americans... a restored Spanish colonial city would offer the most sympathetic setting possible.” City officials modified codes to eradicate blight and discourage demolition of Spanish buildings; to foster compatible infill construction; to spur commercial redevelopment; and to restore features along the waterfront.38


38St. Augustine Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission, A Florida State Commission, Master Plan. (typescript copy, City of St. Augustine,1960), preface, n.p. Rick Bothwell, Florida Will Show a Colorful Past to Visitors Beginning Next Year, St. Petersburg Times, December 20, 1958, accessed December 14, 2009,
With financial commitments from the State, St. Johns County, and the City of St. Augustine, the program revived goals from earlier efforts to ensure, “authentic residences . . . being restored by various groups and private citizens form the core of the restoration movement.” The decision to emphasize Spanish colonial history combined with the deteriorated condition of many Victorian-era and 20th century buildings built within the original town plan, led to demolition of these newer buildings. This program “restored” or recreated nearly fifty buildings and included participation by several countries, including Spain and the Pan American Union members in the effort.  

The Spanish colonial city was comprised of five distinct zones, from north to south that showcased numerous historic and entertaining venues:

- Mission Area headquartered at the Mission de Nombre de Dios and administered by the Catholic Church;
- Castle and City Gate Area centered around the Castillo de San Marcos and City Gate and hosted by the National Park Service;
- North Restoration Area focused on the Pan American Center, Spanish Garden and Casa del Hidalgo and featuring dozens of restored/reconstructed buildings;
- Plaza Area recognizing the Spanish importance of church and state, linked by the Bridge of Lions to the St. Augustine Amphitheatre on the east and, on the west to Henry Flagler’s properties, including the County Courthouse; and


South Restoration Area/Calle San Francisco operated under the auspices of the St. Augustine Historical Society and included the Franciscan Convent/St. Francis Barracks.40

Initially, the Restoration Commission’s program focused on four properties, three of which were funded through private entities. Begun in 1961, the first project funded by the State of Florida was the Arrivas House, 46 St. George Street, which served as a headquarters for the Restoration Commission. The next year two projects were started, the Fornells House, 32A St. George Street, done by the St. Augustine Historical Society and the Avero-Salcedo House, 42 St. George Street. A fourth project begun in 1958, the Rodriguez-Avero-Sanchez House at 52 St. George Street, was restored with Mr. and Mrs. Walter Scott Crawbuck as the Museum of Yesterday’s Toys to honor their deceased son. By the time of the Quadricentennial celebration three blocks along north St. George Street represented Spanish colonial architecture.41

The Quadricentennial Anniversary and the Restoration

In 1962 Congress had chartered and

President Kennedy had appointed a federal commission [of six citizens from throughout the United States] to plan for the Quadricentennial…Florida [Democratic] Senators Spessard Holland [Bartow] and George Smathers [Miami], Congressmen [Republicans and stalwart segregationists] D. R. (Billy) Matthews and William C. Cramer[,] and George B. Hartzog, Jr., director of the National Park Service…

In 1963 President Kennedy appointed additional members: Herbert E. Wolfe, St. Augustine, Chairman; Henry Ford II, Detroit; J. Peter Grace, Jr., CEO of W. R. Grace &

40St. Augustine Record, September 8, 1965, 7B.

Co.; Archbishop Joseph P. Hurley, St. Augustine; Edward Litchfield, Ph.D., Chancellor of the University of Pittsburgh; and Charles Clark, Washington. On March 11, 1963, Vice President Lyndon B. Johnson visited St. Augustine to dedicate the city’s first restored building, the Arrivas House. He “slipped away from his official duties long enough” for Father Michael V. Gannon to show him the casket of the city’s founder Don Pedro Menendez de Aviles at the La Leche Shrine north of downtown. According to Gannon, the Vice President was humbled by the site; at the time Johnson was 55 years old, the same age as Menendez had been when he died. One of the objectives of the Quadricentennial anniversary’s restoration program was the involvement of the international community in the establishment of a series of five structures, each representing an era in the development of St. Augustine’s history: Spanish, British, American, Florida, and Latin American.

---


The Spanish heritage in this country is one of the greatest among those which today blend to form the United States, and it is a source of great satisfaction to me to note the growing movement in this country to recognize this contribution. The symbolic observances held during 1965 in St. Augustine, Florida, the oldest city in the United States, on the occasion of the 400th anniversary and its founding by the Spanish Admiral, Pedro Menendez de Aviles, is but one example.

Lyndon B. Johnson, President of the United States
1965

The government of Spain constructed the Spanish Exhibition and Cultural Center or the Casa del Hidalgo on St. George and Hypolita Streets, replacing the Weinstein Building. The structure which served as a Spanish Tourist Information Office required an investment of about $200,000, including land, building construction, and furnishings. The building’s style reflected that of an 18th century country house. On September 5, 1965, Secretary of the Interior Stewart Udall with General Alonso Vega and Secretary General Mora, dedicated the Casa del Hidalgo and, in the adjacent Spanish Garden, nationally-known artist Anna Hyatt Huntington’s bronze statue of Queen Isabella. Dignitaries from throughout the United States and Spain attended the festivities. In 2003 to further preservation of the building, the City of St. Augustine “purchased the
building from the Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED), Spain’s national distance learning university” for about $2.6 million. The Spanish Garden is owned by the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc.45

Latin American participation came under the auspices of the Organization of American States. The Pan American Union (PAU) members, “Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Guatemala, Honduras, Paraguay, and the United States” planned exhibits to be housed in reconstructed colonial buildings which were to be constructed by the PAU member nations, “It [the historical restoration program] is unusual also in that it has involved a more extensive degree of international participation than any other program of this kind in the country.” Sponsors for land acquisition and reconstruction of the Florencia House to serve as the Centro Panamericano/Pan American Center came from American corporations with business investments in Latin America: “Ford, General Motors, Humble-Esso, Texaco, Gulf, Dupont, American Tel. & Tel., W. R. Grace, American and Foreign Power, Johnson and Johnson, and others.” This property continues to be owned by the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc.46

In 1960 the State of Florida financed the Wakeman House, known as the Heritage House, for the Florida State Exhibit Center. The Restoration Commission with


a loan of $200,000 reconstructed the facility, “the exhibit set up and operated by the Florida Development Commission tells the story of Florida from the Indians (an original burial ground can be seen through an opening in the floor), the Spanish treasure fleets (the state’s great treasure of Spanish gold is on display) up to the present.” The reconstruction of this structure built in 1800 necessitated the demolition of the 20th century commercial Bernstein Block.47

Two decades later this property became mired in political in-fighting and controversy. According to a prominent citizen and long-time St. Augustine resident, a member of the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board sold the property without authorization from the State or the Board. Funds were to be deposited into a revolving fund for the purchase of additional properties. This action did not take place, and the proceeds from the sale disappeared. Today, the Wakeman Building has a business on the first floor and apartments on the second.48

As part of the State-funded project the British era was presented through the ca. 1779 Watson House, a property located south of the Plaza on Charlotte Street immediately south of the Wakeman House. The post-and-beam construction building “is the first truly English building in the restoration program” and recognized carpenter William Watson’s contribution to St. Augustine’s history. Watson owned several


buildings in that section of St. Augustine as well as two substantial farms outside the city limits. The cost for this component was $15,000.49

Sections of downtown both north and south of the central plaza received attention. Since more of the original building stock in the oldest area south of the Plaza was intact the primary focus was on the area north of the Plaza. Another advantage to an emphasis there was the proximity to the Spanish fort,

The MISSION 66 program for the Castillo...calls for moving all administrative and utility uses now in the historic structure to proposed new facilities on an adjoining property. For better visitor understanding and convenience, the programs calls for reconstruction of drawbridges, gun carriages and artillerymen’s tools, more graphic museum exhibits in the form of dioramas and scale models, restoration of original sally-port grades, and a rearrangement of restrooms.

Beginning in 1952 a National Park Service program, Mission 66, generated funds to improve federal park properties—their infrastructure and interpretation—in time to celebrate the 50th anniversary of the National Park Service in 1966. The initiative provided $1 million (equivalent to $7,230,000 in 2012) to the Castillo for physical and interpretive improvements with an accelerated time frame to coincide with St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary. National Park Service director Conrad Wirth served on St. Augustine’s federal Quadricentennial Commission. With an annual visitation of 500,000, the Castillo provided an excellent location for interpretive expert Freeman Tilden to test his principles regarding interpretation there, including introducing cannon

---

firing. His principles became incorporated in *Interpreting Our Heritage*, published in 1957, and still considered a definitive work.\(^{50}\)

In 1963 Bert C. Roberts, National Park Service official, stated that federal projects would include, "restoration of Cubo Line, City Gates, [Gate] court yard rooms, mounting artillery on carriages and restoration work on certain inside rooms of the Fort … replacing all exhibits….installing storm drains and sewers on the Fort green, a sprinkler system, waterproofing [sic] the gun deck…constructing a library, an administration building and a utility building. . . relocation of Highway A1A according to an agreement made some years ago…" \(^{51}\)

Between 1963 and 1965 the National Park Service continued restoration on the Castillo de San Marcos. An administrative structure built at the north end of the property was named in honor of St. Augustine native, historian, and NPS staff member Albert Manucy. Also, the Cubo Line, part of the fortification that surrounded the town originally, was reconstructed in concrete materials to present the appearance of palm tree trunks laid horizontally and vertically. An irrigation system and foot paths were installed. A major infrastructure change was realignment of Highway A1A as it passed through downtown St. Augustine to promote easier access via the Bridge of Lions to


Anastasia Island. The roadway southward from the City Gate, restored by NPS also, was widened to two lanes each way, and a parking lot was added to the south side of the Castillo grounds. These changes necessitated an appropriation of $250,000 and negotiation with landowners having properties near the City Gate, including Victor Rahner, Sr. for his photography studio. The Bennett Hotel was bought from Kenneth Dow. The total expenditure for the properties was $413,000. Both properties were demolished.52

In the early 1960s the Fort was proposed for another role. On October 23, 1962, following the Cuban Missile Crisis, this public announcement drew mixed reactions, “The famed Castillo de San Marcos, which repelled enemy invaders of St. Augustine for 200 years, will be used as a bomb shelter in the event of a nuclear attack that would endanger America’s oldest city.” The County proposed an alternative plan – to use the Hotel Ponce de Leon for such purpose as it could hold more people and was more solidly built.53

The original 1724 Franciscan Convent, converted into the St. Francis Barracks during the British occupation of St. Augustine during the American Revolution and used for military purposes since that time, underwent a transformation. The building had been abandoned by the Army in 1900 and used by the State of Florida since 1907. In 1921 Congress donated the structure to the State of Florida. With an appropriation from the Florida Legislature, St. Augustine architect Francis A. Hollingsworth orchestrated a renovation of the exterior and updated the interior of the building. Beginning in the

52Roberts letter to Behm.
53Ancient City Will Use Old Fort as A-Shelter, St. Augustine Record, October 24, 1962.
1950s the building became home to the Florida National Guard and continues so today. Under the direction of Adjutant-General of the Army National Guard Henry MacMillan, and with assistance from Air National Guard director Charles Riggle, the site was investigated archaeologically.\textsuperscript{54}

In 1954 the St. Augustine Historical Society celebrated the restoration of the Fernandez Llambias House at 31 St. Francis Street, near the St. Francis Barracks at the southern end of the Spanish colonial town. The City of St. Augustine, owner of the property, provided funds as did the St. Augustine Restoration and Preservation Commission, and the State of Florida, the last entity through a state grant of $50,000 provided before World War II. The Historical Society’s efforts continued in 1961 with reconstruction of the de la Rosa House on Marine Street and addition of a research library in a reconstructed Alexander-O’Donovan-O’Reilly House on Charlotte Street.\textsuperscript{55}

In 1961 St. Johns County government joined the 400\textsuperscript{th} Anniversary effort by acquiring Henry Flagler’s mothballed Hotel Cordova for $250,000 from William Rand Kenan, Jr., president of the Florida East Coast Hotel Company. The building was converted to an administration building reflecting institutional design of the 1960s. To achieve that modernization, the 1880s elegance was eradicated. Historic photographs from the hotel era exist as the sole evidence of the building’s interiors. Four decades later Orlando hotelier Richard Kessler bought the property from the County for the same amount and recreated Gilded Age grandeur sufficient to host 21\textsuperscript{st} century VIPs including

\textsuperscript{54}Florida Military Headquarters Building was Once Franciscan Monastery, Convent, \textit{St. Augustine Record}, September 8, 1965, 4B. Florida Site File Form, 8SJ10 St. Francis Barracks, City of St. Augustine files.

Spain’s King Juan Carlos and Queen Sofia on April 1, 2001, and President Bill Clinton in March of 2012.  

The Florida National Exhibits Corporation, discussed earlier in the section on the Great Depression, grew into the nation’s largest exhibit design organization. The company launched a massive and imaginative program at the 1963 New York World’s Fair celebrating that city’s 325th anniversary. The State of Florida appropriated $1,000,000 to assist with Florida’s participation in the World’s Fair, about twenty percent (20%) of the cost. On September 9, 1964, Hurricane Dora wreaked hundreds of thousands of dollars of damage throughout northeast Florida. None of St. Augustine’s restoration projects experienced damage; however, many of the city’s “precious old trees” succumbed to the winds and rain. The area rebounded from the damage, and in 1965 more than 14,000,000 people visited Florida. 

In 1957 St. Augustine had revived the Easter celebrations that defined its cultural identity. The city hosted 40,000 attendants for the Easter celebration held on Sunday, April 18, 1965. Named “‘Parada de los Caballos y Coches’” (Parade of Horses and Coaches), the event ran two miles in length along San Marco Avenue south through the downtown, a route still followed today. The 1972 parade was most memorable, with winter residents Cornelius Vanderbilt Whitney, co-founder and owner of Marineland, and his wife Marylou coming for the celebration, “The Easter Parade in St. Augustine is

56 Actions Speak Louder Than Words, St. Augustine Record, November 5, 1961, 8A.

57 Joel Hoffman, 77 – 86. Charles Stafford, Sliced by Summer’s Storms, Gainesville Sun, September 13, 1964. Florida’s closest attempt to host a world’s fair came with the 500th anniversary of Columbus’ landing in the New World. Miami served as the proposed location for the October 1992 event. If the celebration had occurred there another world-renowned event would have preempted the celebration by a few weeks and precluded the fair —Hurricane Andrew.
thrilling? Where else would you find wagons pulled by horses wearing hats that once belonged to famous women? And, guess what, some lucky horse is going to get to wear one of Mrs. Whitney’s . . . Looking on will be . . . Sonny and Marylou . . . “58

The Catholic Church achieved significant and lasting contributions to preserving and portraying religious New World history in St. Augustine. Archbishop Hurley directed renovation of the Cathedral Basilica and the building’s expansion by 4,000 square feet as part of the Quadricentennial preparations and in concert with Vatican II. That effort included demolition of a block of buildings at the northeast corner of St. George and Cathedral Streets to reestablish the Cathedral’s original setting.59

On March 8, 1966, six months into the year-long 400th anniversary celebration, St. Augustine hosted a dinner at the Ponce for His Eminence William Cardinal Conway of Ireland who recognized, “The Cathedral of St. Augustine is the Mother Church of the Diocese of St. Augustine and has been such since its erection in the year of Our Lord Eighteen Hundred and Seventy.” Honored guests included Governors LeRoy Collins and Claude Kirk and C. V. and Marylou Whitney of Marineland.60


Gannon championed the restoration effort. He noted that "the church and community raised $6,000,000 for preservation of St. Augustine’s colonial city, emphasizing authenticity and requiring employment of academics, one each with a doctorate in history and in archaeology. Decades later this emphasis would translate into establishment of the Historic St. Augustine Research Institute, an academic partnership hosted by Flagler College with the University of Florida and funded by the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc.  

Gannon verified that private individuals and organizations funded the bulk of the restoration in the colonial city. Between 1964 and 1966 private gifts of $600,000 were received, matching the State funds 2:1. Investors included local business leaders and community residents. Leonard Tucker reconstructed the Carmona-Salcedo House for a camera shop. The Suarez-McHenry House became offices for the Thompson-Bailey Agency. On November 2, 1972, newspapers announced that St. Augustine Restoration, Inc. had received a gift of $50,000 from Florida Senator Verle Pope for acquisition of 49-53 St. George Street, enabling demolition of the Paffe building on that property and reconstruction of the Francisco Pellicer-Jose de Burgos House.  

Assistance came from Jacksonville businesses and individuals with ties to St. Augustine. For example, Ring Power founder and St. Augustine resident L. C. (Lance Christian) Ringhaver restored the Oliveros House at 59 St. George Street. Following

---

\(^{61}\) Gannon interview.  

his death, his widow donated the property to the St. Augustine Foundation. Today, the Flagler’s Legacy Tours occupies the building. Two State of Florida properties benefitted. Gannon introduced Florida East Coast Railroad chairman Ed Ball to the restoration effort. Ball and his sister, philanthropist Jessie Ball (widow of Mrs. Alfred I.) duPont, underwrote restoration of the Sanchez de Ortigosa House at 60 St. George Street. About 1971 civic leader, Colonial Dame, and Florida State Parks board chair Elizabeth Morley Towers became the benefactor for 57 Treasury Street. Towers contacted architect Herschel Shepard to assist her with selection and restoration of the property that, after restoration, she donated to the State, retaining a life estate.  

Figure 4-4. LBJ at St. Augustine 1963

As St. Augustine attracted a national audience for the 400\textsuperscript{th} anniversary activities, the oldest city drew nationwide attention for a role in the final chapter of the Civil Rights

Movement. As with many southern cities St. Augustine was segregated geographically, socially, economically, and politically, through its application of Jim Crow laws.\(^{64}\)

In 1830, African-Americans accounted for almost half of the city’s population. The Spanish settlers were more tolerant than their English counterparts. Free and enslaved African-Americans had a limited amount of independence. As post-Civil War tourism brought increases to the white population, the composition of the population changed. Historians credited Henry Flagler’s tourism development with preventing worsening relations in the late 19\(^{th}\) century, “a more civil relationship [developed] between black and white residents.”\(^{65}\)

The first half of the 20\(^{th}\) century increased St. Augustine’s white population and decreased the African-American population. Heightened racial tension after World War II drew attention to many Southern cities, including St. Augustine. In 1960 African-Americans comprised nearly one-quarter of the city’s population, concentrated in Lincolnville south of King Street and west of City Hall. This area had developed after the Civil War by former slaves and free blacks. White winter residents built cottages there, too. West of downtown across the new business road U.S. 1 was another African-American enclave. Whites and African-Americans lived in both areas.\(^{66}\)

After Kennedy established the Quadricentennial Commission, on March 11, 1963, Vice-President Johnson visited, and suddenly the nation’s oldest city garnered


\(^{66}\)Ibid.
national attention. African-Americans had been excluded from the 400th anniversary preparations, an action that drew national attention as well. This action brought outside activists on both sides of the Civil Rights conflict to St. Augustine. Martin Luther King, Jr., and his supporters came into direct confrontation with Ku Klux Klan leaders who had come from Georgia.67

Between the Vice-President’s visit and Congress’s ratification of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 fifteen months later, the Civil Rights battle came to a critical juncture in St. Augustine. During that period peaceful demonstrations became violent. M. L. King, Jr. was arrested, the only time he was arrested in Florida. Andrew Young was beaten. The Commission lost its pledged $500,000 per year in federal funding.68

On March 31, 1964, the Ponce was the site of two events. Vice President Johnson’s advisors mandated that African-Americans be included in the banquet in his honor. After negotiations two tables for African-Americans drew mixed feelings, “The first Negroes to present themselves there as guests instead of doormen would make themselves as conspicuous as the Ponce itself.” A year later Murray High School students led a group of 150 singing through downtown to the Ponce where they “tried to stage a sit-in” in the Dining Room. They left the premises peacefully.69

As the 50th anniversary of the Civil Rights Act approaches in 2014, Ambassador Andrew Young has returned repeatedly to St. Augustine, emphasizing healing. He returned as a guest of the City of St. Augustine and Flagler College to a different St.

Augustine and to the Ponce, now centerpiece of the College. His award winning “Crossing in St. Augustine” spurred a new chapter for the oldest city. He joined community leaders for dedication of a Civil Rights memorial in the Plaza de la Constitución and donated his civil rights archive in digital form to the College.70

Figure 4-5. Ambassador Andrew Young donating Civil Rights Archive, Flagler College

**St. Augustine Restoration Foundation, Inc.**

Henry Flagler’s great-nephew Lawrence Lewis, Jr., born at Flagler’s St. Augustine home Kirkside and raised there and in Richmond, Virginia, participated with the private and public efforts to preserve St. Augustine’s colonial heritage. Lewis and his sister Molly Lewis Wiley operated through their family’s Flagler Foundation, assisting St. Augustine and funding some of the restoration of Flagler’s Hotel Ponce de Leon as part of that building’s conversion to the headquarters for Flagler College. Over the years they supported preservation at the University of Virginia. Also, archaeologist Dr.

---

William Kelso considered his friend Lewis as the first supporter for the archaeological investigations that began in the 1980s ultimately locating Jamestown.  

In 1962 Lewis and other local citizens created the St. Augustine Restoration Foundation, Inc., to assist the colonial St. Augustine preservation effort. (Two decades later the foundation was renamed the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc.) William Rolleston of Marineland served as inaugural president. The Foundation acquired and rehabilitated or reconstructed several properties in the city’s historic business district. Five years later the Foundation and the Preservation Commission acquired a major property the De Mesa-Sanchez House. Acquisition of properties had handicapped the Preservation Commission financially, resulting in “accumulated debt totaled nearly $300,000.” With annual gifts of $150,000 from the Flagler Foundation ($1,000,000 today), the debt was paid.

The Flagler Foundation underwrote the Preservation Commission’s portion of the restoration program over the next several years. On October 31, 1972, the Flagler Foundation made a gift to assist with reconstruction of the Villalonga House. The community’s fundraising event on September 8 of that year Fiesta de Menendez had raised $35,000 toward a goal of $50,000 projected to be needed for the project. This was the first event for the Restoration Commission in its new role as the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board, an entity of the State of Florida.

---

72 Lawrence Lewis, Jr., An Open Letter to the Citizens of St. Augustine and St. Johns County, St. Augustine Record, July 12, 1988, 10A.
Between 1968 and 1970 Lewis provided more than $150,000 for reconstruction of the east wing of the Spanish Treasurer's house. This work returned the house to its original U form from the L shape it had maintained for a century. As stated earlier, this property had been donated to the City of St. Augustine and was managed by the Woman's Exchange, a charitable organization.\textsuperscript{74}

Lewis approached restaurant developer Cesar Gonzmart to participate in the restoration program. Gonzmart opened a Columbia Restaurant at the northwest corner of St. George and Hypolita Streets. Similar to the original in Tampa’s Cuban Ybor City, St. Augustine’s Columbia Restaurant anchored the center of the business district. The reconstructed Spanish colonial building replaced the Gilded Age City Hall that was constructed by Henry Flagler and demolished by the City government.\textsuperscript{75}

In May of 1977 the Foundation announced publicly an ambitious venture the research for which had begun several years earlier. A $7,000,000 living history program “1580 St. Augustine Village” was proposed to be created on 50 acres of land north of St. Augustine. The site was near the Ponce de Leon Lodge on Flagler System property inherited by Lewis and his sister. According to architect Herschel Shepard who considered his role to be minor, “Lewis enlisted Albert Manucy, Paul Hoffmann, Eugene Lyon, and Kathleen Deagan to provide research for the reconstruction, and a California firm that specialized in theme parks to assist in planning the village.”\textsuperscript{76}

\textsuperscript{74}Lewis, An Open Letter, 10A.

\textsuperscript{75}Bailey interview.

\textsuperscript{76}Waterbury, 210-12. Shepard interview.
In 1974 under the directorship of Dr. John Griffin the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board had endorsed the project. This was during the project’s research phase. Drs. Hoffman and Lyon spent the summer of 1974-1975 in the Archive of the Indies at Sevilla, Spain, and returned with sixteen rolls of microfilmed records addressing 16th century life in St. Augustine. Manucy provided assistance with descriptions on buildings, drawings and interpretation. Dr. Deagan’s archaeological investigation in 1976 indicated that the town was located south of the Plaza and bounded on the north by Artillery Lane, east by Marine Street, south by Bridge Street, and west by St. George Street. Through their collective efforts a picture was created based on archival records of the 1580 town with and wooden fort and rows of thatched houses for the 250 estimated inhabitants.77

Unfortunately, the nation’s economic recession forced an announcement on January 8, 1981, of the program’s postponement. Though the program was not revived, Lewis and other Foundation members channeled energies into a project with the National Geographic Society. In 1983 the two organizations made a movie, “Struggle to Survive” and then a second one, “Dream of Empire” as well as an exhibit installed in Government House. Lewis stated that “Al Manucy will have the final word on Spanish dwellings and buildings, as well as weaponry…Kathy Deagan should be called on regarding Indian culture and related matters.” Thirty years later, Deagan served as the

principal scholar for a new exhibit in Government House, “First Colony” introducing more research on St. Augustine.78

One of the Foundation’s greatest scholarly successes took place during Dr. Eugene Lyon’s tenure as executive director. The project began with dialogue led by Monsignor Michael V. Gannon, Director of the Institute for Early Contact Period Studies at the University of Florida. In 1987 with support from the university administration and funding from the Foundation, Menendez family papers were microfilmed in Spain, enabling their translation and use to advance scholarship and a greater understanding of Spanish colonial settlement.79

In 1989 the final chapter in the relationship between the Foundation and the Preservation Board began. The State of Florida, on behalf of the St. Augustine Preservation Board, initiated legal action against the St. Augustine Foundation over properties on St. George Street, specifically ownership of the “Acosta House, Spanish Garden, Oliveros House, Ortega House, Pan American Building, Santoya House and Villalonga House.” In 1994 the case ended: “[both parties] stipulate to the dismissal of this action with prejudice.” In a press release issued after the settlement the State noted, “The State also wishes to acknowledge specially the many contributions Mr. Lawrence Lewis, Jr., a director of the Foundation, has unselfishly made and continues to make to the city of St. Augustine and the people of the state of Florida, and the key role he played in helping to settle the lawsuit.” The Foundation retained its position as

78Foundation Archives, Lawrence Lewis, Jr., letter to Dennis B. Kane, National Geographic Society, February 7, 1983.

79Restoration Foundation Archives, miscellaneous correspondence.
owner of the properties, but that should dissolution occur, the properties would be transferred to the State of Florida.  

**St. Augustine Preservation Efforts after the Quadricentennial Anniversary**

In 1968, physical and economic successes that had taken place over the previous decade led the Florida Legislature to convert the Restoration Commission to a Preservation Board, designed to be one of a dozen to oversee historic properties in Florida communities. St. Augustine was proposed to serve as the model for establishing partnerships to preserve community cultural resources. The program focused on architecture, archaeology, documentary research, and cartography.

Administratively, Preservation Boards were under the supervision, including “budget review and approval authority” of the Secretary of State.  

Earle Newton, director of the Restoration Commission, served as a driving force during the initial phase of St. Augustine’s restoration program. “Newton arrived in St. Augustine with impeccable credentials” and remarkable contacts. He returned to the area in his retirement, living at Ponte Vedra Beach until his death in 2006. However, Newton’s time with the Commission was clouded with controversy. According to a 1979 story in *The Florida Times-Union*,

---


I knew there were problems, said [Lawrence] Lewis [, Jr.] Nothing criminal that we could prove, just things that shouldn’t have been done. When I took over I couldn’t get Earle Newton out of here fast enough.

The 1979 article continued,

[Dr. Michael] Gannon’s blessings [regarding others involved with the Commission] do not extend to Earle Newton….’Nobody who occupies such a position should enrich himself because he possessed confidential or privileged information,

Newton acquired properties which would be part of the restoration program and resold them for personal gain: “extracurricular real estate transactions”. In 1968 Newton left St. Augustine for a similar position as director of the newly-formed Pensacola Preservation Board. 82

In 1984 the U.S. Department of the Interior designated the St. Augustine Town Plan National Historic Landmark District, recognizing St. Augustine as the “oldest continuously occupied European city in the continental United States,” as significant on a national level. During that decade the City of St. Augustine made a significant—both substantively and financially—infrastructure investment along north St. George Street, redesigning the sewer systems, installing underground utilities, converting the street to

82 Newton founded two magazines, Vermont Life and American Heritage, in the late 1940s. Over his long and distinguished career, he was director of historical research for Webster Publishing Company in St. Louis; director of the Vermont Historical Society; director of Old Sturbridge Village in Massachusetts; director of the Institute on Historical and Archival Management at Radcliffe-Harvard Universities; director of the Pennsylvania Bureau of Museums and Historic Properties; director of the Museum of Art, Science and Industry in Bridgeport, Conn.; executive director of the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board; director general of the National Quadricentennial Commission; president of St. Augustine Restoration Inc.; acting director of libraries at Flagler College, St. Augustine; executive director of the Pensacola Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission; acting chancellor of Mark Hopkins College, Brattleboro, Vt.; Executive Director of the Richmondstreet Restoration, Long Island; adjunct professor of humanities and honorary fellow at Norwich University, Vt.; director of the Museum of the Americas, Vt.; and donor of and consultant to the Earle W. Newton Center for British and American Studies at the Savannah College of Art and Design. Earle Williams Newton II Obituary, St. Augustine Record, May 28, 2006. Dick Leggitt and Christine Hammer, After 20 Years, St. Augustine Still Dreams, The Florida Times-Union, October 18, 1979, A-1, A-10.
pedestrian only, redirecting traffic on the adjacent streets, and paving the street with coquina concrete. This project deviated from an authentic interpretation of the street’s appearance and destroyed archaeological resources. The improvements increased access to the built resources.83

In 1988 factions that had sparred for twenty years for control of the preservation program and development of the real estate came to blows. On one side was Lewis, Henry Flagler’s descendant and founder of Flagler College. Partnered with him were former Mayor John Bailey, Frank Upchurch, Dr. Michael Gannon, and other longstanding St. Augustine residents. The situation reached critical juncture when Governor Bob Martinez appointed William Daniell, triggering the resignation of executive director Robert Gold and board members Lewis and Gannon. In the September 1988 issue of *Jacksonville Today*, results of investigative reporting relayed Daniell’s fabricated credentials and employment history.84

The State of Florida reorganized the Preservation Boards, folding all under authority of the Secretary of State. In 1997 the State of Florida abolished the preservation boards, and the City of St. Augustine assumed management of the State of Florida properties in St. Augustine.

After a decade, City officials approached their legislative delegation requesting establishment of a system that had worked for several years in Pensacola. On July 1, 2010, the University of Florida assumed responsibility for the properties. This transition

83 National Park Service, SJ10 St. Augustine Historic District, National Historic Landmark Nomination.
was modeled on the partnership between the State of Florida, the University of West Florida, and West Florida Historic Preservation, Inc.

Though the effort that began in 1959 bespoke architectural authenticity, methods and materials were contemporary to the 1960s. Perhaps, damage from hurricanes Donna and Dora that wreaked havoc during this period, required new building standards. Replication of details or use of early construction techniques was omitted. For some buildings workmanship did not achieve standards that would enable the buildings to last for great lengths of time. As these buildings aged over the next half century, elements such as doors, windows, trim and balconies required redesign and repair.

Buildings in the Spanish colonial historic district are fifty years old, the minimum age for them to be considered for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. They could be considered as examples of commemorative buildings. Also, they could be considered as representative illustrations of building techniques used on the eve of passage of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. They could hold significance as evidence of an historic preservation and heritage tourism experiment between the governments of St. Augustine, the State of Florida, and the United States. In any case, the buildings assist in understanding an important chapter in the history of the nation, recognizing the importance of Spanish heritage at St. Augustine that began in 1565, half a century before the settlements at Jamestown, Virginia in 1607 or Plymouth, Massachusetts in 1620.

This major chapter in St. Augustine’s history, accomplished in tandem with the celebration of the 400th anniversary of the city’s founding, took place just over a decade
before the nation celebrated its 200th or Bicentennial anniversary in 1976. The new social movement, historic preservation, in its fledgling institutional phase, gained momentum with the 1976 festivities and broadened the understanding of the nation’s heritage. Preservation moved beyond an appreciation of mansions of founding fathers set in an arbitrary boundary “one acre, house center.” Entire neighborhoods and communities were designated as historic districts increasing the understanding of the importance of buildings from settlement through the early decades of the 20th century and the settings in which they are located. Archaeological sites were recognized, many times protected, in part, by their locations remaining undisclosed as restricted public records. Rural historic districts and cultural landscapes added to the breadth of the country’s heritage. This theoretical evolution set the stage for preservation of buildings from another chapter in St. Augustine’s history, those associated with Henry Flagler and the Gilded Age.
In the winter of 1883-1884 John D. Rockefeller, Sr., and his wife Laura spent part of the winter in St. Augustine, Florida. There they joined newlyweds Henry and Ida Alice Flagler who had married in June, but postponed their honeymoon until December to accommodate Flagler’s business schedule. Both couples returned to St. Augustine together the following winter. Rockefeller and Flagler, business partners since 1867, controlled the oil industry. Their business relationship mirrored an equally close friendship. Half a century later Rockefeller reminisced about Flagler,

He [H. M. Flagler] undertook, single handed, the task of building up the East Coast of Florida. He was not satisfied to plan a railroad from St. Augustine to Key West – a distance of more than six hundred miles, which would have been regarded as an undertaking large enough for almost any one man – but in addition he has built a chain of superb hotels to induce tourists to go to this newly developed country.

John D. Rockefeller, Sr.¹

Figure 5-1. Ponce [de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla.]

Flagler’s personal associations and business acumen fostered success in his oil and transportation investments and assisted him in the Florida ventures. Northern contacts proved strategic in establishing a transportation and resort hotel network that ran the length of Florida’s Atlantic coast, from St. Augustine to Key West, and ultimately to Cuba and the Bahamas. Arguably, Flagler’s role in the annals of the nation’s history claims more connection to this second career than to the success of his oil and railroad enterprises which provided the financial resources to sustain the later ventures.  

Rockefeller and Flagler proved inseparable and undefeatable, “Flagler continued to be the closest man to Rockefeller.” The men lived near each other, first on Euclid Avenue in Cleveland. Then, the families moved to New York where they lived across the street from each other at Fifth Avenue and 54th Street on Manhattan’s fashionable millionaire’s row.  

On January 10, 1870, Rockefeller and Flagler, and three other Ohio businessmen had formed the Standard Oil Company. The youthful John D. Rockefeller, 30 years old, and his brother William, 28, served as president and vice president, respectively. Flagler, the senior partner at age 40, served as secretary and treasurer.  

---


credited as being the legal mind of the company as well. Samuel Andrews and Flagler's brother-in-law Stephen V. Harkness held minority financial interests.\(^4\)

Twelve years later, on January 2, 1882, Flagler celebrated his 52\(^{nd}\) birthday with Rockefeller and seven other men by creating the Standard Oil Trust. That act concluded Flagler’s direct participation in operations of Standard Oil. He continued as a company trustee until 1911 when the U. S. Supreme Court found the company to be a monopoly in violation of U.S. anti-trust laws and legally dissolved the corporation.\(^5\)

Also in 1882, Flagler began to diversify his business interests. Henry Bradley Plant enlisted Henry Flagler, Henry Sanford, and eight other northern businessmen, incorporating the Plant Investment Company (PICO) in Plant’s home state of Connecticut to serve as a legal mechanism through which to develop Florida. Art historian Susan Braden noted regarding Flagler and Plant,

> The two men socialized together, visited each other’s domains in Florida, and shared an avid concern with promoting Florida’s image. One mutual associate, John Sewell, a Flagler employee who became mayor of Miami, described them as ‘best of friends.’ Flagler and Plant advertised each other’s hotels and publicized each other’s railroad schedules in their respective promotional literature.\(^6\)

---


Though Henry Plant resided in Georgia for many years, 1882 marked the thirtieth consecutive year that he wintered in Florida. His inaugural visit in 1853 by steamship from Savannah to Jacksonville to improve his wife’s health had included a buggy excursion southward along the Old King’s Road (Philips Highway or US1) to St. Augustine. Beginning in 1879, Plant began investing in Florida railroads, taking advantage of the State’s fragile financial position with regard to its railroad land. Plant’s passion for development continued throughout his lifetime. Upon his death in 1899 Plant left a legacy that included 2,000 miles of Georgia and Gulf Coast railroads, steamships, hotels – the Tampa Bay Hotel and Inn at Port Tampa, the Belleview Biltmore Hotel near Clearwater, the Hotel Kissimmee, the Hotel Seminole near Winter Park, the Ocala House – and a string of towns and villages.7

In 1870 Henry Sanford had founded the town of “Sanford” along the St. Johns River in what was at that time south Florida. Over the next decade, he developed the town with “a country store, a saw mill, a slaughterhouse, a hotel, and a real estate office.” He established the waterfront infrastructure and maintained a citrus grove, Belair. In 1881 Sanford’s friend and fellow Connecticut businessman Disston bought 4,000,000 acres of Florida from the State government. Two years later Disston incorporated the

---

town “Kissimmee” west of Sanford. PICO’s first investment in Florida was acquisition of
the South Florida Railroad that linked Sanford and Kissimmee.8

Additional PICO members included Baltimore businessmen and close friends
William Thompson Walters and Benjamin Franklin “Frank” Newcomer of the Northern
Central Railway. Newcomer served as president of the Union Railroad Company and
as a director of the Philadelphia, Wilmington and Baltimore Railroad Company. These
two men merged interests into the Atlantic Coast Line Company (now CSX Railroad).9

Partners included Edward B. Haskell, co-owner of the Boston Herald and an
investor in the South Florida Railroad. New Yorker Morris Ketchum Jessup, banker,
philanthropist, patron of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, and president of the American
Museum of Natural History and Connecticut railroad executive George H. Tilley
participated in PICO. Plant involved his family, too. Plant’s brothers-in-law Lorenzo
Blackstone, Connecticut banker, railroad developer, and politician and Judge Lynde
Harrison, Plant’s personal attorney, business investor, and a career Connecticut
legislator were members as was Horace P. Hoadley, Plant’s half-brother.10

---

8Richard J. Amundson, The American Life of Henry Shelton Sanford (PhD Diss., Florida State University,
1963), 158, 229 – 33. J. A. MacDonald, Plain Talk about Florida (Eustis, Florida: J. A. MacDonald,
Printer, 1882), 3. This promotional pamphlet touts opportunities in Orange County (Orlando).

9G. Hutchinson Smyth, The Life of Henry Bradley Plant: Founder and President of the Plant System of
Railroads and Steamships and also of the Southern Express Company (New York: G. P. Putnam’s Sons,
1898), 162. Benjamin Franklin Newcomer, Biographies from Men of Mark in Maryland, accessed January

http://anthro.amnh.org/jesup_photos. Lynde Harrison Dead. Was a Noted Lawyer and One of
Each PICO member and their colleague Florida land baron Hamilton Disston shared several characteristics. None served in the Civil War; all benefited from the conflict. They achieved business success, amassed wealth, exerted political influence, patronized the arts, and enjoyed an elite social status. They controlled thousands of miles of rail lines and dozens of transportation enterprises. They based their empires in Northern cities; yet, the most active partners spent time in Florida and reveled in these experiences. Their impact on Florida remains unparalleled.

Their investments in the “southernmost frontier” began at the time when that frontier began at Orlando and terminated at the Florida Keys. In 1845, Florida became the nation’s 27th state without a survey of the entire land area. The coasts had been explored and featured sparse settlements. The interior, Mosquito County, described aptly the swampland that predominated.

Transportation interests brought the men together and became one of their most important Florida ventures. In less than twenty years PICO controlled thousands of Florida’s 8,725,000 acres devoted to railroads including lines that ran the entire length of the state. Over the next several decades, their transportation network would carry wealthy Northerners and Europeans to Flagler’s, Plant’s, and Sanford’s hotels.\footnote{Braden, 36.}

PICO’s incorporation coincided with the beginning of Henry Flagler’s financial interest in St. Augustine. Just as the partners recognized that Florida was ripe for
development, Flagler realized that St. Augustine’s location, climate, and European ambience provided the small coastal town a unique position in the South.\textsuperscript{12}

A decade later, after Flagler and Plant were well established in Florida, they formed another business arrangement. On June 22, 1892, the summer after Henry Plant opened the Tampa Bay Hotel and the year before Flagler opened the Royal Poinciana in Palm Beach, the \textit{New York Times} reported that the two men merged railroad ventures through an “alliance” to control rail transportation in Florida.\textsuperscript{13}

Paralleling rapid expansion of railroad lines throughout the United States and across Canada was a movement to use part of the property to develop resorts for wealthy travelers. Hundreds of resorts built in elaborate architectural designs using modern technology and including contemporary comforts dotted the Atlantic coast, the lake shores and mountains east of the Mississippi River, western mountain ranges of the United States and Canada and along the Pacific Coast. Henry Flagler was aware of this fledgling enterprise that had begun before the Civil War had exploded with economic popularity at the war’s end. He capitalized on his railroad connections to raise the standards for visitor expectation and satisfaction.\textsuperscript{14}


Some hotels of this era that continue to operate as hotels include the Driskill Hotel, Austin, Texas (1886); Hotel Monteleone, New Orleans, Louisiana (1886); Grand Hotel, Mackinac Island, Michigan (1887); Hotel del Coronado, Coronado, California (1887); Grand Hotel, Block Island, Rhode Island (1887); Banff Springs Hotel, Banff, Canada (1888); Hotel Jerome, Vail, Colorado (1889); the Brown Palace, Denver, Colorado (1888-1893); and the Mount Washington Hotel, Bretton Woods, New Hampshire (1899-1901). Many shared discerning clientele who traveled between the hotels, enjoying the varied tourist seasons throughout the year.

