ACADEMIC LIBRARIES
RECRUITMENT EFFICACY
AND OUTCOME STUDY

Brian W Keith
Associate Dean, Administrative Services and Faculty Affairs
George A. Smathers Libraries
University of Florida

Bonnie J Smith
Assistant Program Director for HR
George A. Smathers Libraries
University of Florida

ALA Annual Conference - 2012

Research: Creativity and Innovation
Library Research Round Table (LRRT)
Innovative Inquiry:

“Novelty and innovation are needed to respond to many of today's challenges. Libraries and librarians require new and creative approaches to defining questions and finding answers.”
Maximize the size, quality and diversity of applicant pool.

What strategies and advertising venues are really successful in attracting the best qualified and most diverse applicants?
The Challenge – Where to Aim?

- Diversity Focused Recruiting Institution
- Newspapers
- Electronic Mailing Lists
- Websites
- Social Networking

Individuals
Traditional Response to the Challenge

- The institution
  - specifies where it will post and includes diversity-oriented venues
  - collects anecdotal data for individual searches
  - tries to draw conclusions from that information
  - adds locations as they learn of them and as time and budget permits
Innovative Response to the Challenge

Academic Libraries Recruitment Efficacy and Outcome Study

- Ongoing longitudinal study to investigate the efficacy of employee recruitment techniques at multiple institutions

- Focuses on:
  - Advertising of vacancies,
  - Solicitation of applications
  &
  - Recruitment outcomes resulting from these activities
Purpose

- Comparison and assessment of library recruitment activities
Benefits from Participation

- Repository of search efforts and outcomes – compliance reporting
- Evaluate effectiveness of specific advertising venues
  - Including venues intended to increase applications from underrepresented groups
- Learn about successful posting locations from other institutions
- Capture trends in positions/titles in academic libraries
In partnership between:
- Duke University
- Texas A&M University
- University of California – Irvine
- University of Chicago
- University of Florida
- University of Massachusetts – Amherst
- University of Minnesota
- University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill
Academic Libraries Recruitment Efficacy and Outcome Study

Timeline

Design and Development
2009

Launch Study
June 2010 – 8 institutions and 24 searches

Launch Reporting Tool
June 2011 – 17 institutions and 50 searches

Current Status
June 2012 – 27 institutions and 85 searches
27 Participant Institutions – June 2012

- Baker College
- College of Charleston
- Duke University
- Georgia State University
- Michigan State University
- Middle Tennessee State University
- Northwestern University
- Ohio University
- Pennsylvania State University
- Purdue University
- Rutgers University
- Texas A&M University
- Towson University
- University of Alberta
- University of Buffalo
- University of California – Irvine
- University of Chicago
- University of Colorado – Boulder
- University of Connecticut
- University of Florida
- University of Massachusetts – Amherst
- University of Michigan
- University of Minnesota
- University of Missouri
- University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill
- University of Pennsylvania
- Virginia Commonwealth University
The intent is to collect granular and comprehensive data on each search that will permit analysis and conclusions.
The data collected for each search includes:

- **Position Information**
  - FTE
  - FLSA (+ type of exempt position)
  - Type of position (Specialist; Admin; Branch Head; Department Head)
  - Working Title
  - Employment Type (Temporary; Regular; Tenure Accruing)
  - Institution Type (Law; Medical; Other)
  - Dates (Posted; Closed)
  - Search Status (Filled; Unfilled; Open)
Data

- Where position was posted
  - Specific venues organized into 9 categories
    - General Advertising Venues
    - Electronic Mailing Lists
    - Recruiting Library’s Venues
    - Social Networking Web Sites
    - Regional and Local Venues
    - Newspapers
    - ALA Accredited Library Schools
    - Specialty Venues
    - Individuals

- Write ins
### Recruiting Library's Venues (home institution)

**24. Recruiting Library's Advertising Venues within The Home Institution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Venues</th>
<th>If “yes” enter Y - If “no” leave blank</th>
<th># of completed applications</th>
<th># of applications meeting minimum qualifications</th>
<th># of telephone interviews</th>
<th># of onsite interviews</th>
<th># of offers extended</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University's Web site (HR job posting Web site of recruiting library's university)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University's Regional Campus Web sites (for universities with branches that host their own Web sites)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library's Web site (job posting Web site of recruiting library)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University's Career Services Web site (oriented towards institution's graduates)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**25. Special Interest Venues within The Home Institution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Venues</th>
<th># of Sites</th>
<th># of completed applications</th>
<th># of applications meeting minimum qualifications</th>
<th># of telephone interviews</th>
<th># of onsite interviews</th>
<th># of offers extended</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Library's University electronic mailing lists (clubs, groups special interest organizations - such as Chemistry Club list for a Chemistry Librarian position)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specify Special Interest Venues
Data