Of particular regional interest was establishment of the Jekyll Island Club. (Club members adopted the “Jekyll” spelling in 1929.) Several New York industrialists began the project in March 1885 and finalized arrangements on December 9. Also in March, Flagler bought land for the Ponce and with a groundbreaking on December 1. The Jekyll Island Club was located on an island near Brunswick, Georgia, 110 miles north of St. Augustine and accessible by rail. Club records verify that members went to the Ponce, particularly each February. Although Flagler did not join, his ties to the Club included family members and business colleagues, such as J. P. Morgan, William Rockefeller, William K. Vanderbilt, Edward Stephen Harkness, and Morris Ketchum Jessup. Designers for Jekyll’s buildings belied New York connections. Flagler recommended architect Charles Gifford, designer of several Jekyll Island buildings, for work on White Mountain resorts. In St. Augustine Gifford orchestrated a Beaux Arts transformation for Flagler’s friend Dr. Anderson at Markland.¹⁵

In the winter of 1878 Henry Flagler and his family had visited Florida for the first time, staying several weeks in Jacksonville as treatment for his wife Mary Harkness Flagler’s lung ailment. Her doctor encouraged her to seek treatment in Florida’s warm climate each winter, but Flagler’s schedule precluded him from leaving New York. She chose to remain with her husband and family. In May of 1881 Mary Flagler died.16

Henry Flagler in Florida

Figure 5-2. Ponce de Leon Day Celebration, 1885

Two-and-a-half years later, in December of 1883 a remarried Henry and his bride (Ida) Alice Flagler came to Florida. The Flaglers joined the Rockefellers and visited St. Augustine, the “nation’s oldest city.” There, St. Augustine native and New York-educated Dr. Andrew Anderson and New York tobacco baron George P. Lorillard

---

16Dr. Thomas Graham provided several primary source documents to verify the 1885 date. Featured postcard from 1909 celebration. Ponce de Leon Day Celebration, 1885, Letter to Arthur N. Storhaug, Faribault, Minnesota, postcard donor, from Jacqueline Fretwell, Librarian, Festivals: Ponce de Leon Celebration Correspondence and Clippings Files St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library. Martin, Henry Flagler, 64.
entertained the couples. Anderson lived at Markland, his family’s citrus property west of town. He became Flagler’s representative in St. Augustine, a role enhanced in 1886 by his election as mayor. Lorillard’s new winter residence, Lorillard Villa, with its striking windmill, commanded the intersection of St. George and Hypolita Streets.\(^\text{17}\)

In early 1885 the Flaglers and Rockefellers returned to Florida. The Flaglers arrived in Jacksonville on February 19, staying at the St. James Hotel before heading to St. Augustine on February 25. Both couples stayed at the new San Marco Hotel located just north of the City Gate and overlooking Fort Marion and Matanzas Bay. Opened in 1884 by Boston developer Isaac Cruft and managed by veteran New England hotelier O. D. (Osborn Dunlap) Seavey, the San Marco satisfied Northerners expectations for luxurious accommodations supported by nearby arts and recreation.\(^\text{18}\)

Beginning in 1875, Cruft had established his reputation as a summer resort developer with the Maplewood Hotel. Located in New Hampshire’s White Mountains in a landscaped setting replete with formal gardens, the hotel afforded luxury and comfort during July and August—“season” there, “With a capacity of over 350 people, the interior contained several new dining rooms and parlors, a large hall with stage, game rooms, an ample lobby (office), and over 130 bedrooms, each lit with gas and connected to the

\(^{17}\)Nevins, 94. Chernow, 344 – 45.

office by ingenious speaking tubes…” By 1886 under Cruft’s ownership, the advertised “Palace Hotel of the Mountains” expanded to serve more than 500 guests. The site included a hunting park, an observatory, a farm to provide food for the hotel, and a reservoir for fresh water. In addition to the Maplewood Seavey managed Cruft’s first Florida resort the Magnolia Springs Hotel west of St. Augustine in Green Cove Springs. Seavey moved to the San Marco Hotel when it opened. As did many New York industrialists the Standard Oil co-founders enjoyed summer vacations in the White Mountains. Cruft’s and Seavey’s reputations may have inspired the Standard Oil partners’ choice of lodging and, possibly, influenced Henry Flagler’s decision on a new career investing in Florida.¹⁹

In March 1885, as St. Augustine’s winter season concluded the Flaglers prepared to return to New York. The Rockefellers had left earlier, though perhaps regrettably for at least one half of that couple. Rockefeller noted in a business letter to Flagler dated St. Patrick’s Day, March 17, that “the thermometer is this morning 14 degrees above zero,” cold and windy. Assuming that Rockefeller used the modern mode, the railway mail

service, for delivery of this correspondence the letter would have required about three
days travel time on a newly-launched route from New York through Charlotte to
Jacksonville. The information would have reached Flagler shortly before the end of his
warm, sunny Florida vacation.\textsuperscript{20}

To close the winter season in grand style St. Augustine launched the inaugural
Ponce de Leon Festival on March 27, 1885.

On March 27, 1883 [1885] the 373\textsuperscript{rd} year of the existance [sic] of this city
was celebrated in grand style. It was Ponce de Leon day[,] and the event
brought to this city the greatest crowd ever gathered here.

Three days later Henry Flagler bought part of Markland, reinforcing his ties to PICO and
a commitment to develop the peninsula. With Anderson's help, Flagler gained title to an
entire square block, redirected or filled portions of Maria Sanchez Creek, and relocated
buildings to achieve his vision for a grand hotel.\textsuperscript{21}

\textbf{The Architects, Artisans and Inventors}

The Ponce stands as an architectural and artistic masterpiece, one of Florida's
and the nation's most elaborate, iconic, and significant buildings. This has been true
since the time of the building's construction, throughout the structure's decades as a
resort, and continues today in its new role as the centerpiece of a college. The building
maintains a national and international reputation for its engineering and architectural
attributes and serves as one of the region's most visited historic attractions.


The Ponce incorporated the talents of a team of artisans, craftsmen and inventors in the construction and decoration of the building, making the building the only one in the world to feature their collective talents. The group included New York architects John Merven Carrère and Thomas Hastings. They were assisted by Bernard Maybeck and Emmanuel Masqueray. Maybeck left the firm and established an architectural practice on the west coast. Carrère died in a traffic accident in 1911. These two actions provide the basis for the statement that the team worked together only on the Hotel Ponce de Leon. Connecticut-based builders James McGuire and Joseph McDonald achieved the nation’s first major cast-in-place concrete structure in this hotel project. Louis Comfort Tiffany designed the interior decoration and the 79 stained glass windows early in his glassmaking career and before he achieved international renown. Also, Maitland Armstrong participated in the glass works. Thomas Edison’s direct current dynamos and thousands of electric lights brought St. Augustine its first and the nation’s largest incandescent lighting plant at that time. Nationally-renowned artists George Willoughby Maynard and Virgilio Tojetti created the ceiling murals of the grand public rooms.

All of these artisans were emerging leaders in their professional fields before and, in part, due to their participation in the project. They were socio-economically linked with connections to New York and New England, connections that reinforced the importance of their collaboration on Flagler’s hotel. To fully appreciate what each man brought to the Ponce project, it is worth examining them in closer detail.

**John Merven Carrère and Thomas Hastings, Jr.**

Carrère & Hastings were now the unchallenged overseers of the largest and most unusual building project under way in the United States, subject only to the phantasmal vision and inexhaustible pocketbook of Henry Morrison Flagler.
Upon his return to New York City in April 1885, Flagler chose young New York architects John Merven Carrère, 26, and Thomas Hastings, Jr., who had just celebrated his 25th birthday, to design his St. Augustine hotel. In 1877 Flagler had joined West Presbyterian Church in New York City where Thomas Hastings, Sr., served as pastor. Hastings, Jr., a lifelong New Yorker, enjoyed a reputation for attention to details, “ironclad integrity, serious purpose, exacting thoroughness, and a measure of personal dullness.” An intertwined series of familial connections between Flagler, Hastings, and the Benedict family added to the intricacy of the relationship. On the professional side Flagler knew of Hastings’ training at the Ecole des Beaux-Arts and Carrère and Hastings’ work for the firm of McKim, Mead & White. In October 1883 Flagler had retained that firm to redesign his newly-purchased country house Satan’s Toe. Hastings designed the library. The 40-room house was set on a 28-acre peninsula of land on Orienta Point in Mamaroneck, New York. Following a complete renovation Flagler renamed the property Lawn Beach.22

John Merven Carrère’s strengths were developing and implementing large scale concepts. He was recognized nationally in 1894 after the close of the Columbian

---

Exposition “as one of the profession’s leading figures” when offered the position of Supervising Architect for the United States Government. He declined, possibly as his first loyalty lay to his firm which was busy with work in the Northeast and in Florida. He performed as the diplomat for the firm, negotiating with clients, suppliers, and employees. Also, he kept projects moving. Born in Brazil to a French father and Scottish mother and boarding-school educated in Switzerland, his personality reflected his cosmopolitan background. In contrast Hastings’ introverted, detail-oriented personality enabled orchestration of elaborate architectural designs. Both men enjoyed the recognition that their talents, skills and contacts brought them.23

Flagler’s decision to give the new Carrère & Hastings firm its first major commission resulted in a building that remains as these two architects most original and unique creation. Hastings’ statement regarding the design of the Hotel Ponce de Leon gained fame in its own right over the years. “Fully three quarters of the time that we spent studying this building before beginning the foundation was devoted to the first floor-plan.” This acknowledges the complex assignment of orchestrating grand spaces for guests to assemble, enjoy meals, for music, to dance, and for recreation. In addition, the statement reflected the architects’ unfamiliarity with hotel design. Before the architects started on the project, they requested information about hotel design.24


Due to the newness of concrete construction and builders’ McGuire and McDonald’s experience solely in frame construction, Flagler revised his original request to the architects, requesting more than a “pretty picture.” Carrère & Hastings both designed the five-building complex and served as construction supervisors. The partners oversaw materials, techniques and processes. Hastings is credited with details on the exterior and interior. Particularly for the era, their level of participation gave new responsibilities to architects. In regard to their careers, architect C. Channing Blake commended their efforts for elevating resort hotel design and construction,

First, Carrère and Hastings asserted themselves as the vanguard of American monumental planning…The Ponce de Leon Hotel, in particular, revealed their mastery of the arrangement of large spaces and building blocks that surpassed all other efforts in the second half of the 1880’s. Second, they evidenced real invention and competence in the technical problems of monolithic concrete construction long before their contemporaries began to consider the structural possibilities inherent in the material…Third, Carrère and Hastings, demonstrated that they were extremely proficient in the vocabulary of the Renaissance style and quick to adapt that style to American conditions and materials.25

Both Carrère and Hastings spent significant amounts of time in St. Augustine and Jacksonville to fulfill the myriad of tasks necessary to complete the construction. In addition to launching the firm, Carrère benefitted from an enhanced personal life from his time in the region. In 1886 he married Marion Dell of Jacksonville, daughter of Seminole War commander Colonel Charles Dell.26

In 1900 Thomas Hastings married Helen Benedict. His brother married her cousin, and her brother had been married to Flagler’s daughter Jennie (then deceased),

25Blake, 99 – 100.

reinforcing the complex and longstanding Flagler-Hastings-Benedict family connections. The following year Carrère & Hastings designed Flagler’s spectacular new residence for his third wife and new bride, the former Mary Lily Kenan. Thanks to Flagler and Kenan descendants, the palatial marble Whitehall (1901-1903) overlooking Lake Worth has been preserved as the Henry Morrison Flagler Museum.27

Flagler’s patronage of Carrère & Hastings continued after completion of the Ponce. The firm designed more buildings for Flagler including several in St. Augustine: the Hotel Alcazar (1887-1889), Grace [United] Methodist Church (1887), Flagler Memorial Presbyterian Church (1889-1890) with the Flagler family mausoleum addition (1906), and Flagler’s residence Kirkside (1892). The house was demolished in 1950, although many elements of the building were salvaged and were reused throughout St. Augustine. Carrère & Hastings designed hotels for Flagler down Florida’s East Coast.

With completion of Flagler’s St. Augustine’s hotels, Carrere & Hastings’ reputation as hotel designers was established. By 1888 the firm had been retained to design a major addition to the Waumbek hotel in New Hampshire’s White Mountains. Theirs was the first of several transformations that enabled the hotel to become one of the nation’s “most luxurious grand hotel complexes.” Though much more regimented architecturally than the Ponce, the firm’s Laurel-in-the-Pines hotel in Lakewood, New Jersey, demonstrated once again their success in designing resort hotels.28


28Tolles, White Mountains, 97. Blake, 106.
Carrère & Hastings designed more than 600 buildings, including the Jefferson Hotel (1895) in Richmond, Virginia, the Cannon House and Russell Senate Office Buildings (1903-08) in Washington, D.C., and the New York Public Library (1897-1911). Carrère died in a traffic accident shortly before completion of this project. Hastings continued using the firm name until his death in 1929. In 1912 Hastings was appointed to the team responsible for the Pan-Pacific Exposition of 1915. His Tower of Jewels at 435 feet high was the centerpiece of the construction. Although not as well recognized as the firm from which they began, McKim, Mead, and White, many experts consider Carrère & Hastings to have been the more talented.  

The firm’s ties to Flagler continued after their patron’s death in 1913. Carrère & Hastings expanded dramatically and significantly its Beaux Arts repertoire with the design in 1922 of the 31-story Standard Oil Company building at 26 Broadway in New York City for John D. Rockefeller, Jr.  

---


30In 1928 Hastings designed a small classical Greek Theatre for Robert Worth Bingham of Louisville, Kentucky. At the same time Hastings designed the Louisville Memorial Auditorium, a project Bingham influenced as well. In 1908 the Carrère & Hastings firm had designed a country house east of Louisville for James Ross Todd with which Bingham was familiar. In 1916, recently widowed Bingham had married the former Mary Lily Kenan a sweetheart from his University of North Carolina time. Also, she was the oldest sister of his good friend William Rand Kenan, Jr. and the widow Mrs. Henry Flagler. They spent part of their short marriage at her home Whitehall where they entertained Mr. and Mrs. Thomas Hastings. She died nine months after the marriage at age 53. Family sources attribute her untimely death to a heart condition exacerbated by dependence upon alcohol which was used regularly for medicinal purposes and a common ailment for Victorian-era women of means. Shortly before her death Mary Lily Flagler added a codicil to her will giving Bingham $5 million. History chronicles that Bingham’s subsequent purchase of the *Louisville Daily Journal* and *Louisville Morning Courier* newspapers from Henry Watterson was made possible due to the inheritance. Further intricacies of this situation are indicative of the role Florida tourism played in linking the nation’s movers and shakers. Watterson wintered in Jacksonville and Fort Myers. He and Flagler shared friendships with President and Mrs. Cleveland, writer and actor Joseph Jefferson, and actress Helena Modjeska. Francis Morrone, *The Architectural Guidebook to New York City* (Layton, Utah: Gibb Smith, 1998), 5. Leslee F. Keys and Donna Neary, eds. *Historic Jefferson County* (Louisville:
Carrère & Hastings added staff architects who assisted with the Hotel Ponce de Leon and, upon its completion, gained fame in their own rights with successful careers. Bernard Maybeck and Emmanuel Masqueray joined the firm in its early years. Both headed west from New York to less developed sections of the United States where they exhibited their architectural skills, the former to California and the latter to Minnesota. Training at the Ecole des Beaux-Arts and the popularity of World's Fairs and similar events launched each architect to prominence in his own right in the late 19th century.

**Bernard Maybeck**

![Figure 5-3. View of dining room, facing south - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla & Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL](image)

Historians in search of the earliest evidences of Maybeck’s uninhibited style have found them in the lavish, neo-Spanish Ponce de Leon, which flaunts a

---

playfulness never again shown by Carrère and Hastings; a parasol-like central dome and roof garden...; and some raffish graffiti in the dining room.

Richard Reinhardt

Architect Bernard Maybeck’s contributions to the Ponce (and Hotel Alcazar) have been a source of debate for decades. As one of the most prolific architects of the first half of the 20th century and best known for his work in California, the legacy of his St. Augustine efforts is scattered throughout numerous biographies. He joined the Carrère & Hastings firm in 1886 during construction of the Ponce. Hastings and Maybeck had studied together in the atelier of Jules Andre at the Ecole de Beaux-Arts in Paris. Following completion of the St. Augustine commissions, Maybeck moved westward, first to Chicago attending the Columbian Exposition, then settling in California where he influenced the state’s architecture and enjoyed a rich and lengthy career. Carrère & Hastings’ expert Laurie Ossman credits Maybeck as the “construction supervisor” for the Ponce.31

Maybeck’s “significant role in the design of the two [Ponce de Leon and Alcazar] hotels is confirmed” through signed sketches published at the opening of the first hotel in American Architect and Building News, it was noted that “the free use of historic details, the functional arrangement of the floor plan, and the honest use of unadorned materials for the walls of the exteriors show the influence of Maybeck’s hand.” Two Maybeck contemporaries Jean Murray Banks and Kenneth Cardwell described his role in the

---

Ponce to include “all of the incandescent ornament of the hotel,” the “somewhat poetic qualities,” and “that creative eclecticism which shouts the joy of its creation.”

Sally Woodbridge continues similarly, crediting Maybeck with the “exuberance of detail and an innovative use of a local material.” Flagler biographer Edward Akin extends Maybeck’s role with the following credit, “Bernard Maybeck…combined Moorish and Renaissance influences under the umbrella of a Spanish motif.”

*De la mano ala boga se pierde la sopa.* There’s many a slip betwixt the cup and the lip.

*Oveja que bela bocado pierde.* The sheep that bleats loses its mouthful.

*Remuda de pasturage haze bizerros credos.* Change of pasture makes fat calves.

Richard Reinhardt declares the platitudes on the Dining Room ceiling to be “raffish graffiti” that Maybeck protégé Cardwell credits to a “young architect whose sense of humor included the art of gentle ridicule.” Certainly, the Maybeck scholars demonstrate enthusiasm for his participation in the Ponce project.

Wayne Andrews, in a social history prepared for the American Institute of Architects’ centennial anniversary in 1947, wrote of Maybeck’s contributions declaring that the firm of Carrère and Hastings “was never again to design anything as rash as this hotel…and if they did better than they intended, it was because they were artists in spite of themselves.” Concrete authority Carl Condit exuberantly echoed,

---


As remarkable as its concrete construction is the hotel’s architectural character. Original in treatment, its red brick trim against the gray concrete, elaborately carved wooden beams, palm-trunk columns, and red tile roof give it a playful and exotic quality that suggests the hand of an imaginative architect. The commission went to Carrère and Hastings, but the real author was Bernard Maybeck, then a designer with the New York firm...

Robert Craig reiterates the uniqueness of the “rawness of the concrete surfaces... juxtaposed with...elaboration of adjacent color and patterned ornament.”

In 1952 noted historic preservation architect and University of Virginia professor Frederick D. Nichols interviewed 91-year-old Bernard Maybeck and corresponded with the architect through his wife Annie White Maybeck. Nichols included the description of Maybeck’s design process in an article that same year,

Hastings made the preliminary drawings and explained the scheme. These drawings were given to the draughtsmen to draw up, putting the practical work on paper. Then Hastings or Maybeck ‘studied’ proportions, etc. The drawings were corrected accordingly and turned over to the main office for engineering, electrical, and plumbing drawings. Then the whole thing went to Carrère ...

Nichols commented from the interview with Bernard Maybeck, “So it was with the Ponce de Leon hotel in St. Augustine, which he worked on circa 1885 (and with which he was particularly pleased for he mentioned it several times).”

Architectural historian Richard Longstreth contends that Maybeck’s work in the design of the Hotel was limited, “Maybeck’s contribution came later and was probably


focused on the interior.” He reiterated Carrère & Hastings’ creativity after Maybeck’s exodus to California, crediting Hastings with the talent exhibited in the firm’s commissions. Despite Longstreth’s hesitation to credit Maybeck with design of the building, primary source materials from Bangs, Cardwell, Nichols and Wilson reinforce Maybeck’s important early role in the design, construction and details of the building.\(^{36}\)

Bernhardt Maybeck, the architect’s father and chief architectural woodcarver with the New York interiors firm of Pottier and Stymus, oversaw fabrication and installation of the Ponce’s wood ornamental architectural elements. His son’s fondness for the creative and exuberant use of wood throughout his career reflects on his work in New York and St. Augustine with his father.\(^{37}\)

---


\(^{37}\)Bangs, 79.
Maybeck remained lifelong friends with Hastings. The latter was president of the American Institute of Architects when, in January 1912, he was appointed to Architectural Commission for the Pan-Pacific Exposition. Ossman contends that the unfinished gardens and courtyards for the Ponce design were implemented to scale in this Exposition. Maybeck had chaired the Department of Architecture at the University of California-Berkeley. His creative designs for the Palace of Fine Arts were accepted enthusiastically by the Architectural Commission. Writing in 1965 after the New York World’s Fair, architectural historian Marcus Whiffen considered Hastings’ Tower of Jewels and Maybeck’s Palace of Fine Arts as two of the nation’s four best representations of Beaux-Arts Classicism.38

Arguably, the Palace of Fine Arts was Maybeck’s most acclaimed project and the most famous building of the ten-month long Pan-Pacific Exposition, an event that drew an attendance of one million. Though controversial due to an emphasis on beauty in contrast to function, the building became an immediate San Francisco landmark.39

Midway through the fair, the Exposition Preservation League led by Maybeck’s principal patron Phoebe Apperson Hearst, championed retaining Maybeck’s creation. Buildings constructed for fairs and expositions were designed to be temporary and removed after the celebratory events. A Preservation Day was held on October 16, 1915, with a commitment that funds received in excess of “normal gate receipts” would


go toward preservation of the building. Attendance that day was one of the highest of the fair at 92,865 visitors, and $8,000 was raised for the building ($160,000 in 2012). After the other fair buildings were razed, the Palace of Fine Arts defined the San Francisco Bay skyline. In the 1930s the building was stabilized. Then in 1964 the building succumbed to earthquake codes and was “demolished to make way for a concrete reproduction of itself.” That structure failed to withstand an earthquake in 1989. In 2011 after a $21 million “restoration and seismic retrofit” the building was rededicated in honor of the approaching centennial anniversary in 2015.

Emmanuel Masqueray

Hastings and Maybeck had studied in the same atelier at the Ecole des Beaux-Arts. Similarly, Carrère and Frenchman Emmanuel Masqueray participated in Charles-Jean Laisne’s atelier while at the Ecole. Masqueray possessed a talent that was identified early and cultivated for creating “artistic reconstructions” or picturesque representations of buildings. In 1887 Carrère invited Masqueray to join the firm. Though titled a “draughtsman,” his artistic skills provided an advantage to the firm and gained him personal success as well.

40 Ibid.


Masqueray came ‘to see America’ and was first employed in New York by Carrère and Hastings…on the studies of the buildings at St. Augustine, Florida.

Francis Swales

Construction of the Ponce concluded on May 1, 1887, with interior details and finishes completed by the end of the calendar year. Masqueray prepared watercolors of the façade as part of the building record and marketing for Carrère & Hastings. One watercolor featured the front elevation of the building. A second highlighted the east section of that elevation. The third showcased the elaborate entrance. Masqueray remained with Carrère & Hastings until 1892. After that his work with other firms focused on designs and renderings for the World’s Columbian Exposition in Chicago (1893) and the Louisiana Purchase Exposition in St. Louis (1904). He is noted for his designs of churches and cathedrals in Minnesota and Kansas.43

Figure 5-6. Photocopy of an old, undated photograph (original in files of Hotel Ponce de Leon) construction of dining room rotunda - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla & Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL

Flagler...was so impressed with St. Augustine and with the work of Seavey, McGuire, and McDonald that he hired all three men to build an even grander hotel in the Ancient City.

Susan R. Braden

Flagler employed New England shipbuilders and carpenters James McGuire and Joseph McDonald who he referred to as the “Macks” to construct his St. Augustine hotel. In 1881 Boston hotel investor Isaac Cruft had retained McGuire to rebuild the fire ravaged Magnolia Hotel along the St. Johns River steamship route at Magnolia Springs (now Green Cove Springs) eighteen miles west of St. Augustine. In 1884, satisfied with the result, Cruft hired McGuire and his new partner Joseph A. McDonald to build the San Marco Hotel north of St. Augustine’s City Gate.44

Following construction of the Ponce, Flagler employed McGuire and McDonald for construction of the Alcazar hotel and other St. Augustine buildings, including residences built as ancillary structures to the hotels. The Osborn Seavey (Union Generals’) House reflected the polychromatic appearance of the hotels and hosted their first manager. Ponce de Leon Cottage, (Thompson Hall), was built as half of a pair of twin cottages provided for guests who preferred privacy beyond that available in the hotels. Casa Amarylla, (Wiley Hall), and its accompanying Power Plant (Palm Cottage) were constructed in 1898 and served the Hotel physician. McGuire and McDonald maintained an office in the Ponce, reaffirming the readily available and high quality services to the Hotel’s owner and his guests.45

Flagler retained the duo to expand the Ormond (1891), construct Palm Beach’s Royal Poinciana (1895) and The Breakers (1905), Miami’s Royal Palm (1897), and Nassau, Bahamas’ The Colonial (1899), respectively. Their skills increased as did Flagler’s confidence in their abilities. As Braden notes, “During the 1890s McGuire and McDonald, both trained in carpentry and shipbuilding rather than architecture, became Flagler’s chief builders when they replaced Carrère and Hastings as Flagler’s preferred hotel designers.” Both the architects and the builders joined together for construction of


45 Though considerable original documentation verifies the contractors, a print advertisement fragment McGuire and McDonald was found during the restoration in 2007 behind the brass upper hinge at the entry door of the original marble and mahogany Ponce men’s restroom located off the main lobby. Thomas McDonald, Owner, BTS Builders, Inc., interview by author, St. Augustine, FL, August 13, 2007. Ossman and Ewing, 28.
Henry Flagler’s Palm Beach mansion, Whitehall, completed in 1902, and in the Flagler mausoleum addition to Memorial Presbyterian Church in 1906.46

McGuire remained based in St. Augustine, overseeing repairs to Flagler’s buildings. In 1891 Flagler added the Valencia Hotel to his St. Augustine holdings, entrusting the construction and then the ownership to McGuire. In contrast, McDonald joined the migration down the east coast of Florida to Miami. There, he purchased hotels and related businesses. He served on boards of directors, as an elected official, and participated in the community. His son-in-law served as Miami’s first mayor.47

William Kennish

Figure 5-7. Hotel Ponce de Leon, construction of corner towers

“Mr. Kennish, who previously had charge of the foundation of the Statue of Liberty, and of concrete work in the Erie Basin, etc., was responsible for the detail of plant and execution of all work of this nature.”

46Braden, 144.

William Kennish [Jr.] as “superintendent of concrete construction” handled testing of Hanover Portland cement for use in the Ponce. Simultaneously, he served as Chief Inspector for construction of the 70-foot-tall concrete base in New York Harbor on which the pedestal and Statue of Liberty stood in 1886. That project took place at the same time as the Ponce’s construction. Kennish demonstrated his engineering talents through the many creative and pioneering construction methods and materials used in the Ponce. These included the cast concrete construction and, with William Hammer, the hydraulics for artesian well drilling. Five years later, as he was preparing to patent several inventions, he died. His work on the Ponce remained importance.48

Louis Comfort Tiffany

Figure 5-8. Parlors of the Ponce de Leon

“Tiffany did have the responsibility for the decorations of the interior of the Ponce de Leon and he also supplied the stained glass for the hotel.”

Over the winter of 1882-1883 interior designer Louis Comfort Tiffany, who preferred the French pronunciation for his first name, completed two major commissions and celebrated by bringing his ailing wife Mary and their children to St. Augustine, Florida, for a vacation. In 1881 author Samuel Clemens and his wife Livy had retained Tiffany’s interior design firm to transform “the walls and ceilings of the public spaces of their home, particularly the newly enlarged entry hall.” Simultaneously, at the request of President Chester A. Arthur, Tiffany redecorated a suite of state rooms in the Executive Mansion, renamed the White House in 1901.\textsuperscript{49}

While the Tiffany family stayed in St. Augustine he painted several scenes, the subjects of which included a date palm tree and the courtyard façade of the Segui-Kirby Smith House (St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library) on Aviles Street south of the Plaza. Two views featured Fort Marion (Castillo de San Marcos), “Carriage Waiting Beside a Wall” and “An Old Fort at St. Augustine, Florida.” He introduced the latter work and “A Study in St. Augustine,” featuring a large bird house, at New York’s National Academy Museum & School of Fine Arts’ annual exhibition in April 1883.\textsuperscript{50}

During this same period the artist’s father, jeweler Charles Lewis Tiffany, commissioned the architectural firm of McKim, Mead and White to design a residence for his family in New York City. In 1883, in the midst of that construction, Thomas Hastings


joined that architectural firm. Also, at about that time, the younger Tiffany dissolved his
Associated Artists company, founded Louis C. Tiffany and Company, and worked directly

Then in 1884 Louis Tiffany collaborated with Thomas Edison on the creative
lighting scheme for Steele MacKaye’s Lyceum Theater in New York that opened in the
spring of 1885 as the nation’s first fully electrified theatre. Several months later Tiffany
and Edison joined Hastings and the team responsible for creation of the Ponce. In 1880,
Tiffany had worked with Edison on another MacKaye project, New York’s Madison
Square Theatre.\footnote{James Steele MacKaye is most well-known for orchestrating Buffalo Bill’s Wild West Show and for establishing the nation’s first acting school, later the American Academy of Dramatic Arts. Buffalo’s Steele MacKaye, the ‘Father of Modern Acting’. In an Old Buffalo Castle, Modern Acting was Born \textit{Buffalo History Gazette}, accessed July 8, 2012, \url{http://www.buffalohistorygazette.com/2011/06/buffalos-steele-mackaye-father-of.html}.}

The likelihood that Tiffany knew Flagler is strong as well, particularly since Flagler,
Tiffany, and Edison had visited the small town of St. Augustine at about the same time.
Tiffany biographer Robert Koch noted, “Although it cannot be established that Tiffany
met Flagler, the events of the following year [1885] indicate that it was likely that the

The Ponce serves as a rare example of Tiffany’s work, “Tiffany did have the
responsibility for the decorations of the interior of the Ponce de Leon and he also
supplied the stained glass for the hotel.” He is credited with decorative plaster ceilings
and the eleven Austrian crystal chandeliers in the Grand Parlor (Flagler Room). During this era, he was known for his interiors; he was beginning designs in glass.\textsuperscript{54}

His contributions to the Ponce included windows flanking the main entry doors, along the staircases leading from the Rotunda to the Dining Room (now Dining Hall), and on either side of the west entrance to the same room. The classical designs of the clerestory windows in the rectangular main section of the Dining Room and their companion windows framing the curved \textit{venido} rooms that flank the Dining Room provide remarkable light and complement the murals on the walls and ceilings. Even minor spaces received treatment: both sides of the baggage entrance and the north side of the carriageway. Tiffany created a total of seventy-nine stained glass windows for the building.\textsuperscript{55}

At the conclusion of the construction, Tiffany returned to New York. In 1888 he exhibited “The Old Governor’s House at St. Augustine, Florida” in the Indianapolis Art Association’s annual show. In 1905 his creation, “Cornelius and the Angel” was gifted to Trinity Episcopal Church located a block east of the Ponce. Over the decades he enjoyed Florida winters, continuing to paint images there as well. Beginning in 1921 he built a winter home, Comfort Lodge on Brickell Avenue in Miami. He celebrated his 80\textsuperscript{th} birthday on February 18, 1928, on Miami Beach.\textsuperscript{56}


Figure 5-9. Hotel Ponce de Leon Dining Room

Variations among the windows suggest that they were designed by several artists. The circular, Moorish patterned windows by the front doors, rich in textured glass, display elements common to Louis Tiffany. Large stairwell windows depicting Bacchus repeat the ornamental motifs Maynard used in his murals. The lunet dining room windows with flaming urns incorporate many elements common to Armstrong’s Renaissance designs.

Robert O. Jones

From late April through May of 1887, as construction on the Hotel Ponce de Leon concluded, Tiffany retained his friend and colleague Maitland Armstrong to orchestrate installation of the Dining Room windows. Regarding their design, Armstrong’s biographer and stained glass artisan Robert O. Jones contends that the windows evidence the work of multiple talented artisans. This collaboration emphasizes the

creative and exuberant nature evident throughout the Hotel Ponce de Leon, reinforcing the unique and important contributions of the artists.\textsuperscript{57}

Armstrong strengthened his ties to Northeast Florida with this project and shortly thereafter established his own stained glass studio. Since 1869 his older brother Gouverneur Armstrong had spent time at Hibernia on the west bank of the St. Johns River about 25 miles inland from St. Augustine. There, he became friends with the Fleming family. In 1878 Margaret Fleming had built a small church, and the elder Armstrong participated as church treasurer.

“Four exceptional stained glass windows by Maitland Armstrong & Company enrich St. Margaret’s Episcopal Church at Hibernia, Florida, and are primarily responsible for the church’s reputation for fine windows.” Upon his brother’s death in 1899, Maitland Armstrong inherited and then acquired additional acreage at Hibernia. He and his wife enjoyed the next three decades there. Between 1900 and 1910 Armstrong created windows for St. Augustine’s Trinity Episcopal Church, the congregation of which included numerous Fleming cousins.\textsuperscript{58}

Over the next several years, Armstrong began expanding his artistic talents. He participated on the planning team for the World’s Columbian Exposition in Chicago in 1893 with fellow Hotel Ponce artist George W. Maynard.\textsuperscript{59}

\textsuperscript{57}Flagler College Archives, Hotel Ponce de Leon Dining Room. Fleming family members were descendants of Francis Phillip Fatio, prominent settler who owned thousands of acres throughout Northeast Florida and whose heirs included St. Augustine’s Fatios, Dunhams, and Colts. Robert O. Jones, \textit{D. Maitland Armstrong: American Stained Glass Master} (Tallahassee, Florida: Sentry Press, 2004), 94.

\textsuperscript{58}Ibid., 206.

\textsuperscript{59}Maitland Armstrong, Artist, Dies at 82 \textit{New York Times}, May 27, 1918.
After perfecting the incandescent light in 1879, Thomas Edison began visiting Florida, specifically St. Augustine in early 1882, then during the winters of 1883-1884 and 1884-1885. For the first two visits, his wife Mary’s health provided the impetus for the vacations. The moist air and warm climate afforded relief for her breathing disorder. During their second visit, Edison attracted national attention. While staying at the Magnolia Hotel, he heard tales of an enormous shark that had eluded capture for years. He chartered the Magnolia with its Captain Whitney, took Mrs. Edison and some friends, and went fishing. Shortly after they entered open water, the shark appeared. Edison threw out a line of insulated electrical wire attached to an electric battery, and some
hours later, “the demon shark was towed to the dock.” Edison’s “electric bait” and capture of the fifteen foot, 700 pound shark made headlines.  

Their daughter Marion (nicknamed Dot) and his friends Ezra and Lillian Gilliland accompanied a recently-widowed Edison on his third visit. The sojourn to St. Augustine followed a trip to New Orleans for the World Industrial and Cotton Centennial that featured some of Edison’s telephone inventions. In late March the group returned to New York, a few days before St. Augustine closed its winter season with the inaugural Ponce de Leon Day celebration.  

During at least one of Edison’s trips to St. Augustine he visited Franklin Smith’s new Villa Zorayda. Edison was impressed with concrete as a new building material. He corresponded with Smith’s family well into the twentieth century. He invested considerable time and money in the use of concrete for housing and furniture. Also, he improved the composition of Portland cement.  

In 1886, newly-remarried to Mina Miller, Edison returned to Florida, this time to the warmer Gulf climate of Fort Myers where he and Gilliland had bought thirteen acres of waterfront land the previous year. There, they built winter homes, and Edison constructed a laboratory. Edison remained a part-time resident of Florida throughout his

---


61 Ibid., 147, 151. Israel, 237.  

62 Clark, 40.
lifetime. In addition to his lengthy stays at his Gulf coast property he traveled via the Florida East Coast railroad the length of the state, from Jacksonville to Key West.  

The Edison United Manufacturing Company supplied steam power and electricity to the Ponce. Thomas Hastings’ older brother Frank S. Hastings served as secretary and treasurer, then chief executive officer. He may have influenced the decision to choose Edison’s company for the hotel. “Four Babcock and Wilcox multitubular boilers working up to 107 horse-power nominal each,” operated with an equal number of forty-five kilowatt direct current steam dynamos were powered by three Armington & Sims engines, two supplying 60 horse-power and one 125 horse-power, produced in Providence, Rhode Island. Each of the smaller engines powered an Edison 640-light dynamo with the larger engine driving a pair of No. 16 dynamos.  

Edison’s chief assistant William J. Hammer oversaw “completion and starting of the 8,000-light plant of the Ponce de Leon Hotel at St. Augustine, Fla., which at that time was the largest isolated incandescent lighting plant ever constructed.” This statement was made in 1909 and appears to reflect additions made over time to the system. Lights were located throughout the building, in the public spaces, the hallways, and the guest rooms. Lighting had become customary in fine hotels after being initiated in 1882 at New

---


York’s Hotel Everett. On May 1, 1888, after the Ponce’s opening season, 2,000 lights were added for a total of 4,100 for the Ponce and the Alcazar.65

Carrère & Hastings designed the 100 gilded papier mache lion’s head light fixtures added in 1893 to the friezes framing the Rotunda and Dining Room. About 1890 the two-tiered circular metal chandelier in the Dining Room had been removed, enabling greater appreciation of the ceiling murals. Electrification added the Hotel Ponce de Leon to a prestigious list of modern buildings in the United States.66

George Willoughby Maynard

In 1883 Maynard, Carrère and Hastings worked together on a Stanford White project in Baltimore. Maynard, a preeminent painter and muralist, rejoined the architects for the Ponce. He created the allegorical female figures in oil on plaster on the ceilings of the Rotunda and in the Dining Room. Two series of figures representing the Four Seasons: Spring, Summer, Fall and Winter adorn the latter. In the Rotunda the standing and seated figures alternate encircling the ceiling. Figures represent the Elements: Earth, Air, Fire and Water. Seated figures depict the Exploration series: Adventure, Discovery, Conquest, and Civilization. Interestingly, a quarter-of-a-century later Carrère


and Hastings adapted this series for one of a pair of elaborately-adorned classical flagpole bases set on the terrace of the New York Public Library.\textsuperscript{67}

Figure 5-11. “The View of the Ponce de Leon”

Mr. George W. Maynard has returned from St. Augustine, Florida, where he has just completed the elaborate decorations of the new Ponce de Leon Hotel…Mr. Maynard’s paintings form the most important part of the splendid decorations of the new hotel.

\textit{The Critic, 1888}

After the Hotel opened, Maynard went to Chicago serving on lead architect Daniel Burnham’s planning team for the World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893. Following his contributions there, Maynard traveled to Washington, D.C., participating in decoration for the Jefferson Building at the Library of Congress. In 1897 Maynard gifted several murals

including reproductions of the *Exploration* series. They adorn the ceiling in the Pavilion of the Discoverers (Southwest Pavilion).  

**Herman Schladermundt**

Figure 5-12. Ponce de Leon Hall Dining Hall

“Schladermundt’s primary work was the decoration of buildings, including many built by the architects Carrere and Hastings.”

The Hudson River Museum of Westchester

Yet another young talent at the time of the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s construction, Herman Schladermundt assisted George Maynard with the murals. According to a letter Schladermundt wrote in 1935, “I was working at drafting for Carrère and Hastings [when] I was sent to Florida to superintend the decorations of the Ponce de Leon.” A few years later the artists worked together on the Agriculture Building at the World Columbian Exposition and on the Library of Congress. Schladermundt’s artistic expertise extended

---

to stained glass, so some experts speculate that he executed, with his colleague Maitland Armstrong, some of the designs in the Ponce.\textsuperscript{69}

Shortly after the Ponce was completed the artisans returned to their home base of New York City. In 1890 Carrère and Hastings added Schladermundt to their team of experts for the Central Congregational Church in Providence, Rhode Island. There, he executed the elaborate mural paintings in the apse, one of the many remarkable interior features of the building.\textsuperscript{70}

During the 1890s New York’s American Art Association counted all three men as officers. Arguably, Schladermundt’s greatest effort in St. Augustine was creation of the stained glass windows for the Memorial Presbyterian Church. In 1896, during the era of work on the Library of Congress, Schladermundt moved to the Bronxville artist colony where he joined a friend and colleague Ponce artist Otto Bacher.\textsuperscript{71}

\textbf{Virgilio Tojetti}

Virgilio Tojetti painted the ornately framed oil canvases (\textit{Dreams of Love}) that decorated the parlor ceilings. Tojetti’s paintings of gamboling putti [useful cherubs] set against a pale blue sky arrived from the artist’s studio in Paris.

Susan Braden


\textsuperscript{70}Ossman and Ewing, 58-60.

The Tojetti family, originally of Rome, arrived in San Francisco in 1871. Patriarch Domenico Tojetti, received commissions from popes and decorations from kings before accepting a teaching position in 1867 at the Guatemala Academy of Fine Arts. Sons Virgilio and Eduardo gained fame as artists, also. All three achieved a reputation for their “mythological and allegorical subjects.” Mrs. Emilia Tojetti became a noted art patron, and their daughter Emilia enjoyed a reputation as an accomplished pianist.72

Figure 5-13. Tojetti Frescoes in the Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, FLA.

In 1875-1876 the three Tojetti men were selected to work on California railroad baron Leland Stanford’s palatial San Francisco Italianate-style residence. Specifically, they worked under the direction of William Stymus and his New York interior design firm

of Pottier & Stymus. This exposure to both the east and west coast elite launched their successful careers in the United States.\textsuperscript{73}

Virgilio Tojetti studied in Paris with painters William-Adolphe Bouguereau and Jean-Leon Gerome. A few years after completion of the Stanford mansion he moved to New York where he achieved note for his work on several Pottier & Stymus projects. The Fifth Avenue Hotel, “[Cornelius] Vanderbilt’s new palace, the Savoy Hotel, the Hoffman House, and Keith’s Theatres in Boston and Providence give examples of his decorative work.” He exhibited in New York, Philadelphia, and Boston.\textsuperscript{74}

About 1890 Thomas Edison’s second wife Mina commissioned Tojetti to paint a canvas mural on the ceiling for the 40 x 27 foot den of their home Glenmont in Llewellyn Park at Orange, New Jersey. Featured in an article in \textit{The Decorator and Furnisher} shortly after its completion, the author notes the size, “some 12 x 16 feet” and theme, Music and Science, under the guise of lovely female figures, with their respective symbols, sport with cherubs against a background in perfect harmony with the coloring elsewhere seen. The painting is by Tojetti.

With demolition of most of the Fifth Avenue mansions in the early 20\textsuperscript{th} century to make way for a skyline dominated by high rise buildings, Tojetti’s mural at Glenmont survives as a rare example of his work, particularly in a private residence. The use of color and

\textsuperscript{73}Ibid.

EwAA#v=onepage&q=virgilio%20tojetti%20murals%20at%20vanderbilt&f=false.
stylistic elements is remarkably similar to that he employed a few years earlier in the Ponce and for which he is known.75

**Auguste Pottier and William Stymus**

The prestigious New York interiors firm of Pottier & Stymus orchestrated the interior details and furnishings for the hotel. As early as the Philadelphia Centennial International Exposition of 1876 the firm included Henry Flagler as a client along with fellow industrialists William Rockefeller, George Westinghouse, Leland Stanford and Mark Hopkins. The firm designed U.S. Treasury rooms for President Andrew Johnson and a suite in the Executive Mansion (White House) for President Ulysses S. Grant.

French born Auguste Pottier learned the woodcarving craft in his native country, then immigrated to the United States in 1847. A decade later he worked for the same furniture making firm as did William Stymus. In 1859 they established the New York based company Pottier & Stymus. Their strength was the interrelated use of three elements: color, pattern and woodwork. By 1876 they employed 700 men and achieved gross sales of more than $1 million.76

---


For completion of the Leland Stanford residence in 1975-1976 William Stymus moved to California and listed himself in the city directory there as an architect. A number of designs introduced in that mansion became components of the firm’s trademark designs and details. The enthusiastic use of extravagant materials, “mosaic floors, frescolike painted ceilings and walls, and silk, cut velvet, silver, and gilding…not only grand, they were exotic and intensely pictorial.”

Photographs of the Stanford residence carry elements used throughout the next decade and adapted in Flagler’s hotel, “At the center of the second floor, a brass railing encircled the open well and allowed anyone standing at that railing or below a view of lunettes and pendentives that resembled baroque frescoes.” This design feature reflects the views available from the mezzanine level of the Rotunda in the Ponce. Classical themes, seasons, days of the week, continents, all were representations included in the Stanford mansion and in the Ponce.

The Pottier & Stymus firm was known for lavish woodworking. German immigrant Bernhardt Maybeck served as the chief woodcarver in the firm. His son Bernard apprenticed with the firm briefly before his father arranged for him to study furniture design in Paris with Pottier’s brother.

As 1887 closed details were being completed to open to the world Flagler’s resort hotel built in the edge of a tiny Spanish colonial city. The work of these New York

---

77Ibid., 226.
79Sara Denise Shreve, A History Worth Saving: The Palace of Fine Arts and the Interpretation of History on a Reconstructed Site (M.A. Thesis, Cornell University, 2006), 11 – 12.
artisans, craftsmen, and inventors changed forever both the city and Florida. Tourism drove the economy as the 19th century concluded, and a new modern century began.
CHAPTER 6
“THE MODERN WONDER OF THE ANCIENT CITY”
HENRY FLAGLER’S HOTEL PONCE DE LEON

Henry Flagler brought Thomas Hastings to St. Augustine in May of 1885 to see the Spanish colonial city and begin the design for a grand resort hotel. Over the next half year both Carrère and Hastings returned to St. Augustine numerous times, creating a vision for a European masterpiece that they intended would satisfy Flagler’s wishes, exceed guests’ expectations, and launch their careers.¹

Figure 6-1. Court of the Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla.

I have almost always accepted with reserve the American superlatives followed by the traditional in the world; but it may safely be said that the Ponce de Leon Hotel, at St. Augustine, is not only the largest and handomest hotel in America, but in the whole world. Standing in the prettiest part of the picturesque little town, this Moorish palace, with its walls of onyx, its vast, artistically-furnished saloons, its orange-walks, fountains, cloisters, and towers, is a revelation, a scene from the Arabian Nights.

Max O’Rell, 1889

Historian Caroline Castillo argues that the resulting symmetrical design reflected Carrère and Hastings Beaux-Arts education enhanced with their exposure to Spanish and Moorish architecture, the Alhambra in Granada...open courtyards with fountains and the encircling loggias; the heavy solidity of the Alcazar in Seville; the richness of elaborate patterns around doors and shell motif emblems from the University of Salamanca; the combined Gothic and Moorish elegance of the Cathedral at Seville, in particular the Giralda tower...the Aljaferia Palace at Saragossa with its brick and stone towers, decorated with stucco; and the Church of San Martin and San Esteban of Segovia.²

To accomplish Flagler’s vision required relocation of several buildings located on the site and construction of new structures. The new Grace Methodist Church was built immediately north of the hotel site and reflected the Ponce’s construction in materials and design. Anderson Cottage, a post-Civil War frame dwelling built by Dr. Andrew Anderson’s family for a winter guest cottage, was moved from King Street to Sevilla Street on the interior of the Markland property to accommodate the Palm Garden east of the Ponce. This work was completed by laborers including former enslaved-African Prince Brown whose sister Sarah Murray recalled in a 1934 interview his pride for having been able to work on the project.³

Construction of the Ponce began with a groundbreaking on December 1, 1885. The following summer Flagler received three months leave from Standard Oil to


³Anderson Cottage remains today, heavily transformed through a 1920s Mediterranean Revival modernization, facing Sevilla Street the narrow route created as a boundary between Markland and the Hotel Ponce de Leon. In 2007 the property was donated to Flagler College to ensure its preservation.
oversee activities related to the construction. His leave coincided with the timing of three Gulf hurricanes that struck and damaged north Florida. The last of the three crossed the state at Jacksonville, bringing wind and rain to St. Augustine. Substantial completion of the hotel was accomplished in eighteen months, concluding on May 30, 1887. From that date through the end of 1887 an ambitious punch list of interior details and finishes were addressed as well as furnishings and fixtures.4

**Pioneering Use of Materials**

Flagler had become interested in the use of concrete which had been employed in limited fashion for residential construction in California between 1860 and 1879. Also, hurricanes that struck St. Augustine in the summers of 1882 and 1885 may have influenced his decision, and the three in the summer of 1886 may have reinforced his choice. Flagler’s intent was to incorporate St. Augustine’s native coquina shells into the concrete mix. The shellstone was obtainable from an Anastasia Island quarry nearby. The coquina shell material had been used on Fort Marion (Castillo de San Marcos) as well as many of the extant Spanish colonial dwellings. In 1883 Bostonian Franklin Smith had experimented with mixing concrete and crushed coquina shells. Satisfied with the results, Smith used the material for his residence Villa Zorayda. That structure was located directly across King Street from Flagler’s chosen site for the Ponce.5

Flagler was familiar with Smith’s efforts. Carrère and Hastings developed the scheme that enabled the material to be used for the hotel, a much larger-scaled and

---


more elaborately-designed project. "Technologically advanced, the buildings employed concrete-wall construction at a time when the material was virtually experimental." The exceptional span of the Dining Room ceiling, the four-story concrete-topped central dome, and the two towers required robust iron reinforcing. The balance of the hotel complex was constructed of unreinforced concrete. The cost was significant, but Flagler justified the expenditure, "a hundred years hence it will be all the same to me, and the building will be better because of my extravagance."  

Carrère and Hastings became comfortable with the use of concrete as a building material, and by the early 20th century they had designed three buildings that today remain in high states of preservation and use: Vernon Court (1898) in Newport, Rhode Island, for Mrs. Richard van Nest Gambrill, now the National Museum of American Illustration; Flagler’s south Florida home Whitehall (1901-1902) in Palm Beach, now the Henry Morrison Flagler Museum; and the Murry Guggenheim Residence (1903-1905) in West End, New Jersey, now the Monmouth University library.  

Builders James McGuire and Joseph McDonald began the process of casting in place a mixture of concrete and crushed coquina after conducting tests on strength and compression. Once the testing was completed William Kennish, who had gained a reputation for his work on the Statue of Liberty foundation, served as concrete superintendent. According to Flagler’s brother-in-law William R. Kenan, Jr.,

---


construction was accomplished by “eleven hundred Negroes with song leaders to pace them, tamped the mixture to ensure its solidity as the great walls rose in one piece…”

For the base of the building, the recipe consisted of equal amounts of sand and concrete. Coquina was added in double that amount. The shell aggregate framed the monolithic concrete poured in forms to a thickness of four feet tapering to half that for the upper stories. The upper story walls were “one part cement to five parts coquina and two parts sand” and poured to a thickness of between 16 and 20 inches.

Anticipated and proved over time was the structure’s ability to withstand hurricanes.\(^8\)

The New York distributor Baetjer & Meyerstein advertised in an 1892 edition of *American Architect and Building News* regarding the mortar used in the construction. In addition to 50,000 barrels used in the Hotel Ponce de Leon, the Hotel Alcazar and Hotel Cordova received the same mortar composition,

Hanover Portland Cement, The Highest Grade Imported exclusively by BAETJER & MEYERSTEIN, 5 Day St. NEW YORK. Over 100,000 barrels of our Cement were used in the construction of the magnificent Ponce de Leon Hotel and other buildings at St. Augustine, Florida.\(^9\)

Portland cement was developed in Portland, near Dorset, England in the early 19th century and became popular in the United States after its promotion at the Philadelphia Exposition of 1876. Architect Herschel Shepard noted that use of large quantities of


Hanover Portland Cement at the time of the Ponce’s construction was significant as the material was not widely used in the United States until the 1890s. Masonry expert Harley J. McKee stated, “By the late 19th century, the demand was such that portland [sic] cement was imported into the United States from England, German, Belgium and other European countries.”

According to masonry conservator Norman Weiss, buildings on which this mortar was used were the Biltmore House in Asheville, North Carolina, and the Breakers at Newport, Rhode Island. In the early years of the 20th century Flagler imported the mortar again for the concrete pilings supporting the bridges through the Florida Keys to complete construction of the Overseas Railway.

According to an 1889 article in Engineering News describing the construction of the Ponce, a strong day’s work resulted in a five foot vertical section of the perimeter walls being completed. Both interior and exterior walls consisted of structural concrete. In addition, wood floor beams received corrugated concrete boxes, reinforcing the concrete connections throughout the structure. The article lauded the use of the material for its quantitative benefits as well as its qualitative characteristics. The cost per cubic yard was $6.00, a significant savings over the use of either brick or stone. “These buildings are a striking and most interesting example of both economical and effective concrete construction; the very first of their kind in this country and to the best of our knowledge surpassing anything attempted elsewhere.” The design and execution

---

received praise for the use of a simple material to accomplish an innovative and sophisticated result.¹¹

In contrast to the speckled pearl gray of the coquina concrete mix, the 2,000,000 red bricks with matching mortar and the terra cotta provided a dramatic polychromatic effect, newly popular for the era. In the 1870s during the firm's early years McKim, Mead & White experimented with adding tints to original gray terra cotta to achieve a red clay effect. Later, experts credited the architects as national leaders in this treatment. Their protégés Carrère and Hastings would have been familiar with terra cotta tinting. The Perth Amboy Terra Cotta Company provided the material.¹²

The building featured an exuberant mixture of balconies, loggias, alcoves, and arcades, detailed in brick or terra cotta. The color and ornamentation helped bring the scale of the massive monolithic concrete building to one readily appreciated by visitors. The elaborate variation in the details found throughout the building made a striking contrast to the horizontal rhythmic bands identifying the concrete pours.

Wood structural members were of Argentine heart pine in 4"x8", 6"x10" or 6"x12" sized beams, a material that proved extremely resistant to termites. Henry Plant used this same material for the Tampa Bay Hotel a few years later.¹³


¹³Castillo, 150.
The complex form roof continued the polychromatic theme through the use of clay barrel tiles. Provided by the J. C. Ewart firm of Akron, Ohio, the native Summit County clay echoed the dark red of the bricks. Ewart produced brick and drainage tile as well. The majority of the barrel shaped roof tiles remain on the Ponce after 125 years. Replacements are kindred spirits, being of Ohio clay provided by the nearby Ludowici Roof Tile Company of Lexington, a firm contemporary with Ewart’s.14

The Medal Brand Roofing Felt Company of New York provided underlayment for the roof. The company name, logo and “1854-1886 trade mark” imprints were included on the products. The material remained in service on the Ponce until hurricane damage from the 2004 storms eliminated the continued functional integrity of the material.15

Figure 6-2. Copper flashing, Hotel Ponce de Leon

Original flashing, revealed during re-roofing in December of 2012, was provided by the Revere Copper company of Boston, Massachusetts. Jim Walas, Architectural

15Roofing paper samples were provided to the author for archival retention.
Services Manager, verified that the company began operation in 1801 and manufactured rolled copper shortly after that date. He confirmed that the product had a reputation for use extending more than a century.\(^1\)6

Inaugurated on the Hotel Ponce de Leon the distinctive yellow outlining the 1,000 windows and highlighting the exterior woodwork became a trademark “Flagler yellow” used by Henry Flagler as he continued resort construction down Florida’s Atlantic coast. The color identified readily the Florida East Coast Railway cars as well. Gently, the red and yellow reinforced St. Augustine’s ties to Spain, the flag of which was enjoying its centennial anniversary during the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s construction.

The Sicilian Asphalt Paving Company of New York, under general manager Henry Bolze, provided rock asphalt as the primary component for the floors of the loggias and dome room in the Ponce. Native crushed coquina was added when the mix was in liquid form. The material was used for the Mezzanine in the Hotel Alcazar. Flagler imported 350 tons of asphalt for streets surrounding the hotels. Walkways around the hotels were composed of asphalt laid in blocks. Bolze perfected the use of this material. After his work in St. Augustine, he applied for patents for the use of asphalt.\(^1\)7

Another engineering feat began in November 1886. Daniel Dull, a contractor from New York, drilled a well for Flagler’s hotels and other St. Augustine properties.

\(^{16}\)Revere Company of Massachusetts, copper flashing, Hotel Ponce de Leon, fourth floor, west wing, found 2012, property of Flagler College. Jim Walas, Architectural Services Manager, Revere Copper, correspondence with author, December 7, 2012. Stamped flashing was provided to the author for archival retention.

Securing an artesian well ensured a new, clean water supply to accommodate guests’ needs and added to the exotic landscaped setting for the Ponce. Dull drilled a 12” diameter well with a depth of 1,390 feet by February of 1887. The well provided 10,000,000 gallons of water a day and sustained pressure sufficient to “force the jet 42 ft. above the mouth of the well.” Water circulated through four fountains around the property removing minerals from the well water.18

Figure 6-3. Presbyterian Memorial [i.e. Flagler Memorial Presbyterian] Church, St. Augustine

From the fountains water was pumped into storage tanks in each of the Ponce’s two towers. Each tank held 4,000 gallons of water. The steam-powered pumps were located in the lower floor of the service building beyond the Dining Room. “The water

from two of the tanks provided pressure for the pistons in the basement that powered the hydraulic elevators.” The water stored in the other tanks ran throughout the hotel plumbing for guest services.19

The well was sufficient to serve the Ponce and the Alcazar, including providing 82 degree Fahrenheit water for the latter’s swimming pool. Drilling continued in attempts to break through limestone for water to heat the hotels. The efforts failed. Edison’s four direct current steam dynamos powered the Hotel.

On April 7, 1888, the Thursday prior to Easter Sunday and the end of the Hotel’s first season, Scientific American writer H. Bradford Rockwood chronicled an event related to, but more important than, electrification of the Ponce. William Hammer and engineer William Kennish initiated an experiment for Flagler, “the first case on record where natural water power for driving machinery has been derived directly from the earth.” The scientists set a turbine over one of the artesian wells on the Hotel property, “which throws a solid column of water, 12 inches in diameter, 35 feet into the air…Bolted direct to the shaft of this wheel is an Edison dynamo, capable of supplying 375 sixteen candle lamps.” Scientists accomplished “the first electric light plant in the world ever run directly by power from an artesian well driving a turbine and dynamo.” The power generated was sufficient to serve the Hotel.20


20Power for Lighting from an Artesian Well Western Electrician 1-2 (1888), 177, accessed June 30, 2012, http://books.google.com/books?id=4GJVAAAYAAJ&pg=RA1-PA177&lpg=RA1-PA177&q=william+kennish+ponce+de+leon&source=bl&ots=Ql4xvWf-Pc&sig=yR1xN70sGVUABuVJ4sOK0nPYY-w&hl=en&ei=vXv_TaaFE6fx0gHoufDdAw&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=6&ved=0CCcQ6AEwBQ#v=onepage&q=william%20kennish%ponce%20de%20leon&f=false. Israel, Edison, 231, 237.
“An American Palace”

Flagler named his resort hotel for New World explorer Juan Ponce de Leon, paying homage to the discoverer of “La Florida” and acknowledging St. Augustine’s role in preserving the nation’s Spanish heritage. The city’s inauguration of an annual festival in the explorer’s honor reinforced the relationship. Some scholars have speculated on the similarities between the explorer’s fabled search for the Fountain of Youth and Flagler’s reinvigorated life investing in Florida real estate and remarrying late in life.21

![Image of Hotel Ponce de Leon](image)

Figure 6-4. Exterior view looking north from gate - Hotel Ponce de Leon, King, Valencia, Sevilla & Cordova Streets, Saint Augustine, St. Johns County, FL

Standing within the sound of the surf on the Florida shore, its towers overlooking the sea, it should be named in honor of the Discoverer whose romantic quest had made his name typical of the adventurous and chimerical spirit of his age. And as the bastions and watchtowers of the Fort were significant of the military might of sixteenth century Spain, so this new memorial, in beauty and harmony of parts, shall be a reminder of that other Spain, the mother of artists and architects and cunning craftsmen.

Charles Reynolds

---

21Charles Reynolds, A Tribute (St. Augustine, 1910), n.p.
The principal facade faced south to King Street and comprised 66,480 square feet. A semi-circular central entry plaza led through a pyramid-roof gatehouse featuring two terra cotta lions’ heads flanking a portcullis. A central rectangular courtyard of 150 feet to a side and framed by arcaded walks and loggias afforded access from a variety of points to the U-shaped, four-story building. Landscaping included “date-palms, palmettos, magnolias, and pomegranate, lilies and roses, camellias, azaleas, and blue sage…” The center of the courtyard featured a fountain sporting four turtles considered representative of the four seasons, and twelve frogs spouting water and symbolizing the twelve months. These elements surrounded a tall mosaic column. The central entrance was up a short flight of steps beyond the fountain. Adjacent to the steps a low retaining wall of cut coquina blocks were salvaged and reused after a fire in 1887 burned the Catholic Church nearby. This is the single example of coquina in the building. Correspondingly, the two ladies’ entrances were accessed from walkways to the right and left of the fountain. Channing Blake credits Hastings with exterior details,

The restraint imposed by the structural material makes all that more poignant the release of the pencil and imagination allowed by the decorative fabric. Hastings’ penchant for scribbling exotic and abundant motifs on a design found fruitful expression in the doorway surrounds, the window tympana, the console-supported balconies and the studded cone towers.22

Twin towers, each 163 feet in height including the 15 foot tall finials, anchored the interior corners of the building and flanked the central dome. The towers included staircases descending to the lobby floor from the hotel room corridors. Asphalt-floored

roof terraces led east or west from the upper lobby or Solarium. Elaborate staircases led into the towers from which balconies were accessed, affording exceptional panoramic views of St. Augustine. Water holding tanks, two in each tower, stored 8,000 gallons of water for operation of the elevators and to serve the guests.\footnote{Mike Davis, conversation with author, June 3, 2013.}

![Image of the west tower of the Hotel Ponce de Leon Hotel](image)

**Figure 6-5. The west tower of the Hotel Ponce de Leon Hotel**

The building’s corners boasted hipped-roofed towers with overhanging balconies. Windows exhibited great variety, illustrating the breadth of Victorian-era glass manufacturing: casements, some with transoms, round and flat-headed sash, dormers, stained glass.\footnote{Castleden, 8.}

A nautical theme evident on the exterior and the interior’s public spaces paid homage to Florida’s French and Spanish explorers. As he landed in 1564 at present-
day Jacksonville on the St. Johns River, French Huguenot explorer René Goulaine de Laudonnière claimed the land as New France and its north running waterway as the River of Dolphins. These creatures, as well as mermaids, mermen, and shells, decorated the building. Three dimensional representations of the last element executed in metals highlighted the entry, door knobs, and fences.25

The central entrance opened into a vestibule that provided access to the asphalt-covered loggias that led from the Ladies’ Entrances. The central entrance and those leading to the loggias each feature a pair of carved Spanish motif doors set on heavy bronze hinges. For the main entrance side panels in the same design, small sidelights, and a half-round transom complete the entrance that is framed by a large half-round arch. Decorative iron balusters are set in the glass and add to the fortified appearance. Elaborate carvings flank the central entrance. A round window set in a deeply recessed frame features pieces of clear glass reminiscent of flowers. One of these is located on either side of the entrance. Four Tuscan columns with a ribbon or egg-and-dart molding separate the vestibule from the first of the hotel’s grand spaces.

The vestibule opened onto a large rectangular lobby, identified on drawings as the “Lounge.” At the far side of the lobby, opposite the vestibule, dual staircases descended to the carriage drive, the “pleasuring grounds,” and additional hotel facilities. Materials featured in the lobby included Numidian pink marble wainscoting, oak wainscoting and woodwork, and Italian mosaic tile floors. The Rotunda’s most defining

feature, the octagonal inset framed by eight carved oak caryatids, supported a five-story central dome. George Maynard’s murals, two sets of four allegorical figures each—the Elements and Exploration series—decorated the arches between the caryatids. Smaller, flat arches identified Spanish and French explorers of the New World.²⁶

The Rotunda dome rose through the center of the building’s four stories. Above the second level 24 plump cherubs encircled the space, standing with their arms raised below a series of gold helmets and shell shields. Beyond the circumference of this segment of the dome a wood paneled bench and railing provided guests with another seating area. In the center of the space a small circular metal-framed opening afforded a view to the copper cupola that topped the dome.

At the mezzanine level a gallery provided another gathering space. On each side of the row of south-facing casement windows that overlooked the courtyard, inglenooks featured tiled walls and fireplaces with tiled surrounds and angled oak over-mantles laid in a basket-weave pattern. The fire boxes were shallow for use with either coal or gas. Oak benches flanked the mantles.

Above the lobby and immediately under the thirty-foot diameter dome was the 400 Rotunda. This fourth floor solarium was a rectangular space of 2,500 square feet, the octagonal center of which featured the eight large iron support beams that rose from the ground floor to culminate supporting the cylindrical concrete dome atop the building. These beams were encased within simple rectangular wood columns. A multi-pane sliding glass wall provided views of the courtyard, the Alameda gardens and the Alcazar and Cordova hotels. When open, the glass wall was concealed from view from the

²⁶ Ibid.
building’s exterior by the concrete balcony walls. Flanking the solarium were roof terraces that led to the towers and their balconies.

This terrace is extended to the two sides of the building, forming thus a splendid promenade. The view takes in the sea, the town, the gardens, and the Florida wilderness that creeps up to the very door of St. Augustine.27

The building featured 450 rooms. Of those, 400 rooms in a variety of configurations housed 600 guests. The rooms were considered spacious with fashionable furniture and fireplaces. In contrast to expensive materials used in the public rooms, guest rooms exhibited simple and locally-available materials. Spruce and fir for mantles, doors, windows, surrounds and baseboards was painted.

As built, the single suite with a private bath was built for Flagler. Bathrooms for guests were located at the beginning of each hotel corridor which many guests considered an inconvenience and out of character for an elegant resort. Flagler responded. Between the closing of the hotel in March 1888 and reopening for the 1889 season, nine months later he had McGuire and McDonald reconfigure bedrooms into 150 semi-private baths interspersed along the corridors with the hotel rooms.28

At the end of a corridor leading west from the Rotunda, a pair of carved oak doors led to the delicate and elaborately-painted Grand Parlor provided striking contrast to the rich, substantial oak and marble construction of the Rotunda and Dining Room. The parlor side of the doors featured elaborate applied decoration. Cherubs, nautical characters, and egg-and-dart molding enhanced the spaces. Ceilings of a light robin’s egg blue were remarkably similar to the color that Charles Lewis Tiffany, Louis Comfort

27 Carrère and Hastings, *St. Augustine*, 32.

Tiffany’s father, had trademarked in 1845 and that continues to represent the Tiffany jewelry company. References to Ponce de Leon the explorer decorate the center salon. The 1512 date in a ceiling medallion reflected King Ferdinand’s authorization of the expedition; the landing at “La Florida” took place in April of 1513.29

![Figure 6-6. Parlors of the Ponce de Leon Hotel](http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/det1994000253/PP/)

The Grand Parlor, originally a room reserved for women, included five distinct salons. Short corridors on either end of the room led past rectangular rooms to a large central rectangular space. The ceilings of each of the four small salons exhibited Virgilio Tojetti’s murals painted on canvas. The two salons nearest the entrance featured mantles with tiled hearths. The salon nearest the courtyard included a single door to the loggia. Also, on either side of the mantle a door led to a small ladies lounge, recently converted for use as an accessible women’s restroom. All four salons were framed with fluted and banded Corinthian columns each set on a low wall. Arches with

drapes, originally of red velvet, separated the four salons from the main salon. The latter featured a large electric clock set above the room’s third mantle. The clock was embedded in a large block of Mexican onyx marble that served as the hearth surround. Opposite that wall a pair of doors led to the west corridor. Long multi-pane sash windows added natural light to that provided by the eleven crystal chandeliers spaced equidistantly throughout the Grand Parlor. Wrapping the walls were fine paintings and decorative art objects acquired for Henry Flagler to be exhibited in the Ponce. Both new and established artists, Americans and internationals, were represented.

The Grand Parlor provided direct access to the hotel’s west wing, the area that contained Henry Flagler’s private suite of rooms. This suite was used by President and Mrs. Cleveland during his five visits and by Admiral Dewey for his stay. For VIP guests such as these, the Grand Parlor was closed to other hotel guests, affording the dignitaries this space for their gathering and entertainment.30

---

Figure 6-7. Entrance to the Dining Room, Hotel Ponce de Leon, Flagler College

Though each of the public spaces was distinct and reflected the exuberance of the Victorian era, the room considered historically and contemporarily as the Hotel’s most remarkable was the 14,212 square foot Dining Room. A marble staircase led from the Rotunda to the Dining Room. The marble landing at the top of the staircase features a tile inset with the final stanza of 18th English poet William Shenstone’s work, “Written at an Inn at Henley” on the Thames River and purported to have been a favorite verse of Henry Flagler’s:

Whoe’er has travell’d life’s dull round,
Where’er his stages may have been,
May sigh to think he still has found
The warmest welcome -- at an inn.

Bronze castings created in France by sculptor Leonard Morel Ladeuil and sold in 1887 in England of the pretender and her cousin the monarch “Marie Stuart and Queen Elisabeth” stand on pedestals and are adorned with lights. The base of each is signed
“Morel.” They rest, one to each side of the landing, at the entry to a broad, round-arched opening. Above the arch a pink marble balconette adorned with carved lions’ heads and “AD 1887” indicating the hotel’s completion date affords views of the landing and the Dining Room. On either side of that balconette were paintings by Georg Schweissinger, “Columbus Discovering America” and “The Introduction of Christianity to the Huns by Charlemagne.” The oak framed ceiling featured stenciled panel insets.31

Dual wood staircases rose from the sides of the landing to smaller landings. These latter resting spaces were lit by a triple grouping of tall, narrow round-arched Tiffany stained glass windows. Each featured a cherub-adorned transom over which was an elaborate and colorful assemblage of cornucopias overflowing with fruits, flowers and grapes and highlighting Bacchus, the god of wine. Stained glass expert Robert O. Jones credits Maynard with their design. The windows illustrated the transition from the lobby to the celebratory nature of the Dining Room. The dual staircases turned 90 degrees and rose another half story, terminating at the Mezzanine. From there an arch in the west wall opened to a graceful, oak staircase with a simple oak railing that led to the guest rooms and to the room under the dome.

A broad corridor featuring shields of Spanish provinces led into the Dining Room. On either side of this walkway double doors opened onto two private dining rooms, both

featuring decorative Tiffany glass. Walls of stained glass windows highlight both private
dining rooms. Each window measures about 9'6" in height by 5' in width.

The west wall of the west private dining room was composed of four floor length
panels. A small landing adorned with an elliptical ceiling led from the Dining Room to a
staircase, affording discreet access as appropriate. Light filled the space through three
pairs of floor-length casement windows topped by transoms decorated with shields and
filled with rows of bull’s-eye glass. At the stair landing to this private entry a half-round
cauldron pattern Tiffany stained glass window was installed in the transom,

The outer border is set with oval and round jewels. The central urn has a
simple gadroon base and bowl; curled handles set with round jewels flank
the sides, with round jewels forming a band at the top. Radiating from the
urn are floral type leaves with the center in a tulip design.32

The Dining Room structure was composed of a lower floor of poured concrete
with crushed coquina shells, the material used for the entire hotel complex. The upper
floors were constructed of wood framing members and supported a circular clay tile
roof. The interior featured a wood frame 90-foot square room with a 48-foot barrel-
vaulted ceiling included dramatic semicircular east and west venido, or welcoming,
rooms. At either end balconies served as minstrels’ galleries entertaining guests for
dining or when the room was converted for use as a ballroom.

Resplendent in this room are forty Louis Comfort Tiffany stained glass windows.
Five triple-groupings or fifteen double hung sash windows in each venido, a total of
thirty, feature, “clear glass with metal filigree designs and geometric sections. Ten of
them have rectangular sections of amber bull’s-eye in the upper sash.” The windows

32Tiffany Windows: Flagler College Dining Hall unpublished typescript, Flagler College Archives.
McDonald interview.
measure about 10’6” in height with the center window of each triple grouping measuring 6’ in width. The angled windows flanking each center window measure 5’ in width.  

Above the central rectangle soft light is provided to the room from a clerestory with ten lunette windows, each with a cauldron from which ribbons of flame emerge.

Four of them feature a band of glass jewels around the center portion of the urn, swirl base to the left, elongated gadroon design in the center, and colors of pink, brown, mauve and green. Four others have urns with a cross hatch base, gadroon design center, oval glass border, and scalloped inner border, in colors of yellow, brown, lavender and green. The other two are a matching pair with the urn base and swirl of design to the right, jewel band at the base, band of white serpentine design glass around the upper portion of the urns.

Hastings' and Maynard's murals proved to be equally as inspiring as Tiffany's glass. Once again, allegorical female figures predominated as had been the case in the Rotunda. Here, they represented the four seasons and were accompanied by dolphins, mermaids, cherubs and bowls of porridge. Spanish coats of arms, proverbs, and representations of galleons added to the colorful portrayal. A two-level electrified metal hoop chandelier hung from the center of the ceiling.

Dual staircases originated in the lobby and flanked the central marble staircase that led through the corridor to the Dining Room. These staircases descended to the carriage drive located under the corridor. In the carriage entrance (under the marble staircase) and accessed via short stair was a massive oak door suspended on iron wheels and set in an iron track. The door slid to the left (eastward) revealing a painted sign “Baggage and Boot Room” and a ceiling of beaded board. Providing light to this

---

33 Tiffany Windows. McDonald interview.
34 Tiffany Windows.
basement entrance were “two windows, rectangular frames of amber and green bull’s –
eyes” one on either side of the door. Here luggage was transferred from carriages to
Otis elevators and from there to guest rooms. On the north side of the carriage drive a
stained glass window identified the gymnasium location. This room and the “children’s
playroom, bar, officers’ hall, and workshop” were housed under the Dining Room,

the lunette windows [is] outlined with a band set with round and diamond
shaped jewels; the central design is an urn with flame ribbons radiating
from the center, and the urn is banded with a border featuring white flower
designs. Shield shapes centered with blue ovals flank the urn. 35

Beyond the Dining Room a 23,592 square foot service facility identified on
architectural drawings as the Kitchen housed the 12,000 square-foot kitchen and the
laundry, maintenance, and printing functions for the hotel. Also, the top floor housed
male employees. The kitchen included double brick ovens, refrigerators, “cold storage
apparatus” and a “dough-mixer [that] is 4 feet deep and 5 feet long, and the mixing is
done by machinery.” The rectangular four-story building was topped by a hipped roof.
Rows of six-over-six sash windows were placed symmetrically along the walls of the
building. Shed-roofed dormers spaced symmetrically provided light to the attic level.
“At the back of the lowest level stood the four Edison direct current dynamos that
generated electricity for the hotel.” 36

The Edison Boiler Building housed the boilers that required “eight tons of coal a
day” to power the engines for the dynamos. According to historian Tom Graham,

35Cook and Blythe, 11. Tiffany Windows.
36Graham and Keys, 212. The Great Halls and Corridors of the Ponce Extend Over One Mile
Supplement to the St. Augustine Record, January 9, 1988, reprinted from the Florida Times-Union,
January 12, 1888, 8.
Some of the steam drove pumps that lifted water into the towers for the hydraulic elevators and plumbing. Also, these pumps were on standby in case of fire. If needed, hundreds of yards of fire hose could be unrolled to fight a fire anywhere in the hotel.\textsuperscript{37}

This single-story, flat-roofed, rectangular structure was devoid of ornamentation, a striking contrast to the opulence expressed in the main building and Dining Room. Commanding the skyline, at the west end of the boiler building, a 75’ tall conical brick chimney rested on a rectangular base and was topped by ornamental brick corbelling.

The Artists’ Studios, a 10,068 square-foot structure, stood as the northernmost building in the complex. The long and narrow, two-story, hipped roofed building housed seven ateliers for visiting artists on the upper floor. Each atelier contained a corner fireplace with tiled hearth, a skylight, wood paneled wainscoting, a board and batten closet, windows with nautical rope trim, and canvas fabric on the walls. The ground floor featured a series of broad arched openings that afforded access to coal storage rooms. Both boilers and the multitude of hotel fireplaces operated using this material. The eastern-most room, fireproof and reinforced with metal doors, contained the safe for the Hotel’s cash and firearms.

All of the buildings shared construction of poured concrete with brick and/or terra cotta trim. Clay barrel tiled roofs topped the structures with the exception of the Boiler Building which featured a flat roof with a parapet. Heavy wood trim complemented the structures, most painted in the “Flagler yellow” that became part of the Flagler Hotel Company trademark.

As Flagler’s hotel transformed the skyline, the small waterfront city experienced some painful growing pains responding to the demands for improved infrastructure:

\textsuperscript{37}Ibid.
paved streets, gas lines, a water system, and public safety personnel. Not having Henry Flagler’s financial resources, the city government defaulted on the financial obligations that accompanied these improvements. Increased taxes brought dissatisfaction from an electorate that already had mixed feelings about the Gilded Age changes taking place. Flagler was strong, driven and, according to historian Thomas Graham, “accustomed to getting his way.” Some townsfolk resented the loss of control to an outsider and a Northerner, straining the relationship between the old guard citizenry and the upstart tourists.\(^{38}\)

**Conclusion**

Quickly, Flagler’s magnificent Spanish Renaissance Revival resort hotel gained a reputation as one of the most elegant and remarkable buildings of the century. The hotel featured entertainment for men and women, areas for music and dancing, a barber shop, shoe shine stand, and numerous places to relax and enjoy the sunny climate. Museum designer Dana Ste. Claire incorporated his assessment into an exhibit text panel he designed for Flagler College:

“The crown jewel in Henry Flagler’s resort collection, the Hotel Ponce de Leon was built to exceed the expectations of wealthy guests. Flagler spared no expense on the opulent design of his hotel, and its original architectural magnificence and extravagant interior design is still evident today.”\(^{39}\)

The Ponce charmed guests and visitors from throughout the world over the next eighty years, with the height of the hotel’s glory in the first four decades. Instantly, the

---


\(^{39}\)Flagler College, *Hotel Ponce de Leon* exhibit text panel, 2008.
building achieved a reputation as the grandest hotel in the United States, illustrating European architectural legacy merged with American modern conveniences.
Early in 1888 a Pullman Palace Car Company train left New York carrying hundreds of hotel employees and Joyce’s Military Band down the east coast of the United States to its ultimate destination of St. Augustine and the Hotel Ponce de Leon. Flagler had recruited superb employees “battalions of staff” from New England’s summer resorts, bringing familiarity and comfort for guests who frequented those resorts. His intent was to develop repeat customers for his Florida hotel.¹

When the Ponce de Leon hotel debuted in 1888, it was not just a hotel; it was a glamorous tropical mirage in the midst of the post-Reconstruction South. Its arrival had a singular cultural significance, not only for the development of Florida and its self-identification as the re-imagined reflection of Colonial Spain and Cuba, but for the country at large, as it sparked a sense of the exotic potential of the United States.

Laurie Ossman and Heather Ewing

A few days later the "running of the first all-through vestibule train from New York to St. Augustine, reducing 90 hours traveling time to 30" brought distinguished northern guests to experience sunshine state’s transformation into a resort destination. Visitors included members of the New York social register, Flagler’s business colleagues and associates, many of whom had their own investments in Florida. News accounts reported that Henry Flagler greeted his guests personally and escorted them into the lobby to sign the guest register.\(^2\)

On Tuesday, January 10, 1888, after a “pleasant 80 degree day” and glittering with thousands of Thomas Edison’s electric lights, the Hotel Ponce de Leon opened with a private party held in the magnificent Dining Room. The eighty guests included Frederick William Vanderbilt and William R. Rockefeller, the latter an original Standard Oil partner and the younger brother of John D. Rockefeller, Sr. Both were friends and colleagues of Flagler’s and illustrated the importance of railroad connections to the success of his Florida business operations. Both Vanderbilt and Rockefeller served on the boards of directors of the Lake Shore and Michigan Southern Railroad and the Lake Erie and Western Railroad. Vanderbilt sat on the board of the New York Central Railroad and the Chicago and North Western Railroad. Also and more importantly, they were members of the new Jekyl Island Club, a link that would serve the Ponce well in the next few years.\(^3\)


Two days later, on a cloudy 70 degree January 12, 1888, the Ponce opened for the public to experience the remarkable hotel that Henry Flagler, his architects, engineers, builders, and hundreds of artisans and craftsmen had built. Guests noted the exotic furnishings, a $1,000 table and two others at $600 each. Carpets cost a total of $85,000. The 800 Dining Room chairs were manufactured at $18 each. That evening a formal celebration took place for an estimated 500 guests. Newspapers throughout the country announced the opening, marking a public relations tradition that would carry forward for the next forty years. Activities in St. Augustine and later Palm Beach drew national coverage.4

At the time Flagler opened the Ponce, St. Augustine was recovering from a depressed post-Civil War economy. By 1880 the city’s population had more than doubled to 4,000 with three to four times that number in the winter. Attempts to rebuild the city included conversion of Confederate General Edmund Kirby Smith’s boyhood home into a public library; establishment of a telegraph office; and construction of the Convent of the Sisters of St. Joseph. Adjacent to the bath house and boat basin east of the plaza, the military authorized creation of Florida’s first yacht club, the St. Augustine Yacht Club, as a maritime defensive measure. Transportation improvements included


4Smith, Excerpts, El Escribano 2, no.1 (1965): 8, 10.
the beginnings of a shell road north of town that became San Marco Avenue. A rail line linked St. Augustine to Jacksonville to the north and other points to the south.\textsuperscript{5}

The thousands of winter visitors to St. Augustine hotels beginning in the late 1870s initiated a new and vibrant chapter in the history of this Spanish colonial city. The population in 1890 had more than doubled from twenty years earlier to 4,700. During this era the river city to the north, Jacksonville, became Florida’s largest city in terms of population, a status it retained until after World War II. The 1880s and 1890s marked the end of Florida as a sparsely populated, rural Southern state as many Florida cities witnessed boom periods in the early 20\textsuperscript{th} century.\textsuperscript{6}

In addition to hundreds of hotel guests in St. Augustine at any one time, hotel employees added to the city’s population in number and cultural diversity. Employees included both whites and African-Americans. Annie MacKay was a white housekeeper who worked at the Ponce for many years and was mentioned in Flagler’s correspondence. Frank Thompson, in addition to serving as headwaiter, played on the Cuban Giants Negro League baseball team. The South, including St. Augustine, was segregated. So was the Ponce. The kitchen was located beyond the Dining Room building in present-day Kenan Hall. White employees lived there in the upper floors. African-American men lived on Cordova Street in the block south of the Alcazar. The brick and frame building continues today as apartments. African-American women


\textsuperscript{6}Ibid., 173-74. Almost since its founding in 1822, Key West claimed that standing with a few thousand people, a population slightly larger than the two colonial capitals of St. Augustine and Pensacola combined.
stayed above the steam laundry building on the northwest corner of Valencia and Riberia Streets (replaced in 1950s by ranch houses).  

St. Augustine residents regarded the new hotels, facilities, infrastructure and winter residents with mixed feelings. Some citizens expressed enthusiasm; others considered the changes to be destructive to the town’s uniqueness and charm. Regardless of the reaction, tourism was St. Augustine’s major economic vehicle. Because of tourism the centuries-old Spanish colonial city evidenced new life, with existing buildings repaired and painted, new buildings constructed. Colorful, sub-tropical plantings added to the European ambience in the city. Only the onset of the Great Depression in the 1930s challenged the strength of tourism as the economic engine in the “nation’s oldest city.”

Figure 7-2. Florida Sub-Tropical Exposition, Jacksonville, Florida

---


8Rafael Crespo, Florida’s First Spanish Renaissance Revival (PhD diss., Harvard University, 1987), 323 – 25.
On January 12, 1888, the same day that Flagler opened the Ponce, Jacksonville launched the Sub-Tropical Exposition. This was intended to bolster Florida’s fledgling tourism market and to compete with California for winter visitors. Jacksonville architects Ellis and McClure designed the 50,000 square foot polychromatic exposition building with towers and an electrified fountain that served as the centerpiece of the fair complex. Over the fair’s four-month run, Florida and its sub-tropical region’s life and culture were on display.⁹

A few days prior to the opening of the Ponce and the Jacksonville Exposition, on New Year’s Day, a little more than an hour south of St. Augustine two business partners began another venture. John Anderson, a native of Portland, Maine, and Joseph Price of Louisville, Kentucky, had come to Florida for real estate investments, met, and opened a tourism business. They opened the Ormond Beach Hotel on the ocean side of the Halifax River at Granada Street in Ormond Beach. Three years later Flagler bought their hotel, hiring them as managers for the property.¹⁰

Both the Jacksonville and Ormond Beach ventures indicated Henry Flagler’s influence on northeast Florida’s tourism. Advance publicity for the Ponce had been covered in national newspapers for months. Also, all three cities were linked by rail lines. The relationship of railroad and resort development guided the sunshine state’s

---


growth for the next quarter century and, ultimately, ensured Henry Flagler’s role as the “founder of modern Florida.”