- **Search Results**
  - Number of completed applications
  - Number of applications meeting minimum qualifications
  - Number of phone interviews
  - Number of onsite interviews
  - Number of offers

- **Information for Successful Candidates**
  - Start date
  - Gender
  - Ethnicity
Reporting Tool

- Dynamic
- Flexible
- Comprehensive
- Easy to Use
- Downloadable to PDF and Excel
Reporting Tool

**All data can be used as criteria**

- FTE
- FLSA
- Type of position
- Working Title
- Employment Type
- Institution Type
- Dates
- Search Status

**Additional reporting options**

- Suppress posting voids
- Suppress write-ins
- Searchable by region
Reporting Tool

- How does it work?
- Examples?

http://apps.uflib.ufl.edu/recruitmentstudy/query
21 Job Searches Meet Above Criteria
### General Advertising Venues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Total Posts</th>
<th>Completed Apps</th>
<th>Apps with Min. Requirements</th>
<th>Telephone Interviews</th>
<th>Onsite Interviews</th>
<th>Offers Extended</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic Careers Online</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AILA - American Indian Library Association</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APALA - Asian-Pacific American Librarians Association</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARL - Association of Research Libraries</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCALA - Black Caucus of ALA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALA - Chinese American Librarians Association</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic ALA/ACRL - American Library Association/Association of College and Research Libraries</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic Chronicle of Higher Education</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HigherEDJOBS</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Higher Ed</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libgig</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libjobs.com</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LISjobs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print ALA/ACRL - American Library Association/Association of College and Research Libraries</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Ethnicity of Persons Hired

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Not Disclosed</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaska Native</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African American</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic or Latino</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Disclosed</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Gender of Persons Hired

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Not Disclosed</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
27 participant institutions
13 submitted data
85 searches
6 medical library searches
No law library searches
74 positions filled / 11 unfilled
Results

Most prevalent job categories

- Public Services/Reference (21)
- Subject Specialist (19)
- Instructional Services (14)
- Archivist/Curator (9)
- Information Technology (9)
- Digital Services (5)

Gender and Ethnicity

- Gender
  - 47 women
  - 27 men
- Ethnicity 16% from under-represented groups
  - 6 Asian
  - 4 Black or African American
  - 2 Hispanic Latino
Findings

Most Productive Posting Categories

By Number of Offers to Number of Postings

Library's Venues

General Advertising

Specialty
Findings

Most Productive Posting Categories

By Number of Offers to Number of Applicants Meeting Minimum Qualifications

- Social Media
- Individual Solicitations/Word of Mouth
- Specialty
Findings

Most Productive Posting Categories By Number of Offers

- Library’s Venues
- General Advertising
- Individual Solicitations/Word of Mouth
- Specialty
Findings

Least Productive Posting Categories

By Number of Offers to Number of Postings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Offers</th>
<th>Postings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under-Represented Specific</td>
<td>2/268</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>1/189</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALA Accredited Library Schools</td>
<td>3/1110</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>0/15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings

Number of Postings Compared to Number of Offers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Postings</th>
<th>Offers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3872</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What’s Next

- Enhancements in 2.0
  - Revisions to venues, job types, etc...
  - Key word searching
- More data analysis
- Marketing
Benefits from Participation

- Repository of search efforts and outcomes – compliance reporting
- Evaluate effectiveness of specific advertising venues
  - Including venues intended to increase applications from underrepresented groups
- Learn about successful posting locations from other institutions
- Capture trends in positions/titles in academic libraries
ACADEMIC LIBRARIES RECRUITMENT EFFICACY AND OUTCOME STUDY

Thank you!

Bonnie J Smith
Assistant Program Director for HR
George A. Smathers Libraries
University of Florida

Brian W Keith
Associate Dean, Administrative Services and Faculty Affairs
George A. Smathers Libraries
University of Florida

RecruitmentStudy@uflib.ufl.edu