Lodging rates at the Ponce paralleled those charged by Northern resorts with a variation in prices depending upon the quality of the facility; they corresponded to tariffs charged at Cruft’s Magnolia Hotel in St. Augustine. The least expensive room there required a daily tariff of $5, the same rate charged at the Ponce. In contrast, a large suite at the Ponce cost “$39 per day for room and meals for a lady and her maid.” In contemporary terms that amounted to $100,000 for the winter season. After a renovation in 1893, charges for a three-room corner suite for the season were $75 a day or $250,000 in 2013 dollars, comparable to a suite today at New York’s Four Seasons Hotel.11

Charges for more modest accommodations for one or two people were $15 to $25 per night. In the spring of 1889 one traveler chronicled his first visit. He described room number 112, a courtyard-facing suite composed of two rooms, the first of which measured about 15’ x 12’. In the corner a tiled fireplace with brass andirons included a mirrored over-mantle “framed with a circular procession of plaster angels.” Furniture was of mahogany, including a writing desk, a dresser and a chest of drawers, the latter two topped with mirrors. The desk included a built-in washstand. The furniture flanked the casement window which had a cream and green shade. The room was dominated by a “table, covered with a heavy rug.” Several chairs and an upholstered sofa

completed the furnishings. The alcove or sleeping area, a space of roughly 10’ x 12’ contained the bed, a couple of chairs, and featured a Brussels carpet. Eight electric lights brightened the ensemble. He commented on the service as well,

The moment the room was unoccupied it was put in order, pitchers of ice water were constantly coming up fresh and cold, the supply for the night being a pitcher containing one large block of ice, which, melting slowly, kept cold till morning. The morning’s hot water appeared upon the touch of the bell, and fine stationery for the asking. It would be hard to find as good service anywhere.

On opening day an article in the Florida Times-Union recorded the following,

Suite of rooms convenient for families with handsome furnishings can be obtained. There are also suites of bridal chambers with the most luxurious furniture, each room’s furnishings costing about $1,000. The furnishing of the hotel cost in itself a large fortune. Imported rosewood, walnut and mahogany furniture handsomely carved in patterns calculated to preserve a unity and harmony of effect has been introduced. Even the tone and color of the handsome Brussels carpets is of a rich and mellow tint.12

In 1893 the Hotel underwent a major updating. All of the original electrical wiring was replaced with what amounted to twenty-nine miles of new material. The Dining Room’s two-tiered circular metal chandelier had been removed by 1891. Adding light during the rewiring were one hundred gilded papier mache lion’s head lights designed by Carrère & Hastings. The plumbing was retrofitted as well, with pipes extending through the roof for better flow and ventilation.13

12 Some Big Florida Hotels. Great Halls and Corridors, 8.

In 1894 Flagler enlisted his son Harry Harkness Flagler to manage the Ponce. Flagler and Rockefeller each had a college-age son. Both fathers were at stages in their lives when they considered turning over to those sons' major business responsibilities. Rockefeller was more successful, turning over Standard Oil and, later, administration of a family foundation to John D., Jr.\textsuperscript{14}

The younger Flagler, age 23, was a beginning student at Columbia College. For the Ponce he oversaw seasonal repairs to the hotel rooms and cottages and painting of the exterior trim. In April, after the end of the hotel's season, he returned to New York, married socialite Annie Louise Lamont, continued his college education, and became immersed in the arts, particularly music. Twenty years later the New York Symphony-Philharmonic recognized him for decades of service to that institution. His wife provided a $100,000 endowment for the organization (a $15.5 million gift in current value). News accounts and correspondence of the era indicated that Henry Flagler was disappointed with his son's choice of career pursuits and that the two were estranged for the last decade of the elder Flagler's life.\textsuperscript{15}

In 1901 Henry Flagler married North Carolina socialite Mary Lily Kenan. Shortly after, public documents verify that Flagler gave his son and three young grandchildren, all girls, 1,000 shares of Standard Oil stock with an approximate value at that time of $2,000,000 (or about $48,600,000 in 2013 dollars). Interestingly, Harry Harkness

\textsuperscript{14}Akin, \textit{Rockefeller Partner}, 130.

Flagler served on major cultural organizations’ boards of directors with Thomas Edison. Also, he maintained contact with a number of his father’s colleagues including his father’s partner in Standard Oil John D. Rockefeller, Sr.\textsuperscript{16}

In 1904 Flagler appointed his 31-year-old brother-in-law William Rand Kenan, Jr., two years younger than Harry Harkness Flagler, to the boards of directors for the Florida East Coast railroad and hotel companies. The Flagler and Kenan families had shared business interests and social circles for twenty years by this time. Kenan, a talented chemical engineer who helped found Union Carbide, maintained a management role in the Ponce from 1904 until shortly before his death in 1965. Then, his great-nephew and chosen successor Lawrence Lewis, Jr., took over the role. Lewis and his sister Molly Lewis Wiley were heirs to Henry Flagler’s fortune through their mother, Louise Wise Lewis, Mary Lily Kenan Flagler’s niece. The siblings assumed stewardship roles for Flagler’s Ponce, a place in which they spent a great deal of their childhoods.\textsuperscript{17}

\textsuperscript{16}Greg Smith, email communication with the author, August 24, 2013.

\textsuperscript{17}Campbell,144.
Messrs. Blum and Bacher, who have done some delightful water-colors and drawings intended to spread the renown of that vast example of Moorish architecture known as the Ponce de Leon Hotel. These drawings and an example or two of Mr. Tiffany’s stained glass are at the entrance.

Architectural League Exhibition, Fifth Avenue Art Galleries
December 1887

Dozens of men and women—artists, authors, and entertainers—contributed to the ambience that resulted in an international audience that flocked to and garnered publicity for the Ponce. Many of these talented men and women shared connections in New York and the White Mountains, reinforcing the resort and railroad network that catered to the leisure class during the Gilded Age and early twentieth century. Their contributions enhanced the traveling public’s experience at Flagler’s hotels and left a legacy of support for the cultural arts in the community in and around St. Augustine.18

Figure 7-4. *Giant Magnolias on a Blue Velvet Cloth*

Flagler symbolically anointed Heade as ‘court painter’ to his palatial resort. He became a steady patron, buying at least a dozen paintings from Heade over the years; no other artist received such continuing support from Flagler”

Roberta Favis, art historian

Part of Henry Flagler’s vision for the Hotel Ponce de Leon and for St. Augustine as the “Winter Newport” included providing entertainment and attractions for guests, paralleling the roles played by other Gilded Age resorts in the United States. This expressed his interest in culture and the fine arts, again typical of a man of his socio-economic status, particularly as a resort developer. Also, Flagler’s friendship with tobacco baron and art patron George Lorillard may have encouraged support for the arts. In 1885 Lorillard began construction of Tuxedo Park, a real estate enclave in New York adjacent to which the Bronxville art colony flourished. Several of the Ponce artists
and hotel artisans such as Herman Schlademundt and Otto Henry Bacher came to the colony over the next several years.¹⁹

Flagler offered salons in the Artists’ Studios building, located at the north end of the linearly-arranged hotel complex. Two of the first artists to occupy studios were friends Martin Johnson Heade and George Washington Seavey. The latter was brother to Osborn Dunlap Seavey, the Ponce’s general manager. Additional artists at the hotel included Marie A’Becket, Laura Woodward, Charlotte Buell Coman, Otto Henry Bacher, Frank Shapleigh, Felix DeCrano, and W. Staples Drown.²⁰

Heade had become enamored with St. Augustine in January 1883 upon his first visit to Florida, “‘I have wandered, in an unsatisfactory sort of way, nearly all over the State without finding a spot where I cared to stop until I reached St. Augustine, and that I find a fascinating, quaint old place,...’” In March he bought and remodeled a house for his residence and studio on San Marco Avenue the road leading north from the City Gate out of town. In October he married Elizabeth Smith of Southampton, Long Island, and the couple moved into the house.²¹

Heade received the favored west studio with two windows overlooking the broad lawn. He moved into the studio in the summer of 1887 at completion of the hotel


²⁰Favis, 48. Andrew, 173.

²¹Heade bought General Frederick T. Dent’s house; Dent was commander of the St. Francis Barracks in St. Augustine and brother-in-law to President U.S. Grant. In 1954 as part of the planning of the construction of the Mission of Nombre de Dios, the Diocese of St. Augustine purchased Heade’s residence for demolition until local preservationist Kenneth Dow moved the house to a nearby site; shortly thereafter, the building fell victim to a Florida Department of Transportation road widening. Favis, *Heade*, 43-45, 106 – 07.
construction. Heade’s studio No. 7 was one of the most favored of the city’s social scenes. He was the most well-known of the Ponce artists and achieved national acclaim. Mark Twain bought one of Heade’s Florida landscapes. According to Heade biographer Roberta Favis, in 1886 Flagler commissioned Heade to execute the two largest paintings the artist ever created. The Great Florida Sunset and View From Fern-Tree Walk, Jamaica were exhibited in the Ponce. The first hung on the east wall of the Mezzanine level of the Rotunda near the staircase as evidenced by a photograph of the era. About 1890 Heade painted Giant Magnolias on a Blue Velvet Cloth. In 1986 the work was gifted to the National Gallery of Art.22

Absent Heade’s paintings, a number of Flagler’s collection for the Ponce including works by those in the Artists’ Studios continue to hang in the building. Others went with Flagler to Whitehall in Palm Beach in the early 20th century. According to John Blades, Executive Director of the Henry Morrison Flagler Museum at Whitehall, several of Flagler’s paintings joined the collections of museums in the United States. Others have become significant components in private collections.23

William Henry Jackson and Thomas Moran

Flagler and other U.S. railroad executives recognized the emerging importance of publicity and advertising for their resorts. In the first decade of the Ponce’s history Flagler hired William Henry Jackson to take artistic photographs during the winter tourist season in St. Augustine. In addition to exceptional views of the Ponce’s interiors and


the city’s skyline from the towers, his camera recorded lush tropical foliage in the
courtyard, vines climbing concrete walls, and third story windows sporting striped
canvas awnings. Jackson had achieved national acclaim by 1883 with his inspiring
depictions of the American West. Jackson chronicled Florida buildings and bucolic
scenes in nearly 1,000 glass-plate negatives and transparencies.24

Jackson and painter Thomas Moran were part of a U.S. Geological Survey crew
that traveled in the summer of 1871 to document the Yellowstone region. The team’s
efforts led to conservation of that area as the first national park. The two men
influenced protection of Yosemite, Zion, Grand Teton and Grand Canyon through their
art. Their shared experiences fostered a friendship that remained for more than half a
century until Moran’s death in 1927.25

Moran arrived in St. Augustine in February of 1877, considerably less impressed
with the town than he had been with the panoramic frontier in the West. He was
enamored with St. Augustine’s legend of Ponce de Leon landing on the beach nearby
and painted the explorer on Fort George Island fifty miles to the north. Flagler acquired
Moran’s painting, Ponce de Leon in Florida (1878), for exhibition in the hotel. Evidence
is inconclusive as to where the painting was displayed. The work’s large size, about

Putnam’s Sons, 1940), 259. Jim Hughes, The Birth of a Century: Early Color Photographs of America
Landscape, The Journal of Decorative and Propaganda Arts. (Book 23) Florida Theme Issue. Miami:
Wolfsonian-Florida International University, 2002), 91.

25Jackson, 186. Barry Jones, William Henry Jackson, Thomas Moran: Analysis of Photographic and
Painterly Style and Attitude During Their Explorations of the American West (M.A. Thesis, East
Tennessee State University, 1987), 10, 13.
5.25’ x 9.5’, the location of appropriately-sized wall space, and interior photographs of the hotel suggest that the Moran painting shared the Mezzanine with Heade’s works.\textsuperscript{26}

**Helena Modjeska and the Shakespearian Heroines**

A collection of eight paintings of female figures acquired by Flagler for the Ponce continue to adorn the walls in the Grand Parlor. The artist of the eight was Hungarian artist Joszi Arpad Koppay. Helena Modjeska, Poland’s most beloved and one of America’s most acclaimed actresses was the model. In the 1880s she had portrayed on stage all of the Shakespearian heroines featured—\textit{Rosalind, Titania, Juliet, Katherine, Ann Page, Ophelia, Beatrice, and Desdemona}. Her performances drew exceptional reviews. First Lady Frances Folsom Cleveland was one of Modjeska’s admirers; the actress performed at the White House during the Cleveland administration.\textsuperscript{27}

**Writers**

St. Augustine drew authors to the city since the 1820s shortly after Florida became a United States territory. Author Ralph Waldo Emerson, suffering from tuberculosis, came from Boston by way of Charleston and spent much of the winter and spring of 1827 in St. Augustine. He wrote favorably of the climate, “The air and sky of this ancient, fortified, dilapidated sand-bank of a town are really delicious” and commented on the pastimes, “The entertainments of the place are two, billiards and the sea-beach…” William Cullen Bryan visited in 1843, traveling the region and writing


about his travels. In 1876 poet Sidney Lanier, employed as a travel writer, chronicled his time in the nation’s oldest city. Between 1873 and 1879 Constance Fenimore Woolson, author and niece of James Fenimore Cooper, came as a winter tourist and wrote for *Harper’s Magazine* of her stay at the Fatio House. Their writings and those of others promoted St. Augustine for visitors and settlers.²⁸

![Figure 7-5. Standard Oil trustee Henry H. Rogers and his close friend Mark Twain](image)

Construction of the Ponce and the accompanying transportation improvements increased the attractiveness of the Spanish colonial city. Some of the authors who enjoyed the ambience included Steven Vincent Benet, Edna Ferber, John Dos Passos, Henry James, Sinclair Lewis, Somerset Maugham, and Thornton Wilder.²⁹

Samuel Clemens spent the night of March 14, 1902, at the Ponce and the next night in Palm Beach on his way to a cruise leaving from Miami. Clemens and Standard

---


Oil executive H. H. Rogers were close friends for many years. The men corresponded, enjoyed each other’s company, and Clemens considered Rogers his benefactor. Quite possibly, Rogers introduced Clemens to Henry Flagler with whom the author enjoyed at least a brief correspondence relating to the author’s stay at the Ponce.30

Entertainers

Figure 7-6. Band assembled on the veranda at the Ponce de Leon Hotel – Saint Augustine, Florida

Music was an integral component of the hotel’s ambience. Orchestras serenaded guests from the loggias or in the courtyard. Minstrels played from the galleries overlooking the Dining Room. Bands entertained after dinners. Several noted band and orchestra leaders performed at the Ponce, including Ellis L. Brooks,

Brooks’ band won great acclaim when it was introduced at the Minneapolis Industrial Exposition in 1887. During the wintertime months of the late

1880s and early 1890s, Brooks played at several of the large resorts along the New England coastline, and at least eight consecutive seasons at the historic Ponce de Leon, Alcazar and Cordova hotels in St. Augustine, Florida.

Joyce’s Military Band performed at the opening of the Hotel. Marching band leader John Philip Sousa enjoyed several visits to Flagler’s hotels and participated in a variety of sporting activities.  

Compositions were written in honor of the Ponce and, at the turn of the 20th century, for Mary Lily Kenan Flagler. These were performed at the Ponce. Notes trumpeted, literally, throughout the courtyard. Melodies entertained guests ascending from the Rotunda into the Dining Room and serenaded guests during their sumptuous repasts. Both the Dining Room and Grand Parlor hosted events, concerts, and balls. A New Year’s Eve Ball begun in 1888 returned to prominence when Flagler System executives and community leaders revived the event as a scholarship ball in 1967, a prelude to the opening of Flagler College the next year. The formal black-tie event continues as such today. Then co-chair and St. Augustine’s mayor John D. Bailey, Sr. and his wife Peggy attend every year.

Beginning in 1890 ferry service connected St. Augustine to Anastasia Island, enabling visitors and residents to visit the Atlantic Ocean beaches. Tram service to North Beach provided access to the Surfside Dance Hall and Bath House and the Vilano Beach Casino. At Flagler’s request the Frank Usina family began transporting

---

hotel guests to North Beach where the Usinas hosted oyster roasts. The family tradition continues with the Usina Family’s Victory III cruising passengers on Matanzas Inlet.32

In the 1880s Jacksonville, about to become Florida’s largest city by population, was fostering a fledgling movie industry. Competition for business and for tourism came from California. St. Augustine benefitted from close proximity to Jacksonville and from Henry Flagler’s strong New York connections. Oscar Hammerstein incorporated one of Virgilio Tojetti’s father’s paintings into his first “living picture” show in 1894. Thomas Edison preempted Hammerstein by a month, pursuing movie inventions much as he had the light bulb, phonograph, and steam power (all available at the Ponce).33

Even after California captured the movie making market, the Ponce played a role in U.S. movie history. Theda Bara’s “A Fool There Was” (1915) and Rudolph Valentino’s “Stolen Moments” (1920) are early examples. More well-known is “Distant Drums” (1951) the first of several in a genre of western films during that era.34

**Sports at Flagler’s Hotels**

Flagler’s commitment to entertainment for his guests incorporated facilities a short walk from the Ponce property. He commissioned Carrère and Hastings to design

---


a second hotel, the Alcazar to host a casino and athletic facilities as well as additional
guest rooms. The landscaped garden Alameda crossed King Street and linked the
courtyards of the two hotels. The facilities in the Alcazar included a “'Russian steam
bath, a Turkish bath, a gymnasium, a massage area, a bowling alley, a ballroom,
playhouse, and the world’s largest swimming pool' . . . tennis courts and a bicycle
academy.” Also during this era a number of sporting activities matured from amateur
events to intercollegiate athletic competitions and professional sports. These included
tennis, golf, and baseball. Flagler brought all three to Florida for his hotel guests.35

Flagler’s week-long Tropical Championship tennis tournament, held annually in
late March with “a season to itself, and . . . the premier season, too” drew some of the
best players from the United States and England. In 1889 Flagler replaced the wood
courts north of the Artists’ Studios portion of the Ponce with asphalt courts located south
of the Alcazar. Collegiate contenders from Columbia, Yale and Trinity joined the
competition. As an incentive, Flagler commissioned a massive sterling silver replica of
the City Gate for the winner of four tournaments. In 1887 T. S. Beckwith of Cleveland
won the inaugural tennis tournament before the Ponce opened, and the competition
was established officially. Beckwith continued to finish well, placing first or second in
several of the annual events over the next decade. Quite possibly, he knew the
Rockefellers and Flaglers as his family lived on Euclid Avenue in Cleveland, the same
street and at the same time as the Standard Oil partners.36

36 The St. Augustine Lawn-Tennis Tournament, Outing XVI no. 3 (June 1890): 180 – 83, accessed
Flagler College historian Tom Graham noted that the *St. Augustine Evening Record* of January 28, 1910, announced the completion of a new tennis court on the Ponce grounds. The structure was located on the west side of present-day Kenan Hall, the building constructed to house staff and support facilities. As with many of the Ponce’s activities, hotel guests and local residents participated. This is true particularly in the declining years after the Stock Market Crash in October 1929.

St. Augustine native David Drysdale recalled that his father W. I. (Walter Irvine) Drysdale or “Driz” excelled at several sports offered at the Ponce: tennis, golf and baseball. He gave tennis lessons there and bested a Canadian champion in an exhibition match in the 1930s. John Fraser grew up immediately west of the Ponce grounds at 29 Valencia Street. Fraser’s father John Fraser, Sr. made home movies of the tennis matches a few years later. Janis Versaggi Williams, whose family moved to St. Augustine in 1955 and lived on Valencia Street, too, took tennis lessons there.  

Beginning in 1895, the Fort Marion grounds doubled as a three-hole golf course; however, the sport’s popularity dictated a more spacious course (though perhaps not as challenging). Henry Flagler responded quickly introducing the sport broadly at the Ponce and many of his other Florida resorts. To the west across San Marco Avenue the “Fort Links” attracted a competitive crowd as had the tennis courts. Again, players from throughout the U.S. and the collegiate teams came to compete in winter season games. Established in 1896 the University of Pennsylvania team was represented by the captain Clayton Dixon. He competed regularly against Joseph Greaves of the

---

37David Drysdale, interview by author, February 6, 2013.
Manhattan Club. By the turn of the 20th century the *New York Times* reported the list of golfers arriving via rail for the New Year’s Cup at the Florida East Coast Golf Club.\(^{38}\)

![Figure 7-7. People Playing Golf by Fort Marion, St. Augustine, Florida (1902)](image)

Ponce Serves as Home Field to the Cuban Giants

In the winter of 1885-1886 the Cuban Giants baseball team traveled to Florida reportedly after playing an exhibition game in Cuba. The team, comprised of African-American employees from Babylon, Long Island’s Argyle Hotel and players from several northern cities, began a series in St. Augustine as construction started on the Hotel Ponce de Leon. At Henry Flagler’s behest, the team returned the following winter, setting a pattern that continued for the next decade and helping the team survive the off-season winters.39

Figure 7-8. 1887 Cuban Giants

During their first season the Cuban Giants won forty games before suffering a loss. This string of successes elevated Negro League baseball beyond merely an

---

entertainment. The Cuban Giants toured the South each winter and played Northern teams in the summers, achieving national success and garnering accolades. The team, changing members over the years, played for more than twenty years at hotels along the east coast managed by Osborn Seavey. According to author Mark Ribowsky by 1887 the team's ball playing ability brought them the autonomy to select their opponents, white or black, a rarity at the time.

[Stanislaus Kostka “Cos”] Govern's bookings in Cuba ended in time for the team to repair to St. Augustine, Florida, for the peak of the resort hotels' peak winter season. That a black baseball team should be a part of these festivities was due to [Frank P.] Thompson, who put the Cuban Giants into the annual winter employment of Henry Morrison Flagler, whose hotel-and-railroad empire brought Florida into the modern era.

The colored employees of the Hotel Ponce de Leon will play a game today at the fort grounds with a picked nine from the Alcazar. As both teams possess some of the best colored baseball talent in the United States, being largely composed of the famous Cuban Giants, the game is likely to be an interesting one – St. Augustine Weekly News, January 17, 1889.

Racism remained prevalent so they tempered the demonstrations of their athletic prowess against less competitive teams by introducing barnstorming as “comic relief” to lighten the mood and appeal to audiences’ interest in entertainment. Despite the requisite antics “the Cuban Giants of the late 1880s remain the benchmark against which all of the other black teams of that era are measured.”

---

During this same period Cos Govern and Frank Thompson participated in anti-racist organizations. Govern led the Hotel Brotherhood, founded in 1884 to address inequities among hotel workers based on race. Both men founded the Progressive Association of the United States of America to foster improvements for African-American businessmen. Thompson addressed hotel employees “for forty-five minutes in the dining room of the Ponce de Leon” discussing racism and the South, a story submitted by Govern and printed in the February 23, 1889, issue of the *New York Age*. The speech bespoke the rhetoric of the era. If African-Americans could improve themselves economically, they could fare better politically in the white world. Though the subject matter was typical for the era, the presentation in a luxury hotel for wealthy Northerners was a remarkable activity.41

**Discerning Clientele**

But the great Mecca of fashion and wealth in the winter is Florida. In forty-eight hours at the outside any one in New York or Chicago may change his environment from arctic to tropic, winter or summer; zero mercury for one between 60° and 80° above; ice and snow for blue skies and bluer waters, ever-blooming flowers, and singing birds; and all this without leaving the mainland of the United States;...

Katherine Graves Busbey

Throughout the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s eighty years as a resort, hundreds of notable people visited. Guests included several U.S. Presidents and their Cabinet members, Congressmen and their aides, and military officers such as Admiral Perry and Civil War Union Generals Martin Hardin and John McAllister Schofield. Andrew Carnegie, Hamilton Disston, George M. Pullman, J. P. Morgan, and John Jacob Astor

---

led a lengthy list of industrialists who enjoyed Henry Flagler's hospitality. The Alexander Brinton Coxe family from Pennsylvania enjoyed their stay, renting one of the Ponce de Leon cottages at 9 Carrera Street for their extended family's visit.

President Grover Cleveland and his wife Frances Folsom Cleveland made their first visit to the Ponce the month after the grand opening, in February of 1888. They stayed in a suite at the southwest corner of the lobby floor at the end of the west wing. The suite, overlooking the palm garden, was described in the March 20, 1889 issue of the *New York Times*.

They are on the ground floor, connecting by a broad hall with the great parlors. The ex-President's suite consists of a corner parlor, large bathroom, and sleeping apartment, all luxuriously furnished. The chairs and sofas are upholstered in light gray and pink brocaded satin, with curtains of the same material hung over curtains of delicate lace. In the center is a table topped with Mexican onyx, and the beautifully-tiled fireplace is such a work of art that no one has yet been induced to light a fire in it . . . .

The sleeping room is one of the finest in the house, overlooking the beautiful hotel gardens. It is upholstered throughout in delicate pink satin, with a canopy of the same material over the bed, which is covered with an antique lace spread. Every article of furniture in the room is upholstered—the headboard, sides, and footboard of the bedstead and the fronts of the bureau drawers. The three rooms contain 12 electric lights, and are in every respect the perfection of comfort.42

In 1895 when he was Governor of Ohio and two years before he was elected chief executive, William McKinley stayed at the Ponce. Flagler was a strong supporter of McKinley so presumably the visit was welcomed.

Theodore Roosevelt stayed one night on October 21, 1905, the first time that the Ponce was opened outside the winter season for anyone other than Flagler or Kenan family members. Instead of greeting the President personally Flagler sent his brother-in-law William Rand Kenan, Jr., north from Palm Beach to meet Roosevelt. The “trust-busting” President had targeted Standard Oil for legal action. Flagler’s business interest in the Panama Canal’s construction, a project of Roosevelt’s, was balanced against his wariness of the President. News accounts indicate that Roosevelt enjoyed the visit.43

Warren G. Harding, an avid sportsman, visited each year for nineteen consecutive years beginning in 1904 and concluding in March 1923 a few short years before he died that August.

Harding and his wife, Florence, made the Ponce their base during late January and February of 1921 before his March inauguration. From there he held conferences, chose cabinet members and played golf. He played several rounds of golf at the St. Augustine Links, partnering with William Rand Kenan, Jr.44

Vice-President Lyndon B. Johnson came to the city in March 1963 to launch St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration. Robert Harper, then a teenager vacationing with his family and now the Lightner Museum director, noted that the antique bedroom furniture had been replaced with contemporary 1960s chrome pieces for Johnson’s visit. Presumably, the hotel management wanted to appear to be fashionable.45


44Presidential Days.

As evidence of the modern and cosmopolitan changes accompanying the Ponce Alexander Graham Bell took the opportunity to send his wife a telegram from the hotel shortly before he completed his visit at the end of the hotel’s second season. The resort hotel was designed to fulfill all guest needs, whims and desires.46

![Telegram from Alexander Graham Bell to Mabel Hubbard Bell, March 29, 1889.](image)

**Figure 7-9.** Telegram from Alexander Graham Bell to Mabel Hubbard Bell, March 29, 1889.

The Ponce hosted special events that attracted large audiences. In 1892 a charity event chaired by Ellen Call Long, daughter of former Florida Governor Richard Keith Call, raised funds for the preservation of Andrew Jackson’s Tennessee home, the Hermitage where Governor and Mrs. Call married. Holding charity events at the Ponce elevated the importance of both the event and the hotel.47

---


The Hotel Ponce de Leon on the Eve of the 20th Century

In 1893 Henry Flagler helped St. Augustine set the theme for a long history of Florida’s participation in commemorations and celebrations. A 140’x140’ replica of Fort Marion (Castillo de San Marcos) complete with flags representing France, Spain, England and the United States, served as the Florida Building at the World’s Columbian Exposition that opened to the public on May 1, 1893 in Chicago. The fort facsimile’s patriotic theme emphasized the nation’s colonial past as did a number of other state buildings such as Virginia’s emulation of Mt. Vernon and Massachusetts’ representation of the John Hancock Mansion (the latter of which had been demolished as a result of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts’ lack of timely action). Simultaneously, Florida’s simple construction contrasted greatly with other state buildings such as Pennsylvania’s Independence Hall replica and New York’s elaborate Victorian-era confection. Henry Flagler invested $10,000 that enabled construction of the Florida Building. In addition Flagler, Henry Plant and H. Rieman Duval provided complimentary transportation via their railroads that shipped Florida’s exhibits to Chicago.48

---

St. Augustine was the oldest European settlement in what is now the United States, and Fort Marion, originally known as Castillo [de] San Marcos, had the distinction of protecting the city and Spanish Florida from English invasion in both 1702 and 1740. Fort Marion therefore alluded to a strong and proud chapter in Florida history… the image creatively exaggerates the relationship of the Fort Marion replica to neighboring state pavilions… the Florida Building is shown quite literally as a fortress. It encloses and protects neighboring pavilions, most notably Pennsylvania’s replica of Independence Hall… The image seems to imply that Florida is older, strong, and culturally distinct from the rest of the nation.

Joel Hoffman

*The Journal of Decorative and Propaganda Arts*

That same year, following the Exposition’s successful promotion of Florida, Flagler had the Ponce updated. Insurance underwriters found the original electrical system unacceptable. As noted in Chapter 6 the entire system was replaced with new knob and tube wiring. This included more 175,000 feet of conduit provided by Interior Conduit and Insulation Company of New York and 100,000 feet of cable from the Okonite Company of New Jersey. (The latter company remains in business.) Underground wires set in wooden troughs ran to the lights set along the perimeter wall.
The hotel returned to a national resort hotel industry leader once again. The Rotunda and Dining Room gained their gilded paper mache lion’s head lights at this time. Plumbing lines were rerun and drain lines vented through the roof to preclude dangers and the unpleasant aroma that had permeated the building previously.\(^{49}\)

Flagler made these investments during a year of national financial recession. The winter of 1894-1895 brought a freeze to north Florida that destroyed citrus crops and flowering plants. The weather delivered a chilly reception to tourism in St. Augustine, too. Flagler focused on his new Florida properties further south.

Flagler’s expanded railroad to Palm Beach and beyond ended St. Augustine’s reign as the “Winter Newport.” In 1895 the Hotel Cordova closed with the exception of the guest rooms. In 1903 reprogrammed as the Alcazar Annex, a concrete walkway suspended over Cordova Street linked the two properties. Though tourism moved south the Ponce remained dramatically impressive, and Flagler remained committed to making physical changes that would, “transform St. Augustine from a town mired in the past into a Gilded Age resort.”\(^{50}\)

On February 15, 1898, the U.S.S. Maine battleship exploded while docked in Havana Harbor. President McKinley declared war on Spain two months later, waiting until Henry Plant’s steamships, in Havana to unload tobacco, had removed all United


\(^{50}\) Akin, *Southern Reflections*, 41 – 42.
States’ citizens safely from the Cuban capital and for troops to be effectively readied. The *Olivette* returned survivors of the *Maine* to Tampa, and the *Mascotte* returned 700 evacuees to the port city. As the nation prepared for war, representatives were dispatched to Washington to lobby for the U.S. Navy to use Plant’s Tampa or Flagler’s St. Augustine or Miami as the base of operations. Tampa became the location from which the war was launched, with the Tampa Bay Hotel hosting financially-healthy officers. Flagler settled for his Florida East Coast Railway chauffeuring American troops stationed in Jacksonville to St. Augustine to experience the city and enjoy his resorts.\(^5\)

**A New Century and a New Role for the Hotel Ponce de Leon**

Though Palm Beach had replaced St. Augustine as Northerners favorite winter destination, many vacationers chose to incorporate more than one resort destination in their seasonal itineraries. St. Augustine was favored in January until the chilly temperatures encouraged visitors to continue along the Florida East Coast railroad route to Palm Beach for February. Wealthy yachtsmen, including Andrew Carnegie and Frank Vanderbilt, docked at the marina adjacent to the bay front on their sojourns south and returned weeks later as they were heading back to New York, Philadelphia, or New England. European travelers, particularly royalty, drew news coverage—Duke and Duchess of Manchester, Count Starzynski of Russia—as did military heroes.

Socially, few changes were noticed in activities during this era. The Ponce continued to host sports, recreation, leisure and charitable activities, annual events that

---

had begun their traditions with the opening of the Ponce in 1888 and maintained their
audiences, even if the composition of the members changed. Though the volume of
visitors had declined, the hotel maintained a steady trade. During the 1909 season 500
people had enjoyed the hospitality of the hotel.

In March of 1900, near the end of the winter season, Admiral Dewey and his wife
arrived for a stay. They attended the twelfth annual Alicia Hospital charity ball,

Mr. Robert Murray has caused Mr. Flagler’s suite of rooms to be put in
readiness for the reception of the Admiral and his wife. This suite, which is
naturally the most elaborate in the house, was used by ex-President
Cleveland and Mrs. Cleveland when they visited this city several years
ago.  

The pomp and circumstance continued with local dignitaries and members of the
social set from St. Augustine included in events throughout the years. For the January
5, 1910 opening, local enthusiasm brought the following accolade,

The Ponce de Leon is Florida’s pride and nothing has been left undone to
hold it up to just as high a standard this winter as ever…A large number
registered today and…Every indication points toward the heaviest tourist
travel south this year of any previous season in the history of the East
Coast and there is little doubt but that the immense hotel will have an
unusually large number of guests for the opening week of the season.

The state had suffered a hurricane in 1909 (and would again in 1910) which prompted
the positive opening commentary. News accounts closed out the season with the
closure of the hotel’s portcullis on April 5, 1910, reiterating the strong number of visitors
to the city as guests of the hotel. At the time Henry Flagler had enjoyed his dual winter
homes in St. Augustine and Palm Beach for nearly a decade and was in the midst of
constructing the Key West Extension to the Florida East Coast Railway. He continued

to own Lawn Beach in Mamaroneck and spend a portion of the summer season in the White Mountains.

**John D. Rockefeller Returns to Florida**

Arguably, the man who knew Flagler best came to enjoy life in Florida as well. “Ever since their first Florida visit, Rockefeller had followed with interest Flagler’s passion for the development of the peninsula.” Rockefeller continued throughout his lifetime to consider Flagler his dear friend, though their personal lives differed dramatically. John D. Rockefeller returned to Florida beginning in 1913 staying at the small coastal community of Seabreeze about sixty miles south of St. Augustine. In 1914 the year after Flagler’s death, Rockefeller began annual winter stays at Flagler’s nearby Ormond Beach Hotel. Rockefeller traveled by rail requiring him to pass through St. Augustine. Perhaps, he visited the Ponce on his way further south.53

In 1918, five years after Flagler’s death, Rockefeller purchased the Casements property, immediately south across Granada Street from the Ormond Beach Hotel. He lamented that he had waited so long to enjoy Flagler’s Florida. Rockefeller stayed at the Casements over the next 22 years enjoying golf on Flagler’s course, until his death at his Ormond Beach property on May 23, 1937.54

Rockefeller’s wife Laura Spelman Rockefeller had been a semi-invalid since the beginning of the 20th century. He had remained devoted to her, curbing much of his leisure travel to share with his family members in her care. Rockefeller was at the

---


Ormond Beach Hotel in April 1915 with his son John D., Jr. and daughter-in-law Abby Aldrich Rockefeller, when they received the news of his wife's death. Her deteriorating health coincided with the time of Henry Flagler’s divorce and his subsequent marriage to Mary Lily Kenan. Both Rockefellers’ disagreed with Flagler’s divorce, and her health problems enabled them to distance themselves from Flagler. Possibly, Rockefeller’s timing in returning to Florida and to the Ormond hotel after Flagler’s death was more than a coincidence.\(^{55}\)

John D. Rockefeller, Jr. brought his five sons to St. Augustine in the 1920s as he was beginning to make investments in Williamsburg. On January 24, 1935, his eldest son, John D. Rockefeller III and his wife Blanchette Ferry Rockefeller visited the Ponce, following the luncheon, Mr. and Mrs. Rockefeller enjoyed a stroll through the famous gardens and patios of the hotel. They manifested keen interest in the structure and the beauty of the palatial hostelry.\(^{56}\)

**The Roaring 20s, Roads, and a Reprieve for a Gilded Age Hotel**

The 1920s brought a brief resurgence in popularity for St. Augustine as a winter destination. On October 1, 1921, the Florida Department of Agriculture released a *Florida Tourist Quarterly Bulletin* noting that the city’s hotels could accommodate 3,000 visitors with 1,500 more served in rooming houses (boarding houses or inns). Upwards of 5,000 visitors could enjoy St. Augustine during the winter season - October through March.\(^{57}\)


A few months earlier the Atlantic Intracoastal Waterway had opened incorporating the Tolomato and Matanzas Rivers through St. Augustine en route to its terminus at Miami’s Biscayne Bay. Along the west side of downtown the San Sebastian River south of King Street became the home port for a segment of the former Fernandina Beach shrimping fleet. Both of these maritime elements attracted businesses and tourists.\textsuperscript{58}

**Decline of Tourism and Travel**

The Great Depression dealt a devastating blow to Florida tourism, particularly for St. Augustine and the Ponce. Though the Flagler Hotel company through the Kenan family management continued to operate the building, business was slow. Economic development proposals, including the historic preservation and heritage tourism program outlined in previous chapters, provided some relief.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{palmbeach.jpg}
\caption{Joseph P. Kennedy, Sr. with sons Joseph P. Kennedy, Jr. (left) and John F. Kennedy (right). Palm Beach, Florida, 1931.}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{58}Dunkle, 177.
The *St. Augustine Record* noted that John F. Kennedy stayed at the Ponce in 1931 with his family. He was thirteen years old. The Kennedy family was en route to Palm Beach where, in 1933, Joseph P. Kennedy, Sr. bought an oceanfront property that became known as the Kennedy compound. Perhaps three decades later, in 1962, President Kennedy recalled memories of this earlier visit when he appointed the federal commission for St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration. 59

As part of the Ponce’s contribution, records dating from October 26, 1934, state that the Florida East Coast Hotel Company authorized the “Automatic” Sprinkler Corporation of America to install a fire sprinkler system, keeping pace with safety standards and requirements of the time. The installation was completed in time for the Hotel’s opening on December 22, according to the *St. Augustine Record*, “the earliest date ever set for the opening…and indicative of the optimistic feeling with regard to the coming season.” The hotel closed for the season on April 2, 1935.60


60Hotel Ponce de Leon Will Open Season on Dec. 22nd: Earliest Date Ever Set For This Hostelry, *St. Augustine Record*, October 21, 1934.
Beginning in the 1930s when she was an amateur golfer Babe Didrickson began visits to St. Augustine. She married wrestler George Zaharias, and they both enjoyed wintering at the Ponce over the next two decades. Nancy Jo Cafaro James, daughter of St. Augustine physician Dr. Raymond Cafaro recalled from the 1950s,

One lovely lady was a patient of Daddy's and a Marquesa. She lived at the Ponce with her Standard Poodle which I loved. She was very pretty, early middle aged, and her name was 'The Marquesa De Zaharias.'

In 1956 Babe Zaharias died at age 45 of cancer.61

In March 1938 the Hotel Ponce de Leon hosted a grand dinner as a prelude to the upcoming opening in June of Marineland. The new entertaining and scientific enterprise was developed by Marine Studios' corporate executives Chairman of the Board Cornelius Vanderbilt Whitney, Vanderbilt relative and President W. Douglas

---

Burden, Vice-President Count Ilia Tolstoy, and Sherman Pratt, a grandson of Standard Oil Trust co-founder Charles Pratt. Entertainment included the Meyer Davis Orchestra that specialized in playing special events at hotels, typically in Washington, D.C. and Philadelphia. Over the years Marineland’s growth and prestige provided business for the Ponce, bringing celebrities such as swimmer Johnny Weissmuller who trained at the Alcazar pool and actor Lloyd Bridges for the Marineland Circus in 1961.62

Training the Military: The Ponce as Founding Home for the Coast Guard Reserve

By the time that the United States entered World War II, half a century and the Great Depression after the hotel’s momentous opening, the Ponce’s visitation had dwindled to ten percent of the original numbers. William Rand Kenan, Jr., brother-in-law of Henry Flagler and head of Flagler’s Florida business enterprises, made the Ponce available to the United States Government. The former grand hotel became the founding home of a new military unit, the Coast Guard Reserve. Between 1942 and 1945 the Ponce served as headquarters for the Coast Guard Training Center, hosting 1,500 of the 2,500 soldiers stationed in St. Augustine. The arrangement with the U.S. military expanded out of mutual need.63


63A connection to the military chapter of the Ponce’s history continued with the building’s transformation as the centerpiece of Flagler College. Louis M. Thayer a Coast Guard training instructor stationed at the Ponce became the father-in-law of attorney and later judge Frank D. Upchurch. One of Flagler College’s founding trustees Upchurch served the institution for forty years. His son Tracy joined the College as a faculty member after a distinguished career in law and government service. In 1991 as St. Augustine’s mayor he welcomed the Coast Guard Reserve for its 50th anniversary festivities in St. Augustine and at the Ponce. Coast Guard Reserve, Parade Time in St. Augustine, and St. Augustine is considered by many to be the...Birthplace of the CGR. The Reservist, April 1991. Charlton W. Tebeau, A History of Florida (Coral Gables: University of Miami Press, 1971), 320, accessed November 12, 2012,
There is no question but that William R. Kenan, Jr., president of the Florida East Coast Hotel Company, and L. C. Haines, vice president and treasurer, have made a tremendous sacrifice in connection with the war effort by offering to the Coast Guard use of the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

*St. Augustine Record, August 31, 1942*

The U.S. government made changes to the building to accommodate the trainees. The Mezzanine space became a library and chapel, and nearby balcony offices were used by the chaplains. The brig was housed in a small room on the fourth floor of the east wing immediately adjacent to the bathroom. The hallway was on the south side of the corridor and changed to the north side in the 1950s when the elevator

http://www.floridavets.org/wwii/sites3results.asp?Historical_Title=Hotel+Ponce+DeLeon. “A Real Sacrifice” and Furniture Being Moved From Ponce de Leon To Make Room For U.S. Coast Guard Center *St. Augustine Record, August 31, 1942.* Who Once Filled Flagler’s Halls?....Guards Strolled the Beaches photocopy, n.d., Flagler College Archives.
mechanical system was modernized. Some hotel rooms became classrooms and gear storage. Fire escapes were added on the east and west sides of the Ponce.\textsuperscript{64}

The hotel furniture was stored across King Street from the Ponce in the former Hotel Alcazar, vacant by that time. Decorative elements in the hotel were removed or covered. Shades were attached to the frames of Tiffany’s triple stained glass windows in the Dining Room. These enabled the room to be darkened so training movies could be shown. The parade march route left the Ponce entry gate with the troops heading east on King Street, north on St. George Street, through the City Gate, to the parade field on the Fort Marion grounds.\textsuperscript{65}

In addition to the Ponce, two other local hotels were used, the Bennett and the Monson, both along the bayfront near the Castillo de San Marcos. Also, women serving in the SPARS, the female component of the Coast Guard, were stationed on the bayfront at the Ocean View Hotel. The soldiers’ training took between six and twelve weeks. The Ponce remains as the only hotel of those four standing; the other three were demolished.\textsuperscript{66}

Socialization was important for the soldiers’ morale and the community’s feeling of well-being. Sports included boat races, golf, and the most competitive and favorite

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[64] St. Augustine Lighthouse & Museum, SPARs at Ponce Hotel, U.S. Coast Guard, Flagler College Hotel Ponce de Leon 125\textsuperscript{th} anniversary exhibit. Carrère & Hastings Digital Collection, Plans for Hotel Ponce de Leon as converted for Coast Guard Use. (United States Coast Guard Training Station, St. Augustine, Fla.) UF Digital Collections, accessed January 2, 2013, http://ufdc.ufl.edu/caha.
\item[65] Furniture. St. Augustine Record, August 31, 1942. Hotel Ponce de Leon National Advisory Committee, Minutes, October 27, 1986, 10.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
activity—baseball. Dances were held regularly in the Dining Room. As was much of
the nation, the military was segregated by gender and race.

Renowned African-American artist Jacob Lawrence, influenced by the Harlem
Renaissance, used his race as subject matter for his art. His first exhibit in New York
crossed the color barrier. The show opened on December 9, 1941, two days after the
Japanese bombed Pearl Harbor initiating the United States’ entry into World War II. In
1944 Lawrence spent his first year in the Coast Guard stationed at the Hotel Ponce de
Leon. As was the nation, the military was segregated; his responsibility was to serve
white officers their meals. Commanding officer Capt. C. S. Rosenthal knew of
Lawrence’s talent and encouraged the artist’s efforts. No works from this era survive.67

![Image of Jacob Lawrence in his Coast Guard uniform]

Figure 7-14. Jacob Lawrence in his Coast Guard uniform

The U.S. government enlisted other Flagler System hotels for the war effort: the
Hotel Ormond in Ormond Beach; the Breakers in Palm Beach; and the Casa Marina

---

Hotel in Key West. The agreement for use of the Breakers as an army hospital for nine months concluding in September 1943 provided a $250,000 rental fee and funds to ready the building for that winter’s season. As with the Breakers, the military use of the hotels left the buildings damaged. When the military returned the Ponce to the hotel company at the end of 1945, “the hotel required extensive repairs and renovation.”

The Final Chapter for a Grand Hotel

Figure 7-15. This Will Hurt Me More Than Its Hurts You, Route 66 television episode A) Martin Milner and Glenn Corbett B) Milner and comedian Soupy Sales.

Post World War II expectations for the traveling public led to changes in hotel accommodations nationwide. The Flagler System sought to compete by updating the Ponce. In 1952 Norman C. Schmid and Associates, Palm Beach engineers submitted designs for the outdoor Swimming Pool that would be located on the west lawn of the property. On this location a fountain marked the site of the artesian well that had

---

powered the hotel when it opened in 1888, drawing the attention of scientific and engineering publications.69

Improvements through the 1950s included upgrades to elevators. As evidenced by comparing blueprints for the building to existing conditions, a change on the fourth floor to accommodate the east elevator mechanism flipped the location of the corridor and rooms. As built and used until this time, the corridor ran straight east off a short staircase from the 400 Rotunda (Solarium) with rooms located to the left or north of the corridor. Beginning with this renovation in the 1950s to the present, the corridor runs along the north side of the wing. Plaster, lathe and stud walls exposed during 2013 renovations verified the reversal.

William Rand Kenan, Jr. and his sisters Jessie Kenan Wise and Sarah Graham Kenan used the hotel as their legal residence. Each maintained a large suite on the third floor of the west wing of the Ponce. Each suite was of sufficient size to entertain a number of dinner guests, and formal attire (black tie, not white tie) was required. Their cousin Tom Kenan recalled from his visits as a college student in the 1950s, “The suites had a large living room, two bedrooms, baths and a pantry where food and drinks would be prepared by hotel staff.” An elevator off the Rotunda near the west entrance of the Dining Room “had a secret elevator door that opened on the Kenan floor.”70

Alyn Pope remembered that same decade as a teenager working at his father Neil Pope’s Garage at 58 Charlotte Street. The business served guests from the Hotel

---


Ponce de Leon, the Bennett Hotel and the Monson Hotel via bell captains. The three-story building accommodated about 50 cars including those belonging to owners of businesses in the Exchange Bank Building, “lawyers, dentists, and judges.” His father personally maintained Mr. Kenan’s 1940 black Cadillac limousine with gray felt interior, keeping the “car on blocks when not in use, driving the vehicle two to three times a month, and cranking the engine once a month.” Pope recalled, “Chappy” the chauffeur was “as old as Mr. Kenan.” Louise Lewis Foster, Mrs. Wise’s great-granddaughter remembered fondly coming to the Ponce in 1956 during spring vacation with two high school friends and “how beautiful the hotel was.” Her great-grandmother toured the girls in the limo to Weeki Wachee to see the “mermaid” water skiers.71

Though the Ponce remained open for the winter season occupancy was only about ten percent or fifty guests. Conference groups proved to be a boost to registrations. According to Lawrence Lewis, Jr., some years the Ponce opened on December 20 when William Kenan chose to spend Christmas at the property. Otherwise, the hotel opened in January.72

Tom Kenan reminisced, “The hotel was fully staffed and a small orchestra played during dinner. The food was delicious and a waiter [stood] behind every chair.” Roy Hunt, newly moved to Florida in 1962, verified that the hotel maintained its elegance and refinement. “The Hotel still had a sense of grandeur,” echoed historian Michael Gannon. He noted that dinner dances in the Dining Room and the band music at the

---


72Lawrence Lewis, Jr., interview with Robert Neeland, October 31, 1985, St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library.
[Gay 90s] bar located beneath the Dining Room were major attractions for guests and St. Augustine residents.  

Figure 7-16. Group Portrait at St. Augustine’s Easter Celebration – Saint Augustine, Florida,

The Easter 1959 “Royal Family” event recognizing Florida’s Spanish heritage was one of the many community events held at the Ponce (or the Alcazar). The Grand Parlor and Dining Room provided elegant settings for pageantry and spectacle, entertainment and dining. The “dome room” or 400 Rotunda, now recognized as the Solarium, hosted less dramatic activities, such as weekly bingo or card games.  

The Ponce played a last significant role with St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration which took place between 1963 and 1965. Preparations had begun a decade earlier that brought international dignitaries to the city, and they stayed in suites


at the grand hotel. As discussed earlier, this drew the last Presidential visit from Lyndon B. Johnson as Vice President in March 1963. Senator Hubert Humphrey who would be elected Johnson’s Vice President in coming months stayed at the Ponce as did Florida Senators Bruce Smathers and Spessard Holland.75

On October 28, 1964 President of the Florida East Coast Hotel Company A. R. MacMannis announced that the Ponce would open on November 20 that year. This change in schedule coincided with St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration. The hotel was in the process of completing major upgrades to facilities, including,

- an auditorium seating 200 and complete with audio-visual equipment,
- modernized kitchen, new telephone system, and a new room, El Toro Bravo, featuring cocktails and buffet luncheons...New innovations will include refinements in the hotel’s famous cuisine, a Sunday champagne brunch and a special Thanksgiving dinner to be served on Nov. 26.76

One of the contemporary entertainments to attract visitors to the city brought the new television series Route 66 to shoot two episodes, “Dove with a Broken Wing” and “This is Going to Hurt You More Than It Hurts Me.” Actors Martin Milner, Glenn Corbett, Soupy Sales, and Lee Meriwether were featured. Scenes includes community members including St. Augustine High School student Greg Baker and a young Len Weeks, both of whom went on to become mayors of the city. The Flagler System funded the production of the latter, with the Ponce figuring prominently in the shooting. One of the final scenes proved to be the trademark Soupy Sales routine, a cream pie fight, in this instance held in the Ponce Dining Room.77

75He Rubbed Back of Johnson, news clipping, n.d.
76Hotel Ponce de Leon Will Open Early for St. Augustine Event, Florida Times-Union, October 29, 1964.
The 400th anniversary programs proved to be the last major functions that the building enjoyed as a hotel. Will Kenan and his sisters Jessie and Sarah, family members that were Henry Flagler’s contemporaries and had sustained the hotel throughout the 20th century, passed away in the early 1960s. Lawrence Lewis, Jr., Wise’s grandson, assumed management of the Ponce. Discussion had been underway for some time during the Palm Beach winter season between the Kenan heirs and the Carlson family of Connecticut. The latter proposed to convert the Ponce to a four-year undergraduate women’s college. As this proposal took shape, plans proceeded to conclude the building’s tenure as a hotel.78

The Ponce’s 79th and final season opened on October 28, 1966, recognized with a feature story in The St. Augustine Record detailing the upcoming activities that were scheduled for the building. Highlighted events were an annual Catholic priests’ retreat that would use the entire hotel. Football fans in the area for the Florida-Georgia Gator Bowl would stay at the hotel, and the Woman’s Exchange’s would hold its annual charity ball there.79

On April 5, 1967, the Flagler System hosted a final dinner dance that drew crowds from St. Augustine and Jacksonville to witness the end of an era. As had been the case throughout the history of the building, the final gala was held with style and

78The Kenan heirs split the Flagler System. Lawrence Lewis, Jr. retained ownership of the Ponce. His cousins led by Frank H. Kenan held The Breakers Hotel in Palm Beach and continue to do so. Pamela Morris Versaggi, conversation with author, June 20, 2013.

attention to detail. The Bruce Thomas Orchestra played, and more than two hundred guests were invited. Elizabeth Morley Towers, Jacksonville community philanthropist with ties to St. Augustine’s historic preservation program since the 1930s, brought her family to enjoy the event. Her daughter Sarah Towers Van Cleve reminisced nearly forty-five years later with her children who had enjoyed the event on the remarkable history and architecture of the Hotel Ponce de Leon. Proceeds from the event exceeded $2,500 and were earmarked to fund a scholarship for a student from St. Johns County to attend the new women’s institution Flagler College.80

Substantial construction of the Ponce had been completed in May of 1887. The building completed its final season as a hotel eighty years later, operating continuously throughout that period with the exception of the three years between 1942 and 1945 when the building hosted the Coast Guard Reserve.

As with any luxury lodging establishment the building was updated throughout its history. The final configuration featured 240 “rental rooms” and numerous other rooms “used by the extensive staff, which serves the many patrons and conventioners [sic]” that came to the hotel. At the time of the closing, rates for the hotel ranged from a single room for one person at $10.00-15.00, and a double was $12.00-18.00. A tariff of $16.00-32.00 was charged for “Family Rooms” for two to four persons. A suite with a

---

sitting room and bedroom could be reserved for $16.00-26.00 for a single person and $26.00-30.00 for two people. All arrangements included a private bath.\(^8^1\)

**Imitation is ... Flattery: The Influence of the Hotel Ponce de Leon**

With the opening of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, Henry Flagler gained international acclaim as a resort developer. Over the next several decades entrepreneurs gained business successes capitalizing on Henry Flagler’s name and reputation. Though this next segment may seem to be a fanciful stretch in relation to the Ponce, the information illustrates the importance of the St. Augustine hotel and its reputation.

Many of the seasonal leisure tourists, the hotel management and staff members, and artists who painted at the resorts of the north in the summers, including the White Mountains, traveled each winter to the resorts of the south especially the Ponce in the late 19\(^{th}\) century. Flagler’s hotels did not operate in a vacuum, but were a component of a national movement encompassing travel, leisure, sports, and entertainment. In 1888 the Ponce set a high bar to which other resorts were measured for exceptional service and hospitality in an exuberant Gilded Age setting.

Those hotels and resorts that shared a relationship of staffing or guests with the Ponce are discussed briefly in this section. Also, those that gained their own fame, in part, from their association to Henry Flagler or to the Ponce—however tenuous those ties—are mentioned.

Flagler House

Figure 7-17. “Flagler House” John Conway, Sullivan County Historian

“In 1920, the Flagler introduced the distinctive stucco covered, parapet and Palladian window dominated architectural style now known as Sullivan County Mission.”

John Conway

In 1872 in the Catskill Mountains, native Carrie G. Flagler opened the Flagler House, a 35-room summer hotel in (South) Fallsburgh, three hours from New York City. The Flagler House thrived (on right in photo). Success increased after the New York Times covered activities at Henry Flagler’s St. Augustine hotels. The upstate New York Flagler hotel enjoyed the affiliation in owners’ names only. Adding to the fortunate coincidence were personal connections. Henry Flagler’s sister Caroline Flagler was nicknamed Carrie. Both Presbyterian families hailed from upstate New York.82

Flagler Hotel

Figure 7-18. The Flagler Hotel and Country Club, So. Fallsburg, N.Y.

In 1908 Asias Fleischer and Philip Morganstern bought Flagler House and expanded the building in size and scope to achieve a kosher hotel. By 1920 when domestic business including tourism had resumed after World War I the Flagler Hotel had attained a reputation as the most prestigious of Sullivan County's many prominent hotels. Fleischer and Morganstern added a “Sullivan County Mission” style building, emulating in concept the Spanish heritage that Henry Flagler honored in St. Augustine. In 1929 the Flagler Hotel became a ski resort with outbuildings incorporating the original hotel structures.  

In 1898, a decade after Henry Flagler opened the Ponce de Leon Hotel, the Phelps Dodge Mining Company began construction of a hotel at the town of Bisbee in the Arizona Territory. Under the presidency of New York railroad and steel executive William Earle Dodge, Jr., the company grew exponentially. Dodge and William Rockefeller partnered in western copper mining enterprises, and their families intermarried. Dodge and his family wintered at Flagler’s St. Augustine and Palm Beach resorts.⁸⁴

The *New York Times* reported that Dodge spent the winter of 1912 at the resorts. Late that season he returned north on his yacht *Ednada*, traveling from Palm Beach to St. Augustine and on to visit the Thomas Carnegie family at Cumberland Island. From there he returned to New York in his personal railroad car.⁸⁵

---


“The Copper Queen Hotel was one of the most modern hotels in the west during that time.” Completed in 1902 and named for the mine, the hotel featured a polychromatic appearance with poured concrete walls, red brick trim, hipped roofed corner towers, and overhanging balconies. Interiors featured Italian tile, oak woodwork and Tiffany-style glass. The building bore strong similarity in appearance and convenience to the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s guest room wings fronting on King Street.86

White Mountains Hotels

![Image of Mount Pleasant House]

Figure 7-20. Mount Pleasant House

Flagler spent late summers in the White Mountains of New Hampshire where many of his New York business colleagues vacationed, and the Ponce artists painted.

About 1895 Flagler had introduced native Pennsylvanian and fellow New York railroad

---

Nicholl Boyd, Bisbee, Arizona, Then and Now (Phoenix: Cowboy Miner Productions, 2003), 39, accessed November 10, 2012,
http://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=RLzEvN5k0WkC&oi=fnd&pg=PA6&dq=%22copper+queen+hotel%22&ots=qjYzwjKUe&sig=qlgYJz6JscSTPsf2Krd9dVDC3k#v=onepage&q=%22copper%20queen+hotel%22&f=false.
magnate Joseph Stickney to his hotel managers. John Anderson of Portland, Maine, and Joseph Price of Louisville, Kentucky, met in Florida. They built, owned, then sold and managed, Flagler’s Ormond Beach Hotel. Stickney hired Anderson and Price to manage his summer resort the Mount Pleasant House in Bretton Woods as is evidenced by the announcement shown above the text.87

Figure 7-21. The Mount Washington Hotel, Bretton Woods, New Hampshire

In 1896 New York architect Charles Alling Gifford designed the six-unit Sans Souci building at the Jekyl Island Club for an equal number of New York’s elite and Flagler’s colleagues, including Stickney and Standard Oil founding partner William Rockefeller. A few years later Flagler influenced Stickney to retain Gifford for the design of a new hotel near the Mount Pleasant House. The large, modern, and

technologically-advanced Mount Washington Hotel opened in 1902 and shared many similarities and conveniences with Flagler’s Hotel Ponce de Leon.  

Gifford had designed the New Jersey state building for the World’s Columbian Exposition in 1893 and, after the Mount Washington Hotel, went on to design the New Jersey building for the St. Louis World’s Fair in 1904. At the time of the Mount Washington project Dr. Andrew Anderson, Flagler’s friend and confidante in St. Augustine, retained Gifford to redesign his residence Markland between 1899 and 1901. During this same era Carrère and Hastings overlapped with Gifford in the locations of their commissions, to the resorts of the New England mountains, mansions of Long Island, and the Spanish city of St. Augustine. Numerous parallels between the northern resorts and Flagler’s Florida hotels acknowledge the discerning public’s demand for luxury and convenience—and Henry Flagler’s role at the forefront of the trend.

**Henry Flagler’s Impact on Florida**

With construction of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, Henry Flagler achieved artistic design, fireproof construction, and contemporary facilities. The Ponce met the needs of discerning wealthy guests, many of whom were Flagler’s business colleagues and friends. Under Flagler’s influence over the next quarter century St. Augustine hosted politicians, socialites, industrialists, musicians and athletes. The city retained its longstanding attractiveness to authors and artists. The Ponce sustained a position as

---


the center of the region’s social life, and St. Augustine continued to enjoy a reputation as a Spanish colonial city with European ambiance and characteristics.

Flagler bought the Hotel Cordova (Casa Monica), 95 Cordova Street, in April of 1888, after its first season, and built or funded churches—Grace Methodist Episcopal, 8 Carrera Street; Cathedral Basilica, 35 Treasury Street; and Ancient City Baptist, 27 Sevilla Street. He built the Alicia Hospital on Marine Street (demolished); City Hall, 98 St. George Street (demolished); a jail, 167 San Marco Avenue, now a museum; St. Augustine Record newspaper building on Cordova and Bridge Streets, now apartments; YMCA near Riberia and Valencia Streets; and founded the Florida East Coast Railway, headquartered on Malaga Street. Infrastructure improvements modernized the economically-depressed post-Civil War St. Augustine in time for the beginning of the twentieth century.

The Hotel Ponce de Leon, a creative and exuberant reflection of the optimism and economic vitality of the Gilded Age, launched a new and lengthy chapter in Flagler’s life. At the time he completed the Ponce, just 25 miles to the north Jacksonville became Florida’s largest city, a status retained until after World War II. During that same era Jacksonville functioned as the social, economic and political capital of Florida. Flagler continued to develop hotels, moving north and south along the east coast. Ultimately, his resort empire stretched from Jacksonville to Key West and across the water to Havana, Cuba and Nassau, Bahamas.

Flagler developed the Florida East Coast Railway as a means to link his resort hotels. Through the State’s legal land development program, essentially a pass through of federal land, Flagler received 250,000 acres of land in North Florida, significantly
more than other railroad developers. As Flagler moved down the east coast with his hotel empire, he received more than double the legally-mandated number of acres for development of his rail lines. As political pressure tightened the land development process, Flagler maneuvered surreptitiously around the legal requirements, acquiring millions of acres of land in the sunshine state.90

The Florida East Coast Railway's construction had reached present-day Miami by 1896 just over a decade after Henry Flagler bought his first parcel of land in St. Augustine. Flagler constructed eight hotels and acquired several more as his empire moved southward along Florida’s east coast.

Resort and Transport Business Partners Henry Flagler and Henry Plant

Also significant to Florida’s development was the Plant Steamship Line that began in 1886 and operated with the following ships: *Olivette* and *Mascotte*. The preeminent William Cramp & Sons’ Ship and Engine Building Company of Philadelphia built both ships. The *Mascotte* was a 215-foot steamer that Plant launched on October 27, 1885, with some of his PICO partners, five weeks before Henry Flagler broke ground on the Hotel Ponce de Leon. The *Olivette*, nearly 275 feet long, was ready in

---

April 1887. The ships traveled from Port Tampa to Key West and Havana, Cuba, and Nassau, Bahamas.91

In December 1894 the firm of Raymond & Whitcomb, with offices in New York, Boston, and Philadelphia, promoted “Raymond’s Vacation Excursions.” These all-expense-paid tours to Florida cities during the month of January featured “elegant vestibuled Pullman sleeping and dining cars” that ran along Plant’s PICO rail lines or Flagler’s Florida East Coast Railway. Guests visited St. Augustine, with an extended stay at Flagler’s Ponce. They traveled west to the Oclawaha and St. Johns Rivers and south to Palatka, Ormond, Rockledge, and Lake Worth—to a lengthy stay at Flagler’s Hotel Royal Poinciana. The westward leg passed through Winter Park and Plant’s Seminole Hotel to Tampa where visitors stayed in Plant’s Tampa Bay Hotel.92

---


92 Lyman Abbott, Hamilton Wright Mabie and Ernest Hamblin Abbott, The Outlook: A Family Paper 50 no. 2 (December 1, 1894): 946, accessed March 2, 2011, http://books.google.com/books?id=vo0sAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA946&dq=plant+steamship+line&source=bl&ots=c0QALDoNQF&sig=YAKkFK6g5CdH51PdAMJeIxa1g&hl=en&ei=VpuTai-KdSTgtfDydyADw&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=2&ved=0CBkQ6AEwATgK#v=onepage&q=plant%20steamship%20line&f=false.
These excursion vacations could be extended, enabling visitors to stay in Florida for five months, with the final train leaving on May 31. Also, visitors could travel to Cuba on the Plant Steamship Line’s *Olivette* or *Mascotte*, enjoying a week in Havana.\textsuperscript{93}

Plant retained his connections to the Northeast United States as well. With $1,000,000 in capital, he organized the Atlantic, Canada, and Plant Steamship Line, Limited, that operated in the summers between Boston, Massachusetts, and Halifax, Nova Scotia. In 1893 Plant acquired the Canadian company, North Atlantic Steamship Line that had operated for half a century in that northern country. This added routes through Cape Breton and Prince Edward Island.\textsuperscript{94}

In 1893, Mr. and Mrs. Plant hosted Henry and Ida Alice “Alicia” Flagler for a cruise from Tampa on Plant’s chartered *Halifax* steamship leaving on February 16 for Nassau and Jamaica, returning ten days later. This trip was reciprocation of a recent excursion the couples’ shared to Flagler’s properties, the Indian River and Plaza Hotels at Rockledge, Brevard County, Florida. The Flaglers and the Plants lived near each other in New York, the Flaglers’ mansion was located at 685 5\textsuperscript{th} Avenue at E. 54\textsuperscript{th} Street. The Plants lived at 586 5\textsuperscript{th} Avenue between W. 47\textsuperscript{th} and W. 48\textsuperscript{th} Streets.\textsuperscript{95}

\textsuperscript{93}Abbott, 946.


Plant’s steamships became significant links in the Spanish-American War. His *Olivette* returned survivors of the *Maine* to Tampa, and the *Mascotte* returned 700 evacuees to the port city. The steamships provided transportation for Teddy Roosevelt’s “Rough Riders” to Havana and returned soldiers to the United States. The Tampa Bay Hotel served as a holding area for troops, headquarters for war correspondents including Stephen Crane (late of Jacksonville). Clara Barton came on behalf of the American Red Cross, too. Additional Plant ships that participated included the “Rio Grande, Alleghany, Seguranca, Vigilancia, Miami, and Yucatan.”96

At the settlement of Plant’s will in 1900, Flagler acquired the Plant System’s steamship lines. In 1899 he had constructed the Colonial Hotel on Bay Street overlooking Nassau harbor in the Bahamas. Acquisition of the steamship lines worked in tandem with Flagler’s efforts to extend his resort empire to the Caribbean and to complete a railroad to Key West en route to the Panama Canal. The merged line had a lengthy and distinguished career of service, long outliving its progenitors.97

**Key West Extension – International Transportation Links for Flagler’s Resorts**

Theodore Roosevelt, elected U.S. President in 1901, committed the United States to completing construction of the Panama Canal begun by the French twenty years earlier. Work began in 1904, the year after a revolution resulted in Panama becoming a United States protectorate. The Canal was finished in 1914.

Also in 1904, at the age of 74, Flagler announced that he would continue his railroad to Key West. He recognized the importance of extending his business interests

---

96 Ibid., 29-34

beyond the borders of the continental United States and that this Overseas Extension, the Railroad Across the Sea would accomplish that goal. Key West could provide water access closer to Panama than any other U.S. port city.

The two massive construction projects shared parallel time frames and drew comparable public attention, with “Flagler’s Folly” considered the more daunting endeavor. The railroad terminated at Key West in January 22, 1912, twenty days after Flagler’s 82nd birthday. On the train with Henry and Mary Lily Flagler were “Assistant Secretary of War Robert Shaw Oliver and diplomats from Italy, Mexico, Portugal, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Guatemala, San Salvador and Uruguay.” Termed “The Eighth Wonder of the World” Flagler completed his final tribute to Florida’s Spanish heritage. 98

Flagler’s tenacity transformed St. Augustine and the city’s skyline forever. On Thursday, May 22, 1913 he returned to St. Augustine and the Hotel Ponce de Leon one last time, when he lied in state in the Rotunda. Once again, the Ponce drew national attention. In his honor, on the following day at 3:00 p.m., “every train on the Florida East Coast Railway will stand still for ten minutes. Other roads in the State will halt traffic for five minutes.” Flagler became recognized as the undisputed “Father of Modern Florida” for this thirty-year investment in the development of the state.99

---

CHAPTER 8
PRESERVING A PALACE IN PARADISE

The Hotel Ponce de Leon met Henry Flagler’s expectations and those of his guests. According to architectural historians Laurie Ossman and Heather Ewing "Carrère and Hastings … introduced modern concrete technology to America—by building the West’s largest monolithic dome since the Pantheon—and created the largest fully electrified building complex to date.” In a 1909 interview, with construction of his overseas railway through the Florida Keys well underway, Flagler maintained that building the Hotel Ponce de Leon had been his greatest challenge. Beginning with completion of the Ponce in 1887, and then with his hotels in Ormond Beach, Jacksonville, Palm Beach, Miami, Nassau and Havana, and the Florida East Coast Railway, Flagler influenced development in Florida to a level that today many experts consider to be unequalled. His initial project, the Ponce, remains one of the nation’s most remarkable buildings.1

The Ponce anchored St. Augustine’s downtown and revived a depressed tourism economy in a city that had relied on that economic force for much of the 19th century. In addition to the success of the Ponce, St. Augustine benefitted from development of nearby neighborhoods known today as the Model Land Company, Lincolnville, the Abbott Tract, and North City. His investments inspired development beyond the city limits and at the beaches. He established recreation and athletic competitions as leisure activities. With Flagler’s extensive transportation network of railroads and steamships and his participation in construction of the Atlantic Intra-Coastal Waterway

---

1Anne Carling, Flagler College Seen As Great Cultural, Economic Asset Here, St. Augustine Record, January 19, 1967. Edwin Lefevre, Flagler and Florida, Everybody’s (February, 1910),182. Ossman and Ewing,10.
system, Florida became a preeminent national and international vacation destination, with St. Augustine serving as the gateway.

Figure 8-1. Aerial Photo of Ponce de Leon Hall, Flagler College

I think what it does is add to the type of historical and cultural center we are trying to create. The economic benefits would be immeasurable at this time.

John D. Bailey, Mayor of St. Augustine, 1967

The Ponce continued as a luxury hotel for forty years until the Stock Market crash in 1929 and the resulting Great Depression halted tourism nationally. The 1930s brought an interest in heritage tourism in St. Augustine (as noted in Chapter 4) followed by the country’s participation in World War II a decade later. The 1950s resulted in continued decline for the grand hotel as travelers preferred auto-related lodging. In the 1960s the building’s final chapter as a hotel took place as part of St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration, with the hotel closing its doors on April 5, 1967. In September
1968 the Hotel Ponce de Leon assumed a much different role as centerpiece for the new Flagler College, named to honor the hotel’s founder.²

From 1968 to 1971 the undergraduate institution struggled financially, of necessity requiring an emphasis on educational facilities rather than restoration of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon. Initially, the building was sold to the college's developers for a publicly-announced price of $1,500,000 with The Flagler System holding the note. In 1971 Lawrence Lewis, Jr., chairman of The Flagler System, returned to direct involvement with the Ponce. He restructured the new college as a co-educational institution and put both the building and the institution on sound financial footings by retiring the existing mortgage. Activities during the first three years of the college did not include preservation of the Ponce; thus, those years are not addressed in this research effort.³

This new role for the Ponce generated controversy. Caroline Castillo noted in her master's thesis presented in 1987, twenty years into the College’s operation, the controversy over establishment of a college in St. Augustine,

When the Ponce de Leon Hotel was converted to a college, there was considerable opposition from the community. There was fear that the students, like those at other universities during the 1970’s, would cause riots and disturbances in the small town. Some of the business men resented having the students using tourist facilities. Others felt that the college would damage the residential area. That some of these fears were never realized did little to assuage the antipathetic attitude of some within

²Flagler College, Aerial Photo of Ponce de Leon Hall. Doors…Closed, Florida Times-Union, April 6, 1967.

the community. It was the beginning of a continuing series of attacks on the college.⁴

As with most “town and gown” controversies, resolution was temporary at best. Most business owners came to enjoy and depend upon the students both as employees and customers. On the other hand, residents remained adamant about limiting students’ presence on the public rights-of-way. Truces and stalemates characterized the relationship from the early days and continue to play a role currently.

**Ponce de Leon Hall**

As with most luxury lodging establishments, the Hotel Ponce de Leon had received regular updates throughout the building’s history. Modifications included changes to room configurations, modernization of bathrooms, and incorporation of new furnishings. In contrast, the exterior of the building, original materials, floor plans, layout, and architectural details remained virtually unchanged over the hotel’s eighty years. The exception to this situation was replacement of some windows to comply with contemporary standards and without regard to architectural appropriateness, such as metal casements fabricated in Jacksonville. The primary rooms, the Rotunda, Dining Room, and Grand Parlor remained as built. Even changes made during occupancy by the Coast Guard during World War II, other than reconfiguration of the fourth floor, were removed when the building returned to hotel use in the 1950s.⁵

---


At Flagler College’s founding the Hotel Ponce de Leon was renamed Ponce de Leon Hall, although continuing to be referred to as “the Ponce.” Though basic components of the building had been maintained, major rehabilitation had been deferred for years. To accomplish transition of the hotel to a higher education institution, some spaces had to be used in ways that were complicated by their original architectural design and decoration. Within a few years of the College’s founding, historic preservation became a component of the institution’s campus planning process. Once again, timing was important. The College’s founding in 1968 paralleled the nation’s institutionalization of historic preservation through the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

Figure 8-2. Coast Guard building on West Lawn - Art Department

College needs required creative treatment of spaces including converting hotel rooms for student living use. The Rotunda remained as the lobby and was the center of student activity. The former gift shop on the west side was used as an office initially for the dean’s secretary Helen Jane Matthews. The 400 Rotunda under the dome became
the Louise Wise Francis Library, named in honor of Lewis’s and Wiley’s mother. The Dining Room became the Dining Hall. The curved west *venido* was enlisted as a classroom. A small private dining room located between the marble staircase and the Dining Room was a student lounge with a television. A former Coast Guard building, present-day Kenan Plaza/Lewis Gazebo, served the Art Department including sculptor Enzo Torcoletti’s office in the early years. The facilities’ building was used minimally due to its severely-deteriorated condition. The Artists’ Studios building became classrooms and offices for faculty members and secretaries. The first floor coal storerooms supported maintenance functions, and a biology lab was created on the east side of the first floor.6

![Figure 8-3. Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor, Flagler College](image)

6Flagler College, Campus Planning Files, Coast Guard building on West Lawn - Art Department. The secretary to the academic dean Helen Jane Matthews experienced her glasses fogging due to the humidity in her office. She benefitted from a new window air conditioner justified to make certain her typing equipment functioned appropriately. Robert Carberry, interview by author, February 8, 2013. Leon Shimer, St. Augustine to See Pace at Hotel Change, *Florida Times-Union*, September 17, 1967. Don Martin, interview by author, February 22, 2013.
In the summer of 1971 the most creative and dramatic adaptation to date relocated the Louise Wise Lewis Library to the Grand Parlor. William T. Abare, Jr., then Director of Admissions, and Robert Carberry, Dean of Students, recalled the assembly line-style relocation of books from the top of the Ponce, hand to hand from one faculty or staff member to another, down the staircases, through the Mezzanine and Rotunda, and through the west wing into the Grand Parlor.\(^7\)

Flanking the Grand Parlor’s eleven crystal chandeliers fluorescent tube lights were mounted to a structural framework created from wood studs. The framework was suspended below the 23-karat-gold trimmed egg-and-dart cornice moldings that framed the Tojetti ceiling murals in the four quadrants and the elaborate plasterwork of the center salon. The marble-encased Edison electric clock set in the carved onyx mantelpiece stood as a sentinel chaperoning the students’ studying at round tables surrounded by significant works from Henry Flagler’s art collection that had graced the walls of the room since 1888.\(^8\)

The physical condition of the 400 Rotunda changed due to life safety codes that precluded the room’s continued use as the library. In the 1970s and 1980s the fourth floor was used for cheerleading practice, to show movies, and as headquarters for the college newspaper, \textit{The Gargoyle}. Later, as the college added facilities to accommodate those needs, the fourth floor was used for storage. Also, the electronic equipment for “WFCF 88.5 Flagler College radio” was located on the fourth floor.

\(^{7}\text{Flagler College Archives, Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor, Flagler College. Abare interview. Carberry interview. Flagler College, Desiderata, yearbook, 1972,104.}\)

\(^{8}\text{Flagler College Archives, untitled photo.}\)
Rehabilitation of Ponce de Leon Hall

“Although regular maintenance had prevented the building from falling into total disrepair, decorative paint, gilding, plaster and other ornamental detailing badly needed conservation and restoration.”

Thomas J. Colin, Editor

*Historic Preservation* magazine, 1987

With the College operating on a more solid financial footing, attention turned to building needs. Between 1971 and 1975 the emphasis focused on renovation of facilities for uses related to the operation of the college. Carberry remembered A. D. Davis, owner of the A. D. Davis Construction Company, coming to his office on the northeast corner of the first floor in December 1971. Davis notified Carberry that construction taking place in the former hotel rooms above Carberry’s office revealed a lack of structural supports between the floors. Carberry was relocated to the other end of the long room. Originally, this room had been a reading room for hotel guests.9

Flagler College alumni and trustees Viki West Freeman of Atlanta (1970-1974), Mitch Walk of Orlando (1974-1979), Richard Groux of Virginia (1975-1979), and Nancy Rutland of Tampa (1976-1980) recalled living in the Ponce’s former hotel rooms and using the hotel furniture. Initially the students lived on the lower two floors. Women lived on the west side; men on the east, until increased admission of students warranted the use of additional rooms. Flowered wallpaper remained on the walls, and color-coordinated drapes hung at the windows. Radiators provided heat. Artificial air conditioning was non-existent. Windows were operable. The rooms were unchanged and included shared baths. Weekly maid service was available through Frankie, the maid in charge. The four trustees were students during the first phase of the Ponce’s

9Carberry interview.
rehabilitation. Rutland noted that the college “maintained a good balance between great academics and a commitment to restoring the buildings.” Additional renovations in the 1980s resulted in new housing for 200 men and 295 women students.  

In 1975 the Hotel Ponce de Leon was listed in the National Register of Historic Places, adding another layer of recognition to the building and enabling the property to qualify for grant funds from both public and private sources. In 1978, following the nation’s 200th birthday celebration, the U.S. Department of the Interior through the State of Florida provided a grant of $68,930 to repair the building’s towers. The following year additional funding was secured from the Arthur Vining Davis Foundations and Flagler College to complete the $151,897 project. This initiative served as the College’s formal entrée into historic preservation.

A. D. Davis Construction Company was selected as the contractor. The clay tile roofs and terra cotta details were particularly challenging. Art faculty members Robert Hall and Enzo Torcoletti reproduced individual clay tiles since matching tiles were no longer available. They reproduced the terra cotta banisters on the towers with cast concrete pieces dyed to the red clay color. This treatment was used on 2009 when additional terra cotta details on the towers failed to retain their structural integrity and had to be recast.

---


11Thorn, Craig Papers, Estate of Craig and Audrey Thorn.

Flagler College’s efforts to preserve a historic hotel as the centerpiece of a higher education institution attracted national attention. Author Barbaralee Diamonstein in her book on adaptive use commented, “Somehow it seemed fitting that the hotel named for the explorer who scoured the Southeast in quest of the fabled fountain of youth should be transformed into a liberal arts college attracting students from 30 states.”

From 1976 to 1985, and with funding of $3,900,400 provided by the Flagler Foundation, 245 hotel rooms were converted to student dormitory rooms complying with modern building, fire and life safety requirements. Fireplace mantles were retained. The flues were sealed. Bathrooms were updated as had been typical throughout the building’s tenure as a hotel.

In the year 2000 climate control was added to the residence hall portion of the Ponce. With the solid masonry walls introduction of a unified heat and air conditioning system was especially challenging. Ductwork was installed just below ceilings along the hallways outside the dorm rooms. This partially obscured the glass-filled transoms over the doors to those rooms, but was less intrusive than damage to original concrete walls that would have resulted otherwise. Attic spaces were used as well for the upper floors. Chases were run at ends of corridors where fire staircases provided open cavities. Multiple condenser units were placed at ground level and screened with shrubbery.

Other areas that were required to be closed for the system to operate properly were done so with framing and glass or Plexiglas, enabling the original openings to

---


14 Restoration Campaign booklet.
remain visible. Some of these compromises provided compliance with life safety codes as well as adding temperature and humidity controls to the building.

The system in the Rotunda operates much like that in the Dining Hall. The plaster ornamentation, decorative woodwork and murals on the ceilings of the first and mezzanine floors remain in their original conditions. Climate control is greatest at the lower level where people circulate.

Kenan Hall

Flagler College administrator Robert Carberry, who joined the College in August of 1970 and retired in 1997, characterized the Ponce as a haven for "rats, bats, roaches and termites" with the facilities building in the worst condition. Most of the structure was vacant and stabilized so that in future years it could be renovated. The kitchen for the hotel remained as the kitchen for the college and was located on the second floor. Maintenance functions were housed in the basement. The college’s art department operated out of three rooms there. In the basement under the kitchen was art faculty member Don Martin’s office. A large well-lit room with a high ceiling and tall windows in the northwest corner of the building served as a studio. Art chair Robert Hall’s office was across the corridor from that studio.¹⁵

¹⁵Carberry interview.
According to College trustee David Drysdale, Lawrence Lewis, Jr., who had an architecture degree from the University of Virginia, planned the renovation of Kenan Hall. St. Augustine architect Craig Thorn prepared the construction drawings. The building was gutted, including removal of a large central skylight and all interior walls. The work created five entirely new stories including the attic from a building that was constructed in four stories with tall ceilings. The renovated building, 61,272 square feet, “provided 39 offices, 15 classrooms, and 6 seminar rooms for faculty use.” The structure continued to house the kitchen and provided space for the Louise Wise Lewis Library, classrooms, faculty offices, science labs and computer labs. The College’s growth required these uses, and accreditation requirements mandated standards to be met with facilities and services.16

Upon completion of work in 1982 the building was rededicated as Kenan Hall to honor William Rand Kenan, Jr., a renowned chemist, businessman, farmer, philanthropist, and industrialist. Kenan was Henry Flagler’s brother-in-law, personal representative, and had overseen management of the Ponce for sixty years.

In 1913, he was named president of several Flagler utilities: Miami Electric Light and Power Company [now FP&L], Miami Water Company, and West Palm Beach Water Company; and in 1923 and 1924, he assumed the presidency of the Model Land Company, Perrine Grant Land Company, Chuluota Land Company, St. Augustine Golf Development Association, Florida East Coast Railway Company, and Florida East Coast Hotel Company.

The $5,000,000 renovation was funded with assistance of $3,500,000 from the William R. Kenan, Jr. Charitable Trust of North Carolina and $1,200,000 from the Flagler Foundation of Virginia. The Edyth Bush Foundation of Winter Park, Florida, provided funds for the College’s “major computer system.”

The renovated building reflected institutional buildings that emphasized function over aesthetics. No doubt, the structure met educational requirements of the times which were critical to a new educational institution. However, the interior design of the building received criticism since all of the unique qualities of the historic building were removed,

Its blank, modern interior could come out of almost any university anywhere in the country…Kenan Hall lacks character. The historic atmosphere evident throughout the rest of the campus disappears as one steps into the functional, low-ceiling, fluorescent lit, yellow halls.” Arguably, this construction may have served as a watershed for the College in regard to facilities’ design and construction. Future renovations and new construction initiated a few years later emphasized the historic character of the campus,

---

17 Restoration Campaign booklet. Kenan Hall booklet.
particularly the Ponce, and incorporated design and materials that emphasized the College’s unique architecture.\textsuperscript{18}

In 1996, in honor of Dr. William L. Proctor’s twenty-fifth anniversary as President, a newly-constructed building west of the Ponce was dedicated as the Proctor Library. That enabled space in Kenan Hall that had been the library to be renovated and reprogrammed. The College invested $1,035,957 creating additional academic facilities in Kenan Hall.\textsuperscript{19}

**Grand Parlor**

As the Ponce approached its centennial anniversary the Flagler Foundation provided a grant of $400,000 for restoration of the Grand Parlor. This was possible as the library had been relocated to the newly-renovated Kenan Hall. Modifications such as the fluorescent tube lighting and institutional furnishings were removed as well. The Biltmore, Campbell, Smith Restorations, Inc. (BCSR) firm of Asheville, North Carolina, orchestrated the work including restoration of Virgilio Tojetti’s murals painted on canvas and located in the room’s four quadrants. The canvas panels had delaminated and, in some areas, dropped to the floor. Those sections had been rolled and stored for more than a decade. Research was undertaken into the mural patterns, paint composition, and methods of installation. Sections of the murals were repainted and reinstalled with epoxy resin. This project overlapped the time frame for the first phase of the Dining Hall restoration, with the same techniques employed in the conservation.\textsuperscript{20}

\textsuperscript{18}Castillo, 192.

\textsuperscript{19}Flagler College, Office of Business Services Records.

\textsuperscript{20}Flagler College Archives, Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor, SE, Flagler College. Flagler College, Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records. Biltmore, Campbell, Smith Restorations,
Figure 8-5. Louise Wise Lewis Library in Grand Parlor

About forty pieces of more than eighty from Henry Flagler’s art collection that hung in the Ponce remained with the building. Many of the works were conserved. Decorative arts objects were restored as well. This work was accomplished by Maurine and Joseph L. Boles, Sr. Original hotel furnishings were restored by conservator Edward E. Hugo, Sr., of Albert Hugo Associates in Jacksonville. Custom-made reproduction carpet and drapes added to the ambience. The room was renamed the Flagler Room and used as a living memorial honoring Henry Morrison Flagler.

In the spring and summer of 2011, Flagler College received a first place ranked State small matching grant of $50,000 for conservation of the Grand Parlor in the Ponce with technical expertise provided through a $10,000 Cynthia Woods Mitchell grant from the National Trust for Historic Preservation. For this work the College retained the Atlanta firm of International Fine Arts Conservation Studio (IFACS) headed by English Inc. The Conservator, newsletter 1:2, n.d. [ca. 1987]. Restoration Campaign booklet. Flagler tapped twice for outstanding historic preservation, St. Augustine Record, September 25, 1988, 1A-2A.
expert Geoffrey Steward. He and the firm had been headquartered in London when enlisted by BCSR to work on the Ponce in 1985. The firm’s project list includes other Florida projects including Vizcaya in Miami and Ca’ d’Zan in Sarasota.

Twenty-five years after the original effort, the damage was minimal in comparison to the conditions found in the 1980s. The four Tojetti murals were delaminating from the ceiling. The synthetic laminating material had dried out in some areas. Advances in conservation materials and techniques enabled the restoration to be accomplished by using hypodermic needles to inject new laminating material along the resulting cracks and crevices. Then, those small areas were repainted. Woodwork was detailed including new gold leaf applied to the egg-and-dart moldings. A wash applied over the painted wood surfaces was reapplied, also.

Based upon the consultants’ investigations, the delamination appeared to be a result of fluctuations in temperature and humidity within the room which is used heavily by the campus and community for meetings and events. Personnel in charge of the fine and decorative arts collection in the room (the author of this work) collaborated with the campus planner and maintenance director to devise a strategy that would preclude this situation recurring in the future through a computerized management system.

A dramatic change to the room took place in September of 2012 with the restoration of the eleven crystal chandeliers that hang in the Flagler Room. The chandeliers had been altered in the early 20th century to a more “colonial” appearance with electric candles installed in the sockets. Over the decades glass pieces and prisms had been damaged or removed, and the glass had been cleaned with abrasive materials. Tim Lillard who operates through King’s Chandeliers of Charleston had
restored the chandeliers in the former Hotel Alcazar a few years ago. He was retained to accomplish similar work on the Ponce. Using historic photographs and his onsite investigations, he was able to rewire each light, repair or replace all of the crystal pieces, and install new glass globes. Though the College was prepared to have the globes fabricated to match the originals, no firms were found worldwide that could accomplish the task. New globes match the originals as closely as possible.\footnote{This included glassmaking in Ireland (Waterford), Czechoslovakia, and China. The worldwide recession precluded custom production.}

**Executive Wing**

Across the Rotunda from the former Grand Parlor, the hotel “Office Floor” included a series of rooms that became the President’s Wing for senior College administrators. A Telegraph office, Ticket Office, Barber and Manicure rooms, and a Reading Room were on the north side of a long corridor. The south side featured a Writing Room “Stores” (storage), and large Smoking Room (45’4”x 19’0”). The rooms retained original tile flooring, mantles, decorative woodwork, and tall ceilings.\footnote{Restoration Campaign booklet. Carrère & Hastings Digital Collection, Office Floor, Hotel Ponce de Leon, accessed April 6, 2013, http://ufdc.ufl.edu/UF00089836/00141/1x?vo=31&vp=3830,0.}

Glass doors were installed at the beginning of the corridor. Most rooms became executive offices, with the Reading Room converted to a Board Room. The most interesting room, the Barber room, featured elaborate tile patterns on the walls, built in counters and mirrors, cherub carvings and a decorative mantle. Though the barber chairs and sink had been removed, the details depicted the original use. The room illustrated the masculine theme prevalent in other hotel spaces through the use of stained, rather than woodwork painted white. In contrast the former Manicure room
retained more delicate details and white woodwork. The Reading Room conversion included wood paneling, adding to the ambience. Lewis provided an $80,000 gift for the Board Room, and the College expended $42,750 for office renovations.23

In 2001, when William T. Abare, Jr. succeeded Dr. William L. Proctor as president of Flagler College, another renovation of this wing took place. The scope of work included removal of the glass doors at the entry to the wing and installation of a pair of wooden doors with lions’ head doorknobs. The new doors were set further to the west, enlarging the office area. The doorknobs provided differentiation from the original scallop shell design in use throughout the main floor. Some additional renovations provided more privacy and convenience for the senior administration. Along the broad hallway, which functions as a reception area for visitors, furnishings incorporated original hotel pieces.

In 2005 the College received a grant from the Grand Marnier Foundation for conservation of the College’s art collection. M. Knoedler and Company had acquired for Henry Flagler many of the more than eighty pieces that were exhibited in the Hotel Ponce de Leon. After conservation, the works were exhibited in the President’s Wing and in the Flagler Room.

**Ponce Hall Facilities**

The College continued to grow and to meet education requirements, resulting in further changes to the Ponce. The ground floor of the Dining Hall building had changed during the era of the hotel and the Coast Guard, with some updates made in the 1950s for guests.

---

23*Restoration Campaign booklet.*
In 1955 St. Augustine contractor E. B. Meade and Son Construction Co. renovated the Billiards Room and “Gay Nineties” Bar, including installing new heating and air conditioning. This popular gathering place for hotel guests continued, this time for students, with the area’s conversion to a student lounge and snack bar. With a gift of $263,350 from Molly Wiley, another renovation took place in the 1980s. The College renamed the snack bar “Molly’s Place” in her honor. Another renovation in 2007, after completion of the Ringhaver Student Center, converted the space to the Learning Resource Center to emphasize student academics.²⁴

The Swimming Pool, located immediately to the west of the former hotel and a modern feature when built in 1954, needed an update thirty years later. That facility and the building’s landscaping were addressed with an investment of $238,650 in the 1980s. In the past decade the College retained the landscape architecture firm of Hauber-Fowler & Associates of Longwood, Florida. Heightened efforts to integrate the campus buildings with their settings and incorporate more outdoor gathering spaces resulted.²⁵

From 1971-1986, the College had raised $19,500,000—nearly all from private entities including major Florida and national foundations—for the historic and new campus facilities. Of that total, restoration activities absorbed $10,500,000. The remaining $9,000,000 was expended on property acquisition and new construction projects including the gymnasium, tennis center, fieldhouse, athletic fields, the theatre in


Government House, and Markland. The Flagler Foundation and the William R. Kenan,
Jr. Charitable Trust had provided much of this initial funding.26

Flagler College Restoration Campaign

“The Dining Hall is one of the greatest rooms in the United States.”

Author and architect George E. Kidder Smith

In 1986 as a prelude to the Hotel Ponce de Leon’s Centennial celebration, Flagler College embarked on the institution’s first capital campaign. This new effort focused on restoration of the Dining Hall and continued to embrace the Rotunda. “The Flagler College Restoration Campaign” featured a National Advisory Committee of experts who would oversee the restoration, including George E. Kidder Smith. The composition of the Committee provided the expertise needed to ensure authenticity and accuracy. The National Advisory Committee members included some of the southeastern United States’ foremost historical museum personnel and preservation architects at the time. (See Appendix A for a complete listing.)

The campaign included publication of a high-quality, full-color booklet portraying the College’s history and development. A summary of preservation activities that had been accomplished set the tone for the upcoming Dining Hall project. Goals for the campaign were included. Contributions were received from a variety of regional corporations: Barnett [Bank] Charities-$25,000, First Union Bank-$35,000, Florida East Coast Railway-$15,000, Florida Rock Industries, Inc.-$5,000, Merrill-Lynch-10,000, Nations Bank-$25,000, Northrop Grummon-$12,500, Southeast Bank-$5,000, Southern Bell-$10,000, SunTrust-Mid Atlantic-$100,000, Tree of Life-$5,000, WD (Winn-Dixie)

26Restoration Campaign booklet.
Charities-$5,000, and Whetstone Chocolates-$5,000. Ultimately, the College secured more than $1,000,000.27

**Dining Hall**

"the most opulent student cafeteria in America"

Garrison Keillor, St. Augustine, November 13, 2010

The oval-shaped, three-and-a-half story room featured a barrel-vaulted ceiling supported by colossal fluted columns. Each of the side walls included a clerestory with five lunettes, each sporting a cauldron-patterned stained glass window. Carved oak and mahogany entries and balconies pierced the end walls. The preeminent New York interior design firm of Pottier & Stymus fabricated the building’s woodwork which was supervised by master woodcarver Bernhardt Maybeck. Oak floors were laid in a simple pattern. The balconies at either end of the Dining Hall served as galleries for musicians. The single story curved *venido* rooms flanking the vaulted main hall contained five arches each into which were set three double-hung stained glass windows. Each window trio measured 10’6” in height with the center window measuring 6’ in width and those flanking it measured 5’ in width each.28

In addition to the forty windows in the Dining Hall, the triple set of stained glass windows flanking either side of the stair landing at the approach to the room, the single arched window in the porte-cochere below the Dining Hall, the sets of 9’6” tall windows in the rooms above the porte-cocheres at either end of the Dining Hall, and the circular

---


windows flanking the building’s courtyard entrance—the total collection numbers 79 windows. Though important at the time, currently, the collection is reputed to be the largest private collection of Louis Comfort Tiffany glass in its original location in the world.²⁹

George Willoughby Maynard, one of the nation’s foremost muralists, created the elaborate ornamentation with assistance from fellow New York art colleague Herman Schladermundt. His emphasis in this room, as in the Rotunda, was on full-length allegorical figures. In this instance, they represented the four seasons. Spanish provincial crests and coats of arms were intermingled with colorful proverbs. Murals depicted ships similar to those of the Spanish, French, and English explorers that came to the New World. Horizontal bands with celebrating cherubs flanked the end wall entries (possibly by another, though unnamed artist). Maynard gained fame for his work on Trinity Church, Boston, before receiving his commission for the Ponce. His later works included the Metropolitan Opera House.³⁰

The National Advisory Committee included BCSR, chosen previously to perform restoration of the Grand Parlor (Flagler Room). The firm was most well known in the United States for work on the Biltmore house, the palatial residence of George Washington Vanderbilt II located near Asheville, North Carolina, America’s largest private residence. In addition, the firm’s credits include preservation of the Pennsylvania State Capitol and the Smithsonian Institution. The architectural firm

²⁹Laurence Ruggiero, Executive Director, Morse Museum of American Art, conversation with the author, November 5, 2009. McDonald, interview.

³⁰Small, 60-63.
began in England in the 19th century, and the project list there included three internationally-renowned London landmarks: Buckingham Palace, Westminster Abbey and St. Paul’s Cathedral. William Amherst Vanderbilt Cecil retained ownership of his American mother’s ancestral Biltmore home and honored his English father as president of the international restoration firm. BCSR worked with artisans from International Fine Art Conservation Studios Inc. (IFACS), also of England and Asheville.31

The plan for the Dining Hall involved addressing four elements, “failing plaster, the deteriorating art work, the extensive redecoration necessary where previous work was virtually non-existent, and the problem of executing the plan while keeping the dining hall open for student use.” The last of the four items was easiest to resolve; the restoration program was divided into three phases, each addressing one of the three areas of the room. The ceiling work was of primary importance, with the balance of the work on the windows, woodwork, and floors performed later. The BCSR firm accomplished the work with assistance from “specialists in mural conservation, plaster consolidation, and scaffolding.”32

On October 27, 1986, the National Advisory Committee received an initial report on the physical investigation of the Dining Hall. The room had undergone no major changes over time; however, in 1934-35 a water-based sprinkler system had been installed in the attic. Though structurally in excellent condition, the attic floor and wood lath might have witnessed stress, though not damage, by inexperienced workmen during that installation. The result was a weakening of the plaster that relied on the lath

31Flagler’s Ponce at 100, Special Supplement to The St. Augustine Record, January 9, 1988, 2.
32Biltmore, Campbell, Smith Restorations, Inc. The Conservator, newsletter 1:2, n.d. [ca. 1987].
for support. Major sections of the murals painted directly on to the plaster in the curved *venido* rooms had fallen to the floor. Large 4’x8’ plywood sheets had been nailed to the ceiling to preclude further deterioration in the *venido* rooms. The massive barrel-vaulted ceiling in the main section of the room precluded that option for stabilization of that area. The exterior of the room was structurally sound; however, a new clay tile roof was needed as leaks were evident where the main room and the *venido* rooms intersected. Damage existed to the wood framing around the semi-circular rooms.\(^{33}\)

In regard to restoration of the ceiling and wall murals, “Overpainting also existed in a variety of areas resulting from previous attempts to restore the art work.” Also, a polyurethane varnish had been used over some of the art work in the west *venido*, an inappropriate treatment.\(^{34}\)

Susanne Pandich of Biltmore provided the initial report and produced technical data sheets illustrating her findings. She noted damage to the keyways and composition of the plaster, though more in the *venido* rooms than in the main hall, a total of about 20 separation points. Little additional weight on the ceiling would take place as a result of the treatment. Due to the accelerated condition of damage in the *venido* rooms, the plaster would be repaired, and the murals would be repainted based on photographic documentation and description. An acryloid, “synthetic picture varnish”

---


\(^{34}\)The Conservator.
that was reversible, did not yellow as did shellac, and “had been in use for about 20 years in picture restoration” would serve as the sealant.\footnote{Advisory Committee minutes, October 27, 1986, 4-5.}

If the restoration research was conducted today, this conservation treatment might be addressed differently from a materials standpoint. In 1980, in preparation for the American Institute for Conservation meeting, Metropolitan Museum of Art Objects Conservation department conservator Elizabeth C. Welsh published an article attesting to the appropriateness of using Acryloid B-72 (Rohm and Haas trade name for the product). Her findings were based on its longevity and chemical properties that made it less hazardous than alternatives. The following year Catherine Sease, in an article published in a 1981 issue of Studies in Conservation (International Institute for Conservation of Historic and Artistic Works, London), contradicted earlier findings, arguing that the substance failed to meet all of its desirable properties: flexibility, clear matt appearance, non-contractile, good adhesion, and water permeable. These articles addressing the controversy over the use of the sealant would have been available to the BCSR team. To this day, scholars differ on whether or not this material is appropriate to use. Interestingly, by early 1982 Sease was employed by the Met as well. Today, Welsh and Sease remain colleagues and collegial, each in other parts of the U.S., continuing to chart the future of conservation philosophy and technology.\footnote{Soluble Nylon Reevaluated, Abbey Newsletter, 6, no.1 (February 1982): 1-2, accessed December 25, 2011, http://cool.conservation-us.org/byorg/abbey/an/an06/an06-1/an06-101.html. Multicultural Participation in Conservation Decision-Making, WAAC Annual Meeting, Seattle, September 30, 1991, accessed December 25, 2011, http://cool.conservation-us.org/waac/wn/wn14/wn14-1/wn14-105.html.}

A new and untested material was available at this time and considered for use as well. BCSR was collaborating on the ceiling project with consultants retained by the
Vatican for conservation of the ceiling murals created by Michaelangelo in the Sistine Chapel. Fortunately, even without the lightning speed of today’s computers, those consultants were able to tell BCSR principals to avoid use of the material. The Italian work included removal of this substance and re-conservation of the areas where the substance had been tried.  

The physical conservation activities were required to be accomplished without disrupting the use of the Dining Hall. This necessitated moving dining service furnishings to one section of the room, erecting scaffolding “finished with a flush deck within six and a half feet of the ceiling surface,” completing conservation, and moving repeatedly until the process was finished. When the main hall was under conservation, the scaffolding was erected in a manner that enabled workers to proceed and College students and personnel to walk beneath the scaffolding, maintaining access to the kitchen at the north end of the room.”

Addressing the condition of the plaster was a significant consideration. In many areas the plaster was loose. Additionally, the “keys” needed to be secured. The keys are areas where the plaster goes through the lath and wraps or curls around the lath, providing integral support for the plaster. BCSR firm’s operations manager Steven Seebohm described the task,

A process of applying a viscous epophen liquid epoxy resin to the key side of the plaster fabric was used. The resin application required removal of all dust and debris from the attic space, with vacuuming as the final cleaning effort. Resins were then applied to the surface from the attic side and brushed into the porous plaster keys and the lath with a stiff brush. A test

---

37 Comments by Abare and Don Martin, Professor of Art, Flagler College, 2009. Martin joined the faculty at the college in 1980 and continues to teach there today.

38 Drysdale interview. The Conservator.
patch was cut out of the ceiling in an area not containing any art work. The results were positive. When dry, the epoxy resin held the keys, the lath and the plaster fabric firmly together. Approximately, 8,000 square feet of ceiling area was cleaned and treated in this manner.

Barney D. Lamar, director and later president of IFACS, provided additional information about the use of epoxy resins particularly in contrast to the weight of plaster, “The selection of epoxy resin as a consolidant in the Dining Hall was based on its strength, bonding properties, inert character and its relative light weight.” About 1980 epoxy resin had been used successfully at Drayton Hall, a 1755 Georgian Palladian style residence outside Charleston, South Carolina, and a property of the National Trust for Historic Preservation. Regular monitoring evidenced no damage after a decade. In England epoxy resin had been used at Fetcham Park House, Southampton University, St. Bartholomew’s Hospital, London, and in the House of Lords and Peers’ Lobby, both at the Palace of Westminster.39

Plaster repair included removal of earlier patches that had been accomplished with materials that did not coincide with the original in regard to expansion and contraction. Hemp fiber was used to strengthen areas where large cracks had resulted, and traditional plaster repair covered the surface. Cleaning was accomplished with mild detergent. In rare cases where plaster coats were separating from each other “PVA resins were injected with a large hypodermic syringe and needle.” Paint analysis was undertaken, also, to identify original colors prior to repainting. Seebohm noted that oil-based paints were used for the new work, “the oils were first set out on an absorbent paper to soak up some of the oils which would additionally darken the paint. The oil

paint was then mixed with Ketone N resins to restore its original consistency and to improve reversibility of the medium.”

International artisans including plaster expert Englishman Peter Divers and paint conservator Italian Massimo Buschi, who worked for months over the summer and fall of 1987 on the murals, woodwork, plaster moldings and gold-leafed lions’ head light fixtures, repairing, painting, re-stenciling, and reproducing the ceiling ornamentation in the Dining Hall. An eight-person team of conservators from England and Scotland worked in shifts to apply 950 books of 18- and 23-karat gold leaves at 25 leaves per book covering a total of 1,000 square feet. Adding to the challenge according to Seebohm were the environmental conditions, “And you’re working on the east coast of Florida, in humid 100-degree temperatures, day after day, painting a ceiling with a small brush one-eighth-inch wide.”

At the same meeting of the National Advisory Committee, a report was provided on the condition of the stained glass windows. Two studios, Shenandoah Studios of Front Royal, Virginia, and Willet Studios of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, were evaluated to be used for the conservation of the stained glass. Each company met skill requirements and retained “large stocks of American and European glass” enabling

40 The Conservator.

replacement where necessary to match the original in color, texture and composition. The Virginia firm was selected to undertake the work, submitting the lower bid by half.\textsuperscript{42}

Each piece of damaged glass had a mold made and clear glass installed to verify the exactness of the mold prior to the creation of a new colored glass piece. The stained glass windows were removed and taken to the Shenandoah Studios for restoration. In their places plywood was installed in the openings. In addition to the conservation, the window frames were repaired. Once restored, protective sheeting with a vapor barrier was installed on the outside of each window. The installation precluded condensation that could damage the window frames, addressing security issues and providing protection from disasters—natural or manmade. The merits of an acrylic versus shatterproof plate glass were debated, with the latter being the preferred alternative. Since then the protective sheets have been replaced with Lexan.\textsuperscript{43}

An authenticity question addressed was the presence of roller shade window fittings. In this case, documentary research indicated and Lewis, who would have been in his 20s at the time, remembered that these had been installed by the Coast Guard to enable viewing of training films in the room. The fittings were made during World War II. They were removed. Though the Coast Guard’s use of the Ponce represents an important chapter in the building’s history, the removal of this item from the Tiffany glass windows did not compromise the integrity of the restoration. Regardless of the decision,


\textsuperscript{43}Minutes, National Advisory Committee, October 27, 1986, 6. Drysdale interview.
the fact that the question was addressed illustrated the care being taken in the research and planning for the project.\textsuperscript{44}

Restoration and reproduction of the brass chandeliers in the Dining Room was undertaken by Klahm & Sons, Inc. of Ocala. The firm specialized in ornamental metalwork and provided a scope of work, cost estimate, and anticipated time frame for all of the metalwork in the Ponce. Also, references were submitted that included the Iolani Palace and Royal Mausoleum in Honolulu.\textsuperscript{45}

The oak flooring was damaged heavily from use and had been sanded and refinished numerous times. The Biltmore consultants stated that the floors could withstand one additional sanding, but encouraged refinishing only. Dialogue included replacement with an artificial material or with new oak flooring. Lewis stated that the College’s Board of Trustees maintained a policy requiring that any restoration or renovation to the Ponce “must be as pure as possible.” The floor was to be retained if possible; if the flooring was too damaged, compatible oak flooring was to be used and finished with varnish. The second alternative was selected. During the time that the sub-flooring was exposed for rewiring, joists marked with “Edison Electric” were visible, providing field verification of the Edison firm’s participation in the project.\textsuperscript{46}

A compromise was made with regard to the steam radiators located symmetrically throughout the Dining Hall. Use of the Edison steam dynamos boilers fired by wood and coal was no longer feasible and more energy-efficient, sustainable

\textsuperscript{44}Minutes, National Advisory Committee, October 27, 1986, 10.

\textsuperscript{45}Alex R. Klahm, letters to Robert Honiker, January 6, 1988 and November 11, 1991, Campus Planner, Grant Records.

\textsuperscript{46}Minutes, National Advisory Committee, October 27, 1986, 8.
chillers were installed; the radiators could be connected to the new system. After considerable discussion about their operational effectiveness, their importance to the character of the room, safety and security with regard to students, and their adaptability as part of an alternate heating system, a decision was made to relocate the radiators only if it proved infeasible to incorporate them into the new HVAC system. They would function throughout the building cosmetically as furniture. If that proved infeasible, new unit ventilators would be installed in front of the wainscoting in a manner that would not harm original fabric. The ventilation would enable air conditioning "to the level of occupancy" in the room. The ceilings would remain at the humidity levels comparable to their first 98 years of life in the building. This latter alternative was chosen.47

The Restoration Campaign for the Dining Hall was anticipated to require $2,000,000 (which would be nearly $4,000,000 today). By October of 1988 Flagler College had secured total private gifts of $1,222,743 from trustees, corporations and foundations, senior administrators, alumni, students, faculty and staff. This included a prestigious Arthur Vining Davis Foundations grant. Within the total amount raised, "Friends of Flagler," a category recognizing individuals principally from Northeast Florida, provided more than $400,000 which proved significant as the College approached a new funding source.48

In 1989, the College applied to the State of Florida through the Special Category grant program. Administered through the Division of Historical Resources with peer review by the gubernatorial-appointed Historic Preservation Advisory Council, this state

47 Minutes, National Advisory Committee, October 27, 1986, 9-10.

48 Flagler College, Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records.
appropriation funding program was the first of its kind in the nation. The College had been encouraged by State officials to apply due to the national significance of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon.

The Dining Hall grant project came through the process with a first place ranking out of 95 applications and a recommendation for full funding of $414,712. A $150,000 challenge grant from The Kresge Foundation was more than met as well, enabling the Restoration Campaign to surpass the $2,000,000 goal. As work had progressed, more damage became evident, necessitating additional funding. In 1991, the College provided verification to the State that $2,187,662 had been invested in the project.49

The Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board, in a lawsuit with the St. Augustine Foundation, Inc., reacted to the recommendation that Flagler College receive grant funding. From 1974 to 1989 and with gifts provided by Molly Lewis Wiley, Flagler College rented the auditorium space in Government House for the institution’s drama program. The College spent more than $70,000 on maintenance of that facility and provided the space at no charge to the Preservation Board that managed the facility for the State of Florida.

The Foundation and the College had some board members in common. In 1987, newly-elected Governor Bob Martinez had removed some Preservation Board members including John D. Bailey, Julio Grabel, Roy Hunt, and Norma Lockwood and made new appointments, Bill Daniell, Thomas Sliney, Jeanne Ray, Teresa Milam, Margaret Foerster, Patricia Lee and John Sundeman. The appointments prompted the

---

49Advancement, Grant Records.
resignation of board members including Dr. Michael Gannon and Lawrence Lewis, Jr., and the executive director.\textsuperscript{50}

Following announcement of the Special Category grant rankings in March 1989, several of the new Preservation Board members attempted to divert Flagler College’s Special Category grant into the Preservation Board’s operating trust fund for use on Government House. Timothy Bradford, Vice-President of the Preservation Board’s support organization, wrote and then was quoted in a \textit{Florida Times-Union} article,

\begin{quote}
If state revenues are as tight as they appear to be, and the Legislature must make a choice between supporting a restoration project at a private institution that is not in danger of being destroyed or lost and a state agency restoring a building for public use, then the funds should go to the state agency.\textsuperscript{51}
\end{quote}

Abare, at that time Flagler College’s Assistant to the President, noted in a letter to Bradford the College’s commitment to preservation of the historic campus, an investment of $12,000,000 that had been made over the previous thirteen years. He challenged the Preservation Board to make the same investment in the same number of years in the future. The College received the grant, and neither Governor Martinez nor the Florida Legislature appropriated the $250,000 that the Preservation Board had requested for Government House.\textsuperscript{52}

\begin{flushright}
\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{50}Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board Archives, Member File.

\textsuperscript{51}Advancement, Grant Records. Flagler College wins battle with historic board over grant, \textit{Florida Times-Union}, June 10, 1989.

\textsuperscript{52}Advancement, Grant Records.
\end{flushright}
The Preservation Board received legal purgatory, operating in a weakened position organizationally until 1997. At that time, Secretary of State Sandra Mortham abolished all of the preservation boards except the one headquartered in Pensacola.53

On the positive side, the November/December 1987 issue of the National Trust’s *Historic Preservation* featured an article on restoration of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon, showcasing the Dining Hall’s conservation. Appropriately, the magazine was released shortly before the College celebrated the Centennial anniversary of the hotel’s opening on January 10, 1988, exactly one hundred years after Henry Flagler’s private opening of the building. Jackson Walter, National Trust president, was one of the dignitaries present for the events which included tours of the Dining Hall and Grand Parlor and a formal banquet in the Dining Hall. The coverage was one of numerous stories at the time about preservation in St. Augustine. Author Thomas J. Colin stated, “part of the emerging picture of our Spanish heritage being pieced together with an eye to the 1992 Quincentennial celebration of Columbus’s discovery of the New World.”

The *St. Augustine Record* published a commemorative special supplement on January 9, 1988, showcasing the building’s history and affording community organizations and corporations an opportunity to pay tribute to Flagler College for the institution’s preservation efforts.54

Lewis received a prestigious National Trust for Historic Preservation Honor Award for his preservation efforts. He had supported projects in North Carolina and


Virginia, as well as Florida. The greatest recognition was for efforts on behalf of the Ponce. In 1995 he received the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation’s highest award, the Evelyn Fortune Bartlett Award for Lifetime Achievement in Preservation Stewardship.55

Restoration of the Flagler College Dining Hall including the Maynard ceiling murals encompassed a five-year period between 1986 and 1991. At the completion of the project the Dining Hall restoration, as did the Grand Parlor in 1988, garnered an Outstanding Achievement Award for Restoration of a Historic Structure awards from the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation.

Following this extensive and expensive effort, the College initiated a more assertive effort to monitor the condition of the building to maintain the restoration effort. In 2000 Rose Leavitt, a former Biltmore conservator then working in Palm Beach, was commissioned to retouch sections of the Dining Hall ceiling. Her firm Rose O. Leavitt Conservation of Fine Arts spent most of the summer accomplishing the repairs.56

Placing research for the restoration of the Dining Hall ceiling into a larger context requires stepping outside St. Augustine. The Ponce is a one-of-a-kind building. Even with consideration of Henry Flagler’s other commissions for Carrère and Hastings in the city, the Ponce rises above the later works in architectural importance. Memorial Presbyterian Church, Flagler’s final resting place, is unique among ecclesiastical buildings. Yet the sanctuary’s interior, its most dramatic space, is considerably less

55Flagler College, Office of Business Services Records.

56Flagler College, Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records. Restoring a relic: Rose Leavitt and crew are returning the splendor to Flagler College’s dining hall one spot at a time, St. Augustine Record Compass, July 7, 2000.
complex architecturally and decoratively than that of the Dining Hall, the Ponce’s most remarkable room.

In Florida, several other properties come to mind that feature interiors that could be compared with regard to conservation issues to those in the Ponce: two Palm Beach properties Whitehall (1900-1901), Flagler’s winter home, and Mar-a-Lago (1927-1931), Marjorie Merriwether Post’s estate. Vizcaya (1916), Charles Deering’s residence on Miami’s Biscayne Bay, was followed a few years later by John and Mabel Ringling’s Ca’d’Zan (1924-1925). All but the last are designated as National Historic Landmarks, and, most likely, the Ringling mansion is eligible.

Historically, the properties share similar construction eras, from the Gilded Age through the Florida Land Boom of the 1920s. Architecturally, each is unique, all of masonry construction, and each features extensive decorative arts collections. All are coastal properties with buildings and grounds that have been damaged by hurricanes and storms. Each of the properties has required research into conservation processes to enable restoration or preservation of their unique interiors. The major difference in the conservation of the Ponce Dining Hall is that the work was undertaken in the late 1980s and early 1990s. Information, techniques, equipment, all of these items has drastically changed in the last twenty-five years.

If undertaken today at the scale accomplished during that earlier period, restorers would use computer technology to examine plaster photographically before evaluating its composition chemically. A more comprehensive assessment of the attic space might be attainable through the use of computers instead of physical examination by people that could place stress on fragile building components. The ceilings in the Sistine
Chapel were undergoing conservation that enabled a comparative analysis on materials and techniques. That the conservation and restoration firms had experience with three of England’s most significant buildings lent credibility to the work on the Ponce. Artisans from Europe provided expertise that either was or was perceived to have been unavailable in the United States at the time.

The Dining Hall research effort was appropriate to the level of expertise demanded to accomplish a high quality restoration. The process used internationally-renowned experts, an advisory board of national scholars, and a procedure that was thoughtful, deliberative, and effective. Shortcomings in the process, if they exist, are not apparent either in the written record or the accomplished project.

In addition to restoration of the room, conservation of the finishes, and introduction of an HVAC system, the hotel chairs were reproduced for use by the College. Furniture company manufacturer John Foster, Lewis’s son-in-law and Louise Lewis Foster’s husband, had the chairs copied. Though their origin is inconclusive, sources indicate that the original chairs were custom-made in Austria.57

By completion of the project, total funds raised amounted to $2,100,000 “of which $1.69 million was contributed by members of the Board of Trustees, the President’s Council, foundations, corporations, financial institutions, local community supporters, alumni, and friends.” The final 25% of the funding was the State’s Special Category grant of $414,712. Flagler College’s first capital campaign proved to be a resounding success and established an effective fundraising pattern used since that time.58

57Foster interview.

In 1989, at the same time that Flagler College was in the midst of the restoration 
and conservation of the Dining Room, the institution began a three-phased, $1,000,000 
campaign to restore the Rotunda. The firm that completed the Grand Parlor and Dining 
Room under the direction of BCSR was retained to analyze the damage to the Rotunda. 
International Fine Arts Conservation Studio (IFACS) developed an elaborate condition 
assessment that addressed the space floor by floor and covered a series of topics: 
plaster, decorative painting, woodwork, marble, and murals. The following paragraphs 
summarize information provided in the report.59

Plaster: Cracks in the ceilings of the first and second floors resulted in paint 
peeling from murals applied directly to the plaster. Fortunately, the damage was 
considerably less than that experienced in the Dining Hall. The firm identified minor 
damage only. The plaster on the walls of the first level evidenced deterioration following 
water leaks. Poor quality repairs had been made over time. The principal wall along 
the grand staircase had “a very heavily applied paint layer of white latex” which covered

59 Ponce de Leon Hall A) Rotunda Ceiling, B) Rotunda Dome, Flagler College.
several major locations of plaster damage. On the mezzanine level, in the rectangular section surrounding the Rotunda, plaster on the walls had been replaced by new plaster, or walls had been covered with plaster board. Original plaster remained on the ceiling. For the third level the structural system to which the plaster was attached was the underside of a circular wooden framework that featured a paneled octagon-shaped seat with a balustrade. The recommendation was to avoid disassembly of this seating system as that action could have exacerbated plaster and structural damage, if present, that would have been revealed.60

The report provided details regarding the damage to the walls of the mezzanine level which was considerably different and more challenging than the condition evident throughout the rest of the Rotunda and lobbies in the building,

Both the east and west walls have been covered with vinyl wallpaper which has been applied with a strong PVA adhesive. When small areas of the walls were tested, we found stripping difficult, as the plaster, paint layer and fillings pulled away with the wallcovering.

The diagnosis required more substantial effort. Fortunately, this area was devoid of decorative plaster details.61

Decorative Painting: This topic was addressed with the same attention to detail as the evaluation for all of the elements within the Rotunda. In addition, microscopic analysis presented through photographs was included. This analysis enabled determination of original and subsequent colors, and the number of times that the


61IFACS, Rotunda report.
surfaces were painted. “Paint” included glazes, washes, faux graining, and similar decorative treatments, depending upon the surface.

The first floor lobby including the grand staircase at both the lobby and mezzanine levels and the perimeter of the dome on the level above the mezzanine went through a series of color transitions. Investigation revealed that the original paint treatment (after primer) was “in a deep rose paint to complement the pink marble found throughout the rotunda.” Additional paint layers that were documented indicated the following order for the main floor and similar shades for the remainder of these areas: red, blue, blue, yellow and white. The last color was on the walls at the time of the restoration and obscured much of the bas relief plaster decoration on the ground floor. The ceilings’ original paint color was yellow green. The door arches, plaster panels over the fireplaces and the plaster niches “appear originally to have been wood-grained in imitation of the surrounding oak.” As much of the third floor plaster had been replaced with plaster board, investigation into original finishes was precluded. For the areas that retained plaster, no decorative treatments were found.62

The report on the Rotunda dome noted that the surface at the time was painted “white with a yellow water-based glaze” and was not adhering to the carved and decorated details. Some of the decorative elements exhibited a bronze paint that had darkened, and present was “a very heavy dirt and dust layer on the upper surfaces of all the figures.” Certainly, this last statement could have been the result of several situations, deferred maintenance, difficulty of accessing the space, the three-

62IFACS, Rotunda report.
dimensional nature of the surfaces precluding their ease of cleaning, or the chemistry of
the paint providing a haven for dirt and dust.

Woodwork: The investigative report stated that the overall condition of the
woodwork exhibited minor damage including that from insect infestation, “Termites have
eaten away mouldings and panels.” Small pieces were missing at the base of several
columns. Applications such as varnishes and polishes had darkened with age and
dulled surfaces, preventing display of the wood’s natural grain. On the mezzanine level
a plastic coating had been applied that had dried to a brittle consistency and was
chipping. Dirt and grease were present as well.

The areas near the staircases exhibited the greatest concentration of damage to
the woodwork. The bench seats and window frames, particularly those containing the
Bacchus theme Tiffany windows, displayed excessive damage, “it should be considered
an important structural priority.” Also, across the Rotunda at the front entrance to the
building the paneling and moldings were found to be loose, damaged or missing, noted
as in “particularly poor condition.” In some locations, damage to moldings had been
repaired with “plastic wood fillings.”

Marble: The condition was fine with grout requiring replacement in areas that
received impact, such as at the base of columns. Though damage was not in evidence,
the report recommended further investigation of the structural condition of the pink
Numidian marble balcony at the south minstrels’ galley. The marble floors, stairs,
wainscoting and trim needed polishing.

Murals: The assessment of the murals included the structural condition of the
dome on all four levels. With assistance from architect Craig Thorn, the conservation
experts determined that some of the structural support in the dome had shifted over time; “transmission of weight” had caused cracking in plaster resulting in damage to the murals painted directly on that plaster. The 400 Rotunda or Solarium at the top of the building had been used since about 1980 as storage for furniture. The report recommended that the items be removed from the room as the additional weight might have exacerbated the damage.

The accepted scope of work responded to included restoration of the mosaic tile floors, Verona and pink Numidian marble and quarter-sawn oak wainscoting in the vestibule, lobby, and along the flanking wings; repair to mezzanine and grand staircase ceiling and wall plaster; restoration of decorative Turkish red glaze and stenciled friezes on plaster walls; reproduction of light fixtures; painting of ceilings Primrose yellow. At the mezzanine level the two Georg Schweissinger oil canvasses flanking the south minstrels’ gallery were conserved. Finally, the paired oak doors, sidelights, and transom that comprised the main entrance from the courtyard into the vestibule were recommended to be reproduced.63

Nearly all of the work proposed for the Rotunda was completed. An exception was reestablishment of original paint colors and faux graining. Also, the door surround on the mezzanine level that was added to meet the fire code was recommended to be removed. That was not able to be accomplished due to code requirements.64

One construction and conservation team was selected to orchestrate all phases of the project. A.D. Davis Construction Company performed construction, and the


64IFACS report.
Cummings Studios of North Adams, Massachusetts, restored the Tiffany windows. IFACS accomplished restoration of the plaster, decorative painting, and murals using the same methods and techniques as had been undertaken successfully for the Dining Hall. The detailed descriptions were presented in that section and are not repeated here. The phases are outlined in the following paragraphs. When details for work items differ from those presented for the Dining Room they are described.\textsuperscript{65}

As part of the fundraising effort, Flagler College applied to the State of Florida for several Special Category grants. For Phase I a request was made for $200,000, with a match committed of $211,997. The College received an award of $92,625 distributed in 1990 and matched the funds with more than proposed, a total of $348,917. The scope of work for this phase called for repair of the plaster cracks in the portion of the dome on which the murals and decorative paint adhered; conservation of the Maynard murals; and restoration of some of the woodwork.\textsuperscript{66}

In 1990 Flagler College proposed Phase II, an estimated $675,000 project. The College pledged $200,000 toward this effort. The College was awarded the highest ranking for a grant of $149,888 in 1991 from the State of Florida to assist with the project. The scope of work for this segment included conservation of the Schweissinger paintings; repair and restoration of the walls; repair and cleaning of the marble walls and floors; reproduction of quarter-sawn oak paneling; restoration of decorative painting

\textsuperscript{65}Grant Records, 1989-1990.

\textsuperscript{66}Grant Records, 1989-1990.
along the grand staircase; reproduction of doors and light fixtures; reconstruction of the round Tiffany window frames; and restoration of those windows.  

Conservation of the Schweissinger paintings included careful removal of the varnish and installation of a new lining canvas. The restoration of the dome included cleaning and repair; application of oil paint and glaze; and re-gilding of the Rotunda dome with 560 books of gold and 250 books of silver leaf.  

The scope included repairs to and restoration of the entrance accessed from the carriageway at the rear of the hotel, “The Porter’s Entrance consists of an Armorial design painted directly onto plaster as well as polychromatic masonry and stencil designs.” Conservation included removal of over-painting; determining and matching original colors; and application of protective varnish.  

In 1992 the College received a State grant ranking of 33 for an award of $146,220 for Phase III and provided $320,555 in matching funds. The work completed under this grant concluded the scope started in Phase II. Once work had been initiated enabling damage to be more accurately evaluated, additional time and funds were required. Included in Phase III was restoration of the Bacchus-themed Tiffany stained glass windows and frames on the east side of the grand staircase.  

As the project progressed, an additional Phase IV was needed. The College continued fundraising, and in 1993 submitted another Special Category grant application. In 1994 the State of Florida provided funding in the amount of $139,880

---

which the College matched 1:1 to complete this significant project. The grant had ranked 46. Multiple-phased projects tended to decline in rank as new projects stepped forward with strong needs and support.\textsuperscript{71}

**Continuing Preservation Efforts**

In the early 1990s the College completed restoration and rehabilitation of the main portions of the Hotel Ponce de Leon and had addressed preservation of several other historic campus buildings. A consulting team of engineering and environmental consultants prepared a list of components on the former Hotel Ponce de Leon that needed to be considered for work, additional projects for preservation.

**Perimeter Wall**

A low coquina concrete wall defined the perimeter of the grounds of the Ponce. The wall featured tall concrete-capped bollards and was punctuated with inward-curving lunettes spaced at regular intervals. Heavy chains with spike mace heads hung between each bollard, emphasizing the fortress exterior of the building and precluding entry to the property. Globe fixtures provided lighting to the property. By the time that the hotel complex was nearing its century mark, the perimeter wall had suffered significant damage to all of the major components: the low wall, bollards, caps, chains, light standards and globes. Wiring for the lights required updating, also. According to alumna and trustee Rick Groux, about half of the pieces of the metal and chain mail were missing by the time the College started the project.\textsuperscript{72}

\textsuperscript{71}Grant Records, 1993-1994.

\textsuperscript{72}Flagler College, Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records, Flagler College Perimeter Wall. Groux interview.
Although original to the Hotel Ponce de Leon property, restoration of the perimeter wall surrounding the seven-acre property was a lower priority than preservation of the five buildings that comprised the hotel complex. Abare stated that without assistance from the State, most likely the College would not have undertaken the project. Consideration had been given to removing the wall for health and safety reasons.  

In 1998, after obtaining detailed estimates and a scope of work over several years, the College submitted an application to the State for another Special Category grant. The request was for $360,000 with a match of $408,000. The project was not funded, and grant records do not provide information as to the reason. At this time the State set an upper limit of $350,000 on the grant awards. The College resubmitted the application the following year for funding in the 2000 State fiscal year. The project was anticipated to cost $768,000. The grant submission was for $350,000 with a match of $418,000. The College was awarded $300,000 and provided a match of $500,000.  

Batson-Cook Company of Jacksonville served as the general contractor for the project. The 1,600 foot wall consisted of 85 pillars and 49 light fixtures joined by 64 sections of spiked maces and chains. The concrete mix used for the wall repairs involved a recipe of seventy percent coquina, twenty percent cement and ten percent water. Seamont Ventures of St. Augustine provided the coquina. Florida Rock Industries, Inc. of Jacksonville supplied the cement.

---

73 Abare interview.

74 Flagler College Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records, Perimeter Wall.
Courtyard

In July 2000 the consulting team identified the following issues to be addressed: “the portcullis (the iron gate protecting the entrance), the loggias (the balconies adjacent to the entrance), the concrete sidewalks in the courtyard, and the light fixtures hanging in the loggias.” Specifically, over time environmental factors with assistance from airborne termites had compromised the integrity of the wood framework of the portcullis and the floor structure. The iron framework for the gate and the decorative lighting standards had suffered rust damage and corrosion. Also, the light fixtures required repair and rewiring. The concrete courtyard floor structure was cracked severely.\footnote{Courtyard Advancement, Grant Records.}

The College applied for a State grant in the amount of $231,545 with a maximum committed match of $200,000. The project was recommended for funding for the 2001-2002 fiscal year. As work began, the College reevaluated the funds to be expended for the project. A total of $310,500 was documented as the College’s participation.\footnote{Phillip Wisley, letter from Nicole Donnelly, August 28, 2001, Advancement, Grant Records.}

A.D. Davis Construction Company was selected as the construction firm with Kenneth Smith Architects, Inc. as the architectural consultant. All of the elements were repaired or replaced to match the originals in materials, techniques, design and details. Cypress was used as the material for the portcullis structure, once again finished in iron. The terrace and steps were recreated in coquina concrete with the original coquina blocks salvaged from the Catholic Church reused. The fountain with its trademark turtles and frogs was repaired, part of a regular maintenance cycle for that element.\footnote{Courtyard, Advancement Grant Records.}
On September 15, 1999, Hurricane Floyd traveled north from the Caribbean up the Atlantic Coast remaining just offshore from Florida, bringing wind and rain for several days. Residents of coastal communities evacuated to hotels and motels well inland as far as central Georgia and Alabama. The hurricane continued up coastal Georgia to the Carolinas, ultimately resulting in 57 deaths and damage estimated between $3,000,000,000 and $6,000,000,000. Floyd’s damage in Florida at $46,500,000 was only about ten percent of the total. The storm served as a warning and a reminder of the potential for greater loss of life and damage.78

In the months of August and September 2004 Florida endured four hurricanes Charley, Frances, Ivan and Jeanne. In all cases wind and rain generated damage to people and property throughout Florida. Flooding in St. Augustine reduced

---

transportation modes to canoes, kayaks, and a few brave souls who swam through the city’s streets. For both hurricanes Frances and Jeanne, mandatory evacuations required Flagler College to take students from the campus inland to safe locales.

Hurricane Floyd wrought damaged to the Ponce specifically to the clay tile roof and many of the 1,000 wood frame windows. Emergency repairs to the dormer windows and corresponding roof sections required an investment of $1,333,309. The 2004 hurricanes and Hurricane Wilma in 2005 Hurricane Wilma brought additional damage. Those storms ranked as the greatest series of major storms in half a century and challenged the College’s preservation efforts.

A component of life in Florida and many other places is, with advanced warning, preparation for hurricanes. This situation is commonplace. Property owners recognize that they must be prepared to address basic needs at the least, evacuation and property devastation, and loss of life at the most. For a building such as the Ponce, the stakes are great, and preparation is dramatic in labor, materials, time, and cost. Timing does not permit installing hurricane protection on 1,000 windows, relocating furniture and storing irreplaceable fine and decorative arts. The Ponce must withstand environmental threats and manmade disasters. Following the early 21st century hurricanes, Flagler College focused on protection of the Ponce.

Upon the recommendation of and with assistance from the State of Florida’s St. Augustine preservation officer, the College submitted a federal grant application. The Save America’s Treasures program was implemented in the Clinton administration and continued through the George W. Bush administration to benefit properties eligible for or designated as National Historic Landmarks. The program operated through the
National Park Service in partnership with the National Endowment for the Humanities and the National Trust for Historic Preservation.

In 2001 Flagler College received $400,000 for repairs to the roof of Ponce Hall. The grant required an equal financial commitment from the College. This commitment was fulfilled by the College and the Board of Trustees led by Chairman Randy Ringhaver, St. Augustine native and Ring Power CEO. The project had a 24-month time frame.79

In 2003 the College applied for a State grant to pursue a windows project, receiving in 2004 funds of $300,000 with $503,100 in matching funds for custom-made hurricane-resistant replacement windows in the configuration of the originals.80

In 2000, corresponding to the windows project which enabled energy conservation and hurricane protection, the College investigated the possibility of installing climate control for the dormitory rooms in Ponce Hall. With assistance from new trustee W. W. “Bill” Gay, a state-of-the-art energy efficient central heating and air conditioning system was installed.

79Advancement, Grant Records.
80Advancement, Grant Records.
Edison Boiler Building and Artists’ Studios

And the smokestack behind the service court at the rear of the complex is one of the unheralded glories of late 19th-century U.S. design. A rectangular base of beige concrete banded with red brick supports a short hexagon, on top of which a tall, banded shaft rises; at the top, a length of studded brickwork gives way to rich corbeling around the mouth. The design seems more worthy of a monument than a chimney.

Lawrence Biemiller, 1988

Early in the history of the College minor modifications were made to the Artists’ Studios building, to enable the former artists’ ateliers to serve as offices for the Flagler System, Inc. Contemporary modifications including paneling, drop ceilings and fluorescent tube lighting replaced skylights, canvas covered walls and tiled fireplaces.
The second floor was commissioned for classrooms as well as one area on the first floor. Maintenance functions retained the balance of the lower floor.  

In contrast to the earlier effort, a two-phased conversion of the Edison Boiler Building and Artists’ Studios orchestrated by the Georgia-based firm Batson-Cook Company returned the building to art studios, offices and a gallery. The building stood out as one of the only examples of industrial architecture from the Flagler era, adding additional importance to the undertaking. The project was supported with the State of Florida’s only two back-to-back $350,000 grants in 2006 and 2007. These public funds were matched privately 7:1 for the $5,500,000 project.

The scope of work for the Edison Boiler Building included lifting the original roof beam structure from the boiler building and setting the beams on the west lawn to have these structural elements certified that they could be reinstalled and meet hurricane standards. The beams had been an exposed construction element throughout the building’s history and represented a character-defining feature of this industrial building. From an interpretive standpoint, the beam structure added a unique and rare opportunity to explore preservation. John Paul Huguley of Charleston, South Carolina, a gifted engineer, preservationist, and a member of the family that had owned Batson-Cook Construction, was excited to witness the salvage and reuse of these original structural components.

---


82 For his master’s thesis project at the University of Virginia, John Paul Huguley developed the intricate computer program then enabled the multi-million dollar restoration of Frank Lloyd Wright’s Fallingwater. In 1997 Huguley founded the American College for the Building Arts in Charleston as a response to the need for educational institutions that emphasized the building trades. He served on the statewide historic preservation task force that addressed needs for the State of Florida properties located in St. Augustine.
To meet fire separation requirements, yet still expose the beams on the interior, thick glass was used between rooms to enable the beam structure to remain visible and provide fire protection. The original clerestory opening (that had been covered over) was re-established, albeit with hurricane glass.

In the Artists’ Studios Building arched openings on the first story that provided access to storage areas for coal to fuel the steam dynamos were retained and repeated in the interior. Windows and doors were repaired instead of replaced. The original palm tree trunk columns on the second floor of the Artists’ Studios segment were certified as sound and remain. Metal reinforcing pipes inserted late in the hotel’s history to support the balcony were removed after steel beams were concealed behind the wood horizontal floor support beam, returning the balcony to its original appearance. Fireplaces located in the studios, if remaining at the time of the restoration, were repaired. As with the hotel room areas of the Ponce fireplace mantles and faces remain. Flues had been sealed many years earlier to meet fire code. New tiles were reproduced, and these unique elements, though non-operational, were preserved to add interest to the building.

In addition to the $700,000 in State of Florida funding, private gifts from about forty donors assisted the effort. The principal funding came from the William R. Kenan, Jr. Charitable Trust, a gift of $3,500,000 to honor Mary Lily Flagler “Molly” Lewis Wiley, Henry Flagler’s great-niece and an enthusiastic supporter of Flagler College. The buildings were renamed the Molly Wiley Art Building in her honor.
In the spring of 2013 the College had the Edison smokestack maintained with gentle cleaning to remove dirt and repointing to match the original mortar composition and color, completing the preservation activities for the former Boiler Building.

**Solarium**

![Solarium](image.jpg)

Figure 8-9. On the roof of the Ponce de Leon

At the top of the Ponce under the dome and between the two towers, is a special room known historically as the 400 Rotunda and identified today as the Solarium. As built all four sides of the room featured tall divided light windows with the southern exposure comprised of a sliding glass wall opening onto a narrow balcony overlooking the courtyard. Side entries opened from the room to the wings at the south side of the courtyard, and adjacent side entries enabled access to roof terraces and the towers. The center of the floor featured a large circular opening framed by a balustrade and
afforded a view downward to the narrow oculus at the top of the Rotunda and from there to the marble floor of the lobby.\textsuperscript{83}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure8-10.png}
\caption{Hotel Ponce de Leon Cross Section}
\end{figure}

The roof terraces flanking the Solarium afforded panoramic views to the east of Fort Marion, the Matanzas River, Anastasia Island, and the Atlantic Ocean. To the west the San Sebastian River and rural lands of St. Johns County were featured. As noted earlier this area was used from 1888 until 1971 when the Solarium’s function as a college library discontinued. After that date, limited activities took place on the fourth floor. Storage use continued until rehabilitation began in 2009. In 1985 the copper

lantern at the top of the dome was restored at a cost of $26,000, and tower balconies were preserved with an investment of $97,950. The College funded both.\footnote{Hotel Ponce de Leon, Cross Section, Kenneth Smith Architects, 2011. Restoration Campaign booklet.}

In 2009 the College received a first place ranking for a grant to restore the Solarium’s hurricane-damaged sliding glass wall overlooking the courtyard. With the decline in the economy, the project was the only grant project to be funded by the State of Florida. Due to the significant of the resource, the State selected the project to receive federal stimulus Historic Preservation Fund monies for “shovel-ready” projects.

![Figure 8-11. Flagler College 400 Rotunda](image)

The glass panels were photographed. Each piece of glass was numbered, removed and stored. The red oak framework was evaluated for structural integrity. Every piece that was could be reused was reused. New red oak pieces were milled with the same dimensions and profile as the original. To meet OSHA requirements the work had to be accomplished in a contained space. To fabricate the enormous door
panels, the work had to be undertaken in the Solarium. Both were accomplished. The wall matched the original, reflecting its 1888 appearance.\(^{85}\)

To maintain the momentum, the College approached Delores Lastinger, College trustee, and her husband Allen, both of whom have a strong interest in preservation. The Lastingers provided a challenge grant of $500,000 and, in response, the College launched “A Crowning Achievement: The Campaign for Restoration of the Solarium.” The text for the fundraising brochure describes proposed uses and the scope of work,

The domed Solarium rises from the center of Ponce de Leon Hall and is flanked by roof terraces and twin towers that pierce the St. Augustine skyline. These dramatic outdoor spaces afford unparalleled views of the city, nearby Intra-coastal Waterway, and the Atlantic Ocean.

Historically, the Solarium served as a space where guests of the Hotel Ponce de Leon could gather for conversation, enjoy entertainment, or watch activities taking place in town or along the bay front.

Rehabilitation of this room and the fourth floor will permit similar activities, as well as provide for an exceptional event venue.

The Solarium remains as the last significant space to be restored in the former Hotel Ponce de Leon, and the room is quite different than any other.

Light streams through windows on all four sides. Square columns support vaulted walls leading to a ribbed ceiling that culminates in a circular skylight.

The restoration of the Solarium will be completed in time for a year-long celebration in 2013 recognizing the 125th anniversary of the opening of the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

The new floor plan will accommodate a catering kitchen and accessible restrooms on the west wing; meeting rooms and a storage room on the east wing; new mechanical systems; and an express elevator.

Original chandeliers and wall sconces will be supplemented by new lighting, and audio-visual and computer technology will be incorporated as well. The

roof terraces will receive new decking, and the staircases leading into the towers will be rebuilt.

Though room arrangements on the wings were modified, the information proved to be accurate. In 2012 the College achieved the fundraising goal of $2,000,000 including a second first-place ranked State small matching grant of $50,000 to rebuild the fire stairs accessing the two towers and a Special Appropriation from the Florida Legislature of $350,000 to honor the centennial anniversary of Henry Flagler’s completion of the Overseas Railway.86

Flagler College completed restoration of the Solarium and fourth floor of Ponce Hall in the spring of 2013. To achieve handicapped accessibility the scope of work included cutting through the original cast coquina concrete wall adjoining the concrete dome to the west wing. A challenging surprise in materials surfaced when the contractor encountered railroad track embedded in the concrete for stability. This same technique had been used in construction of the towers.

Flagler College graduate Natalie Karas of Philadelphia assisted the project during 2009 when she was completing a master’s degree in historic preservation from the University of Pennsylvania under the direction of Frank Sanchez. As a class project, she analyzed the paint and plaster from the Solarium. The main room had been a series of yellow shades in its early years. Yellow was incorporated throughout the Solarium and fourth floor.87

---

86Flagler College Grant Records, 2012-2013.
87Karas, 2011.
A vestige of original material was uncovered during the rehabilitation. Carpet padding provided by Arnold, Constable & Company, New York’s “oldest and most prestigious department store” was located in the west wing, probably dating from construction of the hotel or an early renovation.88

Restoration and rehabilitation of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon consumed more than forty years, nearly all of the years that the building served as the centerpiece of the Flagler College campus. The most dramatic efforts began twenty-five years ago with the Dining Room, Rotunda and Grand Parlor. The final chapter took place in 2013 with restoration of the Solarium or 400 Rotunda. The timing was particularly important as the College completed the effort for the 125th anniversary of the opening of the Hotel Ponce de Leon and the 500th anniversary of the Spanish explorer Juan Ponce de Leon’s landing off the east coast of present-day Florida near St. Augustine.

Some of the early work undertaken for the 100th anniversary reflects outdated technology and conservation treatments. The College has retained a series of experts that return on a regular basis as part of a regular preservation, conservation, and maintenance schedule for the Ponce and the other fourteen historic campus buildings.

In addition to members of the Flagler and Kenan families on the Board of Trustees the College has added a broad range of talented people including alumni who were students early in the history of the institution. In all cases the campus facilities rank as a critical factor for participation with the organization. Oversight for the historic campus is strong as is the demonstrated commitment to historic preservation.

CHAPTER 9
A MOST BEAUTIFUL COLLEGE CAMPUS

Flagler College’s Restoration Campaign placed the institution and the Ponce in a national framework with regard to architectural significance, historic preservation, and attractive college campuses. Also, the success of the campaign elevated historic preservation’s potential in relation to campus buildings in the eyes of College administrators and trustees. With the Ponce’s location in the heart of downtown St. Augustine surrounded by historic buildings and the positive response to the historic campus by parents, students, and visitors, the College continued to pursue historic preservation efforts. This reinforced the symbiotic relationship between the success of the College as an educational institution and the enhancement of the College’s reputation as an attractive campus based on historical resources.¹

As Flagler College grew over the years and needed additional facilities, the institution’s commitment to historic preservation led to acquisition of Flagler-era buildings surrounding the campus. Master Plans were developed, the first in 1998 by architect Craig Thorn. A new plan and its updated were created in the decade following the millennium by Halback and Associates. As of 2013, the College campus includes fourteen historic buildings in addition to the five-building complex constructed originally as the Hotel Ponce de Leon. Flagler College’s efforts have cultivated a statewide reputation as the higher education institution with the state’s greatest commitment to historic preservation.

In 2006 the Flagler College campus ranked sixth in the nation for “most beautiful campuses” according to The Princeton Review. Shortly after this accolade, Florida

¹Ossman and Ewing, 31.
Trend magazine recognized the campus as Florida’s most beautiful college setting. MSN Travel included Flagler College on its list of the “15 Most Beautiful Campuses” for college settings that served as tourist attractions. In 2011 Education ranked the campus as one of the “20 Most Gorgeous College Campuses” in the United States, and The Princeton Review ranked the campus as one of its “20 Most Beautiful Campuses.” In 2012 the Florida Chapter of the American Institute of Architects announced the organization’s “Top 100 Buildings.” Flagler College joined this list as the most popular building from a public vote perspective.

Figure 9-1. Ponce de Leon Hall, Flagler College

Flagler College…has beautifully restored and maintained the National Historic Landmark building. And so it remains today, a tribute to Flagler’s restless retirement and to ‘the boys’—who had just the right mix of concrete, art, and imagination to make the vision a reality.

Laurie Ossman and Heather Ewing

Adding to the College's prestige was St. Augustine’s rating in U.S. News & World Report’s 2009 “10 Best Places to Live” and Forbes Magazine’s 2012 “10 Prettiest Towns in the U.S.” In 2011 National Geographic chose St. Augustine as one of the
“Ten Best Locations in the World” to experience holiday lights. *National Geographic Traveler* ranked twenty cities as “Best of the World 2013” including St. Augustine.

Figure 9-2. Juan Ponce de Leon (Chad Light)  
Florida Gov. Rick Scott, Cabinet Members and Ketterlinus Students

In 1967 writer Anne Carling acknowledged that from its 1888 opening, the hotel “has served as the undisputed center for St. Augustine social and cultural activities.” Flagler College’s campus, located in downtown St. Augustine, plays a strong community role. In addition to the extraordinary historic facilities the campus includes the city’s only auditorium, making the campus a center for events of state or national importance. Considering that the city has a population of only 13,700, drawing national attention verifies the historical importance of the city. Some recent noteworthy activities that took place on the campus include:
• January 29, 2004, Bruce Cole, Chairman of the National Endowment for the Humanities, announced the first round of “Landmarks of American History” grants in the Flagler Room (Grand Parlor) of Ponce de Leon Hall.\(^2\)

• Monday, July 18, 2011, at 10:00 a.m. Ken Salazar, United States Secretary of the Interior, addressed the inaugural meeting of the St. Augustine 450th Commemoration Commission. The meeting in the Flagler College (now Lewis) Auditorium drew numerous national and state dignitaries and a statewide audience of 500.\(^3\)

• August 13, 2012, Presidential candidate Mitt Romney campaigned before a crowd of 4,000 from the west lawn in the shadow of the Ponce Hall towers. Prior to the public event, he greeted and posed for a photo with Dr. Abare, Flagler College President in the Ponce Hall Rotunda.\(^4\)

• Tuesday, April 2, 2013, in honor of Spanish explorer Juan Ponce de Leon’s landing off the coast of “La Florida” Florida Governor Rick Scott and his Cabinet held their regular monthly meeting in the Flagler Room as part of the Viva Florida 500 commemorative program. Attendants included Ponce (Chad Light) and Ketterlinus Elementary School’s fourth graders.\(^5\)

Guests of Flagler College include national personalities as well. On February 9, 2010, Civil Rights activist, former Mayor of Atlanta, and former United Nations Ambassador Andrew Young returned to St. Augustine, site of the final chapter of the Civil Rights movement. He addressed a full house in the auditorium. Acclaimed author Pat Conroy packed the auditorium on January 11, 2011. St. Augustine’s Spanish


history and its longstanding role as a tourist haven bring to the College and community visitors that would seldom visit such small communities otherwise.

**Historic Campus Facilities**

**Markland House**

![Markland House](image)

Figure 9-3. Markland (Dr. Andrew Anderson House), n.d. [ca. 1978]

Initially, Flagler College’s activities were planned to be contained on the site for the former Hotel Ponce de Leon. Even before the institution opened in 1968, an opportunity arose to add another property. Immediately to the west of the Ponce, Dr. Andrew Anderson’s property Markland became part of the campus. In January 1968, in anticipation of Flagler College’s opening nine months later College officials announced that the four-acre Markland site had been purchased from the property’s second owner, the H.E. Wolfe family that had acquired the land from Clarissa Anderson Gibbs. The sale was for an undisclosed amount, though reportedly less than the appraised price of $147,000. The former plantation house was donated by the family to become the
College president’s house. The College recognized that a renovation was needed and added new mechanical systems and redecorated the building.\textsuperscript{6}

The main house at Markland, constructed between 1839 and 1841, began as a two-story, side-hall plan coquina block structure with plain square columns supporting a two-story full front porch. Clarissa Fairbanks Anderson, widow of Dr. Andrew Anderson, completed this structure. Dr. Anderson died six weeks after the construction began. In 1899, after Mrs. Anderson’s death, their son and Henry Flagler’s good friend Dr. Andrew Anderson II and his wife Elizabeth Smethurst Anderson, retained New York architect Charles Gifford to transform the simple, former citrus plantation house into a Beaux Arts mansion. Most likely, Anderson and Flagler had discussed retaining Gifford. As noted earlier, Flagler had witnessed Gifford’s work in the White Mountains and at Jekyll Island. Also, Gifford gained acclaim for the New Jersey building at the World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893 in Chicago.\textsuperscript{7}

For the Andersons, Gifford designed a solid brick addition to the western half of the residence which changed the floor plan to that of a center hall with two principal rooms to each side. He added a shingle-covered half story with a framed attic; completely renovated the entire interior of the building to reflect Gilded Age taste; and wrapped a two-story colossal Ionic-columned porch around the south and east sides. He included outbuildings, including a Billiard Building, a small shingled structure at the back (north) of the property for the gentlemen’s entertainment.


\textsuperscript{7}Markland House file, Flagler College Records.
For the first few years under the College’s ownership, the house was used as guest quarters for College visitors. Following that, it was used as the President’s house, a function that lasted three years before the spaces were used for classrooms. Part of the former plantation setting was redeveloped for tennis courts for the College. The Hotel Ponce de Leon and Markland retained their historic geographical relationship to each other and served Flagler College as the institution’s two most important historical resources. Today, they continue those roles and serve as community icons.\(^8\)

Between 1975 and 1989 the College had invested $220,478 in repairs to Markland House and the immediate environs. By 1990 Markland House was in need of a complete rehabilitation, including restoration of many features and details on the first floor. Many of the main architectural elements remained intact, but wear and tear necessitated a major effort to return those elements to their original appearance. The building was going to become an event venue, possibly even an alumni house, with the second floor maintained as faculty and staff offices. With assistance from Robert W. Harper, executive director of the Lightner Museum, interiors were restored. Curtains were replicated, and bookcases were restored to the Library.\(^9\)

Clarissa Anderson Gibbs returned to her childhood home, providing information important for the project. Though some of those involved in the effort were skeptical, her memory for room colors proved accurate after paint sampling analysis. Also, she retrieved family furniture and heirlooms for the house. Restoration required an investment of more than $220,000. In addition, Mrs. Gibbs established an endowment

\(^8\)Carberry interview.

\(^9\)Markland House file.
of a comparable amount for maintenance of the property, the principal of which has grown thanks to gifts from other Anderson family members.  

**Lewis House Planned Unit Development**

In the mid-1980s Flagler College needed additional facilities for students, specifically a men’s residence hall. The administration proposed to build a new building on Valencia Street midway between Cordova and Sevilla Streets, directly north of the Artists’ Studios building. In 1987 to accomplish the proposed construction which was a more intensive land use than permitted by the zoning classification, the College retained local architect Craig Thorn and applied for a Planned Unit Development (PUD).

The project included demolition of the late-19th century McNally House located on Valencia Street. The College committed to preserving three buildings constructed in conjunction with the Hotel Ponce de Leon. These buildings, located on the east, west, and north sides of the building site, would serve as a buffer for the neighborhood: 6 Valencia Street, or Casa Amarylla; 20 Valencia Street, known as the Union Generals’ House; and 9 Carrera Street, one of the Ponce cottages, winter season residences available for lease through the hotel. All four structures were contributing buildings in the Model Land Company Historic District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1983.

After considerable negotiating between the College and the City with significant input from community residents, the College received approval of the PUD, including

---


11Baker interview.

demolition of the McNally House. The size of the new building was reduced to two stories and “the architectural style of the building was chosen to harmonize with the 1880’s art studio across the street.” Lewis House, a masonry building of brick and stucco featured a symmetrical plan with open balconies and was designed in size, scale, mass and materials to respond to the Artists’ Studios building.\textsuperscript{13}

The $4,600,000 project included $1,400,000 for renovation of the three Flagler-era structures. Funds were provided by the William R. Kenan, Jr. Charitable Trust, the Flagler Foundation, and the College’s resources.\textsuperscript{14}

**Union Generals’ House**

![Figure 9-4. Union Generals’ House, Flagler College](image)

This frame Victorian house was constructed for Henry Flagler by builders McGuire and McDonald to serve as a home for Osborn Dunlap Seavey, manager of the Ponce. A gray concrete veneer was applied to this frame building that was scored to


\textsuperscript{14}Flagler College records.
appear as masonry, and the trim was brick. The façade reflected the appearance of the hotel. Later, “Seavey Cottage” became known as the “Union Generals' House” to honor two Federal officers who had served in the Civil War.\textsuperscript{15}

John M. Schofield, Commanding General of the United States Army and former Secretary of War, moved into the cottage in 1899. Schofield graduated from the U. S. Military Academy in 1853, served in Florida during the 1850s, and was awarded the Congressional Medal of Honor for valor at the Battle of Wilson's Creek in 1861. General Schofield’s “Definition of Discipline” quotation has been memorized by generations of West Point cadets. The General died at the residence in 1906. Beginning in 1916, General Martin D. Hardin occupied the house. Shortly after graduating from the U. S. Military Academy in 1859, he served under Robert E. Lee and was with him at Harper’s Ferry. Hardin gained fame as a fearless field commander and was seriously wounded several times, losing an arm in an engagement with Mosby’s guerillas in 1863. He passed away in the house in 1923.\textsuperscript{16}

In 1973, Flagler College acquired the Union Generals’ House. Due to its substantially-deteriorated condition, the building was used sparingly. In 1985, as the need for administrative facilities grew, the College retained St. Augustine architect Craig Thorn to oversee rehabilitation of the structure with A. D. Davis Construction Company serving as the general contractor. Initially, the cost was anticipated to be $300,000. Engineering studies indicated that the cost would be $400,000. In 1986, as the project progressed, the College and Trustees reevaluated the situation. They made a decision

\textsuperscript{15}Flagler College records, 20 Valencia Street file.

\textsuperscript{16}Flagler College Records, Union Generals unpublished typescript for historical marker.
that the rehabilitation was “in the best interest of the College and the community” and continued. The actual cost was closer to $500,000.17

Water channeled through a faulty built-in gutter system had caused extensive damage to walls and sheathing under the concrete and brick veneer. In some areas, nearly half of each structural member was completely destroyed. Due to concern that the building would collapse, 2”x10” braces were installed around the perimeter of the building. Both the roof structure and most of the veneer were removed to correct the structural deficiencies. Custom made concrete bricks, 4” high, 5” wide and 15” long were fabricated by a Jacksonville firm and installed on the building as 85% of the original materials were beyond repair. Portions of the building had insufficient foundations to support the walls and floor loads and required reinforcement and reconstruction. The west wing of the building was termite eaten and unsalvageable.18

In early 1987, the project was completed at a cost of $471,853. The building’s new use was for administrative services, the College’s finance department. In addition to receiving significant local praise for the work, in Tampa, Governor Bob Martinez presented to Flagler College a Florida Trust for Historic Preservation Award of Merit for the Adaptive Use of a Historic Structure.19

Thompson Hall

In 1888 Henry Flagler had built several cottages for senior staff or winter visitors who preferred privacy to staying in the hotel. Twin residences, known as the Ponce de

17Feagin, Seavey Cottage Restoration. Flagler College Grant Records.


Leon Cottages, were built at 7 and 9 Carrera Street in the block north of the Hotel. Each was Queen Anne in style, built in frame with tall hipped roofs pierced with brick chimneys and featuring elaborate wraparound porches replete with gingerbread. An unusual feature was use of 4/4 double hung sash windows, a pane configuration rarely seen. Originally, the two houses were "boldly painted in contrasting colors to highlight the difference between siding and trim, and between different stories of the house." The building at 7 Carrera Street was demolished about 1970 for a parking lot.20

Figure 9-5. Ponce de Leon Cottage/Thompson Hall

Guests who occupied the house at 9 Carrera Street included Mr. and Mrs. Alexander Brinton Coxe of Pennsylvania. The Coxe Brothers and Company firm specialized in anthracite coal mining and production facilities, owning the mining lands for more than 100 years. They supported local sporting activities in St. Augustine including golf and yachting. From 1911 to 1925 retired Union Army Captain Henry and Mrs. Anna Marcotte lived in the house. She was president of organizations which

20Flagler College Records, Ponce de Leon Cottage/Thompson Hall. Advancement, Grant Records.
promoted medical care and municipal improvements and wrote *The Tatler* newspaper that commented favorably on Henry Flagler’s enterprises.  

The property experienced transitional uses until brought into the Flagler College campus in 1971. The College undertook major capital improvements to the exterior of the structure, particularly after hurricanes, to keep the building in a usable condition. In 1987 contemporary treatments were implemented to convert the building to faculty office use. The building was moved forward on the lot which enabled development of a parking lot for the new Lewis House dormitory.

In 2008 the College undertook a second rehabilitation of the building. This time, the prescribed treatment met the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation with the restored historic exterior while ensuring continued functionality as an educational facility. Work items include correction of termite and environmental damage; removal of drop ceilings with acoustical tiles or sprayed-on finishes; elimination of flush doors, carpet, partition walls and fireplace enclosures.

In their places were new mechanical systems and interior finishes compatible with the original structure. Heart pine floors were sanded and refinished. Fireplace mantles were repaired, though for decorative purposes only. Hearth tiles were reproduced by a Jacksonville artist. One original 7-panel solid wood door remained that enabled reproduction for the other openings in the building. Ceilings, crown molding, door and window casings, tall baseboard, and lighting fixtures added to the appearance.

---

21 Advancement, Grant Records.
22 Feagin, Seavey Cottage Restoration. Advancement, Grant Records.
23 Advancement, Grant Records.
As with Markland Cottage, shutters were reproduced this time from a ca. 1890 black and white photograph of the building. They provide hurricane protection.24

The State of Florida provided $48,000 in a small matching grant. St. Augustine residents Pierre, Shirley and Paul Thompson made a gift of $200,000 for the project. The building was rededicated as Thompson Hall in their honor. In addition to faculty offices, the building became home to the Upchurch Pre-Law Program.25

**Wiley Hall**

![Wiley Hall](image)

Figure 9-6. Casa Amarylla/Wiley Hall

Built in 1898 for the Hotel Ponce de Leon physician by builder James McGuire, the house became a guest cottage for the hotel in the early 20th century. The building featured 4/4 double-hung windows, a configuration developed after the Civil War, but used only for a short time. In 1900 Henry Flagler sold the property. New owners Mr. and Mrs. Albert Lewis of Pennsylvania updated the building, adding a large front porch,

---

24Advancement, Grant Records.

25Advancement, Grant Records.
a two-story rear addition, and a cut coquina block chimney and fireplace. They named the building “Casa Amarylla” or yellow house. They added electricity, with the dynamo located in a separate coquina building located northeast of the main house, a Greek Revival style cottage with palm tree columns and a coquina fireplace.26

In 1936 Louise Wise Francis, principal heir of her aunt Mary Lily Kenan (Mrs. Henry) Flagler’s estate and formerly the Lewis’s daughter-in-law (not related to Lawrence Lewis, Sr.), bought the property. She had St. Augustine architect F.A. Hollingsworth redesign the exterior with a Colonial Revival façade and porte cochere and a two-story sunroom wing on the east side. The interior was modified to accommodate a “nursery school” to assist families in St. Augustine during the economic depression. In 1937 Mrs. Francis died suddenly before opening of the school. After passing to several owners Mrs. Francis’s son Lawrence Lewis, Jr. acquired the house and gave the building to Flagler College.27

In 1988 Molly Lewis Wiley provided $709,078 for conversion of the building to offices for admissions and financial aid, following the changes that had been initiated half a century earlier with the kindergarten conversion. In January of 1989 the building was rededicated as Wiley Hall. On September 30 of that year the building garnered an adaptive use award, an “Award of Merit in the Field of Preservation,” from the Florida Trust in a ceremony held at the Branscomb Auditorium at Florida Southern College. 28

---

26Flagler College Grant Records, Casa Amarylla SJ2293, Florida Site File.
27Flagler College Records, Casa Amarylla Site File.
Markland Cottage

The Markland Cottage project merits mention. Almost the smallest building on the campus at 20’ x 30’ the cottage was constructed as a Billiard Building for Dr. Andrew Anderson II who entertained his close male friends there including Henry Flagler. The building reflects stylistic elements and materials found in Markland House. When Clarissa Anderson Gibbs sold the Markland property to the H. E. Wolfe family the children used the Billiard Building for their activities.29

Figure 9-7. Billiard Building/Markland Cottage

Flagler College used the tiny building as a classroom. When academic standards changed, and the building was too small to meet square foot requirements for academic purposes, the building became faculty housing. Then, for more than 20 years the building served as a storage facility. Hurricanes and storms caused structural damage to the east wall. Insects and vermin inhabited the premises. Certainly, the

29Flagler College Records, Billiard Building/Markland Cottage.
College recognized that the National Register-listed and local landmark had to stand, but could not justify restoration of a building “with no use.”

In 2005 Flagler College competed successfully to host a charter regional center for the new State-funded Florida Public Archaeology Network (FPAN) headquartered at the University of West Florida. Flagler College committed Markland Cottage as the office headquarters for that use. The building reopened the following summer after a rehabilitation undertaken with a $48,000 State of Florida Small Matching Grant-in-Aid matched with $61,500 in funds provided by Flagler College.

The building was restored to its appearance of 1901, including reproducing missing details based on information found in fragments of original materials. For example, originally sycamore used in the wainscoting, columns, doors and trim had been shipped to Florida from Pennsylvania. For the rehabilitation new sycamore was obtained and run through a planer forty times to replicate the appearance of the original material. Every facet of the woodwork: mantle, columns, wainscoting, cornice, windows, frames, doors, shutters, latticework, and porch railing, was rebuilt exactly (including milling dimensioned lumber).

Where exterior shingles were damaged, others from the north side (rear) of the building became replacements. New shingles were used on the north side. The windows operate as do the louvered shutters which serve as hurricane protection. The building retains plaster walls and canvas covered ceilings. Even the palm log column that was damaged over time was replaced with another of the same approximate age.

---

30 Advancement, Grant Records.
31 Advancement, Grant Records.
and from the same general location. Vintage flooring was located to patch damaged sections of the original oak tongue-and-groove installation. The cigar burn in the center of the floor was left intact—evidence of the building’s original recreational purpose. The original marble bathroom sink was reinstalled. New, energy-efficient mechanical systems were concealed in the building. A handicapped ramp was added to the east side where it would be unobtrusive; the railing matched that of the porch railing, a section of which was hinged to maintain the appearance of the porch.\footnote{Advancement, Grant Records.}

The remarkably pure and accurate effort merited an Outstanding Achievement Award from the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation at the annual conference in Pensacola and achieved accolades from the St. Augustine community and FPAN personnel. Alumni and friends, reading about the project in the College’s Magazine, were thrilled to see the tiny building returned to use.\footnote{Advancement, Grant Records.}

Palm Cottage
Figure 9-8. Power House/Palm Cottage

This small, yet charming Greek Revival-styled building housed the steam dynamo that powered the adjacent residence Casa Amarylla (to the right in the photograph). The cut coquina stone building retains the original central entry with a stone soldier arch and palm tree trunk columns supporting the gable roof with Greek broken-pediment detail. Palm tree trunk columns are found on other Flagler College buildings, specifically the Artists' Studios building and on Markland Cottage. The interior includes a finely cut coquina stone fireplace. Over time additions enabled the building to serve as a campus guest residence before being converted to the Counseling Services center.\(^{34}\)

**Anderson Cottage**

Figure 9-9. Anderson Cottage/Crisp-Ellert House

\(^{34}\)Flagler College Records, Power House/Palm Cottage and Wiley Hall files.
By 1870, a widowed Clarissa Fairbanks Anderson built on her property, “Markland,” a 2-story, gable-roofed, frame “winter cottage” for guests. The house sat on King Street east of Markland House. For construction of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, Henry Flagler purchased a portion of Markland and moved the cottage from King Street half a block to the west side of Sevilla Street. Half a century later, architect Fred Henderich updated the building to reflect the architectural style most readily associated with Florida’s 1920s real estate boom, Mediterranean Revival.35

In the 1990s Drs. Robert Ellert and JoAnn Crisp-Ellert bought the house for their residence. They participated in arts, culture and historic preservation activities throughout the St. Augustine community. In 2006, while in their 80s, the Ellerts participated in the Florida Trust conference hosted in St. Augustine. Shortly after that time they began dialogue with Flagler College to ensure preservation of their historic house. Both of the Ellerts died in the next several months. Before that time the Ellerts donated the property to Flagler College with the Florida Trust serving an oversight role to ensure preservation of the building. The College constructed the Crisp-Ellert Art Museum to honor Dr. JoAnn Crisp-Ellert.

Anderson Cottage, the Ellerts house, remains in good condition, though the kitchen and five bathrooms need major updating including new mechanical systems. The house is arranged in a manner that enables common uses on the first floor, including events, and semi-private residential suites on the second floor. In 2012 the College installed a new barrel clay tile roof on the building, matching the roof that had

35Flagler College Records, Anderson Cottage file,
been installed during the Mediterranean Revival conversion. Plans are underway to rehabilitate the building to its 1920s appearance.

**Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings**

In 2006 as Florida East Coast Industries (FECI) anticipated an international acquisition, the company approached Flagler College to assist in preserving the historically significant Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings. This complex of three, four-story Commercial Style towers includes nearly 60,000 square feet of space and stands as the most direct link to Henry Flagler's railroad empire. The buildings sit on the site of Flagler's original St. Augustine train station.  

![Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings](image)

Figure 9-10. Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings, Flagler College

With assistance from a significant gift-of-equity by FECI, Flagler College acquired the trio, converting them to residence halls for upper-class students. The three Commercial Style towers remain much as they were constructed on the exterior. Each is identified by a first story with large plate glass “storefront” windows; a cornice or stringcourse separating the first from the second story; single, paired, or triple windows.

---

36Flagler College Records, Florida East Coast Railway General Office Buildings file.
on the upper floors; and a substantial cornice indicating the top and flat-roofed portion of the building.\textsuperscript{37}

Between 1981 and 1983 the original open walkway that connected the three buildings was enclosed. In 2000, for the millennium, FECI had made a major investment in the buildings. The structures were in extremely good condition when they were transferred to Flagler College. The floors and wainscoting were marble as were the open staircases. Brass hardware was used throughout the three buildings including the surface of the elevator doors.\textsuperscript{38}

The conversion from offices to residence halls left these dramatic details in place. Room divisions were established recognizing the triple window groupings. Changed for security reasons were doors with glass upper panels, heavy wood trim and floor surfaces. Secondary fire egresses were established at the ends of the corridors. The project was recognized in 2012 with an Adaptive Use Award from the Florida Trust at its annual meeting in Gainesville.\textsuperscript{39}

65 and 66 Cuna Street

As Flagler College continued to grow, private properties were offered to the College for acquisition. With the general decline in the economy began in recent years, this trend increased. In the last couple of years the College added two properties to its holdings, properties located near the Communication Building at Cuna and Cordova Streets. These Victorian-era residential buildings in the St. Augustine Historic District

\textsuperscript{37}Flagler College Records.

\textsuperscript{38}Flagler College Records.

\textsuperscript{39}Flagler College Records.
were converted decades ago to commercial use. The two houses with a connector identified as 66 Cuna Street continue as offices for Communication Department faculty. The building at 65 Cuna Street houses WFCF 88.5 Flagler College Radio. The buildings continue to serve as contributing buildings in the St. Augustine Town Plan National Historic Landmark District.

**New Campus Facilities**

The City of St. Augustine maintains a strong historic preservation ordinance with rigorous design review standards. These regulations pertain to new construction in historic districts as well as to rehabilitation of historic buildings. Flagler College has added seven new buildings on all sides of the campus: Gymnasium (1976), Lewis House (1987), Lewis Auditorium (1991), Proctor Library (1996), Cedar Hall (2004), Ringhaver Student Center (2007), and Hanke Hall (2012). The College is beginning construction on a new academic building Pollard Hall (2013-2014). Proctor Library, pictured above, is representative of the design and materials of the Hotel Ponce de Leon, yet is clearly new construction. The new buildings meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation for context and respect the historic integrity of St. Augustine.40

---

40Flagler College Records, Dr. William L. Proctor Library file.
Historic Preservation, nationally, was undergoing a change in emphasis to incorporating historic context in both documentation of properties and their rehabilitation. Efforts by Flagler College may be reflective of regional or national trends that were in transition in the early 1980s. This era, during President Ronald Reagan’s administration (1981-1988), ranks as the only time in the past forty years when a president recommended $0 in the federal appropriation for historic preservation each and every year. Federal grants for historic preservation had been discontinued as well.

**Commitment to Historic Preservation**

When the Hotel Ponce de Leon became the headquarters building for the newly-established Flagler College, the building reflected recent uses as a Coast Guard training facility and as a declining hotel. In 1965 Lewis became head of the Flagler System, Inc. that owned the hotel. Interviewed in 1985, he recalled that the Ponce had lost viability as a resort. At times, only ten guest rooms were filled, and losses amounted to
$250,000-$500,000 annually. The hotel had remained open to accommodate Lewis’s Kenan relatives, his grandmother, aunt and uncle.41

In 1968 when the building became headquarters for the new all women’s institution Flagler College, concern for preservation was reflected in early statements to the community, “the entire lower floor of the hotel will be preserved in its present form”. Women students lived in the former hotel rooms. Maintenance focused on the use of hotel rooms for women students’ dormitory rooms.42

Quite possibly, some of the community reassurances were made due to the demolition in 1950 by Lewis of his childhood home and Henry Flagler’s mansion Kirkside. The building designed by Carrère & Hastings was located immediately west of Memorial Presbyterian Church on Valencia Street. After the building had witnessed significant decline during the 1940s when it was used as a school, it required an estimated $20,000 in repairs. Many elements of the building were salvaged and incorporated into other sites and structures throughout St. Augustine. The property was sub-divided into thirteen building lots.

In 1971 when Lewis restructured the college he enlisted several distinguished community members to serve as trustees including John D. Bailey, Sr., Frank Upchurch, Jr., and Howell Melton. L. C. Ringhaver continued as a trustee. Several faculty or staff members remained, adding stability. In the spring of 1971 Dr. William L. Proctor and William T. Abare, Jr. joined the College as President and Director of


Admissions, respectively. They continue after more than forty years, today as Chancellor and President, respectively. They were responsible for introducing into the College’s mission statement preservation of the Ponce as a tribute to Henry M. Flagler.

Certainly, one of the reasons that the building remained intact can be attributed to support from the Flagler and Kenan families. Henry Flagler’s third wife was North Carolina debutante Mary Lily Kenan. Her siblings had maintained legal residency at the Ponce spending each winter there until their deaths in the mid-1960s.

Will Kenan created the William R. Kenan, Jr. Charitable Trust. Jessie Kenan Wise’s shares in Standard Oil stock established the Flagler Foundation. Her grandchildren Lawrence Lewis, Jr. and “Molly” Lewis Wiley grew up in Richmond, Virginia, and across the street from the Ponce at Kirkside, Flagler’s residence. They were entrusted with the foundation’s assets and served on the Kenan Trust board.43

Lewis financially supported construction of Lewis House, the College’s first men’s residence hall, and the Gymnasium and Auditorium. Lewis and Wiley supported Flagler College as trustees or as donors until their deaths in 1995 and 2010, respectively. This family association continues with their children and grandchildren.

In addition, Henry Flagler’s direct heirs support the institution. Though the majority of his estimated $60,000,000 estate passed to Mary Lily Flagler, his will established a trust that transferred securities to his son Harry Harkness Flagler and his granddaughters Mary Harkness Flagler, Elizabeth Lamont Flagler and Jean Louise

43Both Lewis and Wiley were involved in preservation efforts in their home state of Virginia, Lewis with Jamestown, and both with the University of Virginia. Also, both were involved with preservation at UNC-Wilmington and UNC-Chapel Hill. Their mother was principal heir to Henry Flagler’s fortune through her aunt Mary Lily Kenan. Campbell, 329. Foster interview.
Flagler. Each of the descendants inherited 1,000 shares of Standard Oil stock. Currency today is valued at more than 23 times that a century ago. The Standard Oil Trust split by order of the U.S. Supreme Court following charges of violations of the Sherman Anti-Trust Act. The 34 successor companies include today’s Chevron, ExxonMobil and ConocoPhillips.  

The College’s new admissions building Hanke Hall completed in 2012 was named in honor of Henry Flagler’s great-grandson Col. G. F. Robert Hanke. The project received an infill design award from the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation in St. Augustine in 2013. George Matthews, Hanke’s oldest brother, began supporting with College with participation in the Restoration Campaign for the Ponce’s Centennial anniversary in 1988. In 2011 Matthews’ granddaughter and Henry Flagler’s great-great-great-granddaughter became a student at Flagler College, living her freshman year in the women’s residence hall known originally as the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

---


45Flagler College Records, Hanke Hall file. Lawrence Lewis, Jr. had an interest in management of the Ponce after World War II. His uncle Will Kenan was unready to turn over the reins of the company at that time. Lewis bought land in the Bahamas, in 1955 on Stocking Island and in 1958 opened the Club Peace and Plenty at George Town on nearby Great Exuma. St. Augustine Foundation Archives.
Figure 9-12. Hanke Hall

**Research for Ensuring Authenticity and Accuracy**

With regard to the research process, Flagler College was extremely fortunate. Ownership of the Hotel Ponce de Leon transferred from Henry M. Flagler to his corporate holding company in the 20th century, the Flagler System. Flagler served as president until turning over the reins to Will Kenan who operated the property for sixty years. At that time Lawrence Lewis, Jr. became president and shortly thereafter, assisted in the transfer of the property’s use from hotel to college. He was involved with the Ponce throughout his lifetime and served on the College’s Board of Trustees from 1968 until his death in 1995.46

With the exception of World War II, when the Coast Guard leased the building for a training facility, for more than 100 years the Ponce had been overseen by only three men. During that time, the hotel rooms were updated regularly to meet the fashion of

---

46Background on Kenan from annual reports of The William Rand Kenan, Jr. Charitable Trust and Campbell, *Across Fortune’s Tracks.*
the day. In contrast and more importantly, the Hotel’s grand spaces, though in decline, remained unchanged from the time of completion.

The corporate and family relationships enabled the property records to remain with the building and supplied sources for a wealth of oral history. Many of the written records remain in the College’s Archives. In addition, furnishings, fine and decorative arts, and many works from Henry Flagler’s personal art collection stayed with the building, too. Moreover, many other documents and furnishings that were removed from the Ponce are incorporated in the collection or archives at Whitehall, The Henry Morrison Flagler Museum in Palm Beach. The collaboration between the Museum and the Ponce is lengthy and beneficial to both parties.

Furthermore, the Library of Congress retains, in its American Memory collection, dozens of black and white photographs of the Hotel Ponce de Leon (of the more than 260 photos of St. Augustine images). This collection includes photographs taken throughout the hotel’s history up to the end of World War II. These photographs enabled accuracy in the restoration of the building’s major rooms.

Many of the best quality images were made by William Henry Jackson in the 1880s and 1890s. He traveled the country, frequently at the behest of the railroads, recording natural and built features along their routes. Jackson’s photographs provide excellent representations of the interior and exterior of the Ponce in its early years, during the height of its resort era.47

Archival research for the restoration of the Dining Hall, Rotunda and Flagler Room included those primary sources. Though the research was a critical component

to the restoration, it proved nearly as valuable as financing the work. Due to the deliberative nature of the project planning, the College was able to seek financial underwriting from local, state, and national foundations, corporations, and individuals.

Flagler College’s commitment to scholarly research can be traced to at least 1994 and dialogue between the College and the University of Florida regarding an “Institute for Historic Preservation” in St. Augustine. Discussions between a variety of local officials and academics from Florida colleges and universities translated into establishment of the Historic St. Augustine Research Institute in the fall of 1999. “Flagler College founder Lawrence J. Lewis, Jr. always had a deep interest in the history of St. Augustine.” His St. Augustine Foundation provided the financial support necessary for the institute’s efforts through annual grants. Dr. Thomas Graham representing Flagler College, and Dr. Kathleen Deagan representing the University of Florida, serve as the co-directors of the Institute.48

**Fundraising as a Component of Accuracy**

Flagler College’s campus preservation program as outlined in chapters 8 and 9 illustrates the importance and benefits of public and private funding. The following summary paragraphs address the public funding within an overall framework of the State and federal grant programs for an understanding of Flagler College’s role within that framework.

The College’s restoration program coincided with the State of Florida’s implementation of the Special Category grant program. The first state program to fund

---

historic preservation bricks and mortar projects, this initiative grew from an initial appropriation in 1983 of $400,000 to more than $17,000,000 in 2006. Over the past thirty years of the program’s existence, more than $300,000,000 has been appropriated by the State of Florida. Matching funds account for more than double that amount.49

The peer-reviewed Special Category grant program provides funding from $50,000 to $350,000 for acquisition and development (bricks and mortar), archaeological, or large-scale exhibition projects. In 1989 Flagler College submitted an application for funding. With inclusion of the small matching grants received and an appropriation in 2013, the College has secured a total of sixteen grants for the Hotel Ponce de Leon totaling $3,212,270 in State funds. In addition, three other campus’ historic buildings have benefitted—Markland House, Markland Cottage, and Ponce de Leon Cottage/Thompson Hall, sharing $114,000 in State grant funds.50

As noted previously, several of these grants received the highest ranking from the Historic Preservation Advisory Council, in 2002 reconstituted as the Florida Historical Commission. Though State grants have benefitted hundreds of preservation projects in all of Florida’s 67 counties, seldom have the same applicants garnered repeated first place postings. These rankings reflected the historical importance and architectural significance of the building; the high quality of the work proposed and accomplished; and the amount and breadth of matching funds provided.51

50These figures exclude additional Community Education grants totaling less than $50,000. Flagler College Archives.
51Advancement, Grant Records.
Beyond the $25,000 federal pass-through grant for the tower repairs, a second federal grant was awarded. The Save America’s Treasures (SAT) grant (12-01-ML-1151), for $400,000 assisted with window restoration. In 2010 Flagler College received a second SAT grant of nearly $49,562 for conservation of the Carrere and Hastings drawings for the Hotel and the adjacent Flagler Memorial Presbyterian Church. The conservation grant was one of five awards made nationwide and the only project to receive funding outside major cities in the northeast United States. Few projects in the country have been selected to receive a grant from each of the two categories.52

Currently, public funding for Flagler College’s historic buildings totals $3,833,830. This accounts for about 6.5 percent of the total invested in the buildings, historic and new. The balance has come from private foundations, corporations, and individuals. The total investment approaches $60,000,000, per capita more than other Florida college with an historic campus. (Appendix II provides details on public funding and recognition.)53

Though success in fundraising does not ensure accuracy, continued support from private and public sources does indicate recognition of noteworthy efforts. Also, the College began to gain a national reputation for its preservation achievements. Restoration of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon, showcasing the Dining Room’s conservation, was the subject of a feature story in the November/December 1987 issue of the National Trust for Historic Preservation’s Historic Preservation magazine.

52Advancement, Grant Records.

53Advancement, Grant Records. Flagler College Business Services Records.
Over the quarter century since then, the College’s preservation efforts have been recognized by numerous organizations, and the campus has been included in dozens of publications and featured in television shows and movies. Scholars from throughout the world tour the Ponce to witness the architectural grandeur, to learn about concrete construction and the use of terra cotta, to study the Tiffany windows, and to experience the murals by Maynard and Tojetti. The campus possesses a level of significance much greater than that of any other institution of higher education.
“The historic monuments of a people may be regarded as the features of its countenance, through which is revealed the soul of that people.”

Thomas Hastings

Today, the 125-year-old Hotel Ponce de Leon stands in a high state of preservation. The entire property’s appearance attests to the five decades of effort that have been invested by Flagler College to return the property to the grandeur of the Gilded Age and incorporate contemporary facilities and systems to meet academic needs. Dedication of the rehabilitated Solarium in the spring of 2013 completed the return of the five-building complex to active, vibrant and compatible uses that showcase the construction, architectural details and artistic decoration. With recently-completed construction and conservation projects the building represents the era in which its benefactor Henry Flagler enjoyed hosting his guests there.¹

In September of 2012, the College completed restoration of the eleven crystal chandeliers in the Grand Parlor, now the Flagler Room. That dramatic visual change returned the room to the way it had appeared at the hotel’s opening in 1888 and removed the anachronistic colonial modifications that had been made early in the twentieth century. Also, the lighting quality enabled removal of supplemental contemporary lighting that detracted from the room’s authenticity.

Hotel rooms have been modified to accommodate college student needs with new bathrooms and twenty-first century technology while retaining high ceilings, doors, woodwork, and in some cases and for decorative purposes only, fireplaces and mantles. Similarly, the facilities’ building identified as Kenan Hall reflects a modern interior and technologically-enhanced classrooms. In both cases, those areas were updated regularly throughout the hotel era to meet the changing demands of that industry. Original fabric, if remaining at the time that preservation was initiated, continues to be part of those buildings.

The Ponce contributes greatly to the campus being recognized regularly as one of the nation’s most beautiful academic settings. Author Susan Braden asserts that the Ponce as a hotel became a destination, a location that was widely known and desirable to visit. That legacy remains. The property conveys a sense of place. Tourists visit the Flagler College campus as do people who have an interest in the institution’s academic programs. Together, this number is estimated to be 100,000 annually, making the College one of the region’s most popular attractions as judged by attendance and visitor satisfaction. An authentic historic site is interpreted accurately.2

Florida’s dramatic population growth and land development took place during the 1980s. To ensure that the state’s historic properties could be viable economic partners during this boom era, the State’s Division of Historical Resources took a lead and partnered with the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation. Their joint emphasis resulted in a strong financial commitment by the State of Florida through a legislatively-funded

2Braden, 252. Flagler College regularly ranks in popularity in the top five of the area’s 69 attractions. The attendance numbers are exclusive of the anticipated 1 million people that view the exterior of the building, a sizable portion of the 7,500,000 annual visitors to St. Johns County.
effort known as the Special Category grant program. For twenty-five years this program was the largest of its kind in the United States in terms of funds appropriated and projects benefitted. Private dollars invested counted for several times those approved for the program by the Florida Legislature. Historic properties with great public visibility, such as the Ponce were ideal candidates to benefit from this program and demonstrate the economic, cultural, and social benefits of preservation.

The College retained a number of archival documents related to the building’s construction and use, left with the property by the Flagler System. These provided a foundation for exploring the building’s importance architecturally and historically. Also, all of the trustees were committed to preserving the building, so College policy and priorities could work toward that goal.

The Ponce is an architectural landmark. For construction the building required a talented and creative team, a cadre of youthful men from New York and New England. As the first commission for architects John Merven Carrère and Thomas Hastings, their only major collaboration with Bernard Maybeck, and his only major project on the east coast, the building has heightened significance. Carrère & Hastings became a major firm, and with the centennial anniversary in 2011 of the New York Public Library, their importance as architects is continuing to be elevated.

New research into previously-unavailable primary and fresh secondary sources provided a compelling argument that Maybeck played a more important role in design and execution of the Ponce than that for which he had been credited. His contemporaries and students in California, collections of private papers, and his
interview with architect Frederick Nichols at the zenith of his career, all attest to his direct role in construction of the Ponce.

Many of the materials regarding Maybeck were generated as the American Institute of Architects was celebrating its 100th anniversary. The organization released a listing of what it considered to be the nation's 100 most important buildings. On that list was the Ponce which may have revived interest in Maybeck’s contributions. On the other hand, the hotel was certainly beyond its heyday and was not inspiring newsworthy attention as had been the case when it was in its prime.

The building incorporated the talents of inventor Thomas Edison, making the hotel one of the first buildings in the nation to have electricity and the site of the largest incandescent lighting plant up to that time. Also, one of the property’s artesian wells provided sufficient water power to operate Edison's steam turbine. In both cases, the Ponce was the site of internationally important inventions and engineering firsts.

Louis Comfort Tiffany, though quite well known today, was much less so at the time that he created the seventy-nine stained glass windows and helped design the interiors in the Ponce. Over time many of his works were moved from their original locations or destroyed. The Morse Museum of American Art is widely recognized as home to the largest collection of Tiffany materials. The importance of the Tiffany collection at the Ponce is acknowledged in the museum’s interpretation. For their number and their depiction of Tiffany’s early glass designs, the works at the Ponce are recognized as remarkable.

Other personalities, though not as widely known, are recognized in their fields and warrant recognition for their contributions to the Ponce: shipbuilders-turned-
building contractors James McGuire and Joseph McDonald, concrete engineer William Kennish, interior designers Auguste Pottier and William Stymus, painters George Willoughby Maynard, Herman Schladermundt, and Virgilio Tojetti, and glass artisan Maitland Armstrong. Many of these men’s works were created for buildings that no longer stand. The high quality of their efforts expressed in the Ponce is heightened by the rarity of the existence of these works, particularly in a structure where they can be experienced and appreciated by the public.

In its tenure as a hotel the Ponce ranked as a social center nationally and internationally from its place as a preeminent winter resort and locally as the hub of social activities in St. Augustine. Sports, entertainment, gambling, politics, galas, masked balls, concerts, drama productions, movies, and athletic competitions, all were hosted and sponsored by the Ponce. Though the Hotel Alcazar was the site of pastimes such as the casino and swimming, the Ponce remained as the dominant hotel with these diversions as part of the repertoire.

Arguably, the most remarkable of these entertainments was the hotel’s sponsorship of the predominant Negro League baseball team of the late-1880s, the Cuban Giants. Though the men who played for the team were outstanding athletes, they were breaking new ground in the segregated South as Jim Crow laws were become more established. More amazing in light of the mores at the time was the speech made in the Ponce Dining Room made in February of 1889 by player Frank Thompson addressing racism in the South.

Throughout its time as a hotel the Ponce hosted numerous dignitaries including six men who served as U.S. Presidents. Grover Cleveland, Theodore Roosevelt, and
Warren G. Harding each stayed during his term as leader of the nation. William McKinley came to the hotel when he was Governor of Ohio. Lyndon B. Johnson helped launch St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary activities in March of 1963. The information on these five men is well documented.

New information revealed that future president John Fitzgerald Kennedy came to the Ponce as a youth. With the family’s long-time ties to Palm Beach and JFK’s use of the family property there as a winter White House, his enthusiasm for St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration may have been personally as well as politically inspired.

As St. Augustine’s role as a resort community declined the Ponce’s role increased in importance as a host site for local activities. Virtually no social event of any standing occurred without some role played by the Ponce. Even in 1938 at the height of the Great Depression, the gala opening for the research and entertainment attraction Marineland was held in the Dining Room of the hotel. By this time both the Casa Monica and the Alcazar had closed. The Ponce afforded the only luxury accommodations in the area.

The mid-twentieth century proved to be more challenging to the economic survival of the Ponce than had been its displacement as Florida’s prime winter destination. St. Augustine, a small community with a tourism-based economy, fared poorly when the traveling public stayed home or went to war. In the latter case, the Ponce’s service from 1942 to 1945 as headquarters for the Coast Guard Reserve provided economic sustenance to the community and a social diversion as well. Though using the building was more desirable that closing it, this era proved to be the final time that the Hotel Ponce de Leon was fully occupied. The following decade of the
1950s completed the grand hotel’s tenure as desirable lodging. Post-war auto production, interstate highway construction, and modern building materials ended interest in an antiquated building with outmoded systems.

The Ponce’s role in St. Augustine’s 400th anniversary celebration proved to be the building’s final chapter as a hotel. From hosting a variety of events and activities for dignitaries from throughout the world to sponsoring two episodes of the Route 66 television series as a way to showcase the city nationally, the Ponce completed its tenure as a grand hotel with the finesse that had been the hotel’s trademark for nearly eighty years.

Rebirth of the hotel as a college was begun when the community was at the height of preparations for the city’s 400th anniversary celebration and in the midst of recreating the Spanish colonial town. The grand old hotel was resurrected as the symbol of a new educational institution. As the transition began, community leaders noted that, over time, Flagler College might become a greater asset to the region than the Hotel Ponce de Leon had been.

Early efforts emphasized reversal of deferred maintenance in the areas used most directly by the students. Hotel rooms converted to dormitory rooms had few initial aesthetic changes, but upgrades to the structure and mechanical systems began. As the College grew slowly and stabilized financially, work expanded in scope and scale. Additional portions of the Ponce were rehabilitated, and nearby historic buildings were brought into the campus.

For the building’s 100th anniversary, the College embarked on its first fundraising campaign. Under the leadership of a National Advisory Committee composed of
renowned preservation experts and restoration architects, the Dining Room, Grand Parlor and Rotunda became showpieces once again. Beginning in 1987 this effort garnered significant publicity, returning the Ponce to a national spotlight—a status it held one hundred years earlier on the eve of its opening. The College’s continued preservation program paralleled that of the State of Florida.

In 2013 the College celebrated the Ponce’s 125th anniversary. The anniversary was special in more than an honorific sense. The College completed preservation of the Ponce through rehabilitation of the fourth floor and Solarium, or room under the central dome. The project was accomplished through a public-private fundraising effort and enlisted the same construction firm that had begun repairs on the building in 1971, forty-two years earlier.

The College’s growth over the past half century resulted in development of a downtown campus that features a total of nineteen historic buildings, well over half of the campus facilities. In several cases, the College’s acquisition of the properties ensured their preservation. Six new buildings demonstrate new construction methods and design compatible with the historic campus and meet the City of St. Augustine’s rigorous review standards.

In 1987 historian Caroline Castillo (Crimm) completed research on preservation of the former Hotel Ponce de Leon. Her research addressed the early years of the College’s preservation endeavors. Even so, she noted the importance of the historic campus to the status of Flagler College, “the Ponce de Leon [is] a tremendous bonus as a selling feature…a magnet for parents and students,…The private school image, the
small student-teacher ratios and the high-cost prestige is enhanced by the historical quality of the buildings.”³

Twenty-five years later Castillo’s statement remains true. Flagler College’s reputation is linked directly with the former Hotel Ponce de Leon. Heritage tourism has developed into a major component of leisure activities in the United States and globally. Simultaneously, the internet has become the primary tool of communication in the twenty-first century. The College has taken advantage of both phenomena as it grew as an institution and developed a larger campus based on historic buildings.

Many colleges in the United States feature historic buildings on their campuses, and adaptively using historic buildings that were not built for academic purposes has risen in response to growth of the nation’s historic preservation movement. The July 2013 issue of College Planning & Management magazine included an article addressing the challenges faced in using these buildings. The article addressed buildings at Flagler College and three Massachusetts institutions, the University of Massachusetts-Amherst, the Berklee College of Music, and Williams College. The story cited Flagler College for creatively using former residences for offices, seminars, conferences or receptions.⁴

Based on visitor information maintained by the St. Johns County Tourist Development Council, among the “must see” sites is Flagler College. A tourism barometer Trip Advisor regularly ranks the College in the top five places to visit in the region. Particularly in 2013, with the College’s emphasis on the 125th anniversary of the

³Castillo, 144.

⁴Mark Rowh, Renovation vs. Historic Preservation, College Planning & Management, 16:7 (July 2013), 18-21.
Ponce, media coverage has been strong with numerous feature stories throughout Florida and in the *Atlanta Constitution* and *Boston Herald*.

On January 12, 2013, ceremonies took place that honored the date on which Henry Flagler opened the hotel to the public. Bells at the Cathedral Basilica rang in celebration. The Florida East Coast railroad provided an honorific train with four cars of different eras bringing twenty VIPs south to St. Augustine to a stop near U.S. 1 and West King Street, the contemporary location closest to the historic depot site.

Jacksonville television stations covered Mr. Flagler’s arrival by carriage at the main entry gate of the hotel with St. Augustine Mayor Joseph Boles, Jr. and Flagler College executives Chairman David Drysdale and President William T. Abare, Jr. More than 4,000 people from throughout the southern United States participated in the events that day that included tours of the campus and opening of two exhibitions about the history of the hotel.⁵

Many families with soon-to-be college age children vacation in St. Augustine. Typically, they have planned time at the beaches and time for historic sites. These families comprise substantial numbers of the visitors who tour the campus. Over and over enrolled students relay that their first experience at Flagler College came as a visitor to the Ponce. This has translated into stable enrollment and an increasing support base for activities and fundraising endeavors.

A goal of the College’s founders in 1967 was for the new educational institution to bring greater recognition to the complex of buildings known as the Hotel Ponce de

---

⁵Re-enactor John Stavely portrayed Henry Flagler, including presenting remarks that Flagler had made regarding construction of the Ponce.
Leon than had been the case when they operated as a resort. That goal has been accomplished. Flagler College’s image is inseparable from that of the Ponce. Though the campus has grown with historic and contemporary buildings that provide a unique architectural composition, the building associated worldwide with Flagler College is the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

Henry Flagler’s legacy to Florida began with the Hotel Ponce de Leon, an architectural masterpiece and engineering wonder that embraced an era and set the tone for luxury resorts throughout the nation. From there he and his business partners developed the southernmost frontier—Florida. He extended his influence from the Atlantic to the Pacific. He built a palatial house in Palm Beach late in his life. Though his Overseas Railway was known at the time of its completion in 1912 as the “Eighth Wonder of the World” the railroad proved short lived. The building widely recognized for its association with Henry Flagler is the one that served as his first Florida home, the Hotel Ponce de Leon.

Today, Flagler College uses the term “Flagler family” referring to the personnel, alumni, students, parents and friends that cherish the institution. If, indeed, Flagler College can be considered a family, as was the case with Henry Flagler, the family’s home is that architectural masterpiece and engineering wonder affectionately known as the Ponce.
APPENDIX A
FLAGLER COLLEGE RESTORATION CAMPAIGN

NATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

- Thomas S. Kenan, III, Chairman, Trustee, North Carolina Museum of Art
- William A. V. Cecil, President, Biltmore, Campbell, Smith Restorations, Inc.
- W. Vernon Edenfield, Director, Kenmore Association, Inc., Fredericksburg
- Dr. Michael V. Gannon, Chairman, Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board
- Thomas A. Gray, Chairman, Old Salem Restoration Committee
- John E. Harbour, Resident Director, Mount Vernon
- Dr. Daniel P. Jordan, Director of Monticello, Charlottesville
- G. E. Kidder Smith, FAIA, Architect/Author, New York
- R. Angus Murdoch, Executive Director, Historic Charleston Foundation
- Prof. Frederick D. Nichols, FAIA, Professor Emeritus, University of Virginia
- Nicholas A. Pappas, FAIA, Architect, Colonial Williamsburg Foundation
- F. Blair Reeves, FAIA, Research & Education Center for Architectural Preservation, University of Florida
- Charles B. Simmons, Director, The Henry M. Flagler Museum, Palm Beach

CAMPAIGN COMMITTEE

In addition to the National Advisory Committee that governed the physical restoration of the Ponce, a Campaign Committee was established to orchestrate the capital campaign. Committee members were the Flagler College Board of Trustees and select College supporters:

1. Lawrence Lewis, Jr., Chairman, Flagler College Founder, Richmond, Virginia
2. John D. Bailey, Sr., Partner, Thompson-Bailey Agency, St. Augustine
3. John D. Bailey, Jr., Attorney, St. Augustine
4. Josephine Bozard, Bozard Ford, St. Augustine
5. Fred M. Cone, Jr., Attorney, Jacksonville
6. David C. Drysdale, President, St. Augustine Alligator Farm, St. Augustine
7. Janet Wiseman English, Flagler College alumnus, Jacksonville
8. John N. Foster, Jr., Armstrong Furniture Company, High Point, North Carolina
9. Mrs. John N. (Louise Lewis) Foster, Jr., Secretary, Flagler Foundation
10. Harry R. Gonzalez, Gonzalez Consultants, North Palm Beach
11. Hon. D. Burke Kibler, III, Chairman of the Board of Directors, Holland and Knight
12. Dr. John M. Kistler, Educator, St. Augustine
13. Dr. Charles W. LaPradd, Gainesville
14. George G. Matthews, President, Flagler Museum and Henry Morrison Flagler's great-grandson
15. Dr. William J. McClure, former President, Florida School for the Deaf and the Blind
16. Leslie Gladstone McCraw, President and CEO, Fluor Corporation
17. Judge Howell W. Melton, St. Augustine
18. Hon. Stephen C. O'Connell, former Florida Supreme Court judge and former President, University of Florida
19. Lance C. Ringhaver, Chairman, Ring Power Corporation
20. Bradford B. Sauer, Richmond
21. Hon. T. Terrell Sessums, Chairman, Florida Board of Regents
22. Edwin Lee Shelton, Sr.
23. Judge Frank D. Upchurch, Jr., St. Augustine
24. Mary Lily Flagler Wiley, Great-Niece of Henry M. and Mary Lily Kenan Flagler
25. John E. Wilson, Jr., Wilson Chevrolet, St. Augustine
APPENDIX B
FLAGLER COLLEGE PUBLIC GRANTS AND RECOGNITION

U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service
Save America’s Treasures Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>PROJECT</th>
<th>AMOUNT</th>
<th>FUNDED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon, Windows</td>
<td>$400,000</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Carrere &amp; Hastings St. Augustine Architectural Heritage</td>
<td>49,462</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Florida Department of State, Acquisition and Development Grants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>PROJECT</th>
<th>AMOUNT</th>
<th>RANKING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Flagler College Towers Restoration</td>
<td>$68,930</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Dining Room</td>
<td>414,712</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Rotunda, Phase I</td>
<td>92,625</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Rotunda, Phase II</td>
<td>149,888</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Markland House</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Rotunda, Phase III</td>
<td>146,220</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Rotunda, Phase IV</td>
<td>139,880</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Grand Parlor</td>
<td>212,400</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Flagler College Perimeter Wall</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Ponce Hall Courtyard</td>
<td>231,545</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon – Windows</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Markland Cottage</td>
<td>48,000</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Flagler College Art Building, Phase I</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Flagler College Art Building, Phase II</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Ponce de Leon Cottage</td>
<td>48,000</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon Solarium, Phase I</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon Grand Parlor</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon Solarium, Phase II</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon Solarium</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Hotel Ponce de Leon</td>
<td>400,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National Trust for Historic Preservation

YEAR  AWARD
1987  Lawrence Lewis, Jr. – Honor Award

Florida Trust for Historic Preservation

YEAR  AWARD
1988  20 Valencia Street – Meritorious Achievement for Adaptive Use
1988  Wiley Hall – Meritorious Achievement for Adaptive Use
1988  Grand Parlor – Restoration of Historic Interior
1991  Dining Room – Restoration
1995  Lawrence Lewis, Jr. – Evelyn Fortune Bartlett Award
2006  Flagler College – Organizational Achievement
2008  Markland Cottage – Outstanding Achievement for Restoration
2008  Molly Wiley Art Building – Outstanding Achievement for Adaptive Use
2010  Ponce de Leon Hall, Towers Restoration – Outstanding Achievement for Restoration
2010  Crisp-Ellert Art Museum – Outstanding Achievement for Infill Construction
2012  Florida East Coast Railway Buildings – Outstanding Achievement for Adaptive Use
2013  Hanke Hall – Outstanding Achievement for Infill Construction

American Institute of Architects - Florida

2010  Molly Wiley Art Building – Merit Award in Historic Preservation & Restoration
2012  Hotel Ponce de Leon – 100 Top Buildings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>DATES</th>
<th>CHAIRMAN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Henrietta M. Poynter</td>
<td>1959</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William F. Rolleston</td>
<td>1959-1960</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonard Usina</td>
<td>1959-1961</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W. L. Sims II</td>
<td>1959-1971</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent McKinley</td>
<td>1960-1961</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. S. Lloyd</td>
<td>1960-1967</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam T. Dell</td>
<td>1962-1965</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward Ball</td>
<td>1962-1970</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth Towers</td>
<td>1965-1979</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bishop Joseph Hurley</td>
<td>1966-1970</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walter B. Booth</td>
<td>1968-1970</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Harwood</td>
<td>1968-1971</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacob F. Bryan, III</td>
<td>1969-1972</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marylou Whitney</td>
<td>1970-1978</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Peter P. Pierce, Jr.</td>
<td>1976-1978</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Call Darby Collins</td>
<td>1978-1980</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Fretwell</td>
<td>1979-1986</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julio Grabel</td>
<td>1979-1987</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norma Lockwood</td>
<td>1981-1987</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fae Ensslin</td>
<td>1986-1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Sliney</td>
<td>1987-1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Foerster</td>
<td>1987-1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patricia Wood Lee</td>
<td>1987-1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teresa de Balsameda Milam</td>
<td>1987-1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeanne Ray</td>
<td>1987-1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitchell Drew</td>
<td>1989-1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betty Riggan</td>
<td>1991-1997</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nancy Sikes</td>
<td>1991-1997</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Edmiston</td>
<td>1991-1998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otis Mason</td>
<td>1991-1998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herschel Shepard</td>
<td>1991-1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janis Williams</td>
<td>1991-1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF REFERENCES

400th Anniversary, Inc. Responsible for Planning Anniversary Celebration. 1965. *St. Augustine Record*, September 8, 3B.


http://ufdc.ufl.edu/UF00053708/00001/2x?vo=3.


Abandoned Shipwreck Act of 1987 (ASA), 43 USC 2101-2106.


http://www.staugustinehistoricalsociety.org/about.html.

Actions Speak Louder Than Words. 1961. *St. Augustine Record*, November 5, 8A.


Ancient City Will Use Old Fort as A-Shelter. 1962. St. Augustine Record, October 24.


Anderson Cottage File. Flagler College Records.


Archaeological and Historic Preservation Act of 1974, 16 USC 469.

Archaeological Resources Protection Act of 1979, 16 USC 470.


Armington & Sims telegram to Thomas Alva Edison, September 13, 1884. 1884. Thomas Edison Papers, Rutgers University.


Bailey, John D., Sr., Former Mayor, City of St. Augustine. 2012. Interview by author, November 28.


http://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=RLzEVN5k0WkC&oi=fnd&pg=PA6&q=copper+queen+hotel&ots=qJYzwJbKUE&sig=qlYJz6JscSTPsf2Krd9dVDC3k#v=onepage&q=copper%20queen%20hotel&f=false.


Bushnell, Edward Rogers, ed. 1909. *The History of Athletics at the University of Pennsylvania. Vol. II, 1896-97-1907-08*. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania: The Athletic Association of the University of Pennsylvania. Accessed December 11, 2012. [http://books.google.com/books?id=lcpMAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA150&lpg=PA150&clayton+dixon+university+of+pennsylvania&source=bl&ots=wBMYk0YYi5&sig=M7pu0Q8sErPRd_w8cCQmLNxwxY0&hl=en&sa=X&ei=0qzHUJD8Dorm8gSC04GgBq&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAQ#v=onepage&q=clayton%20dixon%20university%20of%20pennsylvania&f=false](http://books.google.com/books?id=lcpMAAAAYAAJ&pg=PA150&lpg=PA150&clayton+dixon+university+of+pennsylvania&source=bl&ots=wBMYk0YYi5&sig=M7pu0Q8sErPRd_w8cCQmLNxwxY0&hl=en&sa=X&ei=0qzHUJD8Dorm8gSC04GgBq&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAQ#v=onepage&q=clayton%20dixon%20university%20of%20pennsylvania&f=false).


Castle Warden. 1985. Florida Site File Form, typescript copy, City of St. Augustine Planning and Building Department.

Castleden, Louise Decatur, compiler and editor. 'The Early Years of the Ponce de Leon': Clippings from an Old Scrap Book of those days Kept by the First Manager of This 'Prince of Hotels'. n.p. [ca. 1894], Flagler College Archives.

Center for Governmental Responsibility, University of Florida Levin College of Law. 2006. Contributions of Historic Preservation to the Quality of Life in Florida.


The Charity Ball. 1900. The Tatler, St. Augustine, March 22.


City of St. Augustine, Department of Heritage Tourism. 1958. Minutes of the Organizational Meeting of St. Augustine’s 400th Anniversary, Inc., a non-profit corporation, held Thursday, May 1st, at 8:00 p.m., Hotel Bennett, St. Augustine, Florida, Typescript Copy.

City of St. Augustine, Department of Heritage Tourism. 1965. Easter Festival Parade is Hailed as Biggest, Best Ever, St. Augustine Record, April 19.


_________. 1991. St. Augustine is considered by many to be the…Birthplace of the CGR. *The Reservist*, April.


Craftsmen Restoring Ponce Hall Dining Area to Former Glory Days, 1987. The St. Augustine Record, October 3.


Davis, Mike. 2013. Correspondence with author, June 3.


Department of Transportation Act. 1966. 49 USC Section 202 and 23 USC Section 138.


Earl Cunningham: Artist was particular about sharing his work. 1986. Florida Times-Union, October 26. St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library.


Flagler College. 2013. Aerial Photo of Ponce de Leon Hall.


Flagler College. 2008. Hotel Ponce de Leon exhibit text panel.


Flagler College, Office of Business Services, Records.


Flagler College, Office of Institutional Advancement, Grant Records.


Flagler College Archives, untitled photo.


Flagler College, Archives. 1988. Ponce de Leon Hall Dining Hall.

Flagler College, Campus Planning Files. 1972. Coast Guard building on West Lawn - Art Department.

Flagler College, Campus Planning Files. 1999. Flagler College Perimeter Wall.

Flagler College Records.  20 Valencia Street file.

Flagler College Records.  Casa Amarylla SJ2293, Florida Site File.

Flagler College Records. 1968.  Flagler College Opens This Week: Orientation Set For First Class Of 180 Students.  St. Augustine Record, September 21-22.


Flagler County and St. Johns County Historical Markers, National Register Listings and National Historic Landmark Listings.


Flagler Era Is Launched Here With Luxury.  1885.  St. Augustine Record, January 10.


Florida Department of Agriculture. 1921. *Florida Tourist Quarterly Bulletin* 1, no. 4 (October 1).


Florida Military Headquarters Building was Once Franciscan Monastery, Convent. 1965. *St. Augustine Record*, September 8, 4B.


Florida Site File Form. 1987.  8SJ10 St. Francis Barracks.  City of St. Augustine files.


Florida Statutes, Ch. 196.1997.


Florida’s Railroad History Should Be Carefully Preserved.  1937.  St. Augustine Record, July 4.


Foster, Louise Lewis.  2013.  Interview by author, February 15.


Fraser, Walter B., Papers, private collection.


Freeman, Viki West. 2013. Interview by author, February 20.


Furniture Being Moved From Ponce de Leon To Make Room For U.S. Coast Guard Center. 1942. *St. Augustine Record*, August 31.


Gannon, Michael, former member Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board. 2013. Interview by author, January 23.


General Motors Gives $10,000 To Restoration, Spain Expands Project. 1964. *St. Augustine Record*, June 19.


The Great Halls and Corridors of the Ponce Extend Over One Mile. 1888. Special Supplement to the *St. Augustine Record*, January 9, 1888, reprinted from the Florida Times-Union, January 12.


H.E. Wolfe to Be Honored At Dinner: Governor to Lay Cornerstone For Florida Center Tomorrow. 1964. *St. Augustine Record*, November 22. Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board Records.


Hawkins, Ruth, Director, Hemingway-Pfeiffer Museum and Educational Center. 2006. Correspondence with the author.

Heade, Martin Johnson. Giant Magnolias on a Blue Velvet Cloth, ca. 1885-95. National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.


He Rubbed Back of Johnson, news clipping, n.d.


Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board Archives, Member File.


Hotel Ponce de Leon Will Open Season on Dec. 22nd: Earliest Date Ever Set For This Hostelry. 1934. St. Augustine Record, October 21.

Hotel Ponce de Leon Will Open Early for St. Augustine Event. 1964. Florida Times-Union, October 29.


James, Nancy Jo Cafaro. 2013. Correspondence with author, February 20.


Kenan, Thomas. 2013. Interview by author, January 27.


__________. 2010. The St. Augustine Quadricentennial Anniversary, unpublished typescript, University of Florida.


Lewis, Lawrence, Jr. 1988. An Open Letter to the Citizens of St. Augustine and St. Johns County, *St. Augustine Record*, July 12, 10A.

Lewis, Lawrence, Jr. 1983. Letter to Dennis B. Kane, National Geographic Society, February 7.


400


Martin, Donald. 2013. Interview by author, February 22.


403


National Baseba...


Nichols, Frederick D. Correspondence with Bernard Maybeck and Annie W. Maybeck, Papers of Frederick D. Nichols, 1940s-1990s, Accession # 12798, Albert and Shirley Small Special Collections, University of Virginia Library, Charlottesville, Virginia.


Office of Business Services Records. Flagler College.


Only One Member of Quadricentennial Board Urges Celebration Not Be Held. 1964. *Florida Times-Union*, April 10.

Opening of Ponce Was the Event Not to be Missed in Florida in 1888. 1888. Supplement to the *St. Augustine Record*, January 9, reprinted from the *Florida Times-Union*, January 12, 1888.


Pollack, Deborah C. 2009. Laura Woodward: The artist behind the innovator who developed Palm Beach. Singapore: Blue Heron Press.


The Ponce de Leon Reception. 1898. The Tatler. St. Augustine, 7:8 (March 5).

Poole, Hester M. 1891. The Residence of Thomas A Edison, Orange, N.J. The Decorator and Furnisher 19, no. 3 (December): 93 – 96.


Restoration Commission. 1965. *St. Augustine Record*, September 8, 7B.


Restoring a Relic: Rose Leavitt and Crew are Returning the Splendor to Flagler College’s Dining Hall One Spot at a Time. 2000. *St. Augustine Record* Compass, July 7.


Rotunda Special Category Grant records, Flagler College Grant Records.


Ruggiero, Dr. Laurence, Executive Director, Morse Museum of American Art. 2009. Interview with the author, November 5.


Sargeant, Winthrop. 1948. Bernard Maybeck: He is a sage, a dreamer, an eccentric and California’s greatest architect. LIFE Magazine, May 17.


St. Augustine Historical Society. Hotel Ponce de Leon, construction of corner towers, HS4680.

St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library. Festivals and Special Events: Quadricentennial folder, Minutes of the December 5, 1963 meeting.


http://www.la84foundation.org/SportsLibrary/Outing/Volume_16/outXVI03/outXVI03e.pdf.

St. Augustine Lighthouse & Museum. SPARs at Ponce Hotel, U.S. Coast Guard, Flagler College Hotel Ponce de Leon 125th anniversary exhibit.

http://www.gainesvilletoday.com/2003/12/visit_saint_augustine.html


Storhaug, Arthur N., Faribault, Minnesota, Letter to postcard donor, from Jacqueline Fretwell, Librarian, Festivals: Ponce de Leon Celebration Correspondence and Clippings Files St. Augustine Historical Society Research Library (SAHSRL).


This is Flagler College, St. Augustine, Florida 32084. Brochure, n.d. [ca. 1968].

Thorn, Craig, Papers. Estate of Craig and Audrey Thorn.

Tiffany Windows: Flagler College Dining Hall, unpublished typescript, Flagler College Archives.


Tojetti Frescoes in the Ponce de Leon Hotel, St. Augustine, Fla. Undated postcard.


Walas, Jim, Architectural Services Manager, Revere Copper. 2012. Correspondence with author, December 7.


Whites Boycott Dinner for Vice-President at St. Augustine After He Submits to NAACP Mixing Demands. 1963. *Chronicle*, March 15.


Williams, Janis Versaggi. 2013. Interview by author, February 5.


Ximenez-Fatio House Museum, Archives. 1921. Triple Celebration at St. Augustine was Patriotic and Inspiring, With President-Elect Harding at Old Fort. *Florida Times-Union*, February 23.

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Leslee Keys is an Instructor in History and Director of Historic Preservation in the Department of Humanities for Flagler College. She is the faculty member responsible for the College’s decorative and fine arts collection and a member of the Hotel Ponce de Leon 125th Anniversary Steering Committee. She is a representative to the St. Johns County Economic Development Council, Past-President of the St. Johns County Chamber of Commerce’s Historic St. Augustine Area Council, Past President of the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation, and the College’s designee to the St. Augustine 450th Commemoration Commission and St. Augustine Sister Cities Board. In 2005 she became fundraising staff in the Office of Institutional Advancement and from 2007 to 2012 was Director of Corporate, Foundation, and Government Relations.

Between 2002 and 2005 Keys was Executive Director for the Ximenez-Fatio House Museum in St. Augustine, Florida. From 1997 until 2002 she served as the Historical Resources Administrator for the St. Augustine Regional Preservation Office, Division of Historical Resources, Florida Department of State. From 1993-1997, she was manager for the Historic Florida Keys Preservation Board in Key West, Florida.

Between 1986 and 1993, Dr. Keys worked for the Jefferson County, Kentucky, Office of Historic Preservation and Archives, the latter five years as its Administrator. She oversaw the county’s historic preservation efforts and managed the county’s archives and records center. Previously, she held the position of Historic Preservation Analyst with the county.

Dr. Keys was executive director for Riverside-Avondale Preservation, Inc., in Jacksonville, Florida, from 1984-1986. She worked as an assistant planner for the City of Jacksonville’s Department of Housing and Urban Development following a tenure
from 1980-1983 with the City of Dayton, Ohio, planning department as staff to the city’s preservation design review board. From 1979-1980 she was employed by the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

Dr. Keys served as adjunct faculty to Florida Community College at Jacksonville, the University of Louisville, Barry University in Miami, and Flagler College. She is the author of several publications including two books on historic preservation and co-authored *Hotel Ponce de Leon: The Architecture & Decoration* published in 2013.

Numerous organizations have recognized Dr. Keys’ professional efforts. Additionally, in 1983 she was an Outstanding Young Woman of America nominee. In 1991 the State of Kentucky acknowledged her with a Service to Preservation Award. Also, she has been included in Who’s Who in America.

In 1976 Dr. Keys graduated with honors from Ball State University. In 1977 she completed graduate courses in history from Virginia Tech, and in 1983 received a master of urban and regional planning degree from the same university. She received a Ph.D. in historic preservation in the University of Florida’s Design, Construction and Planning program. In 1992 Dr. Keys qualified as a member of the American Institute of Certified Planners